

**A NARRATIVE INQUIRY STUDY OF TWO PIANO TEACHERS'
PERCEPTIONS ON LATER CAREER CREATIVITY AND
SUSTAINABILITY IN MUSIC TEACHING**

LEE WAI KIN

**CULTURAL CENTRE
UNIVERSITY OF MALAYA
KUALA LUMPUR**

2019

**A NARRATIVE INQUIRY STUDY OF TWO PIANO
TEACHERS' PERCEPTIONS ON LATER CAREER
CREATIVITY AND SUSTAINABILITY IN MUSIC
TEACHING**

LEE WAI KIN

**DISSERTATION SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL
FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE
DEGREE OF MASTER OF PERFORMING ARTS
(MUSIC)**

**CULTURAL CENTRE
UNIVERSITY OF MALAYA
KUALA LUMPUR**

2019

ORIGINAL LITERARY WORK DECLARATION

Name of Candidate: Lee Wai Kin

Matric No: RGI 150017

Name of Degree: Master of Performance (Music)

Title of Project Paper/Research Report/Dissertation/Thesis ("this Work"): **A Narrative Inquiry Case Study of Two Piano Teachers' Perception of Later Career Creativity and Sustainability in Music Teaching**

Field of Study: Music Education

I do solemnly and sincerely declare that:

- (1) I am the sole author/writer of this Work;
- (2) This Work is original;
- (3) Any use of any work in which copyright exists was done by way of fair dealing and for permitted purposes and any excerpt or extract from, or reference to or reproduction of any copyright work has been disclosed expressly and sufficiently and the title of the Work and its authorship have been acknowledged in this Work;
- (4) I do not have any actual knowledge nor do I ought reasonably to know that the making of this work constitutes an infringement of any copyright work;
- (5) I hereby assign all and every rights in the copyright to this Work to the University of Malaya ("UM"), who henceforth shall be owner of the copyright in this Work and that any reproduction or use in any form or by any means whatsoever is prohibited without the written consent of UM having been first had and obtained;
- (6) I am fully aware that if in the course of making this Work I have infringed any copyright whether intentionally or otherwise, I may be subject to legal action or any other action as may be determined by UM.

Candidate's Signature

Date:

Subscribed and solemnly declared before,

Witness's Signature Date:

Name:

Designation:

A Narrative Inquiry Case Study of Two Piano Teachers' Perceptions on Later Career Creativity and Sustainability in Music Teaching

Abstract

This study was aimed to investigate the views and perspective of two piano teachers and music educators in Malaysia on the creativity and sustainability in their later music career. A narrative inquiry study approach was conducted to examine how creativity can be realised through their life stories and professional life experiences. Open ended interview was employed, for the interviewees to describe their professional experiences; from their early years of teaching until today; their significant identities as piano teacher, performer, composer and researcher, their contributions on society with their gifted talent and endeavour are undoubtedly essential. This study investigates how propulsion theory proposed by Sternberg (1999) can be applicable to reflect the creativity and sustainability in their career path and their contribution to the field. The eight different types of creative contribution are as follow: (1) replication, (2) redefinition, (3) forward incrementation, (4) advanced forward incrementation, (5) redirection, (6) reconstruction/redirection, (7) reinitiation and (8) integration. The viable options were proposed based on the current study, and how creative discoveries and knowledge in later-career creativity could be achieved. Furthermore, the participants' creative integration of teaching, performing, composition and research were discussed. Overall, the result demonstrated that music teaching is a lifelong learning process, only by constantly engaging in it, creativity and sustainability can be realised.

Keywords: Propulsion Theory, Creativity, Sustainability

Kajian Naratif Mengenai Persepsi Dua Orang Guru Piano Muzik Tentang Kreativiti Semasa Lewat Kerjaya Mereka Dan Kemampuan Dalam Pengajaran Muzik

Akstrak

Kajian ini bertujuan untuk mendalami persepsi dua tokoh pendidik muzik di Malaysia mengenai kreativiti dan kemampuan dalam kerjaya muzik mereka. Pendekatan kajian siasatan naratif telah dijalankan dan ia mengkaji bagaimana kreativiti dapat direalisasikan melalui kisah hidup mereka, memahami pengalaman hidup profesional mereka, temu bual berakhir terbuka telah digunakan menerangkan pengalaman pengajaran mereka dari tahun awal hingga hari ini dan identiti penting dan serba boleh mereka sebagai guru piano, piano performer, komposer dan penyelidik. Sumbangan mereka kepada masyarakat dengan bakat dan usaha berbalat mereka sangat penting. Kajian ini mengkaji bagaimana teori pendorongan yang dicadangkan oleh Sternberg (1999) boleh digunakan untuk mencerminkan kreativiti dan kemampuan dalam laluan kerjaya mereka dan sumbangan mereka kepada dunia muzik. Lapan jenis teori pendorongan telah dibahagikan kepada tiga kategori: menerima paradigma semasa, menurun paradigma semasa dan mensintesis pelbagai paradigma semasa. Lapan jenis sumbangan kreatif adalah seperti berikut: (1) replikasi, (2) definisi semula, (3) penambahan ke hadapan, (4) kemaraan penambahan, (5) pengubahan semula hala, (6) pembinaan semula / redirection, (7) pembentukan semula dan (8) integrasi. Pilihan yang berdaya maju telah dicadangkan berdasarkan kajian semasa, dan bagaimana penemuan kreativiti dan pengetahuan dalam kreativiti kemudian kerjaya dapat dicapai. Tambahan pula, integrasi kreatif peserta pengajaran, melaksanakan, komposisi dan penyelidikan telah dibincangkan. Secara keseluruhan, keputusan menunjukkan bahawa pendidikan muzik adalah satu proses pembelajaran sepanjang hayat, hanya dengan sentiasa melibatkan diri di dalamnya, kreativiti dan kesinambungan dapat direalisasikan.

Kata kunci: Teori Pendorongan, Kreativiti, Kesinambungan

Acknowledgements

I would like to take this opportunity to express my deepest and utmost gratitude to whom, have encouraged, supported, inspired and motivated me during the completion of this study and make this achieved. Researching and writing this thesis has been tremendous grown up in my professional development of my life and it is longitudinal study.

First and foremost, I would like to express my sincere and utmost gratitude to my supervisor Dr Cheong Ku Wing in my learning journey process, with her wisdom and diligence, she is not only helping me with this undertaking, but for also being a source of great inspiration and patient guidance during my travelling studies in Kuala Lumpur. My deepest gratitude to my second supervisor Dr Wang Ita, who assisted in my thesis grammar writing, idea suggestions and shape my proposal draft. I feel extremely fortunate to having valuable and excellent supervision from them, without their superb guidance, my thesis would not have been accomplished. Many thanks to Cikgu Chan Suat Hoon, for her wonderful assistance in translation of Bahasa Malaysia.

Second, my deepest gratitude to my supportive family who are always willing to provide a comfort place during my short stay in Kuala Lumpur. My owing tons of gratitude to my colleges: Lau Yin Ming and Lee Hui Leng, with their understanding and willing replaced classes for me that I can fully concentrate on my research journey.

Third, I am particularly grateful the two-local experienced and eminent piano teachers, who approach with graciously and selflessly shared their valuable stories and resources to make the interviews succeed.

Lastly, I would like to thank to all my friends, my piano teacher and course mates who have encouraged me, accompany me, without all of them, I would not have done this thesis alone. Researching and writing this thesis has been tremendous grown up in my professional development of my life and it is longitudinal study, I am deeply grateful to all of them who made it possible.

Table of Contents

Abstract	iii
Akstrak	iv
Acknowledgements	v
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Background	1
1.2 Statement of Problem	3
1.3 Purpose of the Study	4
1.4 Research Question	4
1.5 Significance of the Study	5
1.6 Delimitations of Study	5
1.7 Definition of Terms	5
1.7.1 Creativity	5
1.7.2 Definition of Sustainability	6
1.7.3 Music Teacher as a Profession	7
1.7.4 Late Life Period	8
1.7.5 Later Career	9
1.8 Conclusion	9
CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW	11
2.1 Introduction	11
2.2 Understanding Creativity and Sustainability	11
2.3 Music Teachers' Perception of Late Life Creativity and Sustainability in Music Teaching	13
2.4 Propulsion Theory	14
2.4.1 Types of accept the current paradigms	16
2.4.2 Types of reject the current paradigms	21
2.4.3 Types of integration of the current paradigms	23
2.5 Sustainability	24
2.5.1 Passion	25
2.5.2 Artistic Vision	25
2.5.3 Create Value	26
2.5.4 Musician Entrepreneur	26
2.5.5 Job Satisfaction	27
2.5.6 Make Meaning/Mission	27
2.6 Conclusion	27
CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY	29
3.1 Overview	29
3.2 Research Method	30
3.2.1 Research Design	31
3.2.2 Theoretical Framework	33

3.3 Data Collection Procedure.....	34
3.3.1 Participants Sampling	36
CHAPTER 4: DATA ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS	44
4.1 Overview	44
4.2 Propulsion Theory of Creative Contributions	47
4.2.1 Replication	47
4.2.2 Redefinition	50
4.2.3 Forward Incrementation.....	53
4.2.4 Advanced Forward Incrementation	56
4.2.5 Redirection.....	58
4.2.6 Reconstruction and Redirection.....	61
4.2.7 Reinitiation.....	63
4.2.8 Integration.....	65
4.2.9 Conclusion	67
4.3 Definition of Sustainability	67
4.3.1 Passion	69
4.3.2 Artistic Vision.....	71
4.3.3 Create Value	72
4.3.4 Musician Entrepreneur.....	73
4.3.5 Job satisfaction.....	75
4.3.6 Make Meaning/Mission	75
4.4 Conclusion.....	76
CHAPTER 5: DICUSSION, IMPLICATION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	78
5.1 Overview	78
5.2 Summary of the Results.....	79
5.3 What is the contribution of creativity of the two experienced piano teachers during their later career music teaching?.....	79
5.3.1 Replication	80
5.3.2 Redefinition	80
5.3.3 Forward Incrementation.....	81
5.3.4 Advanced Forward Incrementation	81
5.3.5 Redirection.....	82
5.3.6 Reconstruction/Redirection	82
5.3.7 Reinitiation.....	83
5.3.8 Synthesis	83
5.4 What are the factors contributing to the sustainability among piano teachers' perception of their later career music teaching?.....	84
5.4.1 Passion	84
5.4.2 Artistic Vision.....	85
5.4.3 Create Value	85
5.4.4 Musician Entrepreneur.....	86
5.4.5 Job Satisfaction.....	86
5.4.6 Make Meaning/Mission	87
5.5 Conclusion.....	87

5.6 Implications of the Study	88
5.7 Recommendation for Future Study	89
5.8 Closing Remarks	90
REFERENCE	92

University of Malaya

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

Becoming a musician and music educator is a career pathway involving a self-motivated life-long learning in developing professional knowledge and practice. It is a process of professional development and educational which stress on “knowledge, energy and dedication” (Elliott, 1995, p. 309). It is a lifelong challenge to provide continuous meaning and purpose to this profession.

The profession of music teaching draws on several fields of knowledge such as social and human science (Danielsen & Johansen 2012), moreover it has great contribution to the well-being of society. Britzman (1985) found that teaching is a gift or intuitive skill that cannot be learned. Teaching path is a long and interesting pathway of career, and is also a calling in which conversation or dialogue between the student and the teacher builds the bridge in both social and intellectual way. Good teachers are also good listeners, potent and yet determined, and as music teachers, they use their profession to teach, to nurture and share their musical knowledge to students and contribute growth and progress to the community and society.

Freire (1970) believes that teacher is the main factor that influences student’s learning. Undoubtedly, dedicated music teachers are more sought-after and are in great demand for their quality musically and pedagogically. Some music teachers embark on the career by chance and some by choice. However, as they move on and progress into their profession for several years, some music teachers feel vague and uncertain about their professional identity and meaning. There are two identities in music teaching, that is, teacher and

musician. Some music teachers are more inclined to the identity as musician and some are more dedicated and committed to the profession of teaching. Nevertheless, both identities are challenging and take on specific significance. Jordhus-Lier (2015) reasoned the challenges in multiple identities in music profession. In her view, both identities require high levels of artistic and teaching competency respectively.

To be competent in music teaching profession, the musicians and music educators who are reflective and dedicated to their profession continuously improve and develop themselves musically and pedagogically. It is essential to achieve professional advancement, job satisfaction and accomplishment through self-growth and self-knowledge. The musicians and music teachers need to acquire these knowledge and expertise to be creative and sustainable in the profession. Sternberg (2003) indicated that creativity is one of the contributing variables in this professional pursuit. Nakamura and Csikszentmihalyi (2003) stated that “every person is potentially creative” (p. 189) where individuals are able to generate “fresh perception, ideas, and experience” (p. 189). Creativity is vital in developing personal and professional values and life.

Many music teachers devoted their life-long career in pursuit of their professional life and values. On becoming an accomplish musician and experience music teachers, what are the process of self-development and personal creativity or “creative contributions” Sternberg (2012) that reflect in the endeavour of sustaining their profession? When it comes to the later-career, what are the relevant attributes in sustaining their passion and commitment in developing their professional skills and create value for their professional life?

The theoretical framework of this study is based on the propulsion theory of creative contributions proposed by Sternberg (1999, 2012). This propulsion model is characterised by eight types of creative contributions which provides the notion that when applied to music career, it can be a navigator to the career directions and decisions; in fulfilling the creative potential and development especially in the later career.

Based on the discussion above, this study aims to investigate the later career creativity among music teachers based on Sternberg's (1999, 2012) notion of propulsion theory. The eight different kinds of creative contributions of the propulsion theory will be discussed in further details in Chapter two of this study.

1.2 Statement of Problem

McPherson and Hallam (2016) described the characteristics of music as a “universal trait of humankind” and the role of music is “as universal as linguistic ability” (p. 433). As music teachers, their contributions to society with their gifted talent are undoubtedly vital. However, in their late-career, it is a challenging task to sustain the passion and creativity. What is the role of creativity in building their sustainable career?

Thus, with the discussion above, this study aims to focus on the creativity and sustainability of the two piano music teachers' on their perceptions in late-career creative contributions and challenges. This study also aims to examine their professional development throughout and the contributing factors to their creativity that sustains their life-long interest and passion for their career.

1.3 Purpose of the Study

The purposes of this study were:

1. To examine the creative contributions of the experienced piano teachers in their later-career in piano teaching.
2. To examine the relationship between creativity and sustainability among experienced piano teachers in their later-career in piano teaching.
3. To examine the contributing factors that: (a) uphold their passion in their teaching; (b) challenge that sustain their creativity; and (c) their professional development in their later-career.

1.4 Research Question

There were 3 research questions that guided this study:

1. What are the creative contributions of the experienced piano teachers in their later-career in piano teaching?
2. What is the relationship between creativity and sustainability among experienced piano teachers in their later-career in piano teaching?
3. What are the contributing factors that (a) uphold their passion in their teaching; (b) challenge that sustain their creativity; and (c) their professional development in their later-career?

A narrative inquiry approach is used for this study as Lyons and LaBoskey (2002) indicated that narrative is a “way of knowing” (p. viii); a “window” into the “meaning” of the life experiences (p. 77).

1.5 Significance of the Study

This study aims to contribute to the understanding of personal characteristics and the creativity contributions in the later-career that encourage professional and personal growth; and the strategies in crafting a sustainable career.

1.6 Delimitations of Study

This research is limited to the investigation of two national and internationally renowned experienced piano teachers whom have above twenty five years of teaching experience. Thus, this study may not be generalised to the novice music teachers.

1.7 Definition of Terms

The following presents the theoretical and operational definition of terms for this study.

1.7.1 Creativity

Sternberg (1999) proposed a propulsion theory of creative contributions and described creativity as “propulsion”, a decision that transports a field of endeavour from one particular point to another point in the creative space (Sternberg, 2003, p. 125-126). According to the investment theory (Sternberg, 2006), there are six components that confluences creativity: (1) intellectual abilities; (2) knowledge; (3) styles of thinking; (4) personality; (5) motivation; and (6) environment (p. 88). In sum, creativity is a drive that encouraged adaptation and innovation which allows one to expand their way of thinking

to achieve their goals and to unleash the potential to explore new endeavours and transform to a new identity.

1.7.2 Definition of Sustainability

The concept of sustainability has diverse meanings and interpretations. The Webster Comprehensive Dictionary (Marckwad, Cassidy & McMillan, 1992) defined sustainability is “to keep”, “to endure”, “to maintain” and “to uphold” (p. 1264).

Gerald Klickstein (2012) quoted Robert Sirota in his blog, *8 Ways to Build Sustainable Music Career* stated that, the “most difficult thing about being a musician these days is not talent” and emphasised that it is “sustainability”. Lang Lang, a great pianist from China stated that “as a pianist and musician, thinking more about music education and development is more important” (Zhang, 2014). Therefore to attain long-term success, sustainability is nevertheless essential. Hence, as an artist or musician, sustainability is to embrace lifelong learning for greater achievement.

In recent years, with the influences and changes in social and cultural contexts and the rapid development in digital technology, the sustainability of music careers are facing more challenges than before.

In sum, sustainability in the later-career possibly refer to Klickstein’s (2012) suggestions concerning sustainability in music career: (1) learn about the music business; (2) acquire professional know-how; (3) develop multiple income streams; (4) build in-demand skills; (5) connect with new audiences; (6) become tech-savvy; (7) lead; and (8) embrace lifelong learning.

1.7.3 Music Teacher as a Profession

Music teaching as a profession is a practice that music teachers facilitate their “professional knowledge and skills of music” (Burnard, 2013, p. 1) in various learning contexts. Additionally, field experience is also vital for establishing the significant identity of the music teachers.

As mentioned by Palmer (2007), “teaching holds a mirror to the soul” (p. 3) that it is through teaching experiences that revealed the perceptions of our teaching ideology. In addition, “we teach who we are” (p. 2), explained that it is important that to know our students is to know our self very well. The questions of “how to be” and how to act as a teacher” (p. 230) which argued by Thomas and Beauchamp (2007) stated that professional identity stands at the core of the profession which provides the construction of teachers’ frameworks.

Danielsen and Johansen (2012) found that the profession of music teaching draws on both social and human science. Compared to music performer, music teacher plays a role that teaching was a conversation or dialogue between student and teacher, an interaction between an individual’s belief and skills. Music teacher had to able to participate and upgrading in their learning process such as performing artist, instruct group in compulsory schools and in the community, arrange and compose music. Music teachers also are the main factor in influencing student’s learning.

In this study, the two piano teachers to be interviewed have multiple identities as performer, researcher and composers, and these identities are recognised through their

music teaching, music performing, musical life and life experience. Danielewicz (2014) views identity construction as a continual process of reformation, addition, reconstruction, dissolution or expansion. Alsup (2006) concurred that identity is a process, in which teachers identities are shaped and reshaped through the discourses in which teachers engage. Furthermore, the influencing factors on identity include personal, social and cognitive response. Regelski (2009) also discussed that music teaching as a profession and a love of music of all kinds, is not only a personal action ideal but also a foundation of moral music education, a dedication to serving students with all kinds of musical needs.

1.7.4 Late Life Period

Late life is a period of profound creativity, where older people express their own unique stories for personal healing or problem solving through some creative ways, for instance, involve themselves into the artistic activities like painting, music making, dancing, and many others fields (Flood & Phillips, 2007).

Creativity is the key element and a core component of a holistic music education. It is essential for music education to continually develop their full repertoire of skills and musical knowledge to achieve self-growth, self-knowledge, self-expression and individual creativity.

Smith and Haack (2000) proposed that as to enhance teachers' effectiveness especially during their later career, it is worthwhile to create a plan to embrace lifelong learning such as keep learning and reading to gain insightful knowledge and skills. They agreed that "revitalisation" is a key for long life learning which will help avoiding burnout and enhance a more meaningful professional and individual live.

1.7.5 Later Career

Career is the unfolding arrangement of an individual's work experience over times. There were varied career paths that a person might went through and it might continue into later career (Johnson, Kawachi & Lewis, 2009). Later career is the stage where is more relaxes and it may play a role of senior statesperson, furthermore it could be the ideal time to start the new career, revive an old one, discovered how to maintain the current work or start another business. However, the literature regarding to later career is comparatively sparse.

Sternberg and Kaufman (2012) stated that later career issues are at least challenging as early-career. In addition, a maturing populace creates challenges for society, organizations and individuals. Nowadays, people are healthier and still able to continue working although after their retirement period, as a result, an increasing need for older people to continue their work is remarkable (Bergmo-Prvulovic, 2017).

Based on the discussion above, this study aims to explore the contribution of the creativity and to observe the sustainability of the two experienced piano teachers during their later teaching career.

1.8 Conclusion

This chapter discussed the background of creativity in the later-career and music teaching as profession. It also discussed succinctly the definitions of creativity and sustainability. It also provided an overview of the study and the purpose of the study focussing on the

perceptions of two piano teachers about their later career creativity and sustainability in their music teaching.

In this study, two experienced piano teachers will be interviewed for their individual narrative. Furthermore, their additional identities besides piano teachers will be discussed in the latter chapters.

University of Malaya

CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Introduction

This chapter provides a discussion of the various relevant studies related to the purpose of this study on two piano teachers' perceptions of late life creativity and sustainability in music teaching. Nevertheless, creativity and sustainability are essential in music learning and teaching. This study considered that later life as period that it occurred after their teaching experiences reached about thirty years. Despite of piano teachers' experienced teaching, they may quit their profession due to stressful condition or facing burnout during their late life career in their music teaching, this may cause them to change their present profession into others domain.

Therefore, this research is to study how they remain their career for over thirty years with gratefulness and enjoyment. Moreover, this chapter is also to review and synthesize literature relevant to study of creativity and sustainability in music teaching. This study use propulsion theory of creative contribution as a theoretical framework based on Sternberg and Kaufman (2012), as to explore such an explanation, and it provides the context of this study.

2.2 Understanding Creativity and Sustainability

The role of creativity is growing significantly in the new worldview of sustainability. Corral-Verdugo, Bonnes, Tapia-Fonllem, Frajio-Sing, Frias-Armentia and Carrus (2009) defined that sustainability seems more thoroughly in human changing and environmental persistent (p. 34). In other words, there is no specific ways to achieve sustainability and it is depending on human creativity. Only few literatures can be found the relationship of sustainability and creativity, especially in the later career for music education. According

to Cheng (2018), sustainability and creativity both are essential for development of humanity. However, these two subjects of research are rarely found.

Runco and Jaeger (2012) have discovered that creativity requires an integration of two components, first is fresh and inventiveness; second is a responsibility of appropriateness, plausibility and effectiveness. Eminently, these two components are characterised within a particular later career challenges (Sternberg & Kaufman, 2012), they defined that most of the creative individuals feel thrilling when they are close to the end of their creative career, whether they set out to accomplish or not accomplish it.

Moreover, there are some approaches to define creativity, Anderson (1992) defined creativity as “nothing more than seeing and acting on new relationships, thereby bringing them to life” (p. 45). Gardner (1995) acclaimed that creativity is the “human ability self-resolution in their domain which is workable and innovative (p. 34). In addition, in Newman-Storen (2014) indicated that creativity is closely related to sustainability that the requirement of affirmation of difference in new production and the exclusive stories linked to everyone and every community’s places, history and narrative.

As observed by Baldaia (2011), while creativity can be enacted from thought to action, or vice versa, action can make it sustainable through long period of time in efficient manner. Importantly, these two elements are defined within a particular later career challenges (Sternberg & Kaufman, 2012), they defined that most of the creativity individuals feel thrilling when they are close to the end of their creative career, whether they set out to accomplish or not accomplish it. As to sustain their domain especially musician, they have to created their own industry based on their interests, genres and instrumental groups (Pratt, 2008).

According to Huckle (1996), he stated that sustainability is one of the way of encouraging such change for education as we no longer have to regulate and control that

we had created the form of nature (p. 4). Therefore, creativity and sustainability in later career in my research, both are related.

2.3 Music Teachers' Perception of Late Life Creativity and Sustainability in Music Teaching

In order to justify this study that specially explores music teachers' perception of their later career, this chapter provides literature references that support the correlation between creativity and sustainability. The most significant job and career satisfaction in later career achievement is with the research demonstrating that job and career satisfaction will generally increase with age, so as to maintain their current job position, increasing their reputation and preparing for their retirement. They also suggested that later career have more positive attitude and realistic expectation towards their job, and most professionals are generally steady and stable in their careers at their late career stage, and it would be characterized by greater stability, security and less enthusiasm in relocation.

In regard to music teachers' perceptions of their later career, it seems sustainability pertains to achieving a sense of wellbeing in their later career. Grange (2013) discovered that the word of 'sustainability' appeared in dictionaries on 1972, is stated that originally it was used in the 18th century for 'German forestry management practices (p.126). Regarding to Thompson (1995, p. 1205), sustainable is something that can be maintained, or the ability of maintenance or endurance.

However, music education is one of the domains of arts; therefore, music education should associate to the student's personal life and educational background (Stuhr, 2003). In addition, an art education supports creativity, interest, and inspiration. Profound commitment in learning shapes the way students' self-understanding and their

understanding of general surrounding (National Association for Music Educational, 2016).

Writing from the perspective of Australia, Petocz, Reid and Bennett (2014) indicated that music is an intangible cultural asset whose sustainability is incorporated into the United Nations' fourth pillar of sustainability; economic growth, social inclusion and environmental balance are the three pillars of sustainable development.

Sternberg and Kaufman (2012) found issue of maintaining creativity and sustainability in later career is as challenging as early-career or more so. As he mentioned that nothing much more exciting than to understand that you are nearly at the end of goal-reaching process, but somehow feel the goal is not completed fully. The perception is shared by few of some creative individuals when they come near the end of their creative profession.

However, everyone has to access the knowledge, skills and information needed to enable them to play a full part in a society in order to improve the quality of life, and this idea of accomplishing goals which is related to longevity/sustainability of ideas. As a result, the research found that creativity and sustainability are closely inter-related.

As Pratt (2008) argues, each creative industry has its own ecology of labour markets and contracting networks, it indicates that a creative class for each musician and group will have established a particular 'market', if their interests, genres and instrumental/vocal domains are managed to be sustained. Nevertheless, music education is a lifelong learning process; the continuing effort changes the society and the culture; it needs to develop new approaches in creativity as to sustaining its pathway.

2.4 Propulsion Theory

Sternberg (1999) proposed that "propulsion theory of creative contribution" (p. 88) focuses on that how creative discoveries and knowledge add into later-career creativity.

It is a hypothesis that focuses how a creative demonstrate and expand into various fields. Therefore, Sternberg and Kauffman (2012) suggested the hypothesis of propulsion theory of creative contributions does not bring to any creative exploration but “provides unexpected options with satisfaction beyond their achievement” (p. 75).

There are eight types of creative contribution: replication, redefinition, forward incrementation, advance forward incrementation, redirection, reconstruction/ redirection, reinitiation and synthesis. These eight types of contributions suggested that a field of endeavour can be made at a given time (Sternberg, 2006). These eight types of creative contributions are divided into three major categories; contributions that accept existing paradigm and try to extend it, all represent achievement within framework; contributions that challenges the existing paradigm and try to replace it; and last contribution integrates different existing paradigm and try to create something new.

The following are eight different types of creative contribution which proposed by (Sternberg, 1999) in brief, he stated that replication is at the ideal place that showed by an endeavour, though keeps proceeding but remaining in place. The second type of contribution is redefinition, it viewed in various ways with its creative works gets back to the initiative place and in a circular motion. Forward incrementation, a third contribution which is a forward motion in the way of slightly pushing forward the domain and also with a slightly change. Advanced forward incrementation is an accelerated forward motion that beyond the expected rate. These are the creative contributions which accept the current paradigm. The declination and replacement of the current ways of doing things and new assumptions are proposed can be found in the last four types of creative contributions. Redirection leads the motion to a new direction from the way it currently moving. Most of the creative contribution types result in forward thinking, whereas reconstruction/ redirection leads in backward and then redirective. An advanced stage from the field it has persisted previously but now into different direction is called

reinitiation, and is the most radical of all the creative contributions. The final creative contribution is synthesis which integrates two or more new ideas from previously.

These eight propulsion theory are suggested to educators who apply to their careers to sustain their intellectual legacy, providing them with satisfaction beyond what they might otherwise achieve (Sternberg & Kaufman, 2012). These eight types propulsion theory then categorised these contribution base on the relationship to the existing domain. We will be discussing these eight types of propulsion theory into two categories: accept current paradigms and decline current paradigm. Moreover, experienced teachers are more critical in their late life career.

2.4.1 Types of accept the current paradigms

These types of creativity of late life career have strong cultures influence in education, and accept the current responsibility and put on them in new ways without changing their profession. In this study I will interview two experienced piano teachers for my study.

2.4.1.1 Replication

Replication is an attempt to demonstrate that they are in the right place and meanwhile the propulsion maintain in that place. It is limiting case of creative contribution that the experience piano teachers' role is to maintain its' stationary motion. Replicative teachers tend to be chosen by a succeed colleges or music organizations, and is likely most successful in terms of teaching demands. Furthermore, a creator will choose this option as he or she tries to replicate his or her profession what they have done previously and he or she may feel more comfortable and that are few number of the reasons they choose this option (Sternberg & Kaufman, 2012).

First, they must accommodate and adapt the new ideas. As Simonton (1999) stated that the creative individuals like music teachers in their later career can only take single

idea or simply go through the specific contention to its end by narrowing down the scope of the work. But the individual may not gain or even not sought. Effectively, he or she has defined the space of possible work narrowly, and he or she has run out of work to do. Second, one may have achievement and successful in the paradigm and find oneself afraid to leave it. It might not be as successful with the beginning of something new.

Third, they may no longer have energy to do something new especially during the late life careers. Therefore, they may make slight adjustment in their later career activities before their retirement or when their status is declined. Fourth, the capabilities of creativity in new ways may have diminished in older age. However, research found that being older does not mean that they have less creativity.

Ng and Feldman (2008) stated that age is not necessarily the contributing factor to less creativity although when one gets older he or she might not be able to execute new concepts as effectively as in the early years. However, the replication theory could have traits of creativity based on the old model, such as the evolution of stringed instrument. Modern luthiers recapture the form and tone of the previous instrument such as Stradivarius and Gagliano, which are unaffordable in price and is of less demand, and yet it departs too much from the earlier models as it has much different of the conventional version of what forms a fine instrument, therefore it is a great challenge to replicate the old luthiers into the modern version.

In addition, Kaufman and Skidmore (2010) defined that replication is to reproduce past work, for instance, the museums organize weekend activity for people to replicate a famous painting, that is absolutely creative and also ambience in the museum is fun during the weekend. As stated by Sternberg, Kaufman and Pretz (2001), creativity is closely in the association between a person and the person's condition.

Therefore replication is to strengthen the present situation of the field, as the nature of the current situation does not require much change to be refined. Therefore, the goal not to move the field forward so much as to establish that where it should be.

2.4.1.2 Redefinition

The second type of contribution is an endeavour to show that the field is in the right place but is view from different angles. The existing field is not to be pushed forward but is interpreted from different perspectives (Kaufman & Skidmore, 2010). Sternberg (2006) indicated that redefiners often taking ideas of others and implement the others ideas because they assumed that this is the best solution for them. For example the aspirin is now used widely for preventing heart attack than its original purpose of pain relief. With its profitable redefinition it becomes the leading product with just simply redefining itself (Sternberg, Kaufman & Pretz, 2003). Many drugs are redefined in a similar way too. Few examples, a writer may write a same kind of articles or books but aimed for the new perspective. An architect may apply similar design but serving with different functions in the new building. Another example, Freud who was founder of psychoanalysis, had found a new definition in his explorations of psychoanalysis on the psychopathology of everyday life (1901) in his later career compared to his early and mid-careers.

Another example of redefinition can be found in the world of art (Sternberg, Kaufman & Pretz, 2001), they stated that the styles of Impressionistic has been reformulated by Paul Cezanne, by using the same type of stroke to paint many different types of objects. He believed that the ideas that the painting was not a window into the world but object in or of itself.

Another media example, Podcast reclassified the configuration of talk shows by facilitating them on the web to be spilled on interest (Baghetto, 2010), they defined that

redefinitions as never approaches employed but not depart much away from the original domain.

Further example of redefinition, a moviemaker George Lucas, he has encountered two phases of redefinition in his profession, for instance, first, he redefined his movie trilogy by telling story how it transform from villain to dark-side, second, he had applied new production technology such as computer-generated imagery.

2.4.1.3 Forward Incrementation

A third contribution which is forward motion, which means the activity evolves in an organic manner with slightly adjustment in its developing process. This process demands less physical energy and does not contradicts the existing paradigms, suitable for the situation when an individual enters into a state of being less creative. Sternberg and Kaufman (2012) noted that this creative contribution is the most acceptable and preferable for most creators, they proceed the previous way they had done, but moving their creative program forward at their comfortable pace. Moreover, forward incrementation tends to be anticipated people need with slightly changed; as a result it tends to be quite successful. For instance, a department of chairman might try to achieve to become a dean (Sternberg & Kaufman, 2012). However they discovered that forward incrementation at the later life of a career is harder to achieve than it expected.

Below are few examples: First, they may run out their creative ideas, therefore they may make forward increment in smaller degree. Second, the researchers in their later career might have concern being judged by a group of evaluation panels, therefore they are hesitated in advancing to the next stage. Third, the investor might be hesitant to give research grant to researchers in their later career because they might have health decline before the research being completed. Fourth, later career educators may have obtained

large numbers of commitment; as a result they may have limited time and energy to proceed forward.

Further examples for forward incrementation others than later career, it also mostly can be found in the products of nowadays market, for instance new modal of car, new breakfast of cereal, it also can occur in the field of arts as well, for instance the minor impressionists arts works elaborate the way of Impressionism which proposed by Monet, Renoir and others (Sternberger, Kaufman & Pretz, 2003).

2.4.1.4 Advanced Forward Incrementation

Advanced forward incrementation is an attempt to accelerate the creative process beyond the expected outcome that “ahead of its time”. It is usually not successfully at the time it is attempted because they are not readily to go in direction at what they expected and less likely during later-career than at earlier or mid-career points.

As Gardner (1995) has pointed out, to convince educators believe in advanced forward incrementation will takes a lot of times as later-career creativity to be more challenging as they may feel time consuming is limited of doing an expansive development in their research study.

The most well-known example is a work that is not recognised at its premiere but is later appreciated or even gets critical acclaim, and finally leaves important historical meanings down the path. In a technology field, self-driving cars are an example of advance forward incrementation, generally it try not to prevail at the time they first presented for the products that are advance forward incrementation, and normally they only introduce the concept.

2.4.2 Types of reject the current paradigms

These types of creativity of later life career that have a strong charismatic (Mumford & Strange, 2002), and also is a transformational in character. These types of creativity reject the current ways and proposed new paradigms, and by their nature it is a type of crowd-defying creativity (Sternberg, nd).

2.4.2.1 Redirection

Redirection leads the motion to a new direction from the way it currently moving, and most of the creative contribution types involves forward thinking, in redirection, they try to look for alternative that they did previously, and it is applicable for later career educators. Sternberg and Kaufman (2012) found that redirection tends to defy the crowd especially in later career.

The most common move during later-career is to go into administration or maneuver into careers where they are equipped with the fundamental knowledge and skills. For instance teachers who are in the situation of burned out may go for the research study, and dancers may become instructors, or the composers may try to compose different style of works that they had done before. Others examples such as the product of binary computer in comparison with electronic devices which it produced in a new way but all was done before.

In the dimension of redirective, teachers may go contradict with their original goal due to the lack of luck. Therefore, according to Sternberg and Vroom (2002), they redirect their later career undertaking to match their working condition to succeed. Madsen and Hancock (2002) proposed that it is critical for music teachers to do other professions by having a “career ladder” as to provide stimulus development (p. 14).

2.4.2.2 Reconstruction/Redirection

In reconstruction/redirection, the educators return to their prior purpose of their field, and from there they attempt to reconstruct from that early point, and now with different direction from the previous point onward. Researchers may feel they had made a misstep during their research and try to redirect from the misstep they had made from the earlier point (Sternberg & Kaufman, 2012).

Furthermore, they also found that artists may maintain their own style which did not work for them for instance, an artist switched from watercolours to oils, but later realised watercolours was his/her natural medium, and hence restart and return to find a new style of painting which he/she may love the appropriate medium.

Another example of common products: selling modern version of old nostalgia product and the most prestigious with mechanical movement such as Rolex watches are now slowly substitute with battery-power (Sternberg, Kaufman & Pretz, 2003). According to Kaufman and Beghetto (2009), the contemporary 'reset' or 'remake' of the past movies serves the example of reconstruction/redirection contributions.

2.4.2.3 Reinitiation

A new starting point with distinctive direction from the field that has previously pursued is called reinitiation, and is the most radical of all the creative contributions. In these reinitiations, the creators decide to try something new that is entirely different from the previous career, they may start with new career after their retirement.

Some examples of notable person in their later career of reinitiation (Sternberg & Kaufman, 2012), like Bill Gate a famous entrepreneur may decide to involve in the charity work, John Holt, an education writer, who committed playing cello in an ensemble during his later years, few theatre professionals who have earned their doctorate degree but still currently doing research.

It also can be found in the products that can be viewed as forms of reinitiation (Sternberg, Kaufman & Pretz, 2003), for instance, can be seen in a various types of products as forms of re-initiation, such as electronic devices in comparison with manually hand washboard, vehicles in correlation with first airplane. Therefore reinitiation is totally using different way drastically; begin their work from what it came before (Kaufman & Baghetto, 2009).

2.4.3 Types of integration of the current paradigms

Integrating of the best elements from at least two different strand of creative endeavour which it previously obtain, in order to make it the best of all worlds (Sternberg, Kaufman, & Pretz, 2003).

2.4.3.1 Synthesis

The final creative contribution is synthesis which integrates two or more ideas or strength from the previously, whether they are related, opposed or unrelated. In later career, it may happens that previously separated interest may integrate the new and the old, as a result they may engaged in career synthesis, in addition to the intellectual challenge, they may reach out with enjoyment unexpectedly (Sternberg & Kaufman, 2012).

Therefore, synthesis represents neither accept nor reject of existing field but rather integrate of both (Sternberg, Kaufman & Pretz, 2003). Sternberg (2006) discovered that this creative contribution that it looks for two different fields and merge it in order to create something new, for example of synthesis products are: the development of smart phones, it was an integration of cell phone and portable computing device; the combination features of seaplanes and boats; e-book which it displays the printed book through software.

2.5 Sustainability

Sustainability implies that something can proceed for the time being, the word, “sustainability” derived from the Latin word ‘sustenare’, literally interpreted as to “endure”, to “support” and to “sustain”. Nowadays, it has expanded to research sources in an ecological sense.

Therefore, the used of the ‘sustainable development’ concept by World Commission on Environment on Environment and Development (WCED) launched in the Bruntland Report in 1987, this concept has been strongly associated with the environmental education, moral education, and during the last decades, it has been a central factor of art education (Bamford, 2006). As a result, the word “sustainability” has been used in wide variety context and situation.

Sustainability of education is challenging the educators to be more intelligence and also their thinking and learning with wider insightful conception (Cassell & Nelson, 2010). According to Edward (2005), he identified that sustainability embraces a complexity and the connection between society, people and the environment. Sobel (2004) indicated that sustainability is teaching and learning occurs not only in the classroom or school but also in informal and public context.

From the previous research study, Barbier, Pruneau and Langis (2009) discovered that there is very limited research in related to teaching and learning with environment sustainability, most of them focused on student creative arts. Furthermore, fostering creativity in environmental sustainability is not a main factor in education especially in music field. Iannarone (2008) suggested that educators should develop creativity and intelligence in both in theory and in practice as to work for sustainability. However, as to sustain ‘happy’ music educators, Bowles (2002) emphasized that self-selected experience and vital nature of lifelong learning are the main factors.

In this study, the discussion of sustainability is regarding to later career of two experienced piano teachers who has been teaching for over twenty five years. As stated by Drucker (1999), most workers were not accomplished their career in their middle age, this is due their burnout situation of their career, that may leads them to 'second career'. As a result, this study explored factors that might influence their creativity as to uphold their passion in their later career as to sustain their career.

In this chapter, there are six key-words were identified in reference to sustainability to later career in music teaching: passion, artistic vision, create value, musician entrepreneur, job satisfaction and make meaning/mission.

2.5.1 Passion

Passion can be defined that a strong feeling of enthusiasm, desire or love for someone or something, everyone can possess passion for his/her job. Nevertheless, there is a query that when come to their later career, will their passion still sustain?

In this study the interviews will reveal the passion in the participants' later career, it will realize that passion will contribute to a person be more motivated, more determined and most importantly is an enjoyment as to sustain their later career. Wangberg (1996) stated that passionate teachers can create passionate learners. Fried (2001) defines that as a passionate teacher, they showed their passion with their knowledge and skill they had possessed, they try to attract young people come into class regularly.

2.5.2 Artistic Vision

Klickstein (2010) defined that 'artistic vision, it can motivate us to create with its big picture surrounding us. He further defined that 'as to become an accomplished musician, we have to create beyond the personal satisfaction'. Creativity can be a way to carry out

the artistic vision for instance: expanding the capacities of materials or formulating a new technique. Cotterill (2012) indicated that as to express the vision the artist has to create their own enlightenment and to make sense of life with their power.

2.5.3 Create Value

Nart (2017) defined value from the sociological viewpoint and also putting into action of value education with mutual beneficial from everything among person or group. Furthermore, Nart (2017) stated that music is a language reflects the culture of the society and also a vital element in people lives, furthermore through music it can develop children personality, and yet, music is broadening our horizons, both in cultural and socially.

2.5.4 Musician Entrepreneur

Music entrepreneur is a process of transforming passion into profession (Weibe, 2017). Furthermore, he stated that music entrepreneur is an integration of creativity, leadership, artistic vision, technical skill and sense of business. He further explained that musicians not necessary to be entrepreneur but can help in a way of develop the sense of business making. His definition for music entrepreneur in three aspects: (1) they are self-driven and can be motivated internally; (2) their mind-sets of learning and growth for challenging; (3) their business sense of understating operating their own business. Barker (2017) argued that entrepreneur is an action to explore, to discover, present music in sustainable and innovative ways.

2.5.5 Job Satisfaction

Job satisfaction has a significant effect in creativity, productivity, achievement and happiness of individual's achievement and it can work with more motivation and integration (Kilic & Yazici, 2012). Brief and Roberson (2006) defined that job satisfaction is an individual attitude characterized the positive assessment towards their work. For the later career educators, the more their satisfaction of their works the more effective instruction they will provide, and it relates both in their teaching behaviour and students' achievement. Thus, we can understand that the disengagement of later career teachers is closely related to their job satisfaction (Kiliç & Yazici, 2012). As result, as to sustain, especially approach to end of teachers' career, job satisfaction is main factor which affect the sustainable career.

2.5.6 Make Meaning/Mission

An author and psychologist Eric Maisel (Klickstein, 2009, p. 325) discovered three types of meaning that people experience in life: (1) received meaning, (2) sought meaning, (3) create meaning. Furthermore he indicated that meaning is a daily practice and also is the process how people understand, making sense of life events, relationship and the self. When you make meaning in music, you can pursue it and explore it. Created meaning is everything you practice even that is the most ordinary of material. The more in depth you gain during your practice the more meaning you will make.

2.6 Conclusion

In summary, creativity among music educator is a lifelong learning process especially for teacher who has been teaching in the field for over thirty years, with its continuing

reflective effort based on the social and cultural context, creativity is vital as to sustain the career path. In this view creativity and sustainability is closely related.

The above literature review also implies that creativity and sustainability in piano teachers' later career is scarce, thus I used propulsion theory of creative contributions the theoretical framework as the current study. The propulsion theory was originally proposed by Sternberg (1999), later further develop through collaboration with Kaufman and Pretz (2001). The propulsion theory of creative contributions is a theory that tries to portray the different ways of how the creative contributions can be achieved in various fields. Therefore, this study applied the propulsion theory of creative contributions to discover two piano teachers in their later career, not only their interest and passion but also their decision about future directions as to sustain their career.

University of Malaya

CHAPTER 3

METHODOLOGY

3.1 Overview

The purpose of this study was to examine how music teacher uphold their passion on their late life teaching career and meanwhile sustain their creativity, furthermore to find out the development and retention of their teaching career. Researchers are often conducted with the intention of gaining more knowledge. There are therefore, of considerable value to the education context as a whole. The objective of this study is to discover the late life career of two piano teachers, result indicated that being piano teachers in their late life career, creativity and sustainability has great influenced for each other as to uphold their passion in music teaching, evidence prove that the more creativity they possess the longer they can sustain in their teaching domain.

Henceforth, this chapter focuses on the research design in qualitative narrative inquiry case study which includes two experienced piano teachers. This chapter intends to provide a succinct description of the research methodology to address the research question. The outline of this chapter will be organised as follows: (1) research design; (2) instrumentation; (3) data collection procedures and (4) data analysis procedures. It begins with the research design, establishes the theoretical framework for the study and relates it to the design of the study.

The study discusses the methods used to examine and address the following research questions:

1. To explore the contribution creativity of experienced piano teachers during their later career in piano teaching.
2. To discover the sustainability of piano teachers' late life career.
3. To find out the relationships between creativity and sustainability of piano teachers during their later career in music teaching.

The following qualitative narrative inquiry determines the perceptions held by two experienced piano teachers who are in their late life career. Two experienced piano teachers were chosen as mentioned by Bell (2002) that any research method has its limitation, as some are unsuitable for large number of participants due to its time commitment.

The interviews are used for the purpose of data collection. The data collection involves two sets of data: scores on teacher personal teaching perception on their late life (1) creativity; and (2) sustainability.

The data for this study was derived from the interview which consisted of two experienced piano teacher characteristic in the aspect of sustainability and creativity in their late life career, through the conversations during the interviews in the research, we can reveal the importance of the progress on how they develop as an established piano teacher. The theoretical framework that has been constructed through the review literature will be tested through interviews.

The interview contents are based on propulsion theory of creative contribution framework (Sternberg, 1999): (1) sustainability and (2) creativity of the two experienced piano teachers' perceptions in their late life music teaching career.

3.2 Research Method

A research method is a methodology used for implement the plan of the study in order to create a better understanding of the topic. There are different types of research methods and in this study; a qualitative narrative inquiry was used to approach in this study. The following presents the research methods for the study. The sections are organized as follows: (1) Interview; (2) Transcription; (3) coding; (4) categorizing theme.

3.2.1 Research Design

Creswell (2014) stated that a research design will go through the procedures of inquiry within quantitative, qualitative and mixed approaches that gives an explicit direction of the research (p. 41). It is for conducting the study so that the greatest control will be practiced over the elements as to obtain an intended outcome and information with genuine situation. Hence, the research design is the whole plan for the researchers to acquire their research questions as a study guiding.

This study will be conducted using qualitative research methods to draw insights in the latter career creativity and sustainability of two eminent Malaysian pianists and music educators' experiences and stories through narrative inquiry (Connelly & Clandinin, 1990). As stated by Connelly and Clandinin (1990), narrative inquiry is a "form of narrative experience" and 'experience happens narratively" (p. 19). Therefore, this study proposed to study the participants' lived experiences narratively, it also allows participants to focus on their personal perspectives and professional development in depth on what are the meaningful and significant moments that contributed vitally to their music career.

Clandinin, Pushor and Orr (2007) indicted that narrative inquiry is a methodology that most of the time the teachers and educators apply in their research as to explore the complexities of narrative inquiry, and yet still developing in this field. Narrative inquiry is mostly conducted in two ways which are stories telling: beginning with living stories and the interviewing and conversation between researchers and participants are through their living experiences. The conversation must be transparent in order to share the similar experience and knowledge.

Here I will share two narrative research works by Garces-Bascal (2016), firstly, about a Filipino musician, Noel Cabangon was recognised as protest singer and highly-esteem musician, to whom he was chosen as the artist-collaborator by using narrative

inquiry research, and the flow state among the creative artist which has written extensively by Csikszentmihalyi (1997), 'as close to a natural conversation as possible' (p. 16), as to get genuine and reflective answers and leads to a rich and comprehensive interview transcript, he also discovered that young artists can be nurtured by insightful narrative from eminent creative adults, and furthermore and open-ended questions were given to Noel's responses and themes regarding to his musical experiences and pathways to his musical development, family background and early childhood experiences were generated. Glasier's emergent theory approach were using in the qualitative framework.

The data collections were divided into two phases. The first phase was sending the interview transcript for validation. The second phase was sharing the themes. Through the narrative inquiry research, it explores how flow can be reflected the realities of an eminent singer/ songwriter in Philippine. Through living, telling and re-telling their stories, personal development and social conditions which a narrative view extended over time. The following example of narrative inquiry excerpt is from Murray Orr (2005), a teacher who wrote her own experiences in schools and classrooms, story about a child, Calvin who seemed to be positioned difficulty in discipline and perhaps resisted instruction. This narrative view indicated that as a teacher educator, Murray Orr's can sees that the importance of awakening teachers to children's composing of their story to live by in school.

From the two examples as above, narrative inquiry was used in this study aims to provide comprehensive insight of two experience piano teachers of their professional development during their later career, regarding to their contributions in music field, impact their valuable experiences within their professional, through their stories telling, that their professional development experiences are reflective, and provide more in-depth understanding of their creativity and sustainability of their later career. Furthermore, in

narrative inquiry research method, it focuses upon a small number amount of participants rather than larger amount populations (Creswell, 2014).

In sum, it is interconnection between participants and researchers (Connelly & Clandinin, 1990), especially communicate verbally, a qualitative method is appropriate in this study as to explore in depth of tow piano teachers' perceptions of their creativity and sustainability of their later career.

3.2.2 Theoretical Framework

Grant and Osanloo (2014) indicated that theoretical framework provides the thesis structure as a guideline and blueprint for the researchers. It also provides a worldview that to investigate the data analysis and problem statement. It is a framework dependent on a current hypothesis that reflects the study inquiry. It is an analytical tool with several variables with interrelated concepts collections, which enables gives direction to the researchers with adaptation of the research modal. Furthermore it will help us to understand with using the fully comprehensive ideas more clearly and yet it makes the research finding meaningful and generalisation, meanwhile it will control and predict the situation during the research process. The system of assumptions, expectations, theories, concepts and beliefs is a key part of the research design (Miles, Huberman & Saldana 2013). According to Adom, Hussein and Agyem (2018), a thorough understanding of the reason, significance and research questions of the study are the least requirements that the theoretical framework is chosen.

This study is formulated with regards based on Sternberg's Propulsion Theory to investigate the later-career creativity and sustainability of two experienced piano teachers. The data collection methodology is in narrative inquiry method and data analysis is in emergent method. The data for this study will be derived from the interview

which consisted of two experienced piano teachers' perception of late life creativity and sustainability.

3.3 Data Collection Procedure

The narrative inquiry methodology is applied in this research. As stated by Glesne (2011), in qualitative research, data was analysed as it was collected. Data will be collected through in-depth interviews to generate a rich and robust description of participants' experiences and perspectives of their later career creativity and sustainability. Glesne (2011) defined that "As the process of getting words to fly" (p. 102) which the interview may be thought. The data collection process involves the interview which "the conversation as genuine as possible" (p. 16), this interview process was found in Csikszentmihalyi's (1997) description. Furthermore genuine and reflective conversations, rich and comprehensive interviews transcript are expected to gain (p. 16).

However interviewing is not simple in the sake of making appointment, setting the questions which relate to the research standpoint and with its connotations. Nonetheless, 'interviewing is a way to understand in-depth of individual human's live experience that they had made' (Seidman 2006, p. 9).

There are three types of designed interview in the qualitative research: structured interview, semi-structured interviews and unstructured interviews or conversational interviews (DiCicco-Bloom & Crabtree, 2006). Structured interviews are which the researcher prepared the interview questions and the participants were responded the questions accordingly throughout the interview. Semi-structured interviews are more relax and flexible, which the prepared questions may change or add on regarding the flow of the interview. Unstructured or conversational interviews happen when the researcher creates the questions only when the interview take place and it is more like a conversation.

In this study, structured interviews were used regarding to propulsion theory conception. The following are the interview questions are guideline for participants during my interviews:

1. Years of teaching.
2. Went abroad/ doing research, what have they pursued.
3. Identities they had obtained as: teacher, performer, composer and researcher.
4. How their study years punctuated in their careers have changed and redefine their meaning of teaching.
5. What are their views, opinion and meaning of teaching during their almost twenty five years life of teaching?
6. In what way they replicate their teaching, may be their belief, their values.
7. When they are moving but replicating, what are they doing (When? Why?). What makes them be stationary for a while?
8. What was their replication each time at the replication mode? How do they be inspired to look at what they have been doing in different views?
9. What are their reflections on making their teaching routine, such as students' exam and competition, in a different perspective?
10. As a teacher, what are their reflections that from a young teacher to today maestro/ researcher? What are the values that have maintained throughout? What are the values have been enhanced through the years from experience, education and exposure.
11. Share about how much they have moved forward from their early years of teaching till today? What contributes to this forward motion?
12. Sharing their achievements that beyond their expectation. What, who and how have contributed to this achievements.

13. What are their new definitions about teaching? Have they defined their purposes of teaching throughout the years?
14. Are they in the process of redirecting their teaching career? Redirecting their teaching and identity of a music teacher to a social entrepreneur in which they use teaching as a tool to provide resources for them to propel into another identity? For example: social entrepreneur, or their charity projects.
15. Other than teaching music to students, they also transcend humanity value to their students, where students see how they can use their talent to help others in the change of social mobility.
16. Teaching was their focus in their early years, what are their priorities now? How they actually reinitiate their teaching/ performance/ researching/ into different direction?
17. What about as a composer/researcher? Please share their journey as a composer/researcher? What is the meaning and value of composition/research today?
18. What has contributed for them to do their jobs for such a long time, a lifelong journey of learning and giving? What is the drive force and motivation?
19. Is there any significant person or encounter spark you into redefine, redirect or reinitiate their direction in their career?
20. How they have integrated their teaching, performing, composing, research works into their creative contributions today? What was their inspiration that sustain them in their profession for such a long time? What were their reflections of these in different points or turning points in their later career?

3.3.1 Participants Sampling

A sampling is a group of people or representative of group who are selected as investigation in the process of doing the research project. Therefore it also referred and called as ‘participants’ (McLeod, 2014). In this study, there are two individuals who were

identified and acknowledged as eminent and music educators in the field of piano pedagogy in Klang Valley. Their significant combination identities are valuable for more insightful research.

3.3.1.1 Purposive Sampling

deMarrias and Lapan (2004) stated that purposive sampling is the most purposeful choice of insightful information that intended for program assessment endeavor (p. 242). Hence, sampling is part of evaluation plan and is essential for research project. As observed by Walliman (2001), careful choosing sample as to obtain a confident research finding is significant. However, time limitation, expenses, accessibility and desirability are the factors to be taken as consideration that may cause covering the entire population is impossible (Banerjee & Chaudhury, 2010).

Sanchez-Jankowski (2002) discovered that researchers can employ a possible sampling strategy during the procedure of participants' selection. In this study, purposive sampling is chosen for the sampling purpose. Purposive sampling is a process in which the elements are chosen for specific purpose with different approaches and the techniques may be used in qualitative descriptive studies. The researcher will gather and observe the information, and the findings from the sample are generalized or may be extended.

As stated by Crossman (2018), purposive sampling is a non-probability sampling and it is depending on the attributes of the participants and the objective of the research. Furthermore he stated that it is workable when you need to achieve the targeted sample test in a short time and the proportionate sampling is not a main concerned. In this study, the sample consisted of two experienced piano teachers, who are established and intellectual teachers, to whom have been teaching more than twenty five years.

3.3.1.2 Definition of Narrative Interview

Narrative inquiry is a relatively new qualitative methodology in the study of experience and also a ubiquitous practice, and as a methodology, it implies phenomenon perspective and is a process of series of life experience, it allows researchers to understand experience, in addition it allows researchers to present experience in its complexity, illuminate and richness (Webster & Mertova, 2007), and it emphasized on teachers' lives and experience (Elbaz Luwisch, 2007). As stated by Connelly and Clandinin (1990), is a story-telling that approach to teachers' education development, they further stated that it is in an approach to conceive, learning, studying and experience through collaboration between researcher and participants, over time, in a place or series of places, and in social interaction with milieus.

Phillion (2002) have stated that narrative inquiries almost always are about people's lives, their experiences, interests, concern, passion and relationship development, this methodology is to explore more deeply of the participants' life experiences, their entire life stories and perspective in their working region. The conversation must be transparent and transform it into story and to be shared to others with the similar experience and particulars, furthermore researchers will get at information that participants may not consciously know about themselves.

Narrative inquiry also allows participants to focus on their personal perspectives on what are the meaningful and significant moments that contributed vitally to their music career. There are three commonplaces of narrative inquiry serve as theoretical framework; temporality, sociality, and place (Clandinin & Huber, 2010)

As stated by (Elliot, 2006), temporality defined as key feature of narrative which it is development of events in a sequence (p. 7). Carr (1986) indicated that we are making our life history as we go along, which the narrative inquirers need to attend the temporality of their places, things and events under their study.

Sociality is based on attend to the of conditions both to personal and social which people experience like emotions, trust, hopes, environment, culture institutional (Clandinin & Huber, 2010). About Place, Connelly and Clandinin (1990) stated that the impact of every single place on the experience that the inquirer has to take a consideration.

Narrative inquiry is mostly conducted in two ways which are stories telling: beginning with living stories and the interviewing and conversation between researchers and participants are through their living experiences. The conversation must be transparent in order to share the similar experience and knowledge.

The following present a summary of a recent narrative research study conducted by Garces-Bacsal (2016) about a Filipino musician, Noel Cabangon who was perceived as dissent protest singer and exceptionally honoured musician, to whom he was selected as the artist colleague by employing narrative inquiry study and the flow state among the creative artist which he has composed broadly by Csikszentmihalyi (1997). He further stated that through conversations as to get genuine and reflective answers and leads to a substance and comprehensive interview transcript, he also discovered that young artists can be nurtured by insightful narrative from eminent creative adults, and furthermore, open-ended questions were given to Noel's responses and themes regarding to his musical experiences and pathways were generate regarding to his musical development, family background and early childhood experiences. Through the narrative inquiry research, it explores how flow can be reflected the realities of an eminent singer/ songwriter in Philippine.

Clandinin, Pushor and Orr (2007) suggested that through living, telling and re-telling their stories, personal development and social conditions which a narrative view extended over time. The following presents an example of narrative inquiry excerpt by Murray Orr 2005(in Clandinin, Pushor and Orr 2007's navigating sites for narrative inquiry) on a teacher who wrote her own experiences in schools and classrooms, story

about a child, Calvin who seemed to be positioned difficulty in discipline and perhaps resisted instruction. This narrative view indicated that as a teacher educator, Orr and Pushor can see that the significance of stimulation teachers to children's composing of their story.

According to Beattie (2000), narrative inquiry serves as a valuable argument for educators as to understand more on participants' life experiences, especially those educators, as to reflect on their perspective of their process of creating a professional knowledge, and also provide insights into their individual's theories, hopes, passions, belief and values.

Therefore, narrative inquiry is acceptable for this study as they also explained that narratives also bring the words and stories of the participants alive. Stories also help us understand ourselves and widen our horizon to others through life experience. "Experience happens narratively, and is a form of narrative experience. Therefore, the study of educational experience increasingly applied in the research (Connelly & Clandinnin, 1990), they defined that narrative inquiry is a way of understanding experience, is stories lived and told and also associated between researchers and participants over time.

Although narrative inquiry is a newly qualitative methodology, undoubtedly any research method has its limitations and advantages. Below are some definitions of limitations and advantages:

Limitation

Through the literature review, few limitations were identified and listed below.

1. A large number of participants may not a suitable as it is time consuming.
2. Close collaboration within participants and researcher is essential.

3. Take note to the ethical issues, respectful manner should be explored by the voices of research participants.
4. Limitations may be imposed by the constraints of the culture, sensitivities of the discussions, scheduling and the operational context of the study.

Advantages

Through the literature review, few advantages were identified and listed below.

1. Narratives of teaching will allow new ways to understand the experience.
2. Communication through story is less linguistically demanding.
3. It can enhance the understanding of language use.
4. Feature in learning autobiographies, diary studies, life stories and case study.

As a new research method as mentioned above, narrative inquiry is convincing but also has its pitfalls. In this study, the interviews will be conducted in a way similar to Csikszentmihalyi's (1997) description of his interview process which was the interview taken naturally with genuine, transparent and reflective response. It may begin with story-telling in various ways.

It will be conducted into three-series interviews (Siedman, 2006): (1) life history which beginning with story-telling in various ways by participants, such as by responding to more or less structured or semi-structured interview questions and also engaging in conversation or discussion; (2) details of experience, it is to encourage them with reproduce their present life experience; (3) reflection on meaning, it is to enable to encourage them to reflect the meaning of their experience (p. 17).

The pathways of interview will go through from talent development, learning and teaching path from early childhood, family background and thus experiences will be generated, and it will go through several separate interview sessions.

The data were coded using Glaser's (2002) emergent theory approach and this systematic approach in the qualitative framework, it will be coding into two phases. Through the conversations in the research, we can reveal the importance of the progress of how the interviewees develop as an artist, continually evolving challenges, their creativities and sustainability.

The findings from this research study were intended to provide a prominent awareness and understanding of peak experiences of the late life creativity and sustainability of the two experienced piano teachers. I used narrative inquiry as window to investigate that through their stories telling, what are their contributions for their later career for such a long time and their reflections of self-evolved in their teaching career.

3.3.1.3 Data Analysis Procedure

Data collected will be transcribed and analyse through a coding system to identify important and significant themes, these themes appears as major finding of the research and provide the perspective from participants (Creswell, 2014). The relationship between the emerged themes will further analysed to generate a theory. The development of theory from qualitative data enables researchers' to have an insight into the reality of experiment complexities and better understanding of organizations (Alvesson & Karreman, 2011). Data analysis is the process of organizing and storing data, analysing the information that had collected in a view of complexity judgement. The interviews conversations were audio recorded and transcribed by researchers into three forms: transcription, restatement and summary, the researcher's own reflections and impressions were also noted down,

although was audio-recorded, but taking notes made the subject more responsible, so that the interviewer formulates the clarification based on the notes taken.

The pathways of interview will propose several times, it will go through from the early childhood, talent development, family background experiences of the experienced piano teachers' perception of their later career creativity and sustainability of their piano teaching were generated, and the research will be valid and reliable. Through the conversations in the research, we can reveal the importance of the progress of how the interviewees develop as an artist, continually evolving challenges, their creativities and sustainability.

The narrative interview's data collection will goes through several sessions. Before the analysis was regulated in the first session, the validation of interview transcript will be sent. The next session comprised sharing the result of open coding and emergent themes. After the intensive investigation of coding and themes, an extensive discussion and changes were made. The multiple effectiveness interviews were operated to the later career experienced teachers with prior arrangement.

CHAPTER 4

DATA ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS

4.1 Overview

This chapter presents the analysis of the qualitative data from the narrative interviews and findings of the study to address the research questions of this study. The following are the research questions that guided this study:

1. What is the contribution of creativity to the experienced piano teachers during their later career music teaching?
2. What are the factors contributing to the sustainability among piano teachers' later career?
3. What are the relationship between creativity and sustainability of piano teachers during their later career music teaching?

This study employed narrative inquiry, a qualitative interview to study the life stories and to understand the experiences of the participants narratively. The narrative interview aims to understand human life's experiences in-depth; about the participants' contribution to culture and value; their relationships and interaction with family, society and themselves; and to explore participants' insights into human life experiences, from joy through grief (Arksey & Knight, 1999).

Hollway and Jefferson (2000) indicated that stories telling not just providing the transparent account but also elicit information from the interviewees. The production of collecting data from interviewees' individual's lives experiences and perception, the role of the interviewer should be taken seriously as to explore the meaning of the research topic for the respondents (Holstein & Gubrium, 1997). Linde (1993) maintained that

narrative interview has greater confidence in the validity of the research study as it is a real life interaction with the participants with thoughtful attention to details (pp. 59-60).

Elliot (2006) has investigated the inquiries of why researchers may interested in people's life stories and also to demonstrate how storied records of people's encounter can be inspired and yet it produced spontaneously (p. 33). Furthermore, it enables participants to give stories of their live and experiences to control the differentials as to provide better evidence of their daily lives.

This study aims to elucidate the understanding of the later career creativity and sustainability in the context of two individuals who were identified and acknowledged as eminent musicians and music educators in the field of piano pedagogy in Klang Valley. The selection of the participants was based on their attributes in providing insights in their professional experiences.

The inquiry intends to acquire knowledge of their journey as musicians and music educators; and to use their stories and experiences to approach and explain the Propulsion Theory of Creative Contributions in the later career (Sternberg & Kaufman, 2012).

The interview sessions were carried out once with each participant, and the duration of each interview was 123 minutes for Participant 1 and 198 minutes for Participant 2. In the previous studies, Garces-Bacsal (2016) conducted a narrative study of flow experience with a Filipina songwriter, the narrative interviews were 9 hours 45 minutes over 10 interview sessions. However, Elliott (2006) indicated that 1 session of narrative inquiry is not satisfactory but is possible, furthermore he suggested that a narrative inquiry interview is ideal to be more than 2 hours; and to follow up with 1 or 2 more subsequent interviews (Elliott, 2005, p. 32).

Siedman (2006) stated that it is important to plan and decide an appropriate duration at the beginning of an interview (p. 20). Besides, he also indicated that

unexpected inconvenience for the participants may conduct two to three interviews during the same afternoon with reasonable result (p. 22).

Due to the time availability of the participants, the narrative interview for this study was conducted in just one meeting modelled on Siedman's (2006) three separate interview sub-sessions. Each interview sub-sessions focus on different context includes: (1) life history, (2) details of experience, (3) reflection on the meaning as suggested by Sideman (2006).

Siedman (2006) further explained that interview provides the meaning of participants' life experiences; however, it may be an insufficient pathway of inquiry (p. 26). He further elaborated that interview as a method for inquiry; it is the most reliable with people's ability to make meaning through language because it shows the significant of the interviewee without criticising the likelihood of community (p. 14).

Siedman (2006) provided a succinct description of each interview session. He indicated that, the first interview is to focus on the participant's early life experience from the family background to working experience. The second interview emphasised on the participants' present lived experienced and the third interview is to encourage participants' reflection on the meaning of their experiences.

This study focus on the narrative interview based on the framework of eight types of creative contribution, which proposed by Sternberg (1999) and later expanded with Kaufman and Pretz (2002), that is: (1) replication; (2) redefinition; (3) forward incrementation; (4) advanced forward incrementation; (5) redirect; (6) reconstruct; (7) reinitiation; and (8) integrate.

The interviews were audio recorded and it is considered good practice in all qualitative interviewing and also enables the interviewer to pay full attention to the interviewee (Elliot, 2006; Hermanowicz, 2002). The interviews conclude with enquiry on the factors that maintain the participants' sustainability in their profession. The findings

revealed that passion; creativity and sustainability in their field, and also wide range of their teaching skills, musical knowledge and attributes, in additionally, their dedication to the social works enhance their sustainability and creativity in their teaching milestone.

4.2 Propulsion Theory of Creative Contributions

Music teachers have also been associated with multiple musical identities such as professional identities as a musician and educator (Hargreaves, Purves, Welch & Marshall, 2007). The participants in this study too, established their professional identities when they commenced on their music career.

In the onset of the interview, when asked about their professional identities, both participants concurred that they are both musician and music educators. Participant 1, as an accomplished pianist identifies herself as ‘born’ to teach, and teaching is her calling. Participant 2, an established and eminent pianist too emphasised his profession as an educator, nurturing young musicians.

The following presents the analysis of the interview data obtained from the narrative inquiry accordingly based on the Propulsion Theory of Creativity Contributions (Sternberg & Kaufman, 2012).

4.2.1 Replication

Replication is an effort to ‘keep’ and ‘maintain’ what is in the field and not moving it (Sternberg, Kaufman & Pretz, 2003). In the creative contribution, Sternberg and Kaufman (2012) indicated that replication is a type of creativities characterised and represented by dynamic moving but in stationary motion. It is a challenge and endeavours to display the suitability of the field with an effort to maintain the quality of the professional field.

Replication is the least creative where music teachers are just repeating their mundane teaching task with no intention and effort for professional development.

However the repeating teaching routine may sometimes bring a surprise that encourages and motivates teachers. It is very important as ‘teaching is a long journey path of learning’, and failures may spark inspiration for seeking out a new teaching method in search of better improvement.

In the beginning of the interview, the participants indicated their long experience in music profession. Participant 1 had engaged in music profession for more than thirty years; and the ‘repetition’ in a teaching routine is bliss for her. This repetitive dynamic is motivational:

I love teaching...it may be repetitive, but it’s a challenge to have repetition with different challenges and making new meanings.

Participant 1 narrated her previous experience, recalled her earlier years in her music studies with a study abroad scholarship. She emphasised that although she attained outstanding results in other academic subjects but music is her optimal choice:

During my grade six practical exam, the examiner was so impressed of my playing, and I almost scored full marks in the exam. After seven years later, she asked my Dutch teacher to meet her at British council after his concert in KL. He can still remember my excellent playing, during the meet-up he offered me to study music in Edinburgh University.

Meanwhile, referring to the identity of a music teacher, Participant 2 recalled his novice years as a music teacher:

I was young and inexperienced, started teaching when I was sixteen. I was teaching how I was taught following my mentor. It was a challenge in the beginning and learning how to teach. After two years of teaching, I proceed my piano study at Royal College of Music in London... I was granted a scholarship by winning the International Competition in 1992.

Participant 1 continued to share her experiences and acknowledged herself as a “born” music educator. She is passionate about teaching since her young age. She shared that she is endowed with natural attributes and personality as a teacher.

I love teaching and it is my passion, I instinctively knew that I am always has passion for music, I think it was very interesting that when I was twelve years old, my Dutch music teacher told me that I will be a music teacher, ”you were born to teach”!

Participant 2, after leaving high school formal education, commenced his teaching career briefly, and furthers his music learning in UK and Graz respectively. He shared that it was memorable experience in music performing in UK and discover new areas of musical interest and passion. He furthers his music education in composition in Graz after a brief transitory return to the replication of music teaching. Therefore professional development is a progressing practice that teachers have the capacity to replicate the practices through the professional development activities they are expose to. He said that:

All these years I have been teaching, I found that teaching is about sharing experience and educating, not only music but the whole well-being. I felt precious and treasure that I had at least ten years attachment with the students, and is good quality time of learning music for them. I believed that besides parents, music teacher is the most close to the children... influencing their characters... a role model for them to growing up.

Considering the definition and meaning of her chosen profession, Participant 1 was delighted to share her goals and passion of music teaching:

I really have passion in doing music, I found that without music, life would be miserable.

Though she also attempted in assisting her spouse in establishing new business ventures, she expressed the meaning of music in her life:

It didn't mean anything at all. I couldn't find myself without music, and it could not be myself!

She further elaborated that music teaching is at her heart and gives her meaning and value to her life

Now I precious my teaching career because I think teaching is imparting to the young generation with musical knowledge, music discovery and also method of teaching for those are teachers, because I hope that teachers able to manage not only practical playing but also theory papers.

Participant 2 shared that his teaching career was motivated by other eminent musicians and teachers whom inspired him a new aspiration as a pianist and propel him into a next level of his musicianship. He stated:

I am grateful I met so many great peoples including good parents which give me tremendous support and encouragement. I deeply felt that educating young children, through music, they learn concentration, coordination, discipline, besides technique, is to teach them how to appreciate music, and as a person, your personality and character can impact the children.

Both participants transpired their passion in music, and this passion sustained their teaching career over 3 decades. The replication had significant meaning in their profession, as music learning and teaching is continuous improvement process which takes time and efforts. This continuous process enables them to share an enriching musical journey with their students.

4.2.2 Redefinition

The second type of contribution, redefinition is a circular motion and the creative work leads back to initiative place, but view in different ways. Involved a little or even no change where the field it is (Sternberg, 2003). Sternberg (2006) found that redefinition is the process of assimilating and implementing other novel ideas on the present situation.

Sternberg, Kaufman and Pretz (2003) indicated that redefinition is a process that leads individuals to interrupt their thoughts and understanding of their field, and attempt to make innovation decision for a higher quality.

When asked about their reflections on the “redefinition” of their music teaching routine, Participant 1 continually emphasised her own endowment as a born teacher and music educator. She recalled her memory that even as a novice piano teacher, though she was able to manage very well, but not always satisfied with what she was doing. She said:

I was always seeking for professional skills and new knowledge to improve and to enrich my own teaching.

Participant 1 did not invest in much time replicating on her work but always contemplating to redefine her job. She shared that:

When I looked over thirty years of teaching, I teach differently now compared to my first started of teaching, by giving them a priority to choose their favourite piece and will work more on the demanding passage

Participant 2 is aspired to the continuous process of broadening and deepening his own musicianship and educatorship. He realises and propels himself to achieve different levels of attribution and qualities of a musician. He said that:

It was so much different compared to my first started of teaching. Always gave them technically and musically demanding repertoires, time to time, now I am still seeking different ways of teaching which they can become better interpretation. Proper encouragement is essential, and yet pieces if they can play it will enable to build up their confident. In the performance area, I came across the difficult stage with facing critical and failure.

Sharing her earlier teaching experiences, Participant 1 was pleased with her capability and capacity in music teaching, especially the 'critical' area, as she said;

The reason is exposure! I believed that with better exposure is through reading, and it will become bigger awareness and better understanding and it will raise your own standard especially for high standard performance nowadays. This is how I approach my teaching nowadays.

As for Participant 2, he has a more philosophical realisation about life where he stated that:

... life is about changing and sharing... music is a kind of spiritual thing, not a worldly competitive career.

To him, music has a special meaning,

... music is a very good friend, and it is always with you and you can spend time with it.

He also has noble insights about teaching and performing, and seeking for redefinition of his identity as a teacher and performer,

...teaching is sharing and learning together with students...performing is also part of sharing, I even told my students competition also part of sharing.

He commented the process of redefinition as seeking new challenges and take risk:

I felt that we 'human' always changing, always look for new challenge and don't be afraid to take risk, in any source, like performing and teaching.

Participant 1 reflected on her varieties of exposure that enhanced her teaching career. She shared her teaching pathway:

With all the exposures I can do and I realised that it will enhance my inputs and much better perspective what music can be like. Furthermore it help me to reflect and improve my teaching and also continue to evolve my whole approaches to teach, I never find

boring in my teaching and every student is a new challenge to me! Over the years, I have formulated my own teaching style through my research study, so my teaching is not static.

Participant 2 continued to sustain his passion and enthusiasm about his profession.

Though long-serving this profession, he is still full of motivation and positive thinking in teaching and performing. He shared that:

I am not purposely teaching for exam or competition but music! For understanding parents, students will follow my advice, especially for taking exam, normally two times only for the graded exam. I will nurture my students' learning path other than music, like conquer their arrogant, how to face failure during their grown up process, I found that attitude is very important! In addition, holistic learning is to enhance their musical knowledge and develop their musicianship.

Music teaching as a profession, at times, perceived as a standout; noble and challenging; socially and culturally respected career. It is also view as stable in terms of financial wellbeing. When asked about their perception on the professional values, Participant 1 shared that:

As a teacher, always honest with the students and not giving them wrong impression and also not give students a target or aim beyond their ability.

Similarly, Participant 2 also shared the same viewpoint:

In the early years, I don't understand what is the meaning of value... but almost thirty years of teaching, I found that everything is keep changing, like as a person, and is growing all the time, and the kind of connection which the students are part of your life, and is a very personal feeling. And always be honest and humble to your students and parents

When asked about their reflections on the value of examinations and music competitions,

Participant 1 responded confidently with assurance that:

..I have gotten in the right line with my method of teaching... I am not only a piano teacher but music educator. All her students passed in the music examinations not only in the diploma examination but also the external degree of Bachelor of Music from University of London.

She added:

My students also succeeded in entering into final stage of international competition.

She realised that self-improvement is very important as to maintain the professional standard and to provide a comprehensive guidance in her teaching career.

Though Participant 2 is eminently recognised for his teaching quality and standard in students' achievements in music examinations and competitions, he humbly stated that:

... most important is music appreciation.

He felt blissful and encourages as the parents and students are very concerned and collaborative; take heed of his professional advice and not imposing emphasis on music examination and music competition. He is always inspiring and opening opportunities for students to gain exposures and knowledge, like attending master classes for self-improvement in musical knowledge and technical performance skills.

Both participants shared their pathway of learning which elucidate new motivation evolve over time; continuous learning and self-improvement to enrich their music teaching. They both concurred that continuous exploration and improvement enhance self-knowledge and self-growth. They also indicated self-enjoyment in attending music festivals and concerts are part of the self-improvement. Other than confining to music profession, social awareness and contribution to the community are vital in discovering and sustaining personal passion for life.

Though both have similar self-improvement attributes and strategies, they have different notions in music sharing. Participant 1 defined her sharing through music teaching; imparting musical knowledge and enthusiasm. Whereas Participant 2, other than sharing good music through teaching, he suggested that the musical sharing and music communication between the performer and audiences increased in meaning and aesthetic values through the performance.

4.2.3 Forward Incrementation

Third contribution which is a forward motion in the way of slightly pushing forward the domain and also with a slightly change. Due to its less demand in energy or physical

health, it is the most easily appreciated, recognised and most common type of creativity contribution due to it less harmful, no threatening on the assumptions and not rejected as useless (Sternberg, Kaufman & Pretz, 2003), therefore occurs in all fields. Further discovery, they stated that if when times are changing relatively predictable, forward incrementation tend to be successful.

However, forward incrementation is harder than it appears at their twilight of their career (Sternberg & Kaufman, 2012). These are the factors may cause: first, they may depart from their creative program. Second, possibility they have judged by search committees for their promotion they are looking for. Third, as for scientist or researchers, is hard to get a grant near the end of their career if compared to at their mid-career points. Fourth, for those researchers who seeking for the supervisors may no longer tied to due to incident happened, and academy works may be affected. Last, most of the late-career creators have others responsibility such as limited time and health concern that unable to proceed forward. Nevertheless, they may keep on contributing and to “earn their keep” in a fairly linear way (Sternberg & Kaufman, 2012).

Both participants shared their attempts in moving their music knowledge forward.

Participant 1 described herself when she was as being novice teacher:

When I was first started teaching, I just taught the piece, but over the years I have formulated my own teaching style, even in the teachers' group teaching, I will find a solutions for the difficult part.

Participant 2 shared his learning pathways in moving his music knowledge forward, he said:

During my novice years as music teacher, I continue to widen my musical knowledge and repertoires. I took most of the Diplomas examinations that available in Malaysia. I even won an International competition in 1992 enable me awarded with fully scholarship to pursue my piano study at Royal College of Music in London.

He continued to recall his dream:

All the while my dream is be a composer instead of pianist, and composing is part of my passion and hobby and I found it is more personal than playing piano, I can write whatever I feel and express my experience!

Through her so many years of experience, Participant 1 found a better approach of teaching, here she voiced that:

With my many years of experience, now I will rather go to the 'critical' area first, this will enable me to choose a piece according to the students' personality, ability and their favourite of the music and the composers, I believe that they will practice willingly.

Participant 2 had developed his performance skills and composition throughout the years learning abroad, he said:

After I have been studying five years in London, I came back teaching for two years and proceed to study composition in Graz for eighteen months. It is truly refresh for me, as during that age, I had faced the hardest period which I am sure that it is the hardest period for almost all the young people, emotionally feel uncertainty and unsecured. So I take a break to give myself a chance to further my composition study. Composition is my passion and hobby

Participant 1 reflected that she had changed a lot the ways and the approaches in teaching. For her, teaching is not static; she tried her best to create varieties. She said that:

Never stop learning to enhance my musical knowledge, presently I continue to widen my musical knowledge with doing Ph. D research now, I believed on God that this motivation keep me going.

Undoubtedly self-improving through learning is essential, she added that:

I believed by providing writing all these articles, available to the world, parents and students can learn from what I had shared during my research and also contributing to the music society.

Similarly to Participant 2, he reflected that keep reading and learning is a pathway of growing, this is not only in developing his musical knowledge but enhance his creativity in teaching and ability of teaching approach in different way.

Now apart from teaching, I read a lot that I believe it enhance my creativity in my teaching, performances and composition. And I believed through that knowledge, not only in music, but personality is formed through life experience and creativity task.

Both participants agreed that reading and gaining knowledge enhance their creativity in piano teaching. They believed that the application of formal knowledge on teaching practice strengthens the abilities in teaching and formulates concrete teaching profession skills.

Participant 1 indicated that she is moving forward in her professional career, seeking a new way of learning by pursuing her doctoral degree. She stated that through her research experiences, she aspires to share the learning experiences with others.

Whereas, Participant 2 indicated that he had two enriched years furthering his music composition studies in Graz. The learning experience and gaining musical knowledge set him a career path as a composer and performer. Other than teaching, composing and performing, he is also actively engaging in charitable contribution.

4.2.4 Advanced Forward Incrementation

Sternberg (2006) stated that advanced forward incrementation is an endeavour to accelerate the pace that beyond the expected rate of in forward progression which an idea is 'ahead its time'. It usually not successfully at the time they are attempting because they are not readily to go in direction and then it seen as a work ahead of its time. Furthermore, the value of the works may credited for the later creators who had the similar ideas and also impossible during late-career.

As Sternberg and Kaufman (2012) stated, for the later-career creativity, they may not have enough time as they have to take a huge leap forward, for instance, they may shortage of time for the researchers during their academic career. Many innovators ideas ahead of their time may fall into this category and their products may not succeed at the initial introduction and attempt. Being a failure at its premier, yet later it is perceived when it goes along the pathway of its genre.

Participant 1 shared her efforts and challenges in propelling beyond herself in terms of music knowledge and also pedagogic knowledge. She said:

When I was started teaching children, I never scored my unexpected achievement and surprisingly that my students had winning the piano international competition. As a result it propels me to plan even more competition in an international level.

Similarly, Participant 2 said that his endeavour is beyond its expectation in terms of music teaching and performance,

Honestly I am not ambitious person, I am blessed and lucky with good friends around, have opportunity to talked to great musicians and from the communication I learnt from them. I am grateful too that been invited to so many places for giving master-classes, performing and also be a jury in the competition.

Participant 1 shared and expressed her gratitude for her supportive and dedicated parents over the years. She is grateful of their effort:

I never forget the motivation and inspiration from my parents. Their encouragement and dedication brought me personal achievement along my music career, especially in my educational and teaching aspect.

Participant 2 mentioned that he experienced burnout and he believed that this is common among music teachers with busy daily teaching routines; matching expectation from parents and students and emotional support; strategies in managing students' attitudes. He said:

Tell you frankly, I had experience burnout in my teaching career previously, but now I will take it easy and teach my very best.

To him, students' improvement both in their learning and attitude would be his reward,

It sounds encouraging that some of my students had achieved some recognition from international competition and well established in their very good career and academy.

Participant 1 reflected that her success in career is a blessing from God. She said in blissfully and humbly manner:

Firstly I can be said that I had a little achievement today in my teaching field that's from my parents' encouragement and dedication along my learning pathway. That is I think more toward to educational and teaching and now I am feeling proud that I have many students all over the world.

Participant 2 said that exposure is a main factor to enhance the learning progress; it is part of the dedication to teaching:

I wish them will not doing the same mistakes that I had made before. As a teacher, I am always willing to share my music journey with my students. As a keen composer, I had

my works commissioned by and premiered in various countries and also for the competition prescribed works.

When asked about what are their new definition of teaching and the purpose of teaching over the years, Participant 1 answered that:

... as I mentioned before, constantly evolving.

So as Participant 2, he said that:

...my principle is at the moment I will do my very best and do what can I do in my teaching and performing career.

Both participants have same teaching goals, keep encouraging students and self-learning and established their recognition from students' participation and achievements in international music competitions. Furthermore, they indicated that participating in competition is good exposure for students.

4.2.5 Redirection

In redirection, it is applicable for later career educators as it leads the motion to a new direction from the way it currently moving, and then redirective, and redirection can change a field in unpredictable ways (Sternberg & Kaufman, 2012). The most common move during later-career is they will prefer go into the careers that the knowledge and skills they had developed over the years. For instance teachers who feel exhausted and burn out, they may further their research academy. As stated by Sternberg and Vroom (as cited in Sternberg, Kaufman & Pretz, 2003) discovered that as to succeed in their career, the engagement of environmental condition for redirective leaders is essential.

Participant 1 shared her teaching journey; with her enrich experience, she challenges herself seeking opportunities to enhance her career further. She recalled:

I am grateful I have a teacher and he is now 93 years old, although with his old age he is still keep learning to play new pieces, daily practice is his routine! Of course he is now not agile as he was young, he used to perform a lot, but still keep learning and listening to music as to keep in touch to the music society for himself, he is also used to be in charge the program of Edinburg society with musicians. He is my source of inspiration.

Similar to Participant 2, he said that at some point in his teaching journey, he has other motivation and vision that challenges him to diverge into other directions and continue on with other more meaningful endeavour. He expressed that:

I had come across very difficult time which I was suffering from depression, fortunately I recovered from my teacher's encouragement and my nephew accompaniment during my summer holiday in hometown.

He further expressed his new viewpoint after recovering from depression:

.....many years later, when I visited to the 3rd world, I saw the poverty that children with no food, without education and even a very basic life requirement. That's drive me want to accomplish something others than music!

Participant 1 redirecting her career in doing research in music education, she agreed that life is about self-growth. Continual learning and apprising knowledge is essential especially in the teaching field. She said that:

My inspiration is to enhance my learning spirit as to broaden my understanding of music and teaching. Now I am redirecting my teaching career on my research in music education on psychology of music hope that can help teachers to understand more in teaching.

Participant 2 found life more meaningful by investing time and effort contributing to community and charity works. He voiced that:

I strongly felt that time is not enough during my most difficult time. It was telling me that spend time with doing thing more meaningful, and giving love is very important.

He is grateful to get along with the children in Nepal, he has developed a close relationship with the children, he said that:

....I believed it is fated! Grateful not because "you provide food for them, is great love you are sharing".

Participant 1 is very determined in the process of lifelong learning. Furthermore she wishes to create meaning and purpose of the music research. She shared her source of inspiration:

I will continue learning as long as my health and ability is still affordable. My 93 years old teacher deeply inspired me. This motivated me to further my research study in music education and expand my knowledge not only in musical knowledge but also music psychology.

At this present moment, Participant 2 found his life more enriching with charity works. He performs recitals and concerts to raise funds in support of his charity works. He found that spiritually, it is more encouraging and positive,

At this moment I am more enrich with charity works and seeking for more contribution and dedicated life. I found my life is more balance in a way that it helps me a lot to let go something, and fill up my life with positive energy, thinking and passion.

Other than teaching music to students, they also transcend humanity values to their students. Below are their sharing. Participant 1 expressed that:

I think I have another student, he is very talented and versatile, he is the main pianist for the choir, and this choir does a lot of community works, various funds. I will always encourage them by going to attend their concerts and financially contribution. I will fully support under their privilege they need it.

Participant 2 share his amazing feeling into his humanity contributing:

Now I found life is more balance if compared to last time, at least besides music, I do others things like social work, although this charity works are challenging and yet I am not rich but I can do my very best and life is full of fulfilment with spiritual.

He further described his consolation and touching feeling that inspired students involved into charity works:

I also encourage my students to organize charity concert and even to perform for fund raising. I am deeply gratitude that I have one student in Australia, he is giving free tuition at the poverty remote area for the young, now he is an executive of charity association.

Charity contribution to society undoubtedly is the most joyful and meaningful other than music making. Both participants actively involved and encourage students partake in charity works with their music talent.

Participant 1 deeply inspired by her ninety three years old teacher, whom has driven and motivated her in furthering the doctoral study. Participant 2's travel experiences in remote countries seeing children suffering from poverty had moved his compassionate heart and further propel him into charitable engagement and contribution.

4.2.6 Reconstruction and Redirection

Reconstruction/redirection creators reject the current situation and they may go back to the starting point and try their effort to redirect from the point it currently are in their careers and work for the better result. Reconstruction/redirection looks backwards as most of the contribution types represent “forward’ thinking (Kaufman & Skidmore, 2010). It is not difficult to find in the market stores that selling the latest version of old model (Sternberg, Kaufman & Pretz, 2003), which are some examples of products and services serve as reconstruction/ redirection.

Sternberg and Kaufman (2012) stated that the creators may made a misstep somewhere along their line, they may go back to the misstep point and redirect from there such as artists will return to restart once they found that a medium did not work after new style was adopted.

Participant 1 said that she always has desire for new knowledge. She has established herself in the music and music education field as an eminent individual. However, she has the determination for self-knowledge. She embarked herself into a new identity as a “student” again pursuing her post graduate study. She said fondly and proudly of her balancing family, career and studying. She remembered fondly,

It is not easy but very gratifying, life is always keeps learning, and I will never give up and burnout upon my teaching career. I am expanding into music research, I assume that researching become quite big priority now.

Participant 1 recalled her intention of furthering in doing her research,

I started doing my music education research in 2008, which is a lady encouraged her from Victoria University, South Africa. I was so excited as this is learning a new language, undoubtedly writing a thesis perhaps is strength but challenging!

Participant 2 indicated that to challenge his motivating vision is a great task. There are new knowledge and new skills to develop, and also to shape new identity in new issues and direction:

I have been teaching for thirty years, during my teaching cycle, it cannot avoid up and down, and I have to face success and failure especially nowadays I am expanding my music career by giving some performances and master classes around the world. And my

rejection of teaching career not because students become less but to have more time in other area like giving recital and charity work.

Participant 1 also shared her experience in her doctorate research study. Her goal is to sharpen her musical ability; to increase and deepen her knowledge and; and to improve and make it better.

And right now I am rushing to finish my doctorate degree with my research title 'Parent-teacher relationships in group music classes; a collective case study'. Initially is not easy because the approach of understanding of theory is entirely different what I studied at UK, I was not a researcher but more on performer. This was inspiring and yet challenging. Everything is learnt from the beginning.

When asked about challenges in music teaching, Participant 2 shared the difficulties he encountered:

This is back to my initial teaching years which was more on adventurous, always tended by giving technically demanding pieces, but now I will seek different ways of teaching, pieces which students can play to enable them to build up their confidence.

Participant 1 reflected on the meaning and value of her learning experience in higher learning:

And my focus area is in West Malaysia. I would say that I hope to develop more area of music research. I wish, in this aspect, it will be broadened and looks for my perspective and give something for prosperity in music field. With doing research, I try to get into the music community, where I meet people doing research, I will form chat room for music community from different universities, sharing the same perceptions and ideas.

As for Participant 2, his endeavour is in teaching, performing and composition:

In my teaching career, I will always communicate with not only students but parents for more understanding of their learning progression and attitude improvement. To make them better is teacher's challenge. I always believe that 'life is always learning and sharing'. I wish to develop musical knowledge not only from playing but performing and composition, the more exposure you gained the more you learnt.

Both participants reflected that teaching is a way of sharing and learning, self-improvement and self-growth is essential to enhance the teaching; and through experience, it helps to develop teaching skills.

Participant 1 identified that, through her research study engaging with the music and research community enable her to broaden her perspectives in the music field. Whereas for Participant 2, extending his music career as a performer giving more

performances; as a teacher giving master classes in aids of lesser and limited means children. He noted that being a teacher is a challenge to improve student's musical and performing skills; and also to cultivate social awareness in their lives.

4.2.7 Reinitiation

In reinitiation, it shows that it is an initial stage at variant with the previous field has pursued, and is the most radical of all the creative contribution and also change following a retirement, which it essentially begins with a new profession, and this pathway is increasingly common nowadays (Sternberg & Kaufman, 2012). In reinitiation, it may suggests that it had reached an undesirable point and also has exhausted itself as the direction is moving then progress from that point.. Similarly to advance forward incrementation, it is hard to predict the new products whether have an impact on the field (Kaufman & Skidmore, 2010), and yet it provides people need that is essentially from what they came before. Comparably with redirection, reinitiation is which people are much less comfortable of the fields (Sternberg, 2006, p. 13).

Participant 1 spoke about the importance of new perspective of her teaching:

I reinitiate my teaching and performing into different direction which I am right now so much inspired by my music education research, nevertheless is combination of two.

Participant 2 also mentioned his new idea emerging along his teaching pathway as well as his performer role;

As a performer, sometimes I will face failure, but I will take it easy and I take it" failure" as learning. I am growing as time passes, especially in the field of teaching, last time I used to more adventurous in giving pieces that beyond their ability.

Participant 1 shared her research experience that she is now e spending more time in research honing in acquiring new musical knowledge; aspired to share and to teach the younger generations:

I am now creating new way of teaching which can help the teachers I am teaching and also sharing what I am learning in my research study. So in the sense what is the reinitiating my teacher is no longer the way that I used to teach for the new perspective of teaching.

The more you share the more you learn, as Participant 2 said:

As to maintain as musician, I must have a passion and creativity. Over the years, I learnt from experience, I found that I am changing especially my teaching method, always with new ideas emerged if compared to last time.

With her family and supervisor supporting and encouragement, Participant 1 is feeling blessed and inspiration that she can put more time and effort in her research study:

When I compare to my initial teaching career, I am now more concentrate into my research study in music education which I found it can really help me to teach in different way both to students and teachers.

She repeated delightful her acknowledgement as a “born” music educator:

I believed I was meant for music, and meant to teach. No lost interest of the joy of doing it like: making music, studying music, reading, analysing, listening and teaching, all these aspects about music in my life which I could not live without it.

When asked about his turning point, Participant 2 said that:

I believe life is always change and keep moving that propel me always look for new challenge, and I will not be afraid for taking risk because it means that how to become a better teacher and performer.

He will seek a better way for new inspiration on his teaching as to sustain his passion:

“Burn out but never give up”! When I feel tiring and burn out from my career, I will take a short break with doing charity, when I see the poverty children in Nepal, I feel that my life filled with blessing and balanced especially facing a competence society nowadays. I will gained again motivation with full of energy and feel fresh.

Along with the thirty years of professional contribution to teaching, both participants indicated that they found balance in life and better way of teaching which enhance their personal passion in the later career. Both participants seek new directions which challenge them to use their creativity in other ways. For example, Participant 1 is pursuing her doctoral degree which she realised that with research study she has more

confident in sharing her knowledge in teaching. Participant 2 with his short vocational break helping the children in Nepal inspired his teaching career.

4.2.8 Integration

The final creative contribution is synthesis which the combination of at least two ideas or courage from the previously, whether is contradicted or related. It is regarded neither acceptance nor rejection of the existing paradigm but integration of both. In synthesis, what the creators have being doing with new pursuits, they will find ways to integrate and select the best elements. Furthermore, a new involvement in their current field may click together with an old one or vice versa (Sternberg & Kaufman, 2012). Example like two different domain in order to create something news, for instance, the creation of the iPhone, it synthesized two different devices, a phone and iPod, this achievement created by Apple which is one of the best-selling products of the 21st century (Kaufman & Skidmore, 2010).

In this study, the two participants not only involving in teaching but they are also integrating their career into performing, researching and charity works in their later-career, they found that teaching life are now a more balance and meaningful endeavour.

Participant 1 recalled that:

When I am writing as researcher, I constantly reflecting on my teaching, so the teaching definitely been integrating into the writing, writing perhaps is a strength but challenging! Research writing is entirely different that would motivate me to learn new language.

Participant 2 shared that life is never stop learning, diversityof learning elevate self-cultivation and attitude. He recalled that:

I always shared to others that “we always learning not only music but is life”! Furthermore,” integration of music and education into be part of your life would be amazed, it cannot be separated”. That is human nature!

When asked about how she integrates her teaching with performing and researching, Participant 1 noted:

Presently I am not only looking at my own personal experiences, but more importantly I am also thinking with the community, the class groups, the parents and teachers. I am finding out a lot that about teaching of teachers-partners' views, and also this all been integrated into my teaching. Performing is part of my teaching, so it is also been integrated, as you cannot be teaching without performing.

Similarly to Participant 2, he noted:

I will keep doing and move on my career with many people support and encouragement although sometimes I am feeling tiring and stressful especially giving master classes and performances. Furthermore I am actively involving in the charity work, spiritually I feel that life is more balance and meaningful.

When asked what are their goals with their different identities as teacher, performer, researcher and community worker,

Participant 1 said that:

To me teaching is look at the relationship with parents, pupils and teachers, and all these coming into ended how this music teaching emerged into community. Performing is part of music sharing with your audience, research is imparting and sharing your knowledge to the new generation. And all these factors are becoming all integrated.

Participant 2 mentioned that:

I feel life is happier and easy going if compared to last time, and I will move forward with my expertise in my music career and also social works.

Both participants had found their passion and happiness in their later career as teacher, performer, researcher and also involving in charity and community projects as social entrepreneur.

Participant 1 mentioned that teaching and performing are merged together so as research reflects in her teaching. She has a broader global perspective now seeing how Malaysian music teaching builds an impact to the society. Participant 2 expressed his gratitude and happiness with his later life which he integrated charity work into his teaching and performing life, he found that life is happier and more meaningful with charitable work contributing to the children in Nepal.

4.2.9 Conclusion

Conversations with Participant 1 and Participant 2 revealed that the importance of continuous improving and evolving professional skills and social awareness. Keep learning, practicing, researching, and dedicating into social works enhance their development of a better self, and more accomplished musician and music educator.

Participant 2 found meaning in life with different aspects of learning and social contribution. He stated that keep changing, keep learning and keep growing is a natural part of life's cycles. Though he is experiencing brevity in music composition, he is aspired to return after he fulfils the priority in other endeavours.

Participant 1 who has been teaching for over thirty six years, maintain her personal passion and aspiration, and her inspiration to the others. She acknowledges her self-growth, self-knowledge and broadening of own global prospective; and delighted with her professional contributions to music teaching especially in the Malaysian music community.

Both Participant 1 and Participant 2 had made a success in music career and maintained their passion in their teaching career. Both have the characteristics of self-determination that motivates them to personal growth and fulfilment. They have in common humanity statement stated: “keep learning, remain humble, communication through love and social works, and mutual respect”, which they actualise in their daily life especially in their teaching career.

4.3 Definition of Sustainability

As Voetman, Golden, Maenpaa, McAtackney, Rekola & Lind (2015) stated that sustainability is one of the defining themes on the 21st century, it is not about survival but being able to live a good life, moreover he stated that in a sustainable society, art and

culture enable individuals to take part on and help to develop society. However to some, 'sustainability' defined differently in a different perspective.

This is can be seen in the music education that study of music enriches not only lives of students and teachers, but the community and society as well provide them the skills for lifelong enjoyment of music. We have no longer to regulate and control and we had created the form of nature, therefore sustainability is one of the way of encouraging such change for education (Huckle, 1996, p. 4). Teachers will discourage due to the demanding parents, challenging also because besides from the proper lessons they can even learn from internet, make comparison.

As to sustain teachers' passion on teaching, they have to keep learning as Hargreaves and Fink (2003) stated that sustainability does not simply mean whether something can last, but it addresses how particular initiatives can be developed without comprising the development of others in the surrounding environment, now and in the future.

In music education, teachers and students learnt how to bring the sustainable of music enjoyment to life, particular how we can apply sustainable enjoyment to meet our lifelong learning and individually collectively. As to strengthen the spirit and courage of learning and teaching, the process of sustainability of lifelong learning is essential, this is preposition of The Webster Comprehensive Dictionary (Marckwadt, Cassidy & McMillan, 1992) defined sustainability is "to keep", "to endure", "to maintain" and "to uphold" (p. 1264). Another recognised dictionary Oxford English Dictionary defined that "able to maintained at a certain rate or level" and to be "able to be upheld or defended" in the word of "sustainability" is simulation of the word 'sustain' (Oxford English Dictionary Online). Furthermore, "sustainability refers to the long-term availability of the long-term achievement of goals (Pelt, Kuyvenhoven & Nijkamp, 1990, p. 141) which Kuyvenhoven stated that it used in surrounding sustainability of projects and programs

in literature definition. Sirota (2012) implies that “the most difficult thing about being a musician those days is not a talent, but its sustainability”.

The two participants in this study stated that it is a process of learning to sustain their later career by keep learning, practising and reading as to improve self-knowledge and cultivation to provide students with musical skills for lifelong enjoyment of music. In addition, when students are inspired, they are motivated to learn, to explore and to practice for their music lessons.

As a musician especially in their late life career, as to sustain personal passion, sustainability is often thought of as a long-term goal in their career. Furthermore it is intimately related to art education and through arts, and culture, education for sustainable living. As Stuhr (2003) stated that “we have lost sight of this teaching mission, of life’s meaning, and we may have become bogged down in the teaching of school subjects or discipline in a way that they are no longer connected to the students’ lives in contemporary institutional education” (p. 301). Therefore, sustainability can be meant a lot of different things to a lot of people, as for education, it can mean as to nourish, to prove, to prolong and to support. Thus, it is essential to appreciate how current education practices contribute to or detract from.

Below are the key-words in this study which engaged with sustainability in the participants’ perceptions during their later-career in music teaching: passion; artistic vision; create value; musician entrepreneur; job satisfaction; and making meaning and mission.

4.3.1 Passion

Participant 1, an experience music educator-researcher, has been involved in music education for over thirty-six years. She self-identified her endowment as “born to teach” and her passion for music undoubtedly instinctive. She acknowledges her passion in

music teaching as self-fulfilment. Over the years, she renew her passion for music, and embraces it through the challenges in music teaching career, from performing and teaching, and in recent years, researching in music education. She is passionate about music and none other than music that her life will be fulfilled. As a music educator, she undertakes a mission to help music teachers to find meaning and significance in their career, and be inspired and motivated about their music teaching and most important to be part of a connected community.

Participant 1 exclaimed that:

If you have a passion for music, your artistic growth will limitless. No matter you are teachers or students, your passion towards music will brings music to life!

Participant 1 expressed that:

All of my musical life I have considered myself to be very fortunate to have been surrounded by wonderful and talented people, those who have guided me, inspired me...

This golden opportunity enhanced her teaching career, she acknowledged that:

...and most of all those who have motivated me as youngster, it is rare to find all these qualities in one person, and enhanced my passion for my music teaching career.

As described by Liston and Garrison (2004), for individuals that have the vision, “call to teach”, will take teaching as a “profoundly meaningful part of their life”, and “have a passion for teaching” (p.1). Participant 1 shared her perception:

I always affirmed that if you do a lot of things which variety but all related to music, then that will sustain the passion!

So as Participant 2:

When my first encounter spark of doing my music study in Austria, I was playing music during Christmas for cancer children patient, I realised that my passion has been emerged in my cell since then, and also a goal and impact for me.

Nowadays he selects his favourite and referenced pieces to practiced and performed as a means to sustain personal musical passion. He stated that:

I can be said that to be a performer, the least you possess is the passion and creativity. And also I will always shares to others that “we always learning not only music but that is life”!

In sum, our personal passion crafts a sustainable career; continue to be enthusiastic, motive and inspire other individuals.

4.3.2 Artistic Vision

With a powerful artistic vision, it will inspired our creativity with seeing through any obstacle and providing the comprehensive view, “Vision is the art of seeing things invisible” by author Jonathan Swift, that are many factors that lead to artistic achievement and beyond artists’ satisfaction (Klickstein 2009, p. 310). It is insufficient to have imaginative alone, it requires industry, and people’s artistry will bloom with their creative work (Klickstein 2009, p. 311).

Furthermore, Lutzker (2012) indicated that educating as an art infers adopting a requisite structure of knowledge, for instance: musicians’ sensitivity to nuances of tone, all represents form of learning and articulation, which they don’t loan themselves effectively to sound.

The research study of Participant 1 provides an insight experiences and knowledge who is an over 30-years veteran of the music education. She indicated that:

My focus area is in West Malaysia, I think because of the distance is easier for me to talk and share about it that I had being seen more happening during my over 30-years teaching experience. My research study enhances my music education which I may lack of and also for self-improvement.

Her endeavour not only in her research study and teaching, but performing:

I am an adviser to the performing arts, which is department of my church. The performances attract almost eight thousands of people every time they put up the show, I think this is part of social change and part of charity. At the same time, I have been drawing many young people, some of them going for music as their career.

Participant 2 stated that,

Integration of music and education into be part of your life would be amazed! They cannot be separated! I perceived that during my life and health suffering, it sensitized him the important of life.

He further elaborated that:

When you see clearly of yourself, then only you can improve and grown up especially during the critical period, failure with make you more strength, I believe without that I will not move on better.

Not everyone has the similar life experiences; Participant 2 expressed his gratitude of his blissful life around with good friends and good opportunity:

Due to my injury period, I could not doing anything including practicing, I try start going for reading, but not my most favourite, I realised that if doing which can dedicate and contribute to the society. So this inspired me to seek for more meaningful and dedicate life.

4.3.3 Create Value

Music education is another way to change lives by instilling the children and youngster the importance and the value of music and also inspire the future generations. Both participants believed that music has tremendous value in our society and also can give good influence and inspiration for the cultural society. Their goals are through music education where the value is created in the process of students' positive behaviour changed to teach common sense and awareness to individual (Nart, 2017).

Schwartz (2010) defines values as desirable goals, varying in importance that serve as guiding principles in people's lives. To put it differently, values serve as a guiding principle for selecting or evaluating behaviour, people, and events. Values are abstract and transcend specific situations—for example, values may affect beliefs and behaviour of different kind. Within individuals, values are relatively stable across time. Furthermore, values should influence singular beliefs and behaviour, to transcend specific actions and situation, and also is part of motivation as to achieve a desirable goal.

Currently Participant 1 is an adviser to the performing arts, department of her church, which she has always produced shows and has been directing and conducting choir, training soloist that anything to do with music, her contributions in the community enriched her life value:

When there is a performance in church, their performance at least eight thousand people in five shows and this presentation is part of social change and also part of charity. Furthermore it is also provide a platform for young artist for encouragement

Beyond teaching, Participant 1 found that one of the values is caring for the students and understanding when students feel difficult time:

I affirmed that my teaching value be maintained throughout over the years, and my belief is always be honest to the students and parents by giving them a proper guidance and also take my responsibility of my teaching.

Similarly Participant 2 said that:

What enhance the value is through from experience, exposure and education. Music teaching is a kind of connection with students, they grow with you, they are part of your life and you are a part of their life too!

He always encourages his students be a good personality, when seeing them in a progress and improvement not only in playing but individually, that is his reward! He expressed that:

I believe that the connection of value that I treasure is the kind of relationship and also provides guidance. Furthermore I found that learning music is not because playing the piano but the composers you had learnt!

His feeling towards the composers:

They will give you honest and the personal feeling especially when you interpret their compositions is very personal feeling.

He further expressed that;

....teaching is an arts due to its demanding task.

4.3.4 Musician Entrepreneur

Wiebe (2017) defined that musician entrepreneur is: (1) motivation internally, they are the people who can make-it-happen and self-driven; (2) Their notions always assumed that learning and growth is challenging; (3) they possess a good sense of business that they know how to manage their own business and fit into their artistic vision, this can

enhance towards creating more profitable and sustainable career. In addition it is important to develop your skill in the sake of being virtuoso or craft person. As entrepreneurs, they understand the value and the power of their goals and to achieve it by creating a plan, Wiebe (2017).

Furthermore too be a good entrepreneur teacher, responsibility and collaborate with others is essential such as synthesis of creativity, artistic vision, sense of business, leadership and not only be a good musician. As stated by Kaschub and Smith (2014), in general, “entrepreneurial teachers are good musicians” with continually efforts to “expand their repertoire and skills” (p. 70).

Participant 1’s enthusiasm and creativity is internally driven, she said that:

I am very much to support of children especially my student Andrew, who was doing the charity to raised fund for autistic children from his winning award RM2000, I felt that it is very important nowadays, because it is creating awareness and encouragement among young people to involve into charity works

Her recent research is regarding the relationships between parents and teachers, partnership between parents and teachers; and to impart and share her knowledge with others. She said that:

I believed that this will be leaving prosperity for future generation, and this is also what motivated her keep going.

Similarly to Participant 2, he required stronger responsibility for his career, not only teaching but has to deal with parents, expectations from parents and society.

I believes besides parents, music teacher is the most close to children, it may influence their character, a model for them to grow up, through music, children can learn concentration, coordination and passion to their lives. In order to play in the concert, I will also encourage them to involve into humanity society.

Undoubtedly his dedication on his teaching is just giving his students more exposure.

4.3.5 Job satisfaction

Job satisfaction, a sense of fulfilment, happiness and contented which you are satisfied with your current career, it may consist of the components of interest, achievements, productivity, working hours and may be compensation. It may also mix with complex emotional response such as serving humanity is the richest reward you ever received.

Participant 1 indicated that teaching is not merely in teaching-learning context; but also to develop relationship and friendship among students and teacher. Her achievement on her academic work and teaching also brings her great satisfaction. She expressed:

I am not feeling any competitive with the teachers I had trained, who they are now able to teach up to diploma level and doing very well.

Participant 1 feels the joys of teaching, making music; studying, reading, analysing, listening and all these aspects fulfilled her job satisfaction, she shared gratefully:

I am glad that I am liaised closely with my students-teachers although they had stopped their lesson after succeed their examination.

Participant 2 found the best of his life is the balance between his careers and charity works. He reflected that life is more significant and committed when involve in charity works. He expressed that:

I am blessed that life is more meaningful and dedicated enrich with charity work .Over the years of teaching, when seeing students in a progress and improvement not only in playing but attitude!

He continued his blissful sharing with the greatest reward, he said that;

I am always feeling I am lucky that I can keep good relationship with professors, family, friends and students. Meanwhile I have good opportunity that always be invited for giving performance and master classes frequently.

4.3.6 Make Meaning/Mission

The study of music enriches not only the lives of the students and teacher, but the community and society as well. In order to maintain the standard of teaching, music

teaching can make meaning as to maintain friendly relationship, create fun atmosphere and nurturing the environment. In addition, the most pertinent of teacher's mission is to create meaning, is themselves personal meaning (Klickstein, 2009, p. 312). As music teacher, the mission is take responsibility to educate, to inspire and to develop students' musical skills and knowledge for lifelong enjoyment as every students comes with his or her musical ability instinctively.

Participant 1 affirmed that her focus on her teaching experience is to teach classical piano music musically and effectively; and also to be able to appreciation music.

She said:

My holistic teaching approach including analysis of the piece, technically and musically explanation like pedalling, phrasing-like where the agogic accent, all these aspect is to develop students capability and interest of playing classical piano. It is always desire to sharpen and make them better as to raise their standard, artistically and aesthetically.

Participant 2 stated that to develop his students' performing ability, cultivate a good learning attitude and personality refinement is essential. He shared that:

Always be humble and more dedicated to the society is essential in the materialistic environment nowadays, to nurture, to educate for the new generations is nevertheless fundamentally required. By making meaning for myself, I will always keep learning and improving both in my teaching and performing.

4.4 Conclusion

Through the conversations with Participant 1 and Participant 2, the findings revealed that the importance of continually improvement in teaching skills, keep learning, practicing, researching, and dedicating to social works. Continuous learning can enhance the development of self-growth and self-knowledge as musician and music educator. Moreover both participants depicted their current status, provided a picture and vision of their teaching experience for the younger generations to model on.

Participant 2 has found a good of his life, learning new knowledge and contributing to the community. He stated that importance of keep changing means keep learning, and to

evolve new knowledge, skills, and identities. Participant 1 maintains her passion and aspiration to inspire others.

Both participants sustained their passion and attained success and achievements in their teaching career. Both have self-determination to keep improving and encourage the others to 'keep learning, remain humble, communication through love and social works, and mutual respect', which they actualise in their life.

University of Malaya

CHAPTER 5

DICUSSION, IMPLICATION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 Overview

This chapter seeks to address the research questions, and also presents the summary of the research findings, included discussion, implication, recommendation and conclusion. It reflects on how the research findings linked to the literature and analysis of data collected from the narrative interview.

The purpose of the study is to investigate and explore in-depth how the perception by the two eminent and dedicated local piano teachers on their later career creativity and sustainability. However, Cheng (2018) argued that study on these two subjects: creativity and sustainable education are rarely found.

For identifying the data from the interviewed, the result showed that creativity and sustainability are interrelation to literature and analysis based on the theoretical framework of propulsion theory. Result indicated that participants established on their background that their identities they carried into their career over twenty five years. The following research questions were intended to evaluate in this chapter:

1. What is the contribution of creativity to the experienced piano teachers during their later career music teaching?
2. What are the factors contributing to the sustainability among piano teachers' later career?
3. What are the relationship between creativity and sustainability of piano teachers during their later career music teaching?

As a result, this study contributed the knowledge by revealing the perceptions of experienced piano teachers regarding their creativity and sustainability during their later

career. And the discussion in this chapter provides a broader and more in-depth understanding evidence to support the creativity and sustainability of later career.

5.2 Summary of the Results

This study focused on looking into two piano teachers' perceptions of their later career creativity and sustainability. The data collection is using narrative interview and based on eight types of creative contribution of propulsion theory as a theoretical framework (Sternberg, 1999; Kaufman, Pretz & Sternberg, 2003; Kaufman & Sternberg, 2012).

These eight types of creative contributions are trying to find out the different ways of later career music teaching that the contributions are created. Nevertheless creativity and sustainability are both related to each other. Over the years they went through their teaching path, passion and self-improvement are the main factors as to sustain their career. The participants shared their views on the later career of creativity and sustainability, from the Participant 1, her later career sustain in the teaching field that was grounded on her passion and her endeavour on her doctorate degree. And Participant 2 reinforced his teaching career with his dedication to the charity works and giving performances and master classes internationally.

However, their extraordinary stories of later career creativity and sustainable teaching experiences provide the power of motivation and inspiration in this later career life teaching research.

5.3 What is the contribution of creativity of the two experienced piano teachers during their later career music teaching?

Putting that the question into context, the two participants were interviewed who had shared their lived experiences in their later life career, with their evolving self-identities

they carried into their late life career, this research was to investigate and identified their perceptions of creativity.

The following sections provide an overview of eight contributions based on propulsion theory which proposed and expanded by Sternberg and Kaufman (2003). I will discuss separately in order to correspond with the eight themes but in reality.

5.3.1 Replication

This creative contribution showed that both of them are repeating their teaching routine, imitating and drawing from their learning experience, and their mentors gave them a lot of encouragement and role-model strategy. With their passion in music, they are enjoying and precious their teaching career which they feel that with their teaching skill they can impart more musical knowledge to young generation, as Crosswell and Elliot (2004) claimed that teachers who with deep feel and genuine love for their job will stay committed to their position.

5.3.2 Redefinition

The second contribution showed that their attribute and quality of musicianship have achieved with their teaching experience and professionals skills they immersed over the years. Their value that they had maintained throughout over the years is always honest and humble to the students and parents. Fung (1995) stated that redefining music is an approach move into the direction of rich and significant of life experience, it can also develop abilities, understandings, which music teachers able to produce full range of musical possibilities. Participant 2 showed a good example redefinition of creative contribution, he redefined his identity as a social entrepreneur, and used his musical ability to contribute to the society by giving recital as to raise funds for the charity.

5.3.3 Forward Incrementation

Third contribution is forward motion with slightly change which Participant 1 and Participant 2 have their common sharing, which they are moving in music knowledge forward by keep reading and learning, these will enhance their creativity in music teaching if compared to last time. Smith and Haack (2000) found out that the main factors that move the music teachers forward in their profession are very important by keep learning as to improve their new insights, skills and challenges. Participant 1 is now doing her doctorate degree research and she believed that never stop learning is self-improving and also contribute to the society.

Likewise, Participant 2, during his novice years as music teacher, he took most of the diploma examination to enhance and broaden his musical knowledge and repertoires, he even continued his composition study in Graz. He keep learning and upgrading himself by doing a lot of reading to enrich his creativity in his teaching, performances and composition. And now participant 2 is giving more performances meanwhile raising funds for the charity society especially children in Nepal.

5.3.4 Advanced Forward Incrementation

This contribution is beyond their expectation with their endeavour of teaching, like Participant 1, her achievement is beyond her expectation in the field of academia. For instance her students won an international competition that she did not expect them to achieve at this level. Such accomplishment propels her to plan more competition to her students. Moreover, her attribute of her a little success nevertheless is a blessing from God and her expressed gratitude to her parents' encouragement and dedication along her learning pathway. Similar to Participant 2 engaged in his composition, and his works were successfully commissioned by and premiered for the competition prescribed works.

Both of them have a same view that participating in competition is a good exposure for students, that is also the reason propel them to work harder.

5.3.5 Redirection

This unpredictable ways of changing field are most common move during later-career. Participant 2 expressed his teaching journey that now he is feeling, currently he felt that life is more balance and dedicated which enrich with social works. However, doing research in music education is an enhancement of Participant 1's later-career, this is to expand her wider and deeper understanding of musical knowledge, music teaching and also music psychology. Both of them also transcended humanity value to their students which involving in charity works. They also encouraged their students for taking parts in the charity works with their music talent.

5.3.6 Reconstruction/Redirection

Reconstruction/ redirection represents the condition where the individual resists or dissatisfied with the current situation and takes the route back to the starting point and go on in different creative direction.

Kaufman & Skidmore (2010) stated that "forward thinking" is a new challenge of motivation which it can be shown in the interview from the two participants. They shaped with their new identities with new knowledge and new skills they had developed along their teaching journey. As Participant 2's sharing, he is seeking different ways of teaching that enable to strengthen his students' confident of playing. In addition, Participant 2 expanded his music career by giving some performances and master classes around the world. Whereas Participant 1 embarked herself into research in music education which she has a very strong determination of self-knowledge and also sharpen her musical

knowledge. Both participants noted that being a teacher is a challenge as to make students better in the area of musical and performing skill.

5.3.7 Reinitiation

This contribution is the most radical and also a major paradigm shift among others creative contributions. As to maintain as a musician, Participant 2 mentioned that passion and creativity is nevertheless essential. And always look for new challenge in his teaching career. Comparable to Participant 1, her doctorate research in music education inspired her a lot in her teaching career, which she can use the new perspective of teaching for young generation.

5.3.8 Synthesis

The final creative contribution is regarded neither reject nor accept with existing paradigm. Both participants are involving not only in teaching but performing, researching and also charity social works. Both of their views are in common: “integration of music and education into part of your life would be amazed”, that is human nature! In additional by Participant 1 indicated that music teaching emerged into community would the relationship among teachers, parents and students would become closer. This study has found that the roles of two participants have within their portfolio careers with their significant identities, and Coker (2009) argued that being a musician nowadays having a chance to play various types of roles, from composing to performance. Both participants found their passion and blissful in their later career from their significant identities integration as: teacher, performer, researcher and also charity entrepreneur.

5.4 What are the factors contributing to the sustainability among piano teachers' perception of their later career music teaching?

Sustainability becomes very prominent both in the media and academic circles at present days (Pawson, 2001; p. 455). In this chapter I will present two participants who I had interviewed, and from the interviews they had demonstrated their passion through their creativity, commitment, sincerity, enthusiasm and also conveyed their understanding of sustainability towards their teaching later career. As a result, they showed a greatest motivation and encouragement to this study, and they stated that education for sustainability is defying educators' thinking and learning with their intelligence with wider perception.

What are the factors of contributing to the sustainability among two piano teachers' perceptions later career in their music teaching?

The answer of this research question was made by the same approach where the narrative interview was conducted. The following are the key-words to explore this study which engaged with sustainability in their perceptions during their later-career in music teaching: Passion, Artistic Vision, Create Value, Musician Entrepreneur, Job Satisfaction and make Meaning/ Mission.

5.4.1 Passion

Both participants embrace their passion rather retreat from the challenges of their music teaching career by transforming to more diverse identities. Similarly they had met good mentors who inspired and motivated them, with their passion in using their professional musical knowledge and experience, showed their students that music is an exciting and life long journey discoveries. They realised that passion also is a connection to a community by motivated and inspired each other.

5.4.2 Artistic Vision

Images, colour or story that artists wish to convey are their artistic visions, a way of sharing the work they do (Grace, 2014), this reflects that music teaching is a sharing and nurturing musical sense. Both participants expressed their vision through their creativity and sustainability over thirty year veteran of music teaching. In Participant 1 teaching endeavour, she is currently doing research doctorate degree, and she wishes that with her research writing, it could be a way of sharing her insightful experience and knowledge. In addition, both participants noted that integration of music teaching and music performing into be part of your later career would be amazing and be fulfilling. They acknowledged that the integration is part of their social change and charity contribution and dedication.

5.4.3 Create Value

Both participants believed that the value of music is immeasurable, it relates not only to music education itself but many aspects in our daily life, it has good influence and inspiration for the cultural society. Through music education, the teacher has opportunity to be a role model and mentor, furthermore it can create the process of students' positive behaviour (Nart, 2017). Both participants imparting their music student not only musical knowledge, but always provide them a proper guidance with keep a good relationship with their students, that it is in a way of nurturing them to be a good personality. They believed that music teaching is a kind of connection with their students, in addition, both participants acknowledged that contributions in the community would enrich their life value.

5.4.4 Musician Entrepreneur

Musician entrepreneur is a unique combination of musician and entrepreneur, it is also integration of creativity, artistic vision, technical skills, leadership, value-based marketing and business sense (Wiebe, 2017). To be a good entrepreneur teacher, responsibility and collaborate with others is essential not only be a good musician but also a good music educator. Both participants showed their supportive and encouragement to their students to involve in the charity works and humanity society by giving charity recital concerts, besides this, participant 1 wish her research get published to share her ideas and help others to improve. Furthermore, with stronger responsibility of participant 2's dedication teaching which he hoped his students will have more exposure to enhance their musical journey. Both participants wish that this can inspire and create awareness among young people and also they believed this will be leaving prosperity for future generation.

5.4.5 Job Satisfaction

Job satisfaction has a significant place in education of creating and developing for teachers to be successful and complete professional activities in a quality way. Furthermore (Kilic & Yazici, 2012) investigated that job satisfaction has the significant effect in happiness, productivity and creativity of individual, it can work with more integration and motivation. Brief and Roberson (1989) defined that job satisfaction is a mentality of an individual attitude towards their current career whether it is in a positive or negative evaluation. In this study Participant 1 found her joys of making music, teaching, studying, reading, analysing, listening and all these aspects fulfilled her job satisfaction, included her achievement on her academic work and develop close relationship with her students.. Participant 2 embraced his job satisfaction with his

contribution on the charity work and students progression on both piano lessons and personality attitude. Their improvement would be his rewards.

5.4.6 Make Meaning/Mission

The study of music enriches not only the lives of the students and teachers, but the culture and society as well. As a piano teacher, not only teaching piano and provide a proper guidance with musical knowledge, but also maintain a good relationship with students, able to share and solve students complex personality problem. Gardner (1995) stated that an understating of theory, concept and skill personally that can apply it suitably in a new circumstance. Participant 1 engaged with her holistic teaching approach is to develop students' capability and interest for playing classical piano. Participant 2 believed that self-improvement enhance not only his playing but personality refinement. Both participants acclaimed that as a music teacher, the mission is taking responsibility to educate, to inspire and to develop students' musical skills and knowledge for lifelong enjoyment.

5.5 Conclusion

The findings from this study indicated some noteworthy conclusions based on authentic lived experiences described by two participants' own voices. The in-depth interview revealed that with the propulsion theory of creative contribution and sustainability of later career, the result manifest important results and contributed the literature exceptionally. Despite it can be more or less creative in various ways, it emerge and depends on the participants situation.

It related to motivating factors that they had been stayed in their profession piano teaching and based on Sternberg and Kaufman (2012) Propulsion theory, there are eight themes related to the factors as to sustain their career for almost thirty years. The

participants in this study presented themselves by telling their lives story over the years. From their early teaching until today, they are identified with researcher, performers, musician entrepreneur which they are dedicated in the charity society. Likewise, both participants in this research demonstrated their passion is the main factor to enhance their creativity as to sustain their later career.

Additionally, their sharing in this study showed the importance and the need of the later career in music teaching. Through their sharing, it can motivate who has been staying for their career for years especially as they went through their creativity later career pathway.

5.6 Implications of the Study

The conclusions of this study mainly focused on two experienced piano teachers' perceptions about their later career creativity and sustainability in piano teaching. It considered a small but accessible research based on their live experienced interview. After making interview with two experienced and eminent piano teachers, they provide some insights in later career of teaching, included teachers attribute, process of teaching and learning.

Furthermore, their lives experiences enrich my understanding of being an experienced teacher, especially when come to the later career, passion, self-improvement, self-motivated, are the main factors as to sustain the creativity in the later career. The two participants demonstrated their passion through their diversity of identities that make their professional career more enrich, joyful and fulfilment. Currently, my practice as later career teacher has been transformed by my research study. I wish these variety resources such as integration of eight types of creative contributions of propulsion theory, passion, self-improvement, job satisfaction, make-meaning/mission and value that I can adapt in

my enthusiasm for my piano teaching, and ultimately my creativity of my teaching career can be sustained.

5.7 Recommendation for Future Study

This study has attempted to gain deeper and insightful understanding of later career and sustainability through in-depth interviews and the purpose is to gain knowledge in the later career of two experienced piano teachers' creativity and sustainability. The findings of this study mainly focused on two experienced piano teachers' perceptions about their later career creativity and sustainability in piano teaching. Despite of the small sample size and the limited account of interviews, the data collected from the interview are suitably in line with the propulsion theory. The result may not be assumed to be applicable for other fields or other instrumental teachers.

Considering the prevalence of burnout in the later career, it may have different perception of different fields that they are involving. Therefore, the future studies would be worthwhile to explore more experienced piano teachers in diverse regions of the country and other field too. It may expand to significant aspect which it may affected the interview such as gender and background. For amplifying the contribution of the current study, the future research should explore the possible implementation of the propulsion theory in later career of music teaching

The research finding would have been enriched if the researcher has an opportunity to observe their teaching classes, simultaneously, attend their master classes giving and recital performances giving by the participant 2 and also both participants' students.

Meanwhile, it is also worthwhile to explore more on sustainability of later career, since there are many of the topics and factors regarding to the status of later career mostly have not been discussed in the previous research, therefore, it is essential for continuing

research in this topics. Teachers who have been teaching for years may encounter burnout, stressful and bored on the tedious daily teaching routine. Hence, the results of the current study showed that experienced teachers' sustainability and creativity serve as a model and reference for later career of experienced piano teachers.

Lastly, recommendations for future research studies in later career of sustainability and creativity may help those experienced teachers who had been teaching for decade, they will be encouraged and motivated. Therefore, future study investigating may be included further on sustainability and creativity how they differed over time and also new factors emerged in later career they had achieved.

5.8 Closing Remarks

This study has attempted to investigate the two piano experienced teachers' perception of later career creativity and sustainability in their music teaching. It is important for experienced teachers to be motivated and inspired from their later career life journeys, they will acquire greatly profit by the two participants valuable sharing in the aspects of eight types of creative contributions of propulsion theory, self-improvement, make-meaning, job satisfaction and actively involved in the community charity works.

Furthermore, both participants had greater experience to seek ways to make the greatest contribution to society through their music profession; they believed that it will form a role model and better perspective for young generations. In addition, they acknowledged that later career is fulfilling with their valuable experiences and have claim a passion for work and wisdom they gained through their life experience that reflects them to continue contributing to the society.

The final chapter of this study has provided a number of ideas which teachers may gain the knowledge from the valuable interviewed sharing, it can serve as a model and reference for developing teachers' passion and sustainability during their later career.

Furthermore, the suggestions of the future research which it may assist in the related area of music teaching especially for piano pedagogy.

University of Malaya

REFERENCE

- Adom, D., Hussein, E. K., & Agyem, J. A. (2018). Theoretical and conceptual framework: Mandatory ingredients of quality research. *International Journal of Scientific Research*, 7(1), 438-441.
- Alsup, J. (2006). *Teacher identity discourses: Negotiating personal and professional spaces*. (1st ed.). New York, NY: Routledge. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781410617286>
- Alvesson, M., & Kärreman, D. (2011). Decolonializing discourse: Critical reflections on organizational discourse analysis. *Human Relation*, 64(9), 1121-1146. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/1177/0018726711408629>
- Anderson, J. V. (1992). Weirder than fiction: The reality and myths of creativity. *The Executive*, 6(4), 40-47. Retrieved from <https://www.jstor.org.ezproxy.um.edu.my/stable/4165093>
- Arksey, H., & Knight, P. T. (1999). *Interview for social scientists: An introductory resources with examples*. Thousands Oaks, CA: SAGE Publication Ltd.
- Baldaia, J. (2011, November 2). *The dream of wellbeing of some is not sustainable for all*. Retrieved from Intuinovare: <http://www.josebaldaia.com/intuinovare/tag/creativity-and-sustainability/?lang=en>
- Bamford, A. (2006). The arts are intrinsic. In *The wow factor: Global research compendium on the impact of the arts in education* (pp. 19-28). Munster, Germany: Waxmann Verlag.
- Banerjee, A., & Chaudhury, S. (2010). Statistics without tears: Populations and samples. *Industrial Psychiatry Journal*, 19(1), 60-65. Retrieved from <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3105563/>
- Barbier, P. Y., Pruneau, D., & Langis, M. (2009). Unfolding being-with-environment through creative problem solving in environmental education. *The International Journal of Learning: Annual Review*, 16(2), 499-510. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.18848/1447-9494/CGP/v16i02/46142>
- Barker, A. (2017). Music entrepreneurship. In K. Peppler (Ed.), *The SAGE encyclopedia of out-of-school learning* (pp. 517-522). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications Inc. doi:<https://dx.doi.org/10.4135/9781483385198.n200>
- Beattie, M. (2000). Narratives of professional learning: Becoming a teacher and learning to teach. *Journal of Educational Enquiry*, 1(2), 1-23.
- Beghetto, R. A. (2010). Creativity in the classroom. In J. C. Kaufman, & R. J. Sternberg (Eds.), *The Cambridge handbook of creativity* (pp. 447-466). Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.

- Bell, J. S. (2002). Narrative inquiry: More than just telling stories. *TESOL Quarterly*, 36(2), 207-213. Retrieved from <https://www.jstor.org/stable/3588331>
- Bergmo-Prvulovic, I. (2017). Demographic changes and the need for later career opportunities. *Adult Education Discourses*, 18, 187-206.
- Bowles, C. (2002). The self-expressed professional development needs of music educators. *Update: Applications of Research in Music Education*, 21(2), 35-41. Retrieved from <http://doi.org/10.1177/87551233020210020701>
- Brief, A. P., & Roberson, L. (2006). Job attitude organization: An exploratory study. *Journal of Applied Social Psychology*, 19(9), 717-727. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1559-1816.1989.tb01254.x>
- Britzman, D. P. (1985). *Reality and ritual: An ethnographic study of student teachers*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Massachusetts, Amherst. Retrieved June 1, 2018, from <http://ezproxy.um.edu.my:2048/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy.um.edu.my/docview/303407510?accountid=28930>
- Burnard, P. (2013). Introduction: The context for professional knowledge in music teacher education. In E. Georgii-Hemming, P. Burnard, & S. E. Holgersen (Eds.), *Professional knowledge in music teacher education* (pp. 1-15). Farnham: Ashgate.
- Carr, D. (1986). *Time, narrative, and history*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Casell, J. A., & Nelson, T. (2010). Visions lost and dreams forgotten: Environmental education, system, thinking, and possible futures in American public schools. *Teacher Education Quarterly*, 37(4), 179-197. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/23479466>
- Cheng, V. M. (2018). Views on creativity, environment sustainability and their integrated development. *Creative Education*, 9(5), 719-743. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.4236/ce.2018.95054>
- Clandinin, F. D., & Huber, J. (2010). Narrative inquiry. In B. McGraw, E. Baker, & P. Peterson (Eds.), *International encyclopedia of education* (3rd ed., Vol. 6, pp. 436-441). New York: Elsevier Ltd.
- Clandinin, F. D., Pushor, D., & Orr, A. M. (2007). Navigating sites for narrative inquiry. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 58(1), 21-35. doi:10.1177/0022487106296218
- Coker, C. (2009, Dec 9). *Redefining the roles of the musician*. Retrieved from Creating a land with music: <https://orgerruredda-hall-2b4o.squarespace.com/s/Creating-a-Land-with-Music.pdf>

- Connelly, F. M., & Clandinin, D. J. (1990). Stories of experience and narrative inquiry. *Educational Researcher*, 19(5), 2-14. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org.ezproxy.um.edu.my/stable/1776100>
- Corral-Verdugo, V., Bonnes, M., Tapia-Fonllem, C., Fraijo-Sing, B., Frias-Armenta, M., & Carrus, G. (2009). Correlates of pro-sustainability orientation: The affinity towards diversity. *Journal of Environmental Psychology*, 29(1), 34-43.
- Cotterill, Thomas. (2012, July 29). How artists develop their artistic vision. Retrieved from <http://thomascotterill.wordpress.com/2012/.../how-artists-develop-their-artistic-vision>
- Creswell, J. W. (2014). The selection of research approach. In J. W. Creswell, *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches* (4th ed., pp. 1-24). London: SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Crossman, A. (2018, September 28). *Understanding purposive sampling: An overview of the methods and its application*. Retrieved from ThoughtCo: <http://www.thoughtco.com/purposive-sampling-3026727>
- Crosswell, L., & Elliot, B. (2004). Committed teachers, passionate teachers: the dimension of passion associated with teacher commitment and engagement. Retrieved from <https://eprints.qut.edu.au/968/1/cro04237.pdf>
- Csikszentmihalyi, M. (1997). *Creativity: Flow and the psychology of discovery and invention*. New York, NY: HarperCollins Publishers.
- Danielewicz, J. (2014). Teaching selves: Identity, pedagogy, and teacher education. *Journal of Foreign Studies*, 34(4), 175-181.
- Danielsen, B. A., & Johansen, G. (2012). *Educating music teachers in the new millennium*. Oslo: Akademia Publishing. Retrieved from <https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/0ab5/89c68262179aa02454097b2211fbde821efb.pdf>
- deMarrias, K., & Lapan, S. D. (Eds.). (2004). *Foundation for research: Method of inquiry in education and the social science*. New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Inc Publishers.
- DiCicco-Bloom, B., & Crabtree, B. F. (2006). The qualitative research interview. *Medical Education*, 40, 314-321. Retrieved from <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2929.02418.x>
- Drucker, P. F. (1999, January). Managing oneself. *Harvard Business Review*, 77(2), 64-74.
- Edwards, A. R. (2005). *The sustainability revolution: Portrait of paradigm shift*. Gabriola Island: New Society Publishers.

- Elbaz-Luwisch, F. (2007). Studying teachers' lives and experiences: Narrative inquiry into K-12 teaching. In D. J. Clandinin, *Handbook of narrative inquiry: Mapping a methodology* (pp. 357-382). Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Elliot, J. (2006). *Using narrative in social research: Qualitative and quantitative approaches*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Elliott, D. J. (1995). *Music matters: A new philosophy of music education*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Flood, M., & Phillips, K. D. (2007). Creativity in older adults: A plethora of possibilities. *Issues in Mental Health Nursing*, 28(4), 389-411. doi:10.1080/01612840701252956
- Freire, P. (1970). *Pedagogy of the oppressed*. (M. B. Ramos, Trans.) New York: The Continuum Publishing Group Inc.
- Fried, R. L. (2001). *The passionate teacher: A practical guide* (2nd ed.). Boston: Beacon Press.
- Fung, C. V. (1995). Rationales for teaching world musics. *Music Educators Journal*, 82(1), 36-40. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org.ezproxy.um.edu.my/stable/3398884>
- Garces-Bascal, R. M. (2016). Extending flow further: Narrative of a Filipino musician. *International Journal of Music Education*, 34(4), 433-444. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761415590368>
- Gardner, H. (1995). Creativity: New views from psychology and education. *RSA Journal*, 143(5459), 33-42. Retrieved from <https://www.jstor.org.ezproxy.um.edu.my/stable/41376733>
- Glaser, B. G. (2002). Conceptualization: On theory and theorizing using grounded theory. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 1(2). Retrieved from <https://doi-org-ezproxy.um.edu.my/10.1177/160940690200100203>
- Glesne, C. (2011). *Becoming qualitative researchers: An introduction* (4th ed.). Boston: Pearson.
- Grace, K. (2014, December 17). *What is artistic vision?* Retrieved from Quora: <https://www.quora.com/what-is-artistic-vision>
- Grange, L. L. (2013). The politics of needs and sustainability education. In R. B. Steven, M. Brody, J. Dillon, & A. E. Wals (Eds.), *International handbook of research on environmental education* (pp. 126-132). London: Routledge.
- Grant, C., & Osanloo, A. (2014). Understanding, selecting, and integrating a theoretical framework in dissertation research: Creating the blueprint for your "house". *Administrative Issues Journal: Connecting Education, Practice and Research*, 4(2). doi:10.5929/2014.4.2.9

- Hargreaves, A., & Fink, D. (2003). Sustaining leadership. *Phi Delta Kappan*, 84(9), 693-700. doi:10.1177/003170308400910
- Hargreaves, D. J., Purves, R. M., Welch, G. F., & Marshall, N. A. (2007). Developing identities and attitudes in musicians and classroom music teachers. *The British Psychological Society*, 77, 665-682. doi:10.1348/000709906XI54676
- Hermanowicz, J. C. (2002). The great interview: 25 strategies for studying people in bed. *Qualitative Sociology*, 25(4), 479-499. doi:10.1023/A:1021062932081
- Hollway, W., & Jefferson, T. (2000). *Doing qualitative research differently: Free association, narrative and the interview method*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Holstein, J. A., & Gubrium, J. F. (1997). Active interviewing. In D. Silverman (Ed.), *Qualitative research theory, method and practice* (pp. 113-129). London: Sage.
- Huckle, J. (1996). Realizing sustainability in changing times. In J. Huckle, & S. Sterling (Eds.), *Education for sustainability* (pp. 3-17). London: Earthscan.
- Iannarone, S. S. (2008). Planning for sustainability: Cultivating wisdom and creativity in practice and theory. Retrieved from https://web.pdx.edu/~sari/Wisdom_Creativity_Draft.pdf
- Johnson, R. W., Kawachi, J., & Lewis, E. K. (2009). *Older workers on the move: Recareering in later life*. Washington: AARP Public Policy Institute.
- Jordhus-Lier, A. (2015). Music teaching as a profession on professionalism and securing the quality of music teaching in Norwegian municipal schools of music and performing arts. *Nordic Research in Music Education*, 16, 163–182.
- Kaschub, M., & Smith, J. (2014). *Promising practices in 21st century music teacher education*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- Kaufman, J. C., & Beghetto, R. A. (2009). Beyond big and little: The four C model of creativity. *Review of General Psychology*, 13(1), 1-12. doi:10.1037/a0013688
- Kaufman, J. C., & Skidmore, L. E. (2010). Taking the propulsion model of creative contributions into the 21st century. *Psychologie in Österreich*, 5, 378-381. Retrieved from https://jck_articles.s3.amazonaws.com/KaufmanSkidmore.pdf
- Khandwalla, P. N. (2004). Quality of creativity. In *Lifelong creativity an unending quest*. New Delhi: Tata McGraw-Hill Publishing Company Limited.
- Kilic, I., & Yazici, T. (2012). Study of job satisfaction and professional exhaustion of music teachers in fine arts and sport high school of some variables. *e-Journal of New World Sciences Academy*, 7(2), 182-198.
- Klickstein, G. (2009). *The musician's way: A guide to practice, performance, and wellness*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.

- Klickstein, G. (2010, September 12). *Artistic vision*. Retrieved from MusicianWay.com: MusicianWay.com:<https://www.musicianway.com/blog/2010/09/artistic-vision/>
- Klickstein, G. (2012, November 5). *8 ways to build sustainable music careers*. Retrieved March 23, 2019, from MusicianWays.com: <https://www.musiciansway.com/blog/2012/11/8-ways-to-build-sustainable-music-careers/>
- Klickstein, Gerald. (2010, September 12). *Artistic Vision*. Retrieved from MusicianWay.com: <https://www/musicianway.com/blog/2010/09/artistic-vision/>
- Lanier, J. T. (1997). Redefining the role of the teacher: It's a multifaceted profession. *George Lucas Educational Foundation*. Retrieved from <https://www.edutopia.org/redefining-role-teacher>
- Linde, C. (1993). *Life stories: The creation of coherence*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- Liston, D., & Garrison, J. W. (Eds.). (2004). *Teaching, learning and loving: Reclaiming passion in educational practice*. London: RoutledgeFalmer.
- Lutzker, P. (2012). Developing artistry in teaching: New approaches to teacher education. *Research on Steiner Education*, 3(1), 52-58. Retrieved from <https://www.rosejourn.com/index.php/rose/article/viewfile/96/122>
- Lyons, N., & Laboskey, V. K. (2002). *Narrative inquiry in practice: Advancing the knowledge of teaching*. New York, NY: Teacher College Press.
- Madsen, C. K., & Hancock, C. B. (2002). Support for music education: A case study of issues concerning teacher retention and attrition. *Journal of Research in Music education*, 50(1), 6-19. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.2307/3345699>
- Marckwardt, A. H., Cassidy, F. G., & McMillan, J. (1992). *Webster comprehensive dictionary* (Vols. 1-2). Chicago: J.G. Ferguson.
- McLeod, S. (2014). *The sampling methods*. Retrieved from Simply Psychology: <https://www.simplypsychology.org/sampling.html>
- McPherson, G. E., & Hallam, S. (2016). Musical potential. In S. Hallam, I. Cross, & M. Thaut (Eds.), *The Oxford handbook of music psychology* (2nd ed., pp. 433-448). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldana, J. (2013). Designing matrix and networks displays. In *Qualitative data analysis: A methods sourcebook* (pp. 107-119). Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publishers Ltd.
- Mumford, M. D., & Strange, J. M. (2002). The origins of vision charismatic: Versus ideological leadership. *The Leadership Quarterly*, 13(4), 343-377.
- Murray Orr, A. (2005). *Stories to live by: Book conversation as spaces for attending to children's lives in school*. Unpublished Doctoral dissertation, University of

Alberta . Retrieved September 8, 2018, from <https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy.um.edu.my/pqdtglobal/docview/305381227/E81EF9C9017948D5PQ/1?accountid=28930>

- Nakamura, J., & Csikszentmihalyi, M. (2003). Creativity in later life. In K. R. Sawyer, V. John-Steiner, S. Moran, R. J. Sternberg, D. H. Feldman, J. Nakamura, & M. Csikszentmihalyi, *Creativity and development* (pp. 186-216). New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- Nart, S. (2017). Influences of music education and values education to each other thru the transfer of cultural values. *The Journal of Academic Social Science Studies*, *61*, 77-89.
- Newman-Storen, R. (2014). Leadership in sustainability: Creating an interface between creativity and leadership theory in dealing with “Wicked Problems”. *6*(9), 5955-5967. doi:10.3390/su6095955
- Ng, T. W., & Feldman, D. C. (2008). The relationship of age to ten dimensions of job performance. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, *93*(2), 392-423. Retrieved from <http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/0021-9010.93.2.392>
- Palmer, P. J. (2007). *The courage to teach: Exploring the inner landscape of a teacher's life*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publisher.
- Pawson, E. (2001). Sustainability and management of the environment. *UC Research Repository*, 455-470. Retrieved from https://1258913_Chapter 25_The Physical Environment.pdf
- Pelt, M. J., Kuyvenhoven, A., & Nijkamp, P. (1990). Project appraisal and sustainability: Methodological challenges. *Project Appraisal*, *5*(3), 139-158. doi:10.1080/02688867.1990.9726764
- Petocz, P., Reid, A., & Bennett, D. (2014). The music workforce, cultural heritage and sustainability. *International Journal of Cultural and Creative Industries*, *1*(2), 4-16.
- Phillion, J. (2002). Becoming a narrative inquirer in a multicultural landscape. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, *34*(5), 535-556.
- Pratt, A. C. (2008). Creative cities: The cultural industries and the creative class. *Geografiska Annaler: Series B, Human Geography*, *90*(2), 107-117.
- Regelski, T. A. (2009). The ethics of music teaching as profession and praxis. *Visions of Research in Music Education*, *13*, 1-34. Retrieved from <http://www.researchgate.net/publication/267990844>
- Runco, M. A., & Jaeger, G. J. (2012). The standard definition of creativity. *Creativity Research Journal*, *24*(1), 92-96. Retrieved from <https://dx.doi.org/10.1080/10400419.2012.650092>

- Sanchez-Jankowski, M. (2002). Representation, responsibility and reliability in participant-observation. In T. May, *Qualitative Research in Action* (pp. 133-146). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications Ltd. Retrieved from <https://edpf.pub/qualitative-research-in-action-html>
- Scarneci-Domnisoru, F. (2013). Narrative technique of interviewing. *Bulletin of The Transylvania University Of Brasov. Series VII: Social Sciences. Law*, 6(55), 21-28.
- Schwartz, S. H. (2010). Are there universal aspects in the structure and contents of human values? *Journal of Social Issues*, 50(4), 19-45. doi:10.1111/j.1540-4560.1994.tb01196.x
- Schwartz, S. H. (2012). An overview of the Schwartz theory of basic values. *Online Readings in Psychology and Culture*, 2(1). Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.9707/2307-0919.1116>
- Seidman, I. (2006). *Interviewing as qualitative research: A guide for reserachers in education and the social sciences* (3rd ed.). New York, NY: Teachers College Press.
- Simonton, D. K. (1999). Creativity from a historiometric perspective. In R. J. Sternberg, *Handbook of creativity* (pp. 116-125). Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press.
- Sirota, R. (2012, November 5). *8 ways to build sustainable music careers*. Retrieved from MusicianWay.com: <https://www.musicianway.com/blog/2012/11/9-ways-to-build-sustainable-music-careers/>
- Smith, M. V., & Haack, P. (2000). The long view of lifelong learning: Lifelong learning and periodic self-assessment are vital for maintaining enthusiasm and avoiding professional burnout. *Music Educators Journal*, 87(3), 28-33. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.2307/3399660>
- Sobel, D. (2004). Place-based Education: Connecting classroom and community. Retrieved from <http://www.antioch.edu/new-england/wp-content/uploads/sites/6/.../pbexcerpt.pdf>
- Sternberg, R. J. (1999). A propulsion model of types of creative contributions. *Review of General Psychology*, 3(2), 83-100 . Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1037/1089-2680.3.2.83>
- Sternberg, R. J. (2003). The propulsion theory of creative contributions. In *Wisdom, intelligence, and creativity synthesized* (pp. 124-144). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Sternberg, R. J. (2003). *Wisdom, Intelligence and Creativity Synthesized*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

- Sternberg, R. J. (2006). The nature of creativity. *Creativity Research Journal*, 18(1), 87-98. doi:10.1207/s15326934cri1801_10
- Sternberg, R. J. (n.d.). *Theory of creativity*. Retrieved from Creativity: <https://www.robertsternberg.com/inversment-theory-of-creativity>
- Sternberg, R. J., & Kaufman, J. C. (2012). When your race is almost run, but you feel you're not yet done: Application of the propulsion theory of creative contributions to late-career challenges. *Creative Education Foundations*, 46(1), 66-76. doi:10.1002/jocb.005
- Sternberg, R. J., & Vroom, V. H. (2002). The person versus the situation in leadership. *Leadership Quarterly*, 13(3), 301-323. Retrieved from [https://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S1048-9843902\)001101-7](https://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S1048-9843902)001101-7)
- Sternberg, R. J., Kaufman, J. C., & Pretz, J. (2001). The propulsion model of creative contributions applied to the arts and letters. *Journal of Creative Behaviour*, 35(2), 75-101. doi:10.1002/j.2162-6057.2001.tb0123.x
- Sternberg, R. J., Kaufman, J. C., & Pretz, J. E. (2003). A propulsion model of creative leadership. *Creativity and Innovation Management*, 13(3), 455-473. doi:10.1016/51048-9843(03)00047-X
- Stuhr, P. L. (2003). A tale of why social and cultural content is often excluded from art education: and why it should not be. *Studies in Art Education*, 44(4), 301-314. Retrieved from <https://www.jstor.org.exproxy.um.edu.my/stable/1321019>
- Thomas, L., & Beauchamp, C. (2007). Learning to live well as teachers in a changing world: Insights into developing a professional identity in teacher education. *The Journal Of Educational Thought (JET)*, 41(3), 229-243.
- Thompson, D. (1995). *The concise Oxford dictionary of current English*. New York : Oxford University Press.
- Voetmann, P., Golden, A., Maenpaa, M., McAttackney, L., Rekola, S., & Lind, U. (2015). Culture and sustainability. Retrieved from https://www.nordiskkulturkontakt.org/wp.../09/Culture-and-sustainability_lores.pdf.
- Walliman, N., & Baiche, B. (2001). Types of research. In *Your research project: A step-by-step guide for the first time researcher* (pp. 69-116). London: SAGE Publishers Ltd. Retrieved from <https://edpf.tips/.../your-research-project-a-step-by-step-guide-for-the-first-time-research>
- Wangberg, J. K. (1996). Teaching with passion. *American Entomologist*, 42(4), 199-200. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1093/ae/42.4.199>
- Webstar, L., & Mertova, P. (2007). Narrative in research. In *Using narrative inquiry as a research method: An introduction to using critical event narrative analysis in research on learning and teaching* (pp. 13-24). London: Routledge.

Weibe, D. A. (2017, July 20). *What does it mean to be a musician entrepreneur?*
Retrieved from Music Entrepreneur HQ:
<https://medium.com/@GoGirlsMusic/what-does-it-mean-to-be-a-musician-entrepreneur-2d705fd6c18c>

Zhang, C. (2014, November 11). *For Lang Lang it's encore encore*. Retrieved from China Dially Europe:
<https://www.chinadialy.com.cn/a/201411/21/WS5a2a37fea3101a51ddf8f8c5.html>

University of Malaya