

R

Wisdom in Conflict:
Three Voices in *The Tempest*

Tuti Ramizan Binti Mohtar

A dissertation submitted to the University of Malaya in partial
fulfillment of the requirement for the Degree of
Masters of Arts (English)

Department of English
Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences
University Malaya

May 2003

Perpustakaan Universiti Malaya



A511202227

To my beloved husband
Muhammad Salahuddin Shahar
who shares my life, tolerates my foibles,
taught me compassion, and
encourages me to dream.

Acknowledgement

In the name of Allah, the Almighty Lord, the Most Gracious and Merciful.

Praise be to Allah who has given me the strength, inspirations and prudence to bring this dissertation to a close. Peace be upon His messenger Muhammad and his honourable family.

Throughout this academic quest, the following people have generously granted their precious guidance and never-ending assistance wherein I am eternally grateful.

First of all, I would like to express my deepest gratitude to my supervisor, Professor Lim Chee Seng, for his immeasurable wisdom, endless patience and ever constructive comments. To my precious inimitable friend, Radziah Nasir, thank you for the inexhaustible moral and spiritual support. To Gina and Martini, I earnestly thank thee for thou art rare gems. Truly thou speakest wiser than thou art ware of.

I am also indebted to my family: Ayah and Mummy, thank you for everything.

To all my friends and colleagues especially Chairuzila, Rusdi, Balaetham, Sitha, Ismaz, Maslawati, Roselind, Salina, Maizura, Azlan, A.J, Gopala, Raj and Dee; thank you for each and every insightful thoughts and caring encouragements. Alhamdulillah.

Abstract

The purpose of this dissertation is to distinguish three varieties of wisdom found in the voices of three characters – Prospero, Gonzalo and Caliban – in Shakespeare’s *The Tempest*. As each voice enunciates its conviction, predisposition and integrity in the interactions between the three characters, conflicts are generated from opposition and juxtaposition of the wisdoms identified in the three voices. The first chapter presents the objectives of the study, discusses the play in its received wisdom, its background and outlines the theoretical framework of the thesis. The second chapter looks at the abstraction of wisdom as well as how man observed and distinguished wisdom throughout the different ages. These two chapters form the foundation for the next chapter. Chapter 3 examines each voice, ascertaining their individual representation as deriving from the Ancient Western Wisdom, Renaissance Wisdom or New World Wisdom. The latter part of this chapter juxtaposes the three voices along with their representations so as to determine their disparate wisdom in conflict. The final chapter concludes that the Ancients’ construction of wisdom is neither complete nor perfect as to be deemed as the yardstick for all ages. As a consequence, we should gauge our world by our own standards and not be bound by any form of prefabricated ancient and alien standards. This study raises a vital point – we need to liberate our restrained understanding of wisdom as well as recognising our own ability as at par with that of our past physical and existing mental colonisers.

Abstrak

Disertasi ini akan meneliti tiga bentuk kebijaksanaan menerusi suara tiga watak utama iaitu Prospero, Gonzalo dan Caliban di dalam karya Shakespeare *The Tempest*. Suara tiga watak di dalam karya tersebut mengandungi integriti, kewibawaan serta kecenderungan tersendiri. Interaksi di antara suara ketiga-tiga watak mewujudkan pelbagai konflik terutamanya apabila pertuturan dan kebijaksanaan mereka dibandingkan secara selari atau bertentangan. Bab Satu membincangkan mengenai teori asas dan latar belakang karya yang digunakan di dalam kajian ini di samping objektif dan tujuan penyelidikan. Analisa mengenai konsep kebijaksanaan serta bagaimana manusia mengandaikan dan membezakan kebijaksanaan itu merentasi zaman akan di utarakan di Bab Dua. Bab Tiga adalah mengenai kepastian terhadap setiap suara kepada bentuk kebijaksanaannya, sama ada suara itu mengandungi kebijaksanaan yang berlandaskan Kebijaksanaan Kuno Barat, Kebijaksanaan Renaissance atau Kebijaksanaan Dunia Baru. Hal ini adalah untuk memastikan adakah konflik itu wujud akibat dari perbezaan bentuk asas kebijaksanaan mereka atau sebaliknya. Bab Empat pula menyimpulkan bahawa kebijaksanaan yang dibentuk oleh ahli falsafah Kuno Barat bukanlah sempurna dan tidak boleh dijadikan kayu pengukur yang unggul. Oleh itu, kita mestilah menilai dunia kita dengan ukuran tersendiri dan tidak terikat dengan nilai-nilai atau sukatan yang asing atau kuno. Kajian ini mengunjurkan maklumat yang mustahak di mana kita wajar memerdekan interpretasi kebijaksanaan kita kerana ia membolehkan kita menilai kebolehan sendiri setara dengan penjajah fizikal yang lalu mahupun penjajah mental kita sekarang.

Table of Contents:

| | |
|--|-----------|
| Acknowledgement | ii |
| Abstract | iii |
| Abstrak | iv |
| | |
| CHAPTER ONE | 1 |
| 1.0 INTRODUCTION | 1 |
| 1.1 OBJECTIVE OF THE STUDY | 2 |
| 1.1.1 <i>THE TEMPEST</i> IN RECEIVED WISDOM..... | 3 |
| 1.2 STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM..... | 5 |
| 1.3 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK | 9 |
| 1.3.1 NEW HISTORICISM AND CULTURAL MATERIALISM..... | 10 |
| 1.4 BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY | 14 |
| 1.4.1 HISTORY OF <i>THE TEMPEST</i> | 14 |
| 1.4.2 THE CRITICAL RECEPTION OF <i>THE TEMPEST</i> | 20 |
| 1.4.3 THE SHAKESPEAREAN MILIEU | 23 |
| 1.4.4 DISCOVERY OF THE NEW WORLD..... | 29 |
| | |
| CHAPTER 2 | 37 |
| 2.0 INTRODUCTION | 37 |
| 2.1 ASPECTS OF WISDOM: THEN AND NOW..... | 38 |

| | |
|---|----------------|
| 2.1.1 WISDOM ACCORDING TO THE WESTERN ANCIENTS..... | 39 |
| 2.1.2 CURRENT PERCEPTION OF WISDOM..... | 43 |
| 2.2 ACTS OF WISDOM..... | 47 |
| 2.3 THE NATURE OF RENAISSANCE MAN ACCORDING TO ANCIENT WESTERN WISDOM..... | 49 |
| 2.3 THE NATURE OF MAN ACCORDING TO THE RENAISSANCE..... | 59 |
| 2.3.1 THE RENAISSANCE CONFLICT..... | 62 |
| 2.3.1.1 Copernicus and the Cosmological Hierarchy..... | 63 |
| 2.3.1.2 Montaigne and the Natural Hierarchy..... | 63 |
| 2.3.1.3 Machiavelli and the Political Hierarchy..... | 65 |
| CHAPTER 3..... | 68 |
| 3.0 INTRODUCTION..... | 68 |
| 3.1 THE THREE VOICES..... | 70 |
| 3.1.1 PROSPERO - THE VOICE OF ANCIENT WISDOM..... | 72 |
| 3.1.2 CALIBAN - THE VOICE OF NEW WORLD WISDOM..... | 82 |
| 3.1.3 GONZALO – THE VOICE OF RENAISSANCE WISDOM..... | 100 |
| 3.2 WISDOMS IN CONFLICT..... | 109 |
| CHAPTER 4..... | 131 |
| 4.0 CONCLUSION..... | 131 |
| ENDNOTES..... | 145 |
| BIBLIOGRAPHY | |
| APPENDIX 1 | |