

ACP9235
P

AN ERROR ANALYSIS OF ENGLISH PREPOSITIONS IN THE WRITTEN
WORK OF UPPER SECONDARY MALAY STUDENTS

PERPUSTAKAAN
UNIVERSITI MALAYA

Loi Chek Kim

Perpustakaan Universiti Malaya



A509556967

A Thesis submitted to the Faculty of Languages and Linguistics,
University of Malaya
in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of Masters in Linguistics
2001

ABSTRAK

Tujuan utama bagi kajian ini adalah untuk mencari kesilapan preposisi yang lumrah dalam penulisan pelajar Melayu Tingkatan Empat yang telah belajar Bahasa Inggeris selama sepuluh tahun. Selain itu, suatu perbandingan terhadap jumlah kesilapan dalam pelbagai konsep preposisi dan punca ujudnya kesilapan-kesilapan itu juga dikaji. Sembilan konsep preposisi telah dikaji , yakni, preposisi tempat, preposisi arah, preposisi masa, preposisi cara-agen, preposisi sebab-tujuan, preposisi persamaan, preposisi perkaitan, preposisi katakerja-prep dan preposisi adjektif-prep. Sembilan konsep preposisi ini dikaji kerana penggunaan preposisi ini adalah lebih sukar bagi pelajar-pelajar.

Subjek kajian adalah terdiri daripada 150 pelajar Melayu Tingkatan 4 di S.M.K. La Salle, Petaling. Suatu ujian diagnostik telah diadakan untuk mendapatkan data-data bagi kajian ini. Pelajar-pelajar Melayu ini dikehendaki menulis sebuah karangan dan mengisi tempat kosong dalam ayat-ayat dengan memilih preposisi yang betul. Karangan dan latihan tersebut diperiksa dan kesilapan preposisi dalam 9 konsep preposisi itu telah ditanda dan dikira. Kesilapan preposisi itu telah dibincang dari segi pengujudan dan punca. Suatu hasil kajian yang jelas ialah pelajar-pelajar Melayu itu membuat banyak kesilapan dalam penggunaan preposisi masa, tempat dan arah. Banyak kesilapan preposisi ini berlaku dalam kategori pilihan yang salah. Oleh itu, dapat dirumuskan bahawa masalah utama dalam penggunaan preposisi bagi pelajar-pelajar Melayu tersebut adalah bekaitan dengan pemilihan preposisi yang betul dalam ayat-ayat.

Kajian terhadap analisa kesilapan dalam penggunaan preposisi ini dapat memanfaatkan guru bahasa untuk mengajar preposisi kerana hasil kajian ini dapat memberikan pengetahuan dan fahaman tentang masalah yang dihadapi oleh pelajar Melayu dalam penggunaan preposisi Bahasa Inggeris. Beberapa cadangan bagi pengajaran preposisi Bahasa Inggeris juga diberi memandangkan cara mengajar preposisi Bahasa Inggeris dapat memainkan peranan yang penting dalam memudahkan pembelajaran preposisi.

ABSTRACT

The primary aims of this study are to identify the common prepositional errors in the written texts of Form 4 Malay ESL students who have studied English in school for ten years, to measure the relative intensities of these errors and to find out the causes for the occurrence of these errors. Nine concepts of prepositions which pose the most difficulty for students are examined. They are prepositions of place, prepositions of direction, prepositions of time, prepositions of manner-agent, prepositions of cause-purpose, prepositions of similarity, prepositions of association, prepositions of verb-prep, and prepositions of adj-prep.

The subjects selected for this study consisted of 150 Form 4 Malay students in S.M.K. La Salle, Petaling. A diagnostic test was administered to these students to elicit the data in which they were required to write an essay and fill the blanks of a cloze text and sentences with the correct prepositions. The essays and the exercises are examined and prepositional errors related to the nine concepts of prepositions are identified and quantified. These errors are described and explained for their occurrences. Besides that, the major causes for these prepositional errors are discussed. One significant finding is that the subjects made the most number of errors in using the prepositions of time, place and direction. These prepositional errors mostly occurred in the category of wrong selection. It can be concluded that the major problem of the Form 4 Malay students is related to the selection of a correct preposition for a sentence.

This study of error analysis on prepositions should be useful to a language teacher in teaching prepositions, as it will give him the knowledge and understanding of the problems faced by the students in the use of English prepositions. Some suggestions for the teaching of English prepositions are also included as the method of teaching English prepositions could play a vital role in facilitating the learning of prepositions.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my profound gratitude to my respectable supervisor, Dr. Azirah for her invaluable guidance, patience, and for the many constructive comments given right from the inception of this study to its completion. I also want to record my sincere thanks to all the lecturers who taught me the various papers. They have been a rich source of knowledge to me.

I am particularly indebted to my friend, Charbati Youssef who has kindly rendered his assistance selflessly in typing, giving his numerous ideas and asking me not to give up. Without him, this thesis would not have taken shape on time. I will always appreciate his concern and kindness.

I also want to thank my family members who have assisted me in the quantification of data. Besides that, they always took time to listen to my frustration and comfort me. My gratitude is also extended to the form 4 Malay students of S.M.K. La Salle, Petaling for their cooperation in completing the worksheets.

Last but not least, I am deeply grateful to God for blessing me with good health and wisdom. He has always been there for me, whether it rains or shines. It's by His grace that I have finally successfully completed my thesis. He has truly been my pillar of strength and source of inspiration.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | Page |
|------------------------------|-------------|
| ABSTRAK | ii |
| ABSTRACT | iv |
| ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS | vi |
| LIST OF TABLES | xiii |
| LIST OF FIGURES | xiv |
| LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS | xvi |

CHAPTER

| | |
|-------------------------------|---|
| I INTRODUCTION | 1 |
| 1.1 Background to the Study | 1 |
| 1.2 Statement of the Problem | 2 |
| 1.3 Objectives of the Study | 4 |
| 1.4 Research Questions | 5 |
| 1.5 Limitation of the Study | 5 |
| 1.6 Significance of the Study | 6 |

| CHAPTER | | Page |
|----------------|--|-------------|
| II | REVIEW OF THE RELATED LITERATURE | 8 |
| 2.1 | Theories of Language Learning Acquisition | 8 |
| 2.2 | Interlanguage Hypothesis..... | 8 |
| 2.3 | Contrastive Analysis | 10 |
| 2.3.1 | The Rationale for Contrastive Analysis | 11 |
| 2.3.2 | Critics of Contrastive Analysis | 13 |
| 2.4 | Interlanguage Hypothesis Versus Contrastive Analysis | 14 |
| 2.5 | Error Analysis | 15 |
| 2.5.1 | Critics of Error Analysis | 16 |
| 2.6 | Contrastive Analysis Versus Error Analysis | 17 |
| 2.7 | Interlingual Errors Versus Intralingual Errors | 18 |
| 2.7.1 | Interlingual Errors | 19 |
| 2.7.2 | Intralingual Errors | 19 |
| 2.7.2.1 | Overgeneralization | 21 |
| 2.7.2.2 | Ignorance of Rules Restriction | 22 |
| 2.7.2.3 | Incomplete Application of Rules | 22 |
| 2.7.2.4 | False Concepts Hypothesized | 24 |
| 2.8 | Prepositions | 25 |
| 2.9 | Review of the Past Studies and Implications..... | 32 |

| CHAPTER | Page |
|---|-------------|
| III METHODOLOGY | 37 |
| 3.1 The Subjects | 37 |
| 3.2 Methodology | 37 |
| 3.3 Administration of the Method | 38 |
| 3.4 Data Analysis | 38 |
| IV RESULTS AND DISCUSSION | 42 |
| 4.1 Presentation of Data Analysis | 42 |
| 4.2 Examples of the Prepositional Errors | 66 |
| 4.2.1 Prepositions of Place | 66 |
| 4.2.2 Prepositions of Direction | 67 |
| 4.2.3 Prepositions of Time | 68 |
| 4.2.4 Prepositions of Manner-Agent | 69 |
| 4.2.5 Prepositions of Cause-Purpose | 70 |
| 4.2.6 Prepositions of Similarity | 71 |
| 4.2.7 Prepositions of Association | 71 |
| 4.2.8 Prepositions of Verb-Prep Combination | 72 |
| 4.2.9 Prepositions of Adj-Prep Combination | 73 |
| 4.3 Discussion of Findings | 74 |
| 4.3.1 Prepositions of Place | 74 |

| CHAPTER | | Page |
|--|-----|-------------|
| 4.3.1.1 Wrong Insertion of ‘in’ | 74 | |
| 4.3.1.2 Wrong Selection of ‘at’ | 75 | |
| 4.3.1.3 Omission of ‘at’ | 76 | |
| 4.3.1.4 Unnecessary Insertion of ‘at’ | 76 | |
| 4.3.1.5 Wrong Selection of ‘on’ | 78 | |
| 4.3.2 Prepositions of Direction | 79 | |
| 4.3.2.1 Wrong Selection of ‘to’ | 79 | |
| 4.3.2.2 Omission of ‘to’ | 81 | |
| 4.3.2.3 Wrong Selection of ‘through’ | 81 | |
| 4.3.2.4 Omission of ‘through’ | 82 | |
| 4.3.2.5 Wrong Selection of ‘towards’ | 82 | |
| 4.3.2.6 Wrong Selection of ‘into’ | 84 | |
| 4.3.2.7 Wrong Selection of ‘of’ | 85 | |
| 4.3.3 Prepositions of Time | 85. | |
| 4.3.3.1 Wrong Selection of ‘on’ | 85 | |
| 4.3.3.2 Wrong Selection of ‘in’ | 87 | |
| 4.3.3.3 Unnecessary Insertion of ‘in’ | 88 | |
| 4.3.3.4 Wrong Selection of ‘at’ | 89 | |
| 4.3.3.5 Omission of ‘at’ | 90 | |
| 4.3.3.6 Unnecessary Insertion of ‘at’ | 90 | |
| 4.3.3.7 Wrong Selection of ‘for’ | 91. | |
| 4.3.3.8 Unnecessary Insertion of ‘after’ | 92 | |

| CHAPTER | | Page |
|--|------------|-------------|
| 4.3.4 Prepositions of Manner-Agent | 92 | |
| 4.3.4.1 Wrong Selection of ‘on’ and ‘in’ | 92 | |
| 4.3.4.2 Wrong Selection of ‘by’ | 94 | |
| 4.3.5 Prepositions of Cause-Purpose | 95 | |
| 4.3.5.1 Unnecessary Insertion of ‘for’ | 95 | |
| 4.3.5.2 Omission of ‘of’ | 95 | |
| 4.3.5.3 Wrong Selection of ‘to’ | 96 | |
| 4.3.6 Prepositions of Verb-Prep and Adj-Prep | 96 | |
| 4.3.6.1 Wrong Selection of the Prepositions | 96 | |
| 4.3.7 Prepositions of Association | 97 | |
| 4.3.7.1 Wrong Selection of ‘between’ and ‘among’ | 97 | |
| 4.3.7.2 Omission of ‘between’ and ‘among’ | 98 | |
| 4.3.7.3 Unnecessary Insertion of ‘between’ and ‘among’ | 99 | |
| 4.3.8 Prepositions of Similarity | 99 | |
| 4.3.8.1 Wrong Selection of ‘as’ and ‘like’ | 99 | |
| V CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS | 102 | |
| 5.1 Conclusion | 102 | |
| 5.2 Suggestions for the Teaching of English Prepositions | 105 | |
| 5.3 Recommendations for Further Research | 107 | |

| | | |
|---------------------------|---|-----|
| BIBLIOGRAPHY | 108 | |
| APPENDIX | | |
| A | Cover Page for the Questions Paper..... | 116 |
| B | Samples of the Malay Students' Compositions..... | 117 |
| C | Samples of Cloze Test / Sentence Completion Worksheets..... | 129 |

LIST OF TABLES

| Table | | Page |
|--------------|---|-------------|
| 1 | Distribution of Prepositional Errors in the Instruments | 43 |
| 2 | Distribution of Prepositional Errors in the Sub-Categories..... | 45 |
| 3 | Prepositional Errors of Time in Their Respective Sub-Categories..... | 50 |
| 4 | Prepositional Errors of Place in Their Respective Sub-Categories..... | 52. |
| 5 | Prepositional Errors of Direction in Their Respective Sub-Categories..... | 54 |
| 6 | Prepositional Errors of Verb-Prep in Their Respective Sub-Categories..... | 56 |
| 7 | Prepositional Errors of Manner-Agent in Their Respective Sub-Categories... | 58 |
| 8 | Prepositional Errors of Adj-Prep in Their Respective Sub-Categories..... | 60 |
| 9 | Prepositional Errors of Cause-Purpose in Their Respective Sub-Categories... | 62 |
| 10 | Prepositional Errors of Similarity in Their Respective Sub-Categories..... | 63 |
| 11 | Prepositional Errors of Association in Their Respective Sub-Categories..... | 65 |

LIST OF FIGURES

| Figure | | Page |
|---------------|--|-------------|
| 1 | Distribution of Prepositional Errors in the Instruments..... | 44 |
| 2 | Distribution of Errors in the Nine Concepts of Prepositional Meanings..... | 44 |
| 3 | Prepositional Errors of the Nine Concepts of Prepositional Meanings in the Three Sub-Categories..... | 46. |
| 4 | Prepositional Errors of Nine Concepts in the Sub-Category of Wrong Selection..... | 47 |
| 5 | Prepositional Errors of Nine Concepts in the Sub-Category of Omission..... | 47 |
| 6 | Prepositional Errors of Nine Concepts in the Sub-Category of Insertion..... | 48 |
| 7 | Distribution of Prepositional Errors in the Three Sub-Categories.. | 49 |
| 8 | Percentage of Prepositional Errors in the Three Sub-Categories... <td style="text-align: right;">49</td> | 49 |
| 9 | Distribution of Prepositional Errors in the Concept of Time..... | 51 |
| 10 | Distribution of Prepositional Errors in the Concept of Place | 53 |
| 11 | Distribution of Prepositional Errors in the Concept of Direction .. | 55 |
| 12 | Distribution of Prepositional Errors (Prepositions of Verb-Prep).. | 57 |

| Figure | Page |
|--|-------------|
| 13 Distribution of Prepositional Errors in the Concept of Manner-Agent... | 59 |
| 14 Distribution of Prepositional Errors (Prepositions of Adj-Prep)..... | 61 |
| 15 Distribution of Prepositional Errors in the Concept of Cause-Purpose... | 62 |
| 16 Distribution of Prepositional Errors in the Concept of Similarity..... | 64 |
| 17 Distribution of Prepositional Errors in the Concept of Association..... | 65 |

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

| | |
|-----------|----------------------------|
| L1 | First Language |
| L2 | Second Language |
| ESL | English as Second Language |
| CA | Contrastive Analysis |
| EA | Error Analysis |
| Prep | Preposition |
| Adj-Prep | Adjective-Preposition |
| Verb-Prep | Verb-Preposition |
| B.M. | Bahasa Melayu |