CHAPTER V
RESEARCH FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The preceding chapters have explored the various aspects of the QCC systems, both internal and external to the Circles, which can influence the development of the Circles in the two public organizations. Attempts were made to examine the QCC implementation strategies, their QCC organizational structures and the different parts that make up the QCC System—the Steering Committee, the facilitators and participants, and the many aspects of the QCC operations. The perception of the participants were also sought to determine how they influence the development of the Circles. The objective in the preceding chapters has been to identify the obstacles or facilitative factors which can inhibit or promote Circle development. This chapter, however, will represent the final chapter of this study. The purpose of this chapter is to summarize the research findings of the study. It will also include a discussion of the possible solutions (recommendations) for overcoming some of the highlighted problems that confront the two agencies in the process of implementing and operating QCC groups.

5.1: Summary of Findings

The various salient findings of the research may be summarised as follows:
5.1.1. QOC Development and Implementation Strategy

(i) The two organizations appeared to have adopted a gradual implementation strategy for QOC. Such a strategy has the advantages that there is no overwhelming demand for resources and that there is also the "demonstration effect" which allows for stimulating interest in the formation of new Circles. This aspect thus represents a plus factor for both these organizations.

(ii) The extent of employee participation in the four years have grown to 20 percent of the total employees. Considering that QOC has been implemented for only four years, this can be a reasonably good achievement. It may be taken to indicate active employee participation.

(iii) The number of completed projects had also been on a small scale. It would appear negligible if we are to compare them by the Japanese Standards. Nevertheless, this performance can be said to be encouraging, for as the QOC movement matures, one can expect a higher rate of completed projects.

(iv) As far as the QOC objectives of both organizations are concerned, a lot of emphasis was made on the following objectives: effective utilization of human resources, increasing productivity for problem-solving opportunities.
and improving workers' proficiency and developing the potentials of the workers (only in the Ministry of Housing). Less emphasis had been placed on the remaining objectives. With such clear emphasis on these objectives, it would facilitate both these organizations in their attempts to channel the resources for QCC.

5.1.2: QCC Organizational Structure: The Steering Committee

(i) The DFA, Ministry of Education has a Steering Committee specially set up to oversee the QCC movement in the organization. In the Ministry of Housing, the Steering Committee functions were merely added to two existing executive Committees. Given this, it was noted that the set up in the DFA, Ministry of Education seems better equipped to handle the QCC development in the organization. In the Ministry of Housing, the possible inadequacy of attention given to QCC matters by the two executive Committees would hinder the proper planning and administration of QCC groups.

(ii) In the DFA the planning and administrative functions are concentrated in one Committee (the Steering Committee). In the Ministry of Housing, one executive committee takes care of QCC policy matters while the other takes care of administrative matters. There is a separation of functions
in the Ministry of Housing. This may not be healthy for QCC development in this organization for it may prevent a proper translation of policies into administrative actions.

(iii) As for the Steering Committees' understanding of the QCC concepts and operations, the majority of the facilitators from both these organizations (above 80 percent of them) claimed their Steering Committee members understood the QCC concepts and philosophies well. This is likely to facilitate the QCC development of both these organizations.

5.1.3: Facilitators

(i) In both these organizations, a small percentage of the facilitators (between 20 to 33 percent) have volunteered to participate in QCC, the rest have been appointed as facilitators. With voluntary participation, there is every likelihood that there is a tendency among them to be enthusiastic about QCC. This is a good indication for the development of QCC activities.

(ii) The sex distribution among the facilitators indicate there is almost a fair representation of both the sexes in both these organizations (although the male facilitators make up a slight majority). In comparison with the proportion of males and females in category 'A' officers), the study
reveals that there is almost a fair representation of both
the sexes as facilitators in the DFA. A fair representation
of both the sexes will encourage utilization of the
existing potentials of both sex groups. However, in the
Ministry of Housing, the male facilitators are
under-represented in terms of the total population of
category 'A' male officers. This would imply that the
potentials of the male officers would be underutilized.

(iii) In terms of their age distribution, more than 60 percent
of them in both these organizations are more than 30 years
old. These facilitators being more matured in age are
more likely to be confident and can easily gain the
respect of the participants. This advantage will help
them undertake their facilitators' task well. This would
be good for the QOC movements of both these organizations.

(iv) All the facilitators involved in this study have a
University degree. This would mean that they have the
required intellectual capability and capacity to coordinate
the Circles effectively and positively. They have another
added advantage in the sense that a high percentage of them
(80 percent) indicated their confidence to undertake the
facilitators' tasks. Hence, with confident facilitators,
it is likely that there can be effective Circle
coordination and management in both these organizations.
(v) With regards to their span of control the majority of them facilitated less than 2 Circles each. This narrow span of control can ensure close personal attention to the QCC movement and hence permit the facilitators to take effective coordination of Circle activities. This would seem good for the long-term development of QCC in both these organizations.

(vi) However, facilitating the Circles is a part-time activity among these facilitators in both these organizations. The facilitator functions become an added duty to the normal work functions of the facilitators. Such an arrangement has resulted in them, according less than 20 percent of their official time for the QCC task. This may not represent sufficient allocation of time for facilitating the Circles under their charge and may affect the effective management of the QCC movements in both these organizations.

5.1.4: Circle Participants (Members and Leaders)

(i) The sex distribution among the Circle leaders reveals that female leaders are disproportionately less than the male leaders in both these organizations. The males are disproportionately over-represented in the leadership position. In an Asian society like ours, male leadership
is more readily acceptable than female leadership. Given this, an over-representation of male leadership position may seem a facilitative factor in assisting the QCC activities in both organizations.

(ii) As for Circle members in both organizations, there is no overwhelming domination by one sex group over the other in QCC participation. There is a fair representation of both the sexes among the participants and this can be good for the QCC movement because the fair representation of both sexes will allow for the different analytical approach of both groups (it is suggested that males tend to take an analytical approach and females an intuitive approach to problem-solving) to complement each other and this will more likely produce better problem-solving results.

(iii) Another finding regarding the sex distribution shows that both sexes are proportionately represented in QCC activities in terms of their overall population in both these organizations. The proportion of males (or females) in QCC participation is reflected in the population of males (or females) among the employees in the service categories B, C and D (from which QCC draws its membership). This finding suggests that no sex group seems to be alienated or disinterested in the QCC activities.
(iv) The QCC membership from the point of race is fairly homogenous. Participation is largely confined to the Malays. Racial heterogeneity may be a highly desirable element for effective problem-solving. Heterogeneity from culture and religious factors may help to stimulate the production of ideas for problem-solving purposes. Hence there is need in both organizations to ensure greater racial heterogeneity in circle activities.

(v) In terms of their age distribution, the QCC membership is well-spread among the various age groups. Given this distribution, it means that the Circles in these organizations will be able to draw on the assets of the various age groups (open mindedness and greater creativity among the younger members, and experience, knowledge and maturity of the older members) to solve the selected problems in an effective manner.

(vi) As for the leaders, most of them belong to the older age groups. This suggests that such leaders will be able to lead their groups effectively because of their ability to command respect from the members, their maturity and their knowledge of work procedures. This is a facilitative factor for QCC development in both these organizations.
(vii) A very substantial majority (94 in DFA and 81 percent in Ministry of Housing) of the QCC members in both these organizations have at least an MCE qualification which is more than adequate for the members to be able to carry out their QCC activities successfully. With an MCE qualification they will have sufficient intellectual ability to absorb training materials and to utilize effectively the knowledge acquired to solve their QCC problems.

(viii) In terms of members' educational attainment, another finding of the study is that there is more heterogeneity in the educational attainment of the members in the Ministry of Housing than in the DFA. Such a heterogeneous educational background in the Ministry of Housing may be an advantage in that this heterogeneity may facilitate the output of creative ideas in the problem-solving process.

(ix) The study too revealed quite a significant number of graduates and diploma holders participating as QCC members in these two organizations. It was pointed out in the analysis that graduate membership may have a dysfunctional effect on QCC activities in that the graduates may overawe the other members and hence dominate Circle proceedings. This can result in a great loss of ideas and a reduction of active participation from non-graduate members.
(x) As for the leaders, all of them in both organizations have a minimum MCE qualification. Thus they seem suitably qualified to undertake the leadership roles required of them.

(xi) The study also showed that in terms of the educational qualifications of leaders, those in the Ministry of Housing seem better qualified than those in the DFA. About 47 percent of the leaders in the Ministry of Housing have diplomas or University degrees as compared to only 9 percent of them in the DFA. The analysis also noted that the diploma holders and graduates may be in a good position to provide leadership. On the other hand, there may be dysfunctional aspects in that their presence may deter non-graduate members from active participation. This may inhibit the extent of member contribution in QOC.

(xii) On the reasons for participation, most of the members have indicated reasons which showed that they had joined the Circles voluntarily. Participation may be voluntary but selfish reasons permeate the voluntary participation. The extent of forced participation is small (one-fifth in the Ministry of Housing and one-third in the DFA). On the whole, it can be said that the majority of members in both organizations have joined for the right reasons, which augurs well for QOC in both organizations.
5.1.5: Training

(i) The training needs of the facilitators had not been sufficiently and adequately met in the DFA. This lack of training can be a handicap to the QCC movement. On the other hand, the training needs of the facilitators from the Ministry of Housing had been sufficiently and adequately met; thus providing a plus factor for the development of QCC in the latter organization.

(ii) As for the training of leaders, those in the Ministry of Housing appear to be better off than those in the DFA, Ministry of Education. They have received training on the various skill. Hence, they have a better chance than their counterparts in the DFA to develop their Circles into cohesive groups for problem-solving in QCC. As for the members too, those in the Ministry of Housing have received sufficient training while their counterparts in the DFA have not. The sufficient and adequate training given to members and leaders in the Ministry of Housing would facilitate the QCC development in this organization as compared to that in the DFA where the training has been inadequate for both leaders and members.

(iii) On the problems associated with internal training of the participants, financial constraint appears to be a significant reason in both these organizations. Another significant problem within the DFA is that training had
not been on a continuous and permanent basis. These problems can affect the effectiveness of the training programmes thus making it non-conducive to the development of QCC in both these organizations. The other problems identified such as lack of teaching aids, lack of effective trainers, unplanned training programmes, the negative attitude of the trainees and irrelevant course contents may not be so significant problems to the internal training of these organizations. Nevertheless, they should not be overlooked for if they are not rectified, they can become major problems to the QCC movement in both these organizations.

(iv) Problems with external training is also associated with financial constraints as identified by the respondents from the DFA in particular. A further problem is that the major source of external training is INTAN but INTAN normally offers very few places to each organization for any training programmes. These problems identified can affect QCC development in this organization.

5.1.6: Organizational Environment

(i) The organizational environment in both organizations is said to be conducive to QCC. Largely, the existence of management support contributes to this conducive
organizational environment of both organizations. Given this environment, there is greater chance that QCC programmes in both organizations will be able to maximize their effectiveness.

(ii) The participants generally perceived that the management in both organizations have various positive management attitudes. These positive management attitudes can go a long way to contributing towards an environment conducive for QCC in both these organizations.

(iii) The study also showed that, although the organizational environment and management attitudes are positive, management attendance at Circle meetings can be greatly improved. The participants feel that occasional management attendance is important but between 50 to 70 percent of the participants from both organizations cited non-attendance of their management at their Circle meetings. This perception can have a negative impact on the QCC groups in both organizations in that Circle members may sense a lack of commitment from management.

5.1.7: Reward System

(i) The most popular form of reward system in practice in both these organizations is the presentation of certificates. There is the use of cash rewards on a very small scale in the Ministry of Housing but cash rewards are
non-existent in the DFA, Ministry of Education. The other forms of rewards such as presentation of trophies, special publications, participation in QCC conferences and conventions, study tours and exchange visits are also less common forms of reward.

(ii) The analysis pointed out that the use of certificates as the principal form of reward may not be suitable in the Malaysian environment. Given the relatively low-income levels in the B, C and D service categories, cash rewards and other rewards in kind may be better motivators.

(iii) While the participants perceived the existing forms of rewards to be adequate, some 40 percent of the members of both organizations do not think so. Thus, the inadequacy of the reward system as perceived by a sizable 40 percent of the members can affect the development of QCC in general in both these organizations.

5.1.8: Circle Operations

(i) A high percentage of the participants (more than 80 percent) indicated their meetings are held at least once a fortnight. Judging from this performance, we can assume that meetings are regularly held and that the Circles are sustained through regular and frequent meetings. This would seem a plus factor for both organizations.
(ii) It would seem that a substantial majority of the Circle meetings in both these organizations reached above 80 percent attendance level. Such high attendance level may indicate high enthusiasm level in the meetings. This is a healthy indication that Circle meetings are well sustained. This is another plus factor for the QCCs in both organizations.

(iii) Some of the problems associated with attendance were identified. The major problem associated with attendance is that participants are too busy with their normal office duties to attend Circle meetings. Other minor problems identified here include: meetings are not pre-arranged and that meetings are held outside office hours.

(iv) The major problems affecting Circle proceedings in both these organizations are: members lack of understanding of QCC, ineffective leadership and ineffective interaction among members. This is followed by the lack of information for problem-solving, disinterested facilitators, and unequal work distribution.

Other minor problems were also identified. They include: large group size, members not free to choose their problems and the lack of cooperation among the members themselves. Both the major and minor problems need to be
attended to, otherwise they can affect the QCC development in both these organizations.

(v) The perception of members in the DFA on the ability of their leaders appears to be negative. A majority of the members feel that their leaders are inadequate in terms of their knowledge of the organization, their knowledge of problem-solving techniques and their ability to train members. The perception of leadership ability in the Ministry of Housing is generally more favourable. Thus, the relatively negative members' image of leaders may affect the development and functioning of QCCs in the DFA in particular.

(vi) As for management presentations, the analysis showed that more than 90 percent of the participants in both these organizations have made between one to two management presentations. Given a four-year period, this seems to represent a rather low level of management presentations. As for external presentation, a substantial majority (68 percent) of participants in the DFA have not made any presentation. In the Ministry of Housing, a substantial minority (40 percent) have also not made any presentations.
5.2: Recommendations

5.2.1: QCC Development and Implementation Strategy

(i) The satisfactory achievements and beginnings obtained through the gradual implementation strategies of both organizations, can be taken to mean that the existing Circles are doing fairly alright and that the foundations for QCC development have already been established. Therefore, the time is right for the QCC movements in both these organizations therefore to 'take off' into the next stage of QCC development with greater vigour and strength. There is also the need for both these organizations to move into rapid QCC growth. It is therefore recommended that the QCC movement go big with greater fanfare and publicity, with greater emphasis being placed on training and with more effective planning and monitoring systems. With these intensified efforts, only then can an even higher level of employee participation be obtained and an increased number of projects be successfully undertaken.

5.2.2: QCC Organizational Structure: Steering Committee

(i) It was noted in the analysis that the Ministry of Housing does not have a real Steering Committee. It is proposed that the Ministry of Housing do away with the present practice of having pseudo-Steering Committees and splitting
the QQC functions between the two existing Executive Committees. Instead it is recommended that a Steering Committee specifically for QQC be set up so that priority can be given to QQC in its own forum of discussion. Both the task of planning for QQC and administering the development of QQC must be given to this Steering Committee. Given this proposed forum there is therefore no necessity for the existing Executive Committees to meet and discuss over QQC matters anymore. This proposal can go a long way to strengthening further the QQC activities in the Ministry of Housing.

(ii) Though there are indications to show that the Steering Committee members' understanding of the QQC concepts and operations are adequate, attempts at maintaining this adequate level of understanding should go on. Both organizations should undertake to further increase the level of knowledge and understanding of the QQC concepts and operations. It is therefore recommended that these organizations intensify these efforts through having more briefings and training sessions for the Steering Committee members.
5.2.3: Facilitators

(i) In both these organizations the percentage of voluntary facilitators had been small. Voluntary participation has its own merits. It is therefore suggested that in future it may be better to encourage the facilitators to volunteer rather than merely to appoint them. Hence it is recommended that both these organizations seek ways and means to recruit facilitators through the voluntary process rather than through the appointment process.

(ii) It is highly recommended that the sex distribution of facilitators in both organizations should reflect the existing sex ratio found among the officers in the respective organizations. This fair representation of the different sex group will allow the organization to tap fully the potentials of both the different sex groups accordingly. Therefore it is proposed that the Ministry of Housing in particular takes the necessary steps to ensure the continuance of a fair representation of both the sex groups among the facilitators.

(iii) It is also encouraged that facilitators should belong to a senior age group in this case, more than 30 years old since such facilitators tend to have a number of assets. It is therefore recommended that this practice of having facilitators who are senior in age be continued and maintained in both these organizations.
(iv) It is also recommended that the present practice of recruiting facilitators with a University background should be studied to see if it has any dysfunctional aspects. If it is shown that there are no dysfunctional aspects then the present practice of having graduate facilitators should be continued. The narrow span of control of Circles by facilitators should be allowed to continue for this narrow span of control would allow better facilitating of the Circles.

(v) However, for really effective and continuous monitoring of the Circles, full-time facilitators may provide the answer. It is proposed that full-time facilitators be engaged in both these organizations. This can be done through the process of designating certain posts within the organizational structure as posts which carry the task of facilitators. This proposal, however, carries some implications. QOC is just one of the many programmes needed to raise the productivity levels. There is fear that this practice may evoke the same to be done for the other programmes which are aimed at raising the productivity levels in the public sector. There is also the possibility that there may result in under-utilization of resources if too many posts are designated for the QOC movement. Finally, by identifying certain posts within the formal organizational structure as facilitators' posts, this would mean that the incumbents appointed to these posts are
automatically appointed as facilitators. This would not allow for selection to be done by management nor would it allow voluntary participation among facilitators.

Nevertheless, having a full-time facilitator does pay off in the long run. It is therefore proposed that for a start at least a minimum of one full-time facilitator be provided for in these organizations. It would be up to the management of both organizations to identify the post that needs to be converted into a full-time facilitator post.

5.2.4: Circle Participants (Members and Leaders)

(i) There is no reason why we should not allow more males to be leaders if their leadership roles is generally more acceptable. However, with regard to Circle members, since the analysis has argued that having a fair representation of both the sexes among the participants carry several good implications, it is therefore recommended that the present situation where both sexes are fairly represented in the QCC be allowed to exist in both these organizations. Steps must be taken to ensure that no groups is overwhelmingly over represented or under-represented.

(ii) Since the analysis pointed out that racial homogeneity among the participants may have a dysfunctional effect on group problem-solving, it is therefore recommended that greater racial heterogeneity be allowed to exist in the QCC
membership. Attempts must be made to have more non-Malays to participate in the QCC activities, even to the extent of having them over-represented in the QCC membership.

(iii) The age distribution among the members reflect a fairly well-spread distribution among the various age groups. It is recommended that this kind of age distribution be maintained among them as the situation so obtained can contribute to the productivity of problem-solving process in both these organizations. As for the leaders, it is also recommended that the present tendency of having most of them belonging to an older age group should be maintained as it provide benefits to the development of QCC in both these organizations.

(iv) The analysis noted that it may be possible that having graduates as Circle members may have a dysfunctional effect in that non-graduate members may feel intimidated by the superior qualification of the graduate members and hence feel reluctant to contribute. It is therefore recommended that a study be carried to establish whether there is such a dysfunctional effect. Such a study can be conducted by finding out from the non-graduate members in groups with graduate members as to whether they (the non-graduate members) feel inhibited by the presence of graduate members. One alternative study approach will be to set up situations in which the facilitators observe the group processes in those groups with graduate members to
determine whether the graduate presence is an inhibiting factor. Until the result of the study is known, it may be advisable to cease allowing further graduate participation, especially considering that the selected QCC problems tend to be micro work problems on which the graduate may not have special knowledge although it is agreed that intellectual training may allow them to contribute in other forms.

(v) Voluntary participation is one of the principles of QCC. There appears to be some element of coercion present. Thus there must be attempts made on the part of both organizations to make sure that members' participation in QCC is completely voluntary. No force or compulsion should be allowed. Furthermore, since some people joined voluntarily but for negative selfish reasons, it is recommended that some screening process be instituted to ensure that those joining for negative reasons be reduced to a minimal. To allow such people to join may result in a wastage of the resources which the organization allocates to QCC.

5.2.5: Training

(i) It is very clear that training needs to be beefed up in the DFA, Ministry of Education. There is an urgent need for more facilitators and participants to be trained.
There is a need in this organization for intensified training which can be done through more short courses, briefings, training sessions and seminars. It is recommended that priority must be given to internal training instead of external training. External training has its limitations. Not many officers can be trained at any one time. Training may be costly. On the other hand, with internal training expertise can be brought in from INTAN or any other organizations to train many employees at any one time. It is also suggested that more emphasis be given to the basic skills of QCC when undertaking training for the members. Those skills which are not very useful for members, though they may be useful for leaders, should be deemphasised in training for Circle members. This will help achieve maximum training results at a minimum cost.

(ii) For the training to be effective in both these organizations, there must be management support towards the training programmes. Training must be carried out on a sustained and permanent basis. Management must bid for an annual financial allocation for QCC training. On the part of the trainers, they must be adequately trained so that they can undertake training effectively. Here again, training for trainers need to be beefed through more short courses, conducted from within the organization. Herein lies the significance of having full-time facilitators.
Full-time facilitators who are well-trained will be better able to plan for and organise internal courses specifically for leaders and participants. External trainers can be obtained from outside agencies from time to time to assist in the training of the trainers. Finally, there must be a positive attitude among the trainees themselves. They must be prepared to acquire and learn the techniques and operations and apply them. As long as they are negative in their attitude, all efforts at training will prove a failure. Hence, there is need to undertake intensive training of participants, and facilitators in the DFA, Ministry of Education and to a lesser extent, the Ministry of Housing.

5.2.6: Organizational Environment

(i) It is recommended that the conducive organizational environment existing in both these organizations be maintained. This study revealed that management support for instance through positive attitudes has largely contributed to this conducive organizational environment. Given this is so, it is also recommended that the management of these organizations demonstrate even greater support and commitment for their QOC movements.
(ii) It is recommended that occasional attendance by management at Circle meetings must be made a feature of the QCOs in both these organizations. It may not be possible for management to attend all meetings as they are busy people. However, they should be required to make occasional attendance at Circle meetings. This can be done by preparing some form of a schedule to enable occasional attendance by management at these meetings. Such a schedule will ensure that none of the Circles will be accidentally left out of the benefits to be derived from the occasional attendance by management. Such occasional attendance will certainly boost the morale of the Circles.

5.2.7: Reward System

(i) The study did identify that about 40 percent of members of both organizations do not acknowledge the adequacy of the present system. Hence, given that the certificate reward form may not be a sufficient motivator in the Malaysian civil service, it is recommended that other "aggressive" and materialistic forms of rewards be considered for adoption by both these organizations. For instance, more opportunities must be made available to the participants to participate in annual conventions and study tours. As for annual conventions, not every Circle has the opportunity to participate. Only the best is selected to represent the organization at the national level. However, it is possible to conduct more study tours as a form of reward for the
contributions made to QCC. This form of reward can allow contacts to be made with other Circles and with different people hence, allowing the exchange of experiences and report of achievements of their very own cooperative efforts. Perhaps another form of reward worth considering is the presentation of cash rewards. In Malaysia, cash rewards can be an important motivator. It may be difficult to implement for it requires allocation of funds to be made. Besides, at the same time, presentation of cash rewards from such allocations may not be allowed under the present financial arrangements within the public sector. However, such payments can be made available from funds solicited through their own clubs and organizations.

5.2.8: Circle Operations

(1) The attendance levels presently appear satisfactory. It is recommended that both the attendance levels and frequency of Circle meetings be maintained at the highest levels so as to ensure that QCC becomes an on-going process. It should also be observed that although the majority of Circles may be alright, there will still be a fair number of Circles which can have problems in attendance and scheduling of meetings. Hence it is recommended that in order to prevent the situation of one bad apple spoiling the rest the
organizations should establish some monitoring device to detect Circles with attendance and scheduling problems.

(ii) It becomes obvious that there is need to allow for more time to be accorded to QCC activities. This can be done if attempts are made to reduce the existing workload of the participants. This, however, does not sound feasible because the existing workload is there to stay. The other alternative would be to give official recognition that QCC forms part of the normal schedule of duties of each employee. It is recommended that this formal recognition comes from the Chief Executive of the organization at least in the form of a stated policy. Recognition can also be extended when considering the job appraisal review of individual employees by giving extra weight and marks for employees' contribution to QCC. Indirectly, it allows and encourages more time to be spent on QCC activities. These proposals can go a long way to boost the QCC development. With regards to the minor problems identified it is also recommended that both these organizations make sure that problems such as non-prearranged meetings and holding meetings outside office hours should not be allowed to go out of proportion as to become major problems affecting Circle attendance. Hence there must be attempts made to pre-arrange Circle meetings to enable an even higher attendance level to
be achieved. Perhaps to start off, the date of the meetings can be fixed say every second and fourth Saturday of each month for instance. In this way the meeting room can also be booked in advance. It is important that all Circle meetings be held during office hours since the public sector here have not reached a stage like the Japanese who are prepared to work outside office hours. (Working outside office hours may involve a lot of inconvenience and hardship on the part of some individual employees).

(iii) As for the problems identified with the Circle proceedings, it is recommended that these organizations must make attempts to ensure the following: there is effective interaction among members; members must be equipped with the QCC techniques, and leadership must be effective. Information for problem-solving must be made readily available to QCC groups. As for the other minor problems, attempts must also be made by both these organizations to find solutions for them. An in-depth study of these problems and their possible solutions by some task force or specially established QCC groups may be a good idea.

(iv) It is important that leaders should be perceived to be effective by the members. There is a need in the DFA in particular, to rectify this negative image of the leaders.
It is therefore recommended that the DFA take a serious view of this negative perception and take the necessary steps to rectify the negative image of the leaders as perceived by the members.

(v) It is recommended that in both these organizations more opportunities for more management presentations be made by the participants. This would represent the best form of recognition for QCC contribution and will lead to positive effects on the morale of QCC members. Such opportunities too can provide avenues for the participants to practise good communications and to allow them to accumulate experience and help them in the learning process. Hence, there is a need in both these organizations to undertake at least a management presentation per Circle a year.

Conclusion

The study has been confined to two public sector organizations, namely, the DFA, Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Housing and Local Government. These two Ministries were selected for this study because they are known to have well-organized QCC programmes in the public sector. This study has thus been able to identify several of the facilitative and non-facilitative factors which can contribute to or inhibit the development of QCC in both these organizations respectively.
From this study, it can be summarised that the facilitative factors have outweighed the non-facilitative factors in both these organizations. The facilitative factors have promoted greatly to the development of QOC. Hence, these organizations are known to have well-organized QOC programmes in the public sector today. Since this study has focused on organizations with well-organized QOC programmes, perhaps some later studies should be made to compare such organizations with others which do not have well organized programmes. Such study is imperative and urgent in the light of QOC development in the public sector today.
Appendix I

Penilaian Program KMK didalam Perkhidmatan Awam

Soal Selidik kepada Ketua dan Ahli-Ahli KMK

Perhatian: Sila baca dengan teliti dan jawab semua soalan. Sila tandakan (✓) di kotak-kotak yang disediakan dan berikan penjelasan di mana perlu.

A. Latarbelakang Responden

1. Kementerian ............................................................

2. Tempoh berkhidmat dalam jawatan sekarang
   - [ ] Kurang dari 3 tahun
   - [ ] 3 - 6 tahun
   - [ ] 6 - 9 tahun
   - [ ] lebih dari 9 tahun

3. Bangsa:  
   - [ ] Melayu
   - [ ] Cina
   - [ ] India
   - [ ] Lain-lain
   - [ ] Lain-lain

4. Jantina:  
   - [ ] Lelaki
   - [ ] Perempuan

5. Umur:  
   - [ ] Kurang dari 20 tahun
   - [ ] 21 - 25 tahun
   - [ ] 26 - 30 tahun
   - [ ] 31 - 35 tahun
   - [ ] lebih dari 36 tahun

6. Peringkat pengajian yang diperolehi:
   - [ ] SRP
   - [ ] SPM
   - [ ] STPM
   - [ ] Diploma
   - [ ] Lain-lain. Nyatakan ........................................

7. Nama KMK anda ..........................................................
8. Tahun KMK anda ditubuhkan: 

☐ 1983  
☐ 1984  
☐ 1985  
☐ 1986

9. Peranan anda dalam KMK:  

☐ Ahli KMK  
☐ Ketua Kumpulan

10. Nyatakan sebab-sebab anda menyertai KMK.  
(Anda dibenarkan menanda lebih dari satu kotak)  

☐ Diatas paksan pihak atasan  
☐ Untuk membelajer KMK.  
☐ Sekadar ingin mengetahui dan menyertai KMK  
☐ Ingin memajukan diri.  
☐ Untuk mengeratkan perhubungan dengan rakan-rakan sekerja.  
☐ Supaya dapat membantu dalam proses keajaiban pangkat nanti  
☐ Lain-lain sebab. Nyatakan ........................................
........................................................
........................................................

B. 1) Maklumat mengenai program KMK di Kementerian anda

1. Senaraikan mengikut keutamaan objektif KMK anda.  
(Sila gunakan angka 1, 2, 3, 4 ....)

☐ Untuk memperbaiki, menambah & meningkatkan mutu kerja.  
☐ Untuk mengeratkan perhubungan antara pihak pekerja dengan pengurusan.  
☐ Untuk memperbaiki sistem kerja yang ada sekaran.  
☐ Untuk menanam etika kerja yang baik.  
☐ Untuk menambah dorongan kerja & menggalakkan daya kreatif  
☐ Untuk menyelesaikan masalah kerja

bertambah .../3
Untuk mengurangkan kos/perbelanjaan Kementerian/Jabatan.

Lain-lain. Nyatakan ........................................


2. Sejauhmana prinsip-prinsip pengurusan saperti berikut diberi perhatian oleh pihak pengurusan?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sangat Memuaskan</th>
<th>Memuaskan</th>
<th>Kurang Memuaskan</th>
<th>Tidak Memuaskan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pekerja adalah sumber bernilai disamping lain-lain sumber pengurusan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Memajukan pekerja diutamakan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Memperolehi penyertaan &amp; sokongan semua peringkat pekerja</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bekerja secara berkumpulan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kreativiti sentiasa digalakkan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saling membantu kearah kemajuan diri, kumpulan dan organisasi.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sangat Memuaskan</th>
<th>Memuaskan</th>
<th>Kurang Memuaskan</th>
<th>Tidak Memuaskan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pihak pengurusan sentiasa mengiktiraf &amp; menghargai sumbangan pekerja</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pengurusan bersedia meluangkan masa untuk mendengar masalah pekerja</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hubungan mesra dengan pekerja sentiasa digalakkan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pengurusan menganggap KMK sebagai satu cara pembentukan sikap yang positif di kalangan pekerja</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pengurusan bertanggungjawab menyokong, membimbing dan memandu KMK kearah kemajuan pelaksanaan KMK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

.../4
4. Adakah keadaan persekitaran anda sesuai untuk melaksanakan program KMK?

☐ Ya  ☐ Tidak

Sila beri pandangan anda.

............................................................................................................................
............................................................................................................................
............................................................................................................................

5. Senaraikan faedah yang diperolehi oleh Jabatan/Kementerian anda setelah program KMK dilaksanakan. (Sila gunakan 1, 2, 3......)

☐ Dapat mengwujudkan suasana yang harmoni diantara ahli-ahli organisasi

☐ Objektif organisasi untuk meningkatkan produktiviti dan prestasi kerja dapat dicapai.

☐ Dapat memperbaiki dan melicinkan pengurusan dan pentadbiran di dalam organisasi dari segi komunikasi diantara pekerja atasan dan bawahan.

☐ Dapat meningkatkan moral & pengetahuan pekerja.

☐ Semangat berpasukan dapat diwujudkan.

☐ Dapat menggalakkan sikap kesedaran tentang masalah organisasi & kualiti.

II. Maklumat mengenai aktiviti KMK anda

(Sila gunakan 1, 2, 3......)

☐ Interaksi kumpulan yang kurang berkesan.

☐ Bilangan ahli kumpulan terlalu besar.

☐ Ahli-Ahli KMK kurang faham tentang teknik-teknik analisa & prosidur menyelesaikan masalah.

☐ Pembahagian tugas yang tidak seimbang dikalangan ahli-ahli KMK.

☐ Kepimpinan KMK yang kurang berkesan.

bersambong..../5
Fasilitator tidak berminat & tidak mempunyai kesungguhan untuk menyelaras aktiviti KMK.

Kekurangan data & maklumat dalam penyelesaian masalah.

Ahli tidak bebas untuk menentu dan memilih masalah.

Tiada sikap tolak anesor, bertimbang rasa & kerjasama dijalankan ahli-ahli KMK.

7. (i) Sudahkah anda diberi latihan dalam lapangan-lapangan berikut?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Ya</th>
<th>Tidak</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Falsafah, konsep-konsep utama &amp; pendekatan KMK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teknik-Teknik analisa KMK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kepimpinan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pembentukan &amp; pembinaan KMK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perhubungan sesama manusia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prosidur &amp; Tatacara penyelesaian masalah</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Komunikasi</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latihan kemahiran dalam lapangan-lapangan yang diperlukan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(ii) Nyatakan tempoh latihan & pihak yang mengendalikan latihan tersebut.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TEMPOH LATIHAN</th>
<th>PIHAK YANG MENGENDALIKAN LATIHAN</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kurang dari 3 jam</td>
<td>Lebih dari 6 jam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dari Dalam Jabatan</td>
<td>Dari Luar Jabatan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Dari Dalam Jabatan</th>
<th>Dari Luar Jabatan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Falsafah, konsep-konsep utama &amp; pendekatan KMK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teknik-teknik analisa KMK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pembentukan dan pembinaan KMK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

bersambong .../6
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TEMPOH LATIHAN</th>
<th>PIHAK YANG MENGENDALIKAN LATIHAN</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kurang dari 3 jam</td>
<td>Dari Dalam Jabatan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-6 jam</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lebih dari 6 jam</td>
<td>Dari Luar Jabatan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Perhubungan sesama manusia
- Prosidur & Tatacara penyelesaian masalah
- Komunikasi
- Latihan kemahiran dalam lapangan-lapangan yang diperlukan

8. (i) Apakah teknik-teknik mengumpul dan menganalisa data yang anda ketahui? (Anda dibenarkan menanda lebih dari satu kotak)

- [ ] Penggunaan kertas semak
- [ ] Carta Bar
- [ ] Graf
- [ ] Carta Blok
- [ ] Gambarajah Pai
- [ ] Histogram
- [ ] Gambarajah Sebab Akibat
- [ ] Gambarajah Pareto
- [ ] Gambarajah Sebaran
- [ ] Carta Kawalan

(ii) Apakah teknik-teknik mengumpul & menganalisa data yang digunakan?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Penggunaan kertas semak</th>
<th>Sangat Kerap Digunakan</th>
<th>Kerap Digunakan</th>
<th>Tidak Kerap Digunakan</th>
<th>Tidak Pernah Digunakan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graf</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carta Bar</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carta Blok</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gambarajah Pai</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Histogram</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gambarajah Sebab Akibat</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gambarajah Pareto</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gambarajah Sebaran</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carta Kawalan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

bersambong .. / 7
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gambarajah Sebab Akibat</th>
<th>Sangat Kerap Digunakan</th>
<th>Kerap Digunakan</th>
<th>Tidak Kerap Digunakan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(i) Kekerapan mengadakan mesyuarat KMK.

- [ ] Lebih dari seminggu sekali
- [ ] Tipa-tiap minggu
- [ ] Dua minggu sekali
- [ ] Tiga minggu sekali
- [ ] Sebulan sekali
- [ ] Kurang dari sebulan sekali

(ii) Adakah kehadiran dimesyuarat KMK memuaskan?

- [ ] Sangat memuaskan
- [ ] Memuaskan
- [ ] Kurang memuaskan
- [ ] Tidak memuaskan

(iii) Nyatakan peratus kehadiran dilakukan dalam setiap mesyuarat KMK.

- [ ] Kurang dari 50%
- [ ] 50% - 80%
- [ ] 80% - 100%

(iv) Adakah masalah kehadiran mesyuarat KMK disebabkan oleh faktor-faktor berikut?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ya</th>
<th>Tidak</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ahli-ahli selalu sibuk dengan tugas-tugas harian</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mesyuarat KMK tidak dijadualakan terlebih dahulu</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

bersambong .../8
Mesyuarat KMK diadakan di luar waktu pejabat

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ya</th>
<th>Tidak</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Lain-lain. Nyatakan.

(v) Cadangan anda bagi mengatasi masalah kehadiran dalam mesyuarat KMK.

Nyatakan.

(vi) Pernahkah pihak pengurusan menghadiri mesyuarat KMK?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ya</th>
<th>Tidak</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Jika ya, apa pendapat anda tentang penyertaan mereka didalam mesyuarat-mesyuarat KMK?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dapat membantu perjalanan KMK</th>
<th>Tidak memberi kesan kepada KMK</th>
<th>Mengganggu perjalanan KMK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

10. Adakah masalah-masalah berikut timbul dalam pengendalian mesyuarat KMK?

Ahli-Ahli cuba menyelesaikan masalah di luar kemampuan mereka

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ya</th>
<th>Tidak</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Ahli-Ahli tidak berminat dan 'committed' dalam perbincangan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ya</th>
<th>Tidak</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Ahli-Ahli menganggap tugas menyelesaikan masalah bukan tanggungjawab mereka tetapi adalah tanggungjawab pengurusan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ya</th>
<th>Tidak</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Ajenda mesyuarat tidak disediakan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ya</th>
<th>Tidak</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Ahli-Ahli tidak bebas melahirkan pendapat

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ya</th>
<th>Tidak</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Lain-lain. Nyatakan.

..........................................................................................
..........................................................................................
11. Nyatakan kebolehan yang diberi oleh Ketua Kumpulan dari segi:-
(Perlu dijawab oleh Ahli KMK sahaja)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sangat Mencukupi</th>
<th>Mencukupi</th>
<th>Kurang Mencukupi</th>
<th>Tidak Mencukupi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pengetahuan &amp; pengalaman mengenai organisasi Jabatan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kefahaman mengenai teknik-teknik penyelesaian masalah</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kepimpinan operasi KMK sehingga dapat mengelolak KMK dengan sempurna dan berkesan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kemahiran mendapatkan ahli-ahli secara sukarela</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kebolehan melatih ahli-ahli kumpulan dengan jayanya</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

12. Nyatakan kebolehan & kemampuan fasilitator dari segi:-

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sangat Mencukupi</th>
<th>Mencukupi</th>
<th>Kurang Mencukupi</th>
<th>Tidak Mencukupi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kecekapan &amp; kebijaksanaan mengawasi KMK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kemampuan membimbing KMK dengan berkesan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kebolehan untuk menggali dan menyelaras program KMK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kefahaman mendalam mengenai falsafah &amp; amalan KMK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pengetahuan mengenai struktur &amp; operasi organisasi</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kebolehan berinteraksi dengan orang lain</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daya kepimpinan serta kemampuan dari segi keperibadian &amp; pemikiran</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

13.(i) Nyatakan bilangan projek yang telah diselesaikan oleh KMK anda sahingga hari ini.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>0</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Lebih dari 5 projek</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
(i) Senaraikan mengikut keutamaan tujuan projek-projek yang telah dikendalikan itu. (Sila gunakan angka 1, 2, 3,...)

- [ ] untuk meningkat mutu kerja
- [ ] untuk memperbaiki sistem & cara kerja
- [ ] untuk memupuk perhubungan mesra di kalangan pekerja
- [ ] untuk mengurangkan kos
- [ ] untuk mengikut arahan Kerajaan

14. (i) Pernahkah anda membuat persembahan kepada pihak pengurusan didalam Jabatan/Kementerian anda?

- [ ] Belum lagi
- [ ] Ya, 1 - 2 kali
- [ ] Ya, 3 - 4 kali
- [ ] Ya, 5 - 6 kali
- [ ] Ya, lebih dari 6 kali

(ii) Nyatakan bilangan cadangan yang dikemukakan kepada pihak pengurusan anda

- [ ] 0
- [ ] 1
- [ ] 2
- [ ] 3
- [ ] 4
- [ ] lebih dari 5 cadangan

(iii) Bilangan cadangan yang diterima oleh pengurusan anda.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BILANGAN CADANGAN</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diterima dengan sepenuhnya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diterima dengan pindaan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tidak diterima</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lain-lain. Nyatakan.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

.../11
3. Pernahkah KMK anda membuat persembahan di luar pejabat:

[ ] Ya  [ ] Tidak

Jika ya, nyatakan di mana?

[ ] INTAN
[ ] Pusat Daya Pengeluaran Negara
[ ] Pejabat Cawangan Jabatan/Kementerian anda
[ ] di sektor swasta
[ ] di luar negeri
[ ] Lain-lain. Nyatakan ........................

................................................

16. (i) Apakah jenis pengiktirafan dan penghargaan yang diperolehi hasil sumbangan KMK anda?

[ ] Hadiah wang tunai  ............ [ ] Ya  [ ] Tidak

[ ] Piala pusingan  ............... [ ] Ya  [ ] Tidak

[ ] Sijil penghargaan  ............. [ ] Ya  [ ] Tidak

[ ] Penerbitan khas mengenai KMK anda [ ] Ya  [ ] Tidak

[ ] Mewakili organisasi anda dalam konvensyen KMK di peringkat kebangsaan [ ] Ya  [ ] Tidak

[ ] Lawatan sambil belajar keluar/dalam negeri [ ] Ya  [ ] Tidak

[ ] Lain-lain. Nyatakan ........................

................................................

(ii) Adakah penghargaan & sumbangan itu memadai?

Sila beri pandangan anda.

................................................

................................................

................................................

17. Senaraikan mengikut keutamaan faedah-faedah yang diperolehi oleh anda setelah menyertai KMK? (Sila gunakan 1, 2, 3 .... )

[ ] Dapat mengwujudkan perkembangan diri

bersambong .../12
Melatih diri supaya menjadi pekerja yang berfikir.

Dapat menanamkan sikap 'memiliki' kepada organisasi (sense of belonging).

Dapat memberi keyakinan kebolsihan diri sendiri dalam melaksanakan tugas-tugas harian.

Dapat meningkatkan kemahiran & daya berfikir.

Pembentukan kualiti kepimpinan dapat dipupok.

Dapat menggalakkan daya kreatif bekerja.

Dapat menimbulkan semangat berbangga dengan kerja-kerja yang dapat dilakukan.

TERIMA KASIH
An Evaluation of the QCC Programme in the Public Sector

Questionnaire for Circle Leaders and Circle Members

Note: Please read carefully and answer all questions. Please tick (✓) in the spaces provided for and give explanations where required.

A. Respondents Background

1. Ministry .........................................................

2. Length of service in present post
   □ Less than 3 years
   □ 3 - 6 years
   □ 6 - 9 years
   □ More than 9 years

3. Race:
   □ Malay
   □ Indian
   □ Chinese
   □ Others

4. Sex:
   □ Male
   □ Female

5. Age:
   □ Less than 20 years
   □ 21 - 25 years
   □ 26 - 30 years
   □ 31 - 35 years
   □ More than 36 years

6. Level of Education attained:
   □ LCE
   □ MCE
   □ HSC
   □ Diploma
   □ Others. Explain ............................................

7. Name of your QCC .............................................
8. Year QCC was established
   □ 1983
   □ 1984
   □ 1985
   □ 1986

9. Your role in QCC
   □ QCC Member
   □ QCC Leader

10. Reasons for QCC participation.
    (You are allowed to tick more than one space).
    □ Forced into participation by management.
    □ To learn about QCC
    □ Curiosity and participation sake
    □ For self-development reasons
    □ To improve working relations
    □ Assist in promotion
    □ Other reasons. Explain ........................................
        ................................................................

B. 1) Information on QCC programme in Ministry

1. List according to priority your QCC objectives. (Use 1,2,3,4 ..)
   □ To increase productivity
   □ To improve management-employee relations
   □ To improve existing work system
   □ To develop positive work ethics
   □ To motivate and inspire creativity
   □ To solve work-related problems

continue.../3
2. State the extent of usage of the following management principles by your management.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Management considers human resources as valuable</th>
<th>Very Satisfactory</th>
<th>Satisfactory</th>
<th>Less Satisfactory</th>
<th>Not Satisfactory</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Development of worker given priority by management</th>
<th>Very Satisfactory</th>
<th>Satisfactory</th>
<th>Less Satisfactory</th>
<th>Not Satisfactory</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Management obtains support from all levels of employees</th>
<th>Very Satisfactory</th>
<th>Satisfactory</th>
<th>Less Satisfactory</th>
<th>Not Satisfactory</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Management emphasises teamwork</th>
<th>Very Satisfactory</th>
<th>Satisfactory</th>
<th>Less Satisfactory</th>
<th>Not Satisfactory</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Management encourages creativity</th>
<th>Very Satisfactory</th>
<th>Satisfactory</th>
<th>Less Satisfactory</th>
<th>Not Satisfactory</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Management supports the development of individuals, group and organization</th>
<th>Very Satisfactory</th>
<th>Satisfactory</th>
<th>Less Satisfactory</th>
<th>Not Satisfactory</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

3. What is the level of management support towards the QCC programme in your organization?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Management always give recognition to workers' contribution</th>
<th>Very Satisfactory</th>
<th>Satisfactory</th>
<th>Less Satisfactory</th>
<th>Not Satisfactory</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Management prepared to attend to workers' problems</th>
<th>Very Satisfactory</th>
<th>Satisfactory</th>
<th>Less Satisfactory</th>
<th>Not Satisfactory</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Management always encourage harmonious worker relations</th>
<th>Very Satisfactory</th>
<th>Satisfactory</th>
<th>Less Satisfactory</th>
<th>Not Satisfactory</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Management uses QCC as a means of developing positive work attitudes among workers</th>
<th>Very Satisfactory</th>
<th>Satisfactory</th>
<th>Less Satisfactory</th>
<th>Not Satisfactory</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

..con't.
Management is responsible towards supporting and guiding QCC implementation.

4. Is your organizational environment conducive to QCC?

☐ Yes    ☐ No
State your views.

..............................................................
..............................................................
..............................................................
..............................................................

5. List the benefits achieved after QCC implementation in your organization. (Use 1,2,3 ....)

☐ Encouraged a harmonious working relations.
☐ Improved performance and increased productivity.
☐ Improved communications between management and workers.
☐ Raised workers' morale.
☐ Teamwork fostered
☐ Developed quality-consciousness among workers.

II. Information regarding your QCC activity

6. List the extent the following problems affect your Circle Proceedings. (Please use 1,2,3 ....)

☐ Ineffective interaction among members
☐ Large group size
☐ Members lack understanding of QCC
☐ Unequal work distribution
☐ Ineffective leadership
☐ Disinterested Facilitator
☐ Lack of information for problem-solving
☐ Members not free to choose problem
☐ Members lack cooperation
7. (i) Have you been trained in the following areas?

- QCC Philosophy and Concepts
- Techniques of Analysis
- Leadership
- Organizing Circles
- Human Relations
- Problem-solving Procedures
- Communication
- Specialised Skills

(ii) Specify duration of training and training authorities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Duration of Training</th>
<th>Training Authorities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Less than 3 hrs</td>
<td>More than 3-6 hrs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- QCC Philosophy and Concepts
- Techniques of Analysis
- Organising Circles
- Human Relations
- Problem-solving Procedures
- Communication
- Specialised Skills

8. (i) Specify the techniques of data collection and data analysis that you know.
(You can tick more than one space)

- Check Sheets
- Bar Charts
- Block Charts
- Pie Charts
- Histogram
- Cause and Effect Diagram
- Pareto Diagram
(ii) The techniques of data collection and data analysis that are being used:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Very Frequent</th>
<th>Frequent</th>
<th>Less Frequent</th>
<th>Not Frequent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Check Sheet</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bar Charts</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Block Charts</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pie Charts</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Histogram</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cause and Effect Diagram</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pareto Diagram</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graphs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distribution Charts</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control Charts</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

9. (i) Frequency of Circle Meetings

- More than once a week
- Weekly
- Fortnightly
- Every three weeks
- Monthly
- Less than once a month

(ii) Is attendance at QCC meetings satisfactory?

- Very satisfactory
- Satisfactory
- Less satisfactory
- Not satisfactory

(iii) State the attendance levels at Circle meetings.

- Less than 50%
- 50% - 80%
- 80% - 100%
(iv) Is attendance affected by the following factors?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YES</th>
<th>NO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participants are too busy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meetings not pre-arranged</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meetings are held outside office hours</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Others. Specify ..................................................

(v) Proposals to overcome these problems.

Specify.............................................................

..............................................................................

(vi) Has management attended your QCC meeting?

[ ] YES [ ] NO

What is your views on their attendance?

[ ] Can assist QCC development
[ ] Does not assist QCC development
[ ] Affects QCC operations

10. Do the following problems arise in Circle meetings?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YES</th>
<th>NO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Members solved problems beyond their abilities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Members non-committed in discussions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Members feel problem-solving is the task of management</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agenda of meeting not prepared</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Members not free to express their views during meetings.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Others. Specify. ..................................................

..............................................................................
11. State the level of your leader's abilities.  
(To be answered only by Circle Members)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Very Adequate</th>
<th>Adequate</th>
<th>Less Adequate</th>
<th>Not Adequate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Leader's knowledge about organization</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leader's knowledge on problem-solving techniques</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to lead</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to recruit members voluntarily</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to train effectively</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

12. State the level of Facilitator abilities:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Very Adequate</th>
<th>Adequate</th>
<th>Less Adequate</th>
<th>Not Adequate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Effectiveness of Facilitator</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to lead</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to encourage and coordinate QCC activities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge about QCC concepts and philosophies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge about organizational structure and operations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to interact with others</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leadership qualities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

13.(i) Specify number of projects completed by your QCC.

- □ 0  □ 3
- □ 1  □ 4
- □ 2  □ More than 5 projects

(ii) List the priorities of the projects undertaken. (Use 1, 2, 3...)

- □ To increase productivity
- □ To improve work systems
- □ To encourage good working relations
- □ To reduce cost
- □ Government directive
14. (i) Have you undertaken any management presentations?

☐ No
☐ Yes, 1 - 2 times
☐ Yes, 3 - 4 times
☐ Yes, 5 - 6 times
☐ Yes, more than 6 times

(ii) Specify the number of proposals made to management.

☐ 0  ☐ 1
☐ 1  ☐ 2
☐ 2  ☐ More than 5 proposals

(iii) Number of proposals accepted by management.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. of Proposals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fully accepted  ☐  ☐  ☐  ☐  ☐  ☐
Accepted with amendments  ☐  ☐  ☐  ☐  ☐  ☐
Not accepted  ☐  ☐  ☐  ☐  ☐  ☐

Others. Specify ..........................................................
..........................................................

15. Have you made any external presentations?

☐ Yes  ☐ No

If yes, specify

☐ INTAN
☐ NPC
☐ Branch Office
☐ Private Sector
☐ Overseas
☐ Others

Con't.../1
Specify .................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................

16. (i) Specify the kinds of rewards made available in your organization.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reward Type</th>
<th>YES</th>
<th>NO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cash</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trophies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certificates</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special publications</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Representing QCC at National Conventions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study Tours</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Others. Specify ..................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................

(ii) Is the reward adequate?

State your views.
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................

17. List the benefits derived from QCC participation. (Use 1,2,3,...)

- [ ] Contributes to self-development
- [ ] Able to think positively
- [ ] Inculcates a sense of belonging
- [ ] Develops self-confidence in oneself
- [ ] Increases proficiency and efficiency of individual
- [ ] Develops leadership qualities
- [ ] Encourages creativity
- [ ] Develops pride over one's own work performance
Appendix II

Penilaian Program KMK didalam Perkhidmatan Awam

Soal Selidik kepada Pusilitator KMK

Perhatian: Sila jawab semua soalan.
Sila tandakan (✓) di kotak-kotak yang disediakan & berikan penjelasan dimana perlu.

A. Latarbelakang Responden

1. Kementerian ........................................

2. Tempoh berkhidmat dalam jawatan sekarang.
   - Kurang dari 3 tahun
   - 3 - 6 tahun
   - 6 - 9 tahun
   - lebih dari 9 tahun

3. Jentins:  [   ] Lelaki  [   ] Perempuan

4. Umur:
   - Kurang dari 20 tahun
   - 21 - 25 tahun
   - 26 - 30 tahun
   - lebih dari 30 tahun

5. Peringkat pengajian yang diperolehi:
   - SRP
   - SPM
   - STPM
   - Diploma
   - Ijazah
   - Lain-lain. Nysakan ........................................

.................................................................
.................................................................
B. Maklumat mengenai KMK di Kementerian/Jabatan anda

1. Senaraikan mengikut keutamaan, tujuan KMK anda dilaksanakan.
   (Sila gunakan 1, 2, 3 ...)
   □ Untuk merapatkan lagi perhubungan pegawai atasan dan bawahan.
   □ Untuk penggunaan tenaga manusia secara lebih berkesan
   □ Untuk mempertinggikan lagi kemajuan dan kematangan pekerja-kerja.
   □ Untuk mengwujudkan perkembangan diri pekerja
   □ Untuk mempertingkatkan lagi kecekapan serta produktiviti dan penghasilan.
   □ Untuk menyelesaikan masalah kerja
   □ Untuk memupuk perasaan saling percaya mempercayai dan hormat menghormati diantara satu sama lain.
   □ Untuk mengurangkan kos perbelanjaan Kementerian/Jabatan.

2. Adakah enironmen di kementerian/Jabatan anda menggalakkan kepada perkembangan KMK?
   □ Sangat menggalakkan
   □ Menggalakkan
   □ Kurang menggalakkan
   □ Tidak menggalakkan

Jelas, jika keadaan sangat menggalakkan/menggalakkan.
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................

Jelaskan juga jika keadaan kurang menggalakkan/tidak menggalakkan.
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................

.../3
3. Adakah anda menghadapi masalah-masalah organisasi dalam melaksanakan tugas-tugas fasilitator?

☐ Ya  ☐ Tidak

Jika ya, jelaskan.

..............................................................................................................................................................................................
..............................................................................................................................................................................................
..............................................................................................................................................................................................
..............................................................................................................................................................................................
..............................................................................................................................................................................................
..............................................................................................................................................................................................
..............................................................................................................................................................................................
..............................................................................................................................................................................................
..............................................................................................................................................................................................
..............................................................................................................................................................................................

4. Nyatakan kesulitan yang dialami dalam usaha memperluas konsep KMK dalam organisasi anda.

..............................................................................................................................................................................................
..............................................................................................................................................................................................
..............................................................................................................................................................................................
..............................................................................................................................................................................................
..............................................................................................................................................................................................
..............................................................................................................................................................................................
..............................................................................................................................................................................................
..............................................................................................................................................................................................
..............................................................................................................................................................................................
..............................................................................................................................................................................................

.../4
5. Sebagai saorang fasilitator, adakah anda mendapat sokongan dari pihak pengurusan?

- [ ] Sokongan yang sangat memuaskan
- [ ] Sokongan yang memuaskan
- [ ] Sokongan yang kurang memuaskan
- [ ] Sokongan yang tidak memuaskan
- [ ] Tiada sokongan

6. Sejauhmana Jawatankuasa Pemandu KMK jelas dan faham mengenai falsafah, konsep dan operasi KMK?

(i) Falsafah & Konsep KMK

- [ ] Sangat faham
- [ ] Faham
- [ ] Kurang faham
- [ ] Tidak faham

(ii) Operasi KMK

- [ ] Sangat faham
- [ ] Faham
- [ ] Kurang faham
- [ ] Tidak faham

Beri cadangan anda bagi mempertingkatkan kefahaman mereka dalam

(i) Falsafah & konsep KMK

...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................

(ii) Operasi KMK

...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
...........................................................................................................................................
7. Bagaimana anda dilantik menjadi fasilitator?
   □ Diatas paksaan pihak atasan
   □ Diatas kerelaan diri sendiri
   □ Diatas desakan rakan-rakan sepejabat
   □ lain-lain. Nyatakan ........................................
   ..............................................................
   ..............................................................
   ..............................................................

8. Nyatakan bilangan KMK yang anda menyelia. ......................

9. Pernahkah anda mengikuti kursus bagi melengkapkan diri untuk menyelaraskan program KMK di organisasi anda?
   □ Ya          □ Tidak
   Jika ya, nyatakan:-
   Jenis kursus: ................................................................
   Tempoh kursus: ...........................................................
   Pihak yang mengendalikan kursus: .................................
   Sejauhmana kursus yang diikuti itu dapat melengkapkan anda bagi melaksanakan tugas-tugas fasilitator dengan berkesan?
   □ Sangat mencukupi
   □ Mencukupi
   □ Kurang mencukupi
   □ Tidak mencukupi
   Nyatakan masalah yang dihadapi dalam mengikuti kursus tersebut.
   ............................................................................
   ............................................................................
   ............................................................................
   ............................................................................
   ............................................................................
   ............................................................................
   ............................................................................
   ............................................................................
   ............................................................................
   ............................................................................
   ............................................................................
   ............................................................................
   ............................................................................
   ............................................................................
   ............................................................................
10. Adakah anda mempunyai keyakinan terhadap diri sendiri untuk membimbing dan menyiap KMK-KMK anda?

☐ Sangat yakin
☐ Yakin
☐ Kurang yakin
☐ Tidak yakin

Jelaskan. ......................................................................................................................
......................................................................................................................
......................................................................................................................
......................................................................................................................
......................................................................................................................
......................................................................................................................
......................................................................................................................
......................................................................................................................
......................................................................................................................

11. Adakah tugas-tugas harian anda mengganggu tugas-tugas fasilitator dipejabat?

☐ Sangat mengganggu
☐ Mengganggu
☐ Kurang mengganggu
☐ Tidak mengganggu

Nyatakan peratus waktu pejabat yang digunakan bagi mengendalikan tugas-tugas fasilitator.

☐ Kurang dari 10%
☐ 10 - 20%
☐ 20 - 30%
☐ 30 - 40%
☐ 40 - 50%
☐ 50 - 60%
☐ 60 - 70%
☐ 70 - 80%
☐ 80 - 90%
☐ lebih dari 90%
Cadangkan bagaimana lebih masa dapat diperuntukkan untuk mengendalikan tugas-tugas fasilitator.

12. Senaraikan mengikut pendapat anda, minat dan 'commitment' ahli-ahli terhadap KMK

☐ Sangat penuh minat dan kesungguhan
☐ Minat dan kesungguhan
☐ Kurang kinat dan kesungguhan
☐ Tidak minat dan kesungguhan

Cadangkan tindakan yang perlu diambil bagi mendapatkan minat dan 'commitment' yang sangat memuaskan

13. Adakah kefahaman ahli KMK terhadap konsep KMK dan teknik-teknik penyelesaian masalah memuaskan?

(i) Konsep KMK

☐ Sangat mendalam dan sangat memuaskan
☐ Mendalam dan memuaskan
☐ Kurang mendalam dan kurang memuaskan
☐ Tidak mendalam dan tidak memuaskan

(ii) Teknik-Teknik penyelesaian masalah

☐ Sangat mendalam dan sangat memuaskan
☐ Mendalam dan memuaskan
☐ Kurang mendalam dan kurang memuaskan
☐ Tidak mendalam dan tidak memuaskan

☐ Sangat memuaskan

☐ Memuaskan

☐ Kurang memuaskan

☐ Tidak memuaskan

15. Pada keseluruhannya, nyatakan peratus kehadiran dalam mesyuarat-mesyuarat KMK

☐ Kurang dari 30%

☐ 30 - 40%

☐ 40 - 50%

☐ 50 - 60%

☐ 60 - 70%

☐ 70 - 80%

☐ 80 - 90%

☐ 90 - 100%

Adakah masalah-masalah kehadiran mesyuarat KMK disebabkan oleh faktor-faktor berikut:

Ya Tidak

a) Ahli-Ahli selalu sibuk dengan tugas-tugas harian

b) Mesyuarat KMK diadakan diluar waktu pejabat

c) Mesyuarat KMK tidak dijadualkan terlebih dahulu

d) Nyatakan lain-lain faktor yang tidak disenaraikan di atas

..............................................................

..............................................................

..............................................................
16. Kekerapan masalah-masalah berikut timbul dalam pengendalian mesyuarat KMK.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Sangat Kerap</th>
<th>Kerap</th>
<th>Kurang Kerap</th>
<th>Tidak Kerap</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(a) Ahli-Ahli KMK tidak bersedia untuk berbincang</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Minit mesyuarat tidak kemas dan terator</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Ahli-Ahli tidak berminat dan 'committed' dalam perbincangan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(d) Perjalanan mesyuarat dikendalikan secara tidak terator</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(e) Ahli-Ahli tidak bebas melahirkkan pendapat</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(f) Ketua KMK tidak berkemampuan untuk membimbing perbincangan dengan berkesan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(g) Perbincangan terhad kepada beberapa orang ahli sahaja</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Cadangan anda bagi mengatasi masalah-masalah tersebut. Jelaskan.

.................................................................
.................................................................
.................................................................
.................................................................
.................................................................

17. Nyatakan samada KMK anda pernah cuba menyelesaikan masalah di luar kemampuan mereka.

.................................................................
.................................................................
.................................................................
.................................................................
.................................................................
.................................................................
.................................................................
.................................................................
.................................................................

....../10
18. Pada pendapat anda, adakah latihan yang diberikan kepada ahli-ahli KMK memadai bagi mereka mengelolakan KMK dengan berkesan?

Jelaskan.


Pada pendapat anda, adakah latihan yang diberikan kepada Ketua KMK memadai bagi mereka memimpin KMK dengan sempurna dan berkesan?

Jelaskan.


19. Dalam mengendalikan latihan dalam jabatan, adakah masalah-masalah berikut dihadapi?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Sangat Kerap</th>
<th>Kerap</th>
<th>Kurang Kerap</th>
<th>Tidak Kerap</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(a) Kekurangan bahan latihan dan alat pendang</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Kekurangan tenaga pengajar yang mahir dan berkesan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Tiada peruntukan kewangan dibekalkan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(d) Tiada jadwal latihan yang teratur dirancangkan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(e) Latihan tidak dijalankan secara tetap &amp; berterusan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(f) Pegawai-pegawai yang menghadiri kursus mempunyai sikap yang negatif &amp; tidak berminat</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(g) Kandungan kursus yang tidak berkesan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

bersambong/11
(h) Sila nyatakan masalah-masalah lain yang tidak disenaraikan di atas

..............................................................
..............................................................
..............................................................
..............................................................
..............................................................
..............................................................
..............................................................
..............................................................

20. Dalam urusan latihan diluar Jabatan, apakah masalah-masalah yang selalu timbul?

Nyatakan ..............................................................
..............................................................
..............................................................
..............................................................
..............................................................
..............................................................
..............................................................
..............................................................
..............................................................

21. Pada pendapat anda, adakah penyertaan pekerja dalam KMK melibatkan perasaan bahawa mereka disalahgunakan oleh pengurusan?

Jelas. ..............................................................
..............................................................
..............................................................
..............................................................
..............................................................
..............................................................
..............................................................
..............................................................
..............................................................
..............................................................

.../12
22. Nyatakan perhubungan yang dijalankan dengan lain-lain badan/organisasi yang ada kaitan dengan KMK.

(i) Tujuan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Latihan</th>
<th>Khidmat Nasihat</th>
<th>Run-</th>
<th>Lawatan sambil belajar</th>
<th>Persem bahan Pengurusan</th>
<th>Lain lain sebab</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>INTAN</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pusat Daya Pengeluaran Negara</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kesatuan Kawalan Mutu Malaysia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ajensi-ajensi Kerajaan yang mempunyai KMK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Badan-Badan lain dan ajensi-ajensi antarabangsa</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(ii) Kekerapan berhubong

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Santet</th>
<th>Kerap</th>
<th>Kurang Kerap</th>
<th>Tidak Kerap</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>INTAN</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pusat Daya Pengeluaran Negara</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kesatuan Kawalan Mutu Malaysia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ajensi-ajensi Kerajaan yang mempunyai KMK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Badan-Badan lain dan ajensi-ajensi antarabangsa</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Pada pendapat anda adakah perhubungan ini memberi kesan kepada kemajuan pelaksanaan KMK anda.

Nyatakan........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................

.../13
13. Pada pendapat anda, adakah objektif-objektif yang telah dicapai oleh KMK-KMK dibawah kelolaan anda memuaskan?

(a) Untuk merapatkan lagi perhubungan pegawai atasan dan bawahan

(b) Untuk penggunaan tenaga manusia secara lebih berkesan

(c) Untuk mempertinggikan lagi kemajuan dan kematangan pekerja

(d) Untuk mengwujudkan per-kembangan diri pekerja

(e) Untuk mempertinggikan lagi kecekapan serta produktiviti

(f) Untuk menyelesaikan masalah pekerja

(g) Untuk memupuk perasaan suing percaya mempercayai dan hormat menghormati di antara satu sama lain

(h) Untuk mengurangkan kos perbelanjaan Kementerian/ Jabatan.

TERIMA KASIH
An Evaluation of the QCC Programme in the Public Sector

Questionnaire for QCC Facilitators

Note: Please answer all questions.
Tick (√) in the spaces provided and give explanations where necessary.

A. Respondent's Background

1. Ministry ........................................

2. Length of service in present post
   - □ Less than 3 years
   - □ 3 - 6 years
   - □ 6 - 9 years
   - □ more than 9 years

3. Sex:  □ Male  □ Female

4. Age:  □ Less than 20 years
   - □ 21 - 25 years
   - □ 26 - 30 years
   - □ More than 30 years

5. Level of Education attained:
   - □ LCE
   - □ MCE
   - □ HSC
   - □ Diploma
   - □ Degree
   - □ Others. Specify ....................................

..........................................................
..........................................................
B. Information pertaining to QCC in your organization

1. List according to priority the purpose of QCC implementation. (Please use 1, 2, 3...)
   - [ ] To improve management-employee relations
   - [ ] For effective utilization of human resources
   - [ ] To improve workers' proficiency
   - [ ] For self-development of individual worker
   - [ ] To raise productivity levels
   - [ ] For problem-solving purposes
   - [ ] To cultivate respect and trust among employees
   - [ ] To reduce cost

2. Is the environment in your organization conducive to QCC development?
   - [ ] Very conducive
   - [ ] Conducive
   - [ ] Less conducive
   - [ ] Not conducive

Specify if the environment is very conducive/conducive.

..........................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................

Specify also if the environment is less conducive/not conducive

..........................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................
3. Do you face organizational problems in undertaking the facilitator's role?

☐ Yes ☐ No

If yes, specify.

........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................

4. The difficulties you encounter at attempts to spread widely in your organization the QCC concepts.

........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................

5. The extent of management support that you get.

☐ Very satisfactory
☐ Satisfactory
☐ Less satisfactory

(i) QCC Concepts and Philosophies

- [ ] Well understood
- [ ] Understood
- [ ] Less understood
- [ ] Do not understand

(ii) QCC Operations

- [ ] Well understood
- [ ] Understood
- [ ] Less understood
- [ ] Do not understand

Proposals to increase their level of understanding in:-

(i) QCC Concepts and philosophy

........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................

(ii) QCC Operations

........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................

7. How were you selected to be Facilitator?

- [ ] Forced by top management
- [ ] Volunteered

Cont...
-5-

☐ Persuaded by friends and colleagues in the organization

☐ Others. Specify ........................................
........................................................................
........................................................................
........................................................................

8. Specify the number of Circles under your control. .................

9. Have you been trained to equip yourself for the task of coordinating the QCC programme in your organization?

☐ YES     ☐ NO

If the answer is yes, please specify;

Type of Course: ...................................................

Duration of Course: ............................................

Authority which undertook the training: ..........................
........................................................................

To what extent has the training been adequate?

☐ Very adequate

☐ Adequate

☐ Less Adequate

☐ Not Adequate

The problems encountered in undergoing the training.
........................................................................
........................................................................
........................................................................
........................................................................
........................................................................
........................................................................
........................................................................
........................................................................
10. How confident are you in undertaking the facilitator's role?

☐ Very confident
☐ Confident
☐ Less Confident
☐ Not Confident

Specify .................................................................
........................................................................
........................................................................
........................................................................
........................................................................
........................................................................
........................................................................

11. Does your daily functions affect your role as a facilitator?

☐ Greatly affect
☐ Affect
☐ Less affect
☐ Do not affect

Specify the time taken to facilitate Circles.

☐ Less than 10%
☐ 10 - 20%
☐ 20 - 30%
☐ 30 - 40%
☐ 40 - 50%
☐ 50 - 60%
☐ 60 - 70%
☐ 70 - 80%
☐ 80 - 90%
☐ More than 90%
Propose solutions to accommodate more time for undertaking the role of the facilitator.

12. What is the level of commitment and interest shown by members of your QCC?

☐ Very interested and very committed
☐ Interested and Committed
☐ Less interested and less committed
☐ Not interested and not committed

Propose solutions for maintaining interest and commitment among them.

13. What is the level of members' understanding of QCC concepts and techniques?

(i) QCC Concepts

☐ Very satisfactory
☐ Satisfactory
☐ Less satisfactory
☐ Not satisfactory
(ii) Problem-solving techniques

- Very satisfactory
- Satisfactory
- Less satisfactory
- Not satisfactory

14. The extent of the ability of the QCC leaders in effectively supervising the Circles.

- Very satisfactory
- Satisfactory
- Less satisfactory
- Not satisfactory

15. On the whole, what is the rate of attendance at QCC meetings?

- Less than 30%
- 30 - 40%
- 40 - 50%
- 50 - 60%
- 60 - 70%
- 70 - 80%
- 80 - 90%
- 90 - 100%

Is attendance affected by the following problems?

a) Members busy with their daily routine
b) Meetings held outside office hours
c) Meetings not pre-scheduled
d) Other reasons not specified above

.........................................................
.........................................................
16. Frequency of the following problems during QCC meetings.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Very Frequent</th>
<th>Frequent</th>
<th>Less Frequent</th>
<th>Not Frequent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(a) Members not prepared to discuss</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Minutes of meeting not in order</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Members not committed in discussions</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(d) Proceedings of meetings not in order</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(e) Members not free to express views</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(f) Leaders not effective</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(g) Discussions confined to a few members</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Propose solutions to overcome the above problems.

......................................................
......................................................
......................................................

17. State whether your QCCs have attempted solving problems beyond their abilities.

......................................................
......................................................
......................................................
......................................................

18. Is the training accorded to QCC members adequate?

Specify. ......................................................
......................................................
......................................................
......................................................

Is the training accorded to QCC leaders adequate and effective?

......................................................
......................................................
......................................................
19. Do the following problems affect internal training undertaken by your organization?

- (a) Lack teaching aids
- (b) Lack effective trainers
- (c) Lack financial allocation
- (d) Training programme unplanned
- (e) Training not continuous and permanent
- (f) Negative attitude of trainers
- (g) Course content not relevant

(h) Specify other problems not specified above.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------
-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

20. Identify the frequent problems encountered with regards to external training.

Explain.  ..................................................................................................................
..................................................................................................................
..................................................................................................................
..................................................................................................................
..................................................................................................................

21. Do you think QCC participation involves a feeling that workers are subjected to abuse by management?

Explain.  ..................................................................................................................
..................................................................................................................
..................................................................................................................
..................................................................................................................
..................................................................................................................
22. Specify the nature of contact with other QCC-related bodies and organizations.

(i) Purpose

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Training</th>
<th>Advisory</th>
<th>Counselling</th>
<th>Exchange Programme</th>
<th>Management Presentation</th>
<th>Others</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>INTAN</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Productivity Centre</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QCC Association Malaysia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government Agencies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other organizations and international bodies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(ii) Frequency of contact

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Very Frequent</th>
<th>Frequent</th>
<th>Less Frequent</th>
<th>Not Frequent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>INTAN</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Productivity Centre</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QCC Association, Malaysia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government Agencies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other organizations and international bodies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Does the above contact bring about effectiveness to your QCC implementation? Specify. .................................................................
........................................................................................................
........................................................................................................
........................................................................................................
........................................................................................................
........................................................................................................
........................................................................................................
23. Specify the extent the following objectives have been achieved.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objective</th>
<th>Very Satisfactory</th>
<th>Satisfactory</th>
<th>Less Satisfactory</th>
<th>Not Satisfactory</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(a) To improve employer-employee relations</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) For effective utilization of human resources</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) To improve employee proficiency</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(d) For self-development of the individual worker</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(e) To increase productivity</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(f) To solve work problems</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(g) To develop a sense of respect among fellow workers</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(h) To reduce cost</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

THANK YOU
Appendix III

Findings of Pilot Test

A pilot survey was carried out on the respondents to test the validity of the questions found in both sets of questionnaires. On the whole, all questions were found to be valid for the study. In fact the questions found in both sets of questionnaires were told to be comprehensive for the survey. However, the respondents did indicate a lack of understanding of some of the questions. Attempts were henceforth made to simplify the language used in the questions. The researcher was also requested to include more open-ended questions particularly for the facilitators so as to enable them to express their views freely on the variables examined. Thus more-open-ended questions were provided for the facilitators than the participants.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Circle No.</th>
<th>Leaders</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>Total</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M.</td>
<td>C.</td>
<td>I.</td>
<td>O.</td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>M.</td>
<td>C.</td>
<td>I.</td>
<td>O.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Min. of Education.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>5 (7.4%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2 (28.6%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>7 (100%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>3 (50%)</td>
<td>3 (50%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>not available</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>14 (90.9%)</td>
<td>1 (9.1%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>3 (75%)</td>
<td>1 (25%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>not available</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>4 (80%)</td>
<td>1 (20%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>5 (83.3%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1 (16.7%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>10 (100%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>5 (83.3%)</td>
<td>1 (16.7%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>2 (100%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>4 (100%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>5 (83.3%)</td>
<td>1 (16.7%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>2 (66.7%)</td>
<td>1 (33.3%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>7 (65.6%)</td>
<td>3 (27.3%)</td>
<td>1 (9.1%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>7 (85.5%)</td>
<td>8 (9.7%)</td>
<td>4 (4.8%)</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Circle No.</td>
<td>M.</td>
<td>C.</td>
<td>I.</td>
<td>D.</td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>M.</td>
<td>C.</td>
<td>I.</td>
<td>D.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men of Housing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2(66.7%)</td>
<td>1(33.3%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5(83.3%)</td>
<td>1(16.7%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4(80%)</td>
<td>2(20%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4(80%)</td>
<td>1(20%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4(80%)</td>
<td>1(20%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1(100%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1(100%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1(100%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1(100%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1(100%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1(100%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1(100%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1(100%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1(100%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1(100%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1(100%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>