

Ⓟ

# **A Web-Based Tool To Support Jigsaw Collaborative Learning Technique**

*A thesis submitted to  
the Faculty of Computer Science & Information Technology,  
University of Malaya  
in Fulfillment of the Requirements for  
the Degree of Master of Computer Science*

*by*

LOW SAI KIT  
(WGADS 00049)

*March 2004*

Supervisor: Ascc. Prof. Dr. Siti Salwah Salim

Perpustakaan Universiti Malaya



A511203995

## **Abstract**

The emergent of the Internet and World Wide Web has made collaborative learning feasible to be carried out in a web-based environment. Computer Supported Collaborative Learning (CSCL) utilizes the use of information and communication technology as a mediation tool within collaborative methods of learning. At the same time, a number of applications started to make use of the agent technology to enhance their applications. This thesis endeavors to develop a web-based tool which utilizes web agents in supporting primary schools jigsaw collaborative learning. First, literature reviews on the theoretical aspects of collaborative learning are carried out. It covers the collaborative learning definition, its benefits and limitations as well as various collaborative learning techniques. The reviews further investigate CSCL and its applications for supporting primary schools education particularly in Malaysia. Then, it attempts to support the jigsaw activity proposed by a group of teachers from a workshop carried out in year 2000. As a result, a G-Jigsaw process model is formulated which comprises of Initial Level, Expert Level and Jigsaw Level of collaborations. This process model restructured the Initial Level of Aronson's Jigsaw Classroom technique to allow students' collaboration throughout every level of the collaborative session. Secondly, reviews on software agent literature, specializing on web agent are carried out. It describes how a multi-agent architecture is formulated to enable the web agents to communicate with each other in simplifying and automating the jigsaw activities. Further, this thesis presents the development and implementation of G-Jigsaw that incorporates the process model, the multi-agent architecture and the deployment of web agents in supporting the jigsaw collaborative learning. Next, it highlights the teachers (pilot testing) and students (hands-on testing) evaluations and the results indicated that

web agents greatly simplified the complex jigsaw processes. Finally, the research contributions and future enhancements are enclosed.

## Acknowledgement

Normally, dissertation research resembles a solitary expedition. As one of the team members in this collaborative project however, I view this research as a joint effort too. The work reported here, at least, would not have achieved the current stage without support, discussions, and other forms of collaboration with many people, a few of whom are mentioned below.

Firstly, I wish to express my heartiest gratitude to my supervisor, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Siti Salwah Salim for giving me the opportunity and environment to carry out my research under her supervision. I thank her for her confidence in me, for her intellectual support, for her the time spent reviewing my system and commenting drafts of my thesis chapters.

Secondly, I feel fortunate for being part of the members in Human Computer Interaction Laboratory (HCI Lab). I am grateful to both current and former members who has been working hard the Lab: Siti Soraya Abdul Rahman, Rafidah Pakir Mohamad, Halimah Ab. Rahman, Abdul Majid Hissen, Kasthuri Subaramaniam, Kemalatha Krishnasamy, Nazila bt. Pardi, Latifah bt. Abd Latib. Their contributions range from reviewing G-Jigsaw at various stages (design, prototype and system), to assisting me to coordinate testing which involved large group of users. Special thanks to Rose Zaimi Mohd Zaid for her willingness in assisting me to proof read my thesis chapters.

Thirdly, I sincerely thank to a number of friends who have strengthened and challenged me at difficult moments throughout the research: Chuah Chong Wei, Peh Boon How,



Lim Khong Leng, Simon Seow Chen Siong, Huang Li Li, Ang Ley Poh, Beh Bee Luan, Lim Shueh Lih, Tan Ley Teng and Yap Bee Ling.

Fourthly, I would like to thanks the Sekolah Kebangsaan Putrajaya 2. Thanks to the school's headmaster Mr. Sukimin for his permission to conduct the testing, to Mr. Masnawi for assisting me in setting up the system at their school's environment and to Mr. Meor and Mr. Khairi for their cooperation in coordinating the teachers and students involved in the testing.

Finally, I thank my parents, Low Kwai Teng and Chin Ah Thaim for their fully support through my study and research. I wish I had devoted myself to them as much as I did to this work.

This research is supported by the IRPA research grant 04-02-03-0704.

# Table of Contents

Abstract.....	i
Acknowledgement.....	iii
Table of Contents.....	v
List of Figures.....	viii
List of Tables.....	x
Chapter 1 – Introduction.....	1
1.1 Research Overview.....	4
1.2 Research Motivations .....	5
1.3 Research Objectives.....	6
1.4 Research Scopes .....	7
1.5 Research Methodology .....	8
1.6 Thesis Organization .....	10
Chapter 2 – Collaborative Learning .....	12
2.1 Collaborative Learning Definition.....	12
2.2 Benefits of Collaborative Learning .....	13
2.3 Limitations of Collaborative Learning .....	15
2.4 Collaborative Learning Techniques.....	15
2.4.1 Circles of Learning (Learning Together).....	16
2.4.2 Student Teams-Achievement Division (STAD).....	16
2.4.3 Teams-Games-Tournaments (TGT) .....	16
2.4.4 Team-Assisted Individualization or Team-Accelerated Instruction (TAI) ...	17
2.4.5 Group Investigation (GI) .....	17
2.4.6 Co-op- Co-op.....	18
2.4.7 Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC).....	18
2.4.8 Jigsaw Classroom .....	19
2.5 Computer Supported Collaborative Learning (CSCL).....	19
2.5.1 CSCL Applications.....	20
2.6 CSCL in Malaysian Schools.....	27
2.7 WebCL Workshop.....	30
2.7.1 The Workshop’s Brainstorming Sessions.....	31
2.7.2 The Workshop Formative Evaluation.....	31
2.7.3 The Workshop Outcomes and Proposal .....	33
2.8 The Proposed G-Jigsaw Module.....	33
2.9 Chapter Summary .....	35
Chapter 3 – G-Jigsaw (Group Jigsaw) Process Model .....	36
3.1 Jigsaw Classroom .....	36
3.2 An Example of Jigsaw Classroom Activities .....	39
3.3 The advantages and limitation of Jigsaw Classroom.....	41
3.4 The proposed G-Jigsaw versus Jigsaw Classroom .....	43
3.5 The G-Jigsaw Process Model .....	46
3.5.1 Initial Level of Collaboration .....	47
3.5.2 Expert Level of Collaboration .....	49
3.5.3 Jigsaw Level of Collaboration.....	51
3.6 Summary of Aronson’s Jigsaw Classroom and G-Jigsaw Process Model .....	52
3.7 Tools to support jigsaw technique .....	54
3.8 G-Jigsaw Prototype.....	55
3.9 Chapter Summary .....	57
Chapter 4 – Web Agents for Supporting Collaborative Learning .....	58
4.1 Agent Definitions.....	58
4.2 Agent Classifications .....	60

4.2.1 Nwana's Agent typology .....	60
4.2.2 Different Agent Types Identified by Nwana .....	63
4.2.2.1 Collaborative Agents .....	64
4.2.2.2 Interface Agents .....	64
4.2.3.3 Mobile Agents .....	64
4.2.2.4 Information Agents .....	65
4.2.2.5 Reactive Agents .....	65
4.2.2.6 Hybrid Agents .....	66
4.2.2.7 Heterogeneous Agents .....	66
4.3 Web Agent .....	67
4.3.1 The Potentials of Web Agents .....	68
4.3.2 Types of Web Agents .....	69
4.4 Agent Architectures for Educational Applications .....	72
4.4.1 Existing Educational Applications with Agent Architectures .....	73
4.4.2 Summary on reviewed Agent Architectures .....	80
4.5 Web Agents in Supporting Collaborative Learning .....	83
4.6 Web Agents in supporting G-Jigsaw Collaborative Learning .....	85
4.7 Review Summary .....	86
Chapter 5 – G-Jigsaw Analysis and Design .....	87
5.1 G-Jigsaw Analysis .....	87
5.1.1 Requirement Analysis .....	87
5.1.1.1 G-Jigsaw Functional Requirements .....	88
5.1.1.2 G-Jigsaw Non-functional requirements .....	91
5.1.2 Object-Oriented Analysis .....	91
5.1.2.1 G-Jigsaw's Use Case Diagrams .....	92
5.1.2.2 G-Jigsaw Class Modeling .....	95
5.1.3 Summary of Web Agents Requirements in G-Jigsaw .....	96
5.2 G-Jigsaw Design .....	97
5.2.1 Architecture Design .....	97
5.2.2 Object-Oriented Design .....	102
5.2.2.1 G-Jigsaw's Sequential Diagrams .....	102
5.2.2.2 G-Jigsaw's Activity Diagrams .....	107
5.2.3 G-Jigsaw Graphical User Interface Design .....	109
5.3 Chapter Summary .....	111
Chapter 6 – G-Jigsaw Implementation and Execution .....	112
6.1 The implementation of G-Jigsaw's Agents .....	112
6.2 The Implementation of G-Jigsaw's Internal Multi-Agent Architecture .....	114
6.2.1 G-Jigsaw's Multi-Agent Communication .....	118
6.3 The Implementation of G-Jigsaw Security Aspects .....	128
6.4 Scenarios of G-Jigsaw Execution .....	128
6.4.1 Jigsaw Task Module .....	129
6.4.2 Initial Group Module .....	131
6.4.3 Expert Group Module .....	133
6.4.4 Jigsaw Group Module .....	136
6.5 Chapter Summary .....	138
Chapter 7 – G-Jigsaw Evaluation and Result .....	139
7.1 G-Jigsaw Evaluation .....	139
7.2 Pilot Test for Primary Schools Teachers .....	139
7.2.1 Experimental Material .....	140
7.2.2 Environment .....	140
7.2.3 Methodology .....	141
7.2.4 Activities Performed in the Task Scenarios .....	141

7.2.5 Designed Questionnaire.....	143
7.2.6 Pilot Test Results .....	145
7.3 Hands-On Testing for Primary School Students .....	154
7.3.1 Experimental Material .....	155
7.3.2 Environment .....	155
7.3.3 Methodology.....	155
7.3.4 Designed Questionnaire.....	156
7.3.5 Student Hands On Testing Results .....	156
7.4 Discussion on G-Jigsaw's Achievement .....	158
7.5 Chapter Summary .....	161
Chapter 8 – Conclusion and Future Enhancements.....	162
8.1 Research Summary .....	162
8.2 Research Contributions.....	163
8.3 Future Enhancements.....	165
References.....	167
Appendix A: G-Jigsaw Object-Oriented Analysis and Design .....	175
Appendix B: G-Jigsaw Evaluation Task Scenarios .....	203
Appendix C: G-Jigsaw Questionnaires.....	210
Appendix D: G-Jigsaw Web Agents' Algorithm.....	217

# List of Figures

Figure 1-1 Research Methodology .....	10
Figure 3-1 Aronson's Jigsaw Classroom Process Model .....	38
Figure 3-2 The Forming of Initial Groups .....	47
Figure 3-3 Initial Level of Collaboration.....	48
Figure 3-4 The Forming of Expert Groups.....	49
Figure 3-5 Expert Level of Collaboration .....	50
Figure 3-6 The Forming of Jigsaw Group .....	51
Figure 4-1 Nwana's Agent Typology (from Nwana, 1996) .....	62
Figure 4-2 A Summary of Nwana's Different Agent Types (from Nwana, 1996).....	63
Figure 4-3 Various Types of Web Agents with Different Roles on the Internet.....	72
Figure 4-4 EduBots' Internal Architecture (Adapted from Andoh et. al., 2001) .....	74
Figure 4-5 Agent Architecture (Adapted from Olguin et. al. 2000).....	76
Figure 4-6 A Proposed Architectural Scheme of a Multi-Agent System (Adapted from Fenton-Kerr et. al., 1998) .....	79
Figure 5-1 Use Case Diagram For Jigsaw Task Module.....	93
Figure 5-2 Use Cases Diagram For Initial Group Module .....	94
Figure 5-3 Use Cases Diagram For Expert Group Module .....	94
Figure 5-4 G-Jigsaw Class Model .....	95
Figure 5-5 G-Jigsaw Environment.....	98
Figure 5-6 Domino Web Server Architecture .....	100
Figure 5-7 G-Jigsaw's Multi-tier Client/Server Architecture.....	101
Figure 5-8 G-Jigsaw Successful Login Scenario.....	103
Figure 5-9 Jigsaw Task Module's Create New Jigsaw Task Scenario.....	105
Figure 5-10 Initial Group Module's Compose Response Scenario .....	106
Figure 5-11 Expert Group Module's View Summaries Scenario.....	106
Figure 5-12 Jigsaw Group Module's Integrate All Reports Scenario.....	107
Figure 5-13 Activity Diagram Showing Students' Jigsaw Activity Process .....	108
Figure 5-14 G-Jigsaw's Homepage GUI Design.....	109
Figure 5-15 G-Jigsaw's Page GUI Design .....	110
Figure 6-1 G-Jigsaw Internal Agent Architecture .....	116
Figure 6-2 The Multi-agent Internal Architecture's Communication in G-Jigsaw .....	117
Figure 6-3 The Sharing Agent Execution.....	121
Figure 6-4 The Navigation Agent Execution.....	125
Figure 6-5 The Integration Agent Execution.....	127
Figure 6-6 G-Jigsaw Homepage .....	129
Figure 6-7 G-Jigsaw's Question Templates .....	129
Figure 6-8 Creating a Jigsaw Task .....	130
Figure 6-9 Jigsaw Tasks View.....	131
Figure 6-10 Questions to be responded in Initial Group .....	131
Figure 6-11 Giving Responses in Initial Group.....	132
Figure 6-12 The Summary View and Form.....	132
Figure 6-13 Expert Group View .....	133
Figure 6-14 Providing comments and feedback to the Summary.....	134
Figure 6-15 The Report View .....	135
Figure 6-16 The Report Form.....	135
Figure 6-17 Jigsaw Group Report View.....	136
Figure 6-18 Integrate Report View.....	137
Figure 6-19 Completed Task View.....	137
Figure 7-1 Comparison Results on the significant differences of web agents in simplifying the jigsaw activities .....	147

Figure 7-2 Comparison Results on the level of difficulties in learning to use G-Jigsaw	148
Figure 7-3 Web Agents in supporting G-Jigsaw Activities	152
Figure A-1-1 Accessing G-Jigsaw Use Case Diagram	176
Figure A-1-2 Accessing Jigsaw Task Module Use Case Diagram	176
Figure A-1-3 Accessing Initial Group Module Use Case Diagram	177
Figure A-1-4 Accessing Expert Group Module Use Case Diagram	177
Figure A-1-5 Accessing Jigsaw Group Module Use Case Diagram	178
Figure A-2-1 G-Jigsaw Class Diagram	179
Figure A-3-1 Successful Login Sequential Diagram	180
Figure A-3-2 Login Failure Sequential Diagram	181
Figure A-3-3 Navigate to other Task Modules Sequential Diagram	181
Figure A-3-4 Read/View Jigsaw Tasks Sequential Diagram	182
Figure A-3-5 Compose New Jigsaw Task Sequential Diagram	183
Figure A-3-6 Preview and Select Templates Sequential Diagram	184
Figure A-3-7 Retrieve Jigsaw Task Questions Sequential Diagram	184
Figure A-3-8 Edit Jigsaw Task Sequential Diagram	185
Figure A-3-10 Submit Jigsaw Task Sequential Diagram	186
Figure A-3-11 Set Profile Sequential Diagram	187
Figure A-3-12 Compose Response Sequential Diagram	187
Figure A-3-13 Submit Response Sequential Diagram	188
Figure A-3-14 Read/View Responses Sequential Diagram	188
Figure A-3-15 Compose Summary Sequential Diagram	189
Figure A-3-16 Retrieve Responses Sequential Diagram	189
Figure A-3-17 Submit Summary Sequential Diagram	190
Figure A-3-18 Read/View Summaries Sequential Diagram	190
Figure A-3-19 Respond to Summaries Sequential Diagram	191
Figure A-3-20 Compose Report Sequential Diagram	191
Figure A-3-21 Retrieve Summary Sequential Diagram	192
Figure A-3-22 Submit Report Sequential Diagram	192
Figure A-3-23 Read/View Reports Sequential Diagram	193
Figure A-3-24 Edit Report Sequential Diagram	194
Figure A-3-25 Delete Report Sequential Diagram	194
Figure A-3-26 Integrate Reports Sequential Diagram	195
Figure A-3-27 Switch Group Sequential Diagram	195
Figure A-4-1 Create New Jigsaw Task Activity Diagram	196
Figure A-4-2 Read and/or Edit Jigsaw Task Activity Diagram	197
Figure A-4-3 Respond to Group Members Activity Diagram	198
Figure A-4-4 Compose Summary Activity Diagram	199
Figure A-4-5 Provide Comments and Compose Report Activity Diagram	200
Figure A-4-6 Read, Edit and Integrate Group Reports Activity Diagram	201
Figure A-4-7 The Entire Jigsaw Session Activity Diagram	202

## List of Tables

Table 2-1 CSCL Applications that support Children's Collaborative Learning .....	25
Table 3-1 The advantages and limitation of Jigsaw Classroom .....	43
Table 3-2 Jigsaw Classroom and G-Jigsaw Requirements Comparison .....	43
Table 3-3 Steps for Aronson's Jigsaw Classroom and G-Jigsaw Process Model. ....	52
Table 4-1 Summary of Web Agents' Implementation in Educational Applications.....	80
Table 4-2 Web Agents Roles in Supporting Collaborative Learning Activities .....	84
Table 6-1 Activity Agency's Reactions Towards User's Requests.....	118
Table 6-2 Sharing Agent's Communication .....	119
Table 6-3 Pseudo-codes for Sharing Agent's Algorithm .....	120
Table 6-4 Navigation Agent's Communication.....	122
Table 6-5 Map Profile Agent's mapping table .....	122
Table 6-6 Pseudo-codes for Navigation Agent's Algorithm .....	123
Table 6-7 Integration Agent's Communication.....	125
Table 6-8 Pseudo-codes for Integration Agent's Algorithm .....	126
Table 7-1 Summary of Pilot Test Designed Questionnaire .....	144
Table 7-2 The Average Time Spent in Performing Each Jigsaw Activity .....	145
Table 7-3 Group Report Integration Steps (with and without web agents) Comparison .....	147
Table 7-4 (a) Results on the Usefulness of G-Jigsaw's Facilities .....	149
Table 7-4 (b) Results on the Collaboration among the Teachers and Students.....	149
Table 7-4 (c) Results on the helpfulness of G-Jigsaw's Quick Helps and Instructions	150
Table 7-4 (d) G-Jigsaw's Performance Evaluation Results.....	150
Table 7-4 (e) G-Jigsaw Ease-of-use Results.....	151
Table 7-5 G-Jigsaw's Usability Test Results.....	152
Table 7-6 Summary of Questionnaire Evaluation Categories .....	156
Table 7-7 Student Hands-On Testing Results .....	156