

ACP 9242

(P)

THE COMPOSING PROCESSES OF PRE-INTERMEDIATE ESL  
STUDENTS IN THEIR FIRST LANGUAGE AND  
THE ENGLISH LANGUAGE

Yeong Mee Leng

Perpustakaan Universiti Malaya



A509556903

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Languages and Linguistics,  
University of Malaya  
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of  
Masters in Teaching English as Second Language  
2001

## ABSTRAK

Penyelidikan ini mengkaji cara penulisan pelajar ESL peringkat pra-perantara untuk meneliti persamaan dan perbezaan cara penulisan mereka dalam bahasa pertama dan bahasa Inggeris. Ia juga menguji hipotesis samada bahasa pertama adalah bahasa utama yang digunakan oleh pelajar ESL peringkat pra-perantara untuk memikir semasa menulis dalam bahasa pertama dan bahasa Inggeris.

Kajian ini menggunakan kaedah kajian kes dan data dikumpul melalui protokol penyuaan-fikiran, senarai soal-selidik, temuramah dan analisis karangan. Lima pelajar Malaysia keturunan Cina dari sebuah kolej swasta yang mengambil bahagian dalam kajian ini dikehendaki menulis dua karangan diskriptif menggunakan satu tajuk, pertama dalam bahasa pertama diikuti dengan penulisan dalam bahasa Inggeris. Mereka diminta menyuarakan pemikiran mereka semasa menulis dan ini dirakamkan secara audio dan video untuk dianalisis.

Hasil kajian ini menunjukkan persamaan cara penulisan pelajar semasa menulis dalam bahasa pertama mereka dan bahasa Inggeris yakni cara penulisan dipindahkan dari bahasa pertama ke bahasa kedua. Perbezaan yang diteliti adalah penggunaan cara penulisan yang lebih kerap semasa menulis dalam bahasa pertama dan penggunaan bahasa pertama serta bahasa ketiga iaitu Bahasa Melayu semasa penulisan bahasa Inggeris. Hipotesis juga diuji positif yakni pelajar ESL pra-perantara dalam kajian ini menggunakan bahasa pertama sebagai bahasa utama untuk memikir semasa menulis dalam bahasa pertama dan bahasa Inggeris.

## ABSTRACT

This study attempts to trace the composing processes of pre-intermediate ESL students in their first language and the English language. It is also to test the hypothesis that pre-intermediate ESL students use L1 as the dominant language to think when writing in their first language and the English Language.

This is a qualitative research project using a case-study approach obtaining data through multiple data collection method. Sources of data were think-aloud protocol, semi-structured questionnaire, retrospective interview and analysis of students' written products. Five Malaysian Chinese students from a private college were asked to write two descriptive essays using one topic, first in their L1 and then in English, verbalizing as they wrote, which was audio and video taped. After writing, they completed a retrospective process questionnaire followed by an interview.

This study found subjects displaying similar behaviors when writing in their L1 and in English. This finding indicates that pre-intermediate ESL students in this study transfer their L1 writing skills to L2 writing. Apart from similarities, the researcher noted differences such as higher occurrences of behavior in L1 writing and usage of other languages i.e. L1 and Malay language when students composed in English. The present study also validated the hypothesis that pre-intermediate ESL students in this study used L1 as the dominant language to think when writing in their first language and the English Language.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Completing this dissertation has not been an easy task but it is truly God's will and grace that made it possible. My heartfelt gratitude to my supervisor, Ms Tam Shu Sim who not only gave me the inspiration to do a research on this subject but also patiently guided me throughout the process of writing this dissertation.

I would like to express my appreciation to my thoughtful colleagues especially, Dr. Lim Ho Peng, the Dean of SOLLA-ICM who generously shared his expertise on the research mechanism; Ms Khaw Li Lian who helped to transcribe and translate; Mr. Chong Eu Choong and Ms Florence Mah who offered their invaluable advice; Ms Linda Tan and Ms Irene Wong who kindly proof read this thesis, and other colleagues who prodded me on. A big thank you to Ms Regina Tan, Ms L.F. Fernandez and my sister-in-law, Ms Yong Hiok Ching for their assistance in facilitating the data analysis.

Last but not least, I would like to thank my husband, Hiok Wong for his encouragement to continue my studies, his understanding of my love of learning and his patience in times of stress. This is specially dedicated to my mother, Madam Chin Siew Ying and my children, Michelle, Alvin and Gavin for being there with their smile and laughter motivating me all along.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
ABSTRACT IN MALAY.....	ii
ABSTRACT IN ENGLISH.....	iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT.....	iv
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	v
LIST OF TABLES.....	viii
 <b>CHAPTER 1 - INTRODUCTION</b>	
1.1 Background to the Study.....	2
1.2 Purpose of Study.....	3
1.3 Research Questions.....	5
1.4 Hypothesis.....	5
1.5 Significance of the Study.....	6
1.6 Assumptions and Limitations.....	7
1.7 Definition of Terms.....	9
 <b>CHAPTER II – LITERATURE REVIEW</b>	
2.1 Introduction.....	11
2.2 Research on the composing processes of first language writers.....	12
2.3 Research on the composing processes of L2 writers.....	14
2.3.1 Comparison of Composing Behaviors of L2 & L1 writers.....	14
2.4 Researches on the composing processes of bilingual writers.....	17
2.5 The use of first language in the second language composing process.....	19
2.6 Conclusion.....	24

**CHAPTER III - METHODOLOGY**

3.1	Introduction.....	26
3.2	Research Design.....	26
3.3	Research Instruments.....	27
	3.3.1 Think-Aloud Protocol.....	27
	3.3.2 Semi-structured Questionnaire.....	28
	3.3.3 Retrospective Interview.....	29
	3.3.4 Students' Written Products.....	30
3.4	Pilot Study.....	30
3.5	Research Subjects.....	31
3.6	Data Collection Procedure.....	33
3.7	Data Analysis Procedure.....	35
	3.7.1 Think-Aloud Protocol Analysis.....	36
	3.7.2 Questionnaire and Retrospective Interview.....	37
	3.7.3 Analysis of Written Product.....	37

**CHAPTER IV – FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION**

4.1	Profiles of the Five Subjects.....	40
4.2	General Composing Processes and Behaviors of the Five Subjects.....	41
4.3	Dominant Language-in-use.....	53
4.4	Discussion on Findings.....	55
4.5	Summary of Findings.....	60

**CHAPTER V – CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

5.1	Overview.....	62
5.2	Implications for Teaching.....	64
5.3	Recommendations for further research.....	65

<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY.....</b>	<b>67</b>
--------------------------	-----------

<b>APPENDIX A – English Language Program for Secondary School.....</b>	<b>72</b>
--	-----------

<b>APPENDIX B – Process log Questionnaire.....</b>	<b>73</b>
--	-----------

<b>APPENDIX C – Sample of written product with codes.....</b>	<b>77</b>
---	-----------

<b>APPENDIX D – Comparison between CHH’s written product and Transcription.....</b>	<b>78</b>
---	-----------

<b>APPENDIX E – TSC’s Chinese writing.....</b>	<b>79</b>
--	-----------

<b>APPENDIX F – TSC’s English writing.....</b>	<b>80</b>
--	-----------

<b>APPENDIX G – CCF’s Chinese writing.....</b>	<b>81</b>
--	-----------

<b>APPENDIX H – CCF’s English writing.....</b>	<b>82</b>
--	-----------

<b>APPENDIX I – LYF’s Chinese writing.....</b>	<b>83</b>
--	-----------

<b>APPENDIX J – LYF’s English writing.....</b>	<b>85</b>
--	-----------

<b>APPENDIX K – NCP’s Chinese writing.....</b>	<b>87</b>
--	-----------

<b>APPENDIX L – NCP’s English writing.....</b>	<b>89</b>
--	-----------

<b>APPENDIX M – CHH’s Chinese writing.....</b>	<b>91</b>
--	-----------

<b>APPENDIX N – CHH’s English writing.....</b>	<b>93</b>
--	-----------

**LIST OF TABLES**

Table 1 –Coding Scheme for Protocol Analysis.....	38
Table 2 – Profile of the Five Subjects.....	41
Table 3 – Composing Processes/Behaviors of all subjects.....	42
Table 4 – TSC’s composing processes/behaviors in Chinese essay.....	79
Table 5 – TSC’s composing processes/behaviors in English essay.....	80
Table 6 – CCF’s composing processes/behaviors in Chinese essay.....	81
Table 7 – CCF’s composing processes/behaviors in English essay.....	82
Table 8 – LYF’s composing processes/behaviors in Chinese essay.....	84
Table 9 – LYF’s composing processes/behaviors in English essay.....	86
Table 10 – NCP’s composing processes/behaviors in Chinese essay.....	88
Table 11 – NCP’s composing processes/behaviors in English essay.....	90
Table 12 - CHH’s composing processes/behaviors in Chinese essay.....	92
Table 13 – CHH’s composing processes/behaviors in English essay.....	94