

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CONTENTS	PAGE
Abstract in English	ii
Abstract in Bahasa Melayu.....	iv
Acknowledgements	vi
Table of Contents.....	vii
List of Appendices.....	xii
List of Figures and Tables.....	xiv
CHAPTER 1	INTRODUCTION
1.1	Evaluation: An Overview.....1
1.2	Evaluating Writing.....4
1.3	Issues to Consider when Scoring Written Work.....6
1.4	Statement of the Problem.....7
1.5	Significance of the Study.....12
1.6	Limitations of the Study.....12
1.7	Definition of Terms.....13
CHAPTER 2	LITERATURE REVIEW
2.1	Second Language Composition Writing.....15

2.2	Popular Approaches to ESL Composition	
	Writing in Malaysia.....	16
2.2.1	The Controlled Approach.....	16
2.2.2	The Current-Traditional Rhetoric Approach.....	17
2.2.3	The Process Approach.....	18
2.2.4	English for Academic Purposes.....	19
2.2.5	Computer Assisted Language Learning	20
2.3	Approaches to Scoring Written Work.....	21
2.4	Holistic Scoring: An Overview.....	24
2.4.1	Holistic Scoring – Its Strengths.....	26
2.4.2	Holistic Scoring – Its Limitations.....	28
2.5	Analytic Scoring: An Overview.....	30
2.5.1	Analytic Scoring: Its Strengths.....	32
2.5.2	Analytic Scoring: Its Weaknesses.....	34
2.6	Previous Studies on Holistic vs. Analytic Scoring.....	36
2.7	What is Feedback.....	37
2.7.1	Considerations for Feedback in second Language Writing.....	38
2.8	The Feedback vs. No Feedback Debate.....	40
CHAPTER 3	METHODOLOGY	
3.1	Introduction.....	45

3.2	The IELTS Exam.....	46
3.2.1	The TCSJ IELTS Preparatory Course.....	49
3.2.2	The Course Content.....	50
3.3	Subjects.....	51
3.3.1	Student Selection Criteria.....	52
3.3.2	Scorer Selection Criteria.....	54
3.3.3	Selection Criteria for Interviewees.....	54
3.4	Instruments.....	55
3.4.1	Student Essays (Pre-test & Post-test).....	55
3.4.2	Questionnaire.....	56
3.4.3	Interviews with Lecturers.....	58
3.5	Scoring Scheme.....	59
3.5.1	The IELTS Scoring Scale.....	60
3.5.2	The ESL Composition Profile Scale.....	62
3.6	Methodology.....	65
3.6.1	Subjects, Writing Tasks and Scoring Methods....	65
3.6.2	Training of Scorers.....	66
3.6.3	Administration of Pre-test and Post-test.....	67
3.6.4	Administration of the Questionnaires.....	68
3.6.5	Interviews with Lecturers.....	68
3.7	Data Analysis.....	70

CHAPTER 4	RESULTS AND DATA ANALYSIS
4.1	Analysis of Data.....71
4.2	Analysis of Students' Essays.....71
4.2.1	Findings of Students' Writing Performance using the IELTS Band Descriptor Scale.....72
4.2.2	Findings of Students' Writing Performance using the ESL Composition Profile Scale.....74
4.3	Analysis of Students Overall Improvement in Each Writing Skill.....76
4.3.1	Percentage of Improvement for Content.....77
4.3.2	Percentage of Improvement for Language.....78
4.3.3	Percentage of Improvement for Organization.....79
4.3.4	Percentage of Improvement for Vocabulary.....80
4.3.5	Percentage of Improvement for Mechanics.....81
4.4	The Average Percentage of Improvement for Each Student in Course A and Course H for the Different Skill Areas.....82
4.5	Analysis of Students' Questionnaires.....84
4.5.1	Students' Perceptions of their Writing Skills.....85
4.5.2	Attitudes toward the Holistic Scoring Method.....86
4.5.3	Attitudes toward the Analytic Scoring Method.....87

4.5.4	Students' Responses to Feedback.....	89
4.5.4.1	Initiative to Re-read Essays.....	89
4.5.4.2	Initiative to Think about and Self-Edit Errors.....	91
4.5.4.3	Pro-active Actions taken by Students in Response to Feedback.....	92
4.5.5	Usefulness of Teacher's Feedback.....	94
4.6	Analysis of Interview with Lecturers.....	96
4.6.1	Background Information of the Teachers.....	97
4.6.2	Scoring Essays – Teachers' Viewpoints.....	99
4.6.3	Teachers' Views of the Analytic Scoring, Holistic Scoring and Other Methods of Scoring Essays	101
CHAPTER 5	CONCLUSIONS	
5.1	Introduction.....	108
5.2	Research Question 1.....	108
5.3	Research Question 2	112
5.4	Research Question 3.....	116
5.5	Conclusions.....	119
5.6	Implications for Teaching.....	120
5.7	Recommendations.....	121

BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	123
APPENDICES.....	131
LIST OF APPENDICES	
Appendix A	Students' Questionnaire.....132
Appendix B	Interview Guide.....133
Appendix C(i)	The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores of Students in Course A (IELTS Band Method of Scoring).....134
Appendix C(ii)	The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores of Students in Course A (ESL Composition Profile Scoring).....135
Appendix C(iii)	The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores for Content for Course A.....136
Appendix C(iv)	The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores for Language for Course A.....137
Appendix C(v)	The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores for Organization for Course A138
Appendix C(vi)	The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores for Vocabulary for Course H.....139
Appendix C(vii)	The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores for Mechanics for Course A140
Appendix C(viii)	The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores of Students in Course H (IELTS Band Method of Scoring).....141
Appendix C(ix)	The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores of Students

	in Course A (ESL Composition Profile Scoring).....	142
Appendix C(x)	The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores for Content for Course H.....	143
Appendix C(xi)	The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores for Language for Course H.....	144
Appendix C(xii)	The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores for Vocabulary for Course H	145
Appendix C(xiii)	The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores for Organization for Course H.....	146
Appendix C(xiv)	The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores for Mechanics for Course H	147
Appendix D(i)	The Overall Band Improvement for Students in Course A and Course H (IELTS Band Scoring Method).....	148
Appendix D(ii)	The Overall Percentage of Improvement for Students in Course A and Course H (ESL Composition Profile Method of Scoring).....	149
Appendix D(iii)	The Overall Percentage of Improvement in the area of Content for Students in Course A and Course H.....	150
Appendix D(iv)	The Overall Percentage of Improvement in the area of Language for Students in Course A and Course H.....	151
Appendix D(v)	The Overall Percentage of Improvement in the area of Organization for Students in Course A and	

	Course H.....	152
Appendix D(vi)	The Overall Percentage of Improvement in the area of Vocabulary for Students in Course A and Course H.....	153
Appendix D(vii)	The Overall Percentage of Improvement in the area of Mechanics for Students in Course A and Course H.....	154
Appendix E(i)	Sample Essay – Course A-ST6 Pre-test.....	155
Appendix E(ii)	Sample Essay- Course A-ST6 Post-test.....	156
Appendix E(iii)	Sample Essay – Course A-ST12 Pre-test.....	157
Appendix E(iv)	Sample Essay – Course A-ST12 Post-test.....	158
Appendix E(v)	Sample Essay – Course H-ST12 Pre-test.....	159
Appendix E(vi)	Sample Essay – Course H- ST12 Post-test.....	160
Appendix E(vii)	Sample Essay – Course H-ST14 Pre-test.....	161
Appendix E(viii)	Sample Essay – Course H –ST14 Post-test.....	162

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1	Evaluation in a Curriculum.....	2
Figure 3.1	The Various Stages of the Data Collection Process.....	69

LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1	The IELTS Band Scoring Scale.....	61
Table 3.2	The ESL Composition Profile Scale.....	62
Table 4.1	The Overall Band Improvement for Students in Course A and Course H (IELTS Band Descriptor Scale).....	73
Table 4.2	The Overall Percentage of Improvement in Scores for Students in Course A and Course H (ESL Composition Profile Scale).....	74
Table 4.3	The Average Percentage of Improvement for each Student in Course A and Course H (ESL Composition Profile Scale).....	75
Table 4.4	The Percentage of Improvement or Otherwise of Students in the areas of Content, Organization, Language, Vocabulary and Mechanics in Course A and Course H using the ESL Composition Profile Scoring Method.....	76
Table 4.5	The Average Percentage of Improvement for each Student from Course A and Course H in the Different Skills.....	82
Table 4.6	Students' Perceptions of their Writing Skills.....	85
Table 4.7	Students' Attitudes toward the Holistic Scoring Method..	86
Table 4.8	Students' Attitudes toward the Analytic Scoring Method.	87
Table 4.9	Students' Initiative to Re-read their Essays upon	

	receiving them.....	90
Table 4.10	Students' Initiatives to think About and Self-Edit Errors.....	91
Table 4.11	Pro-active Actions taken by Students in Response to Feedback.....	93
Table 4.12	Usefulness of Lecturer's Feedback.....	95
Table 4.13	Background Information of the Teachers.....	97
Table 4.14	Scoring Essays – Teachers' Viewpoints.....	100
Table 4.15	Teachers' Views on Analytic Scoring, Holistic Scoring and Other Methods of Scoring Essays.....	102