# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONTENTS</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abstract in English</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstract in Bahasa Melayu</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Contents</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Appendices</td>
<td>xii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Figures and Tables</td>
<td>xiv</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1.1</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Evaluation: An Overview</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluating Writing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Issues to Consider when Scoring</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written Work</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statement of the Problem</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significance of the Study</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limitations of the Study</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Definition of Terms</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## CHAPTER 2 LITERATURE REVIEW

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2.1</th>
<th>15</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Second Language Composition Writing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.2 Popular Approaches to ESL Composition

Writing in Malaysia..............................16

2.2.1 The Controlled Approach......................16

2.2.2 The Current-Traditional Rhetoric Approach.....17

2.2.3 The Process Approach........................18

2.2.4 English for Academic Purposes................19

2.2.5 Computer Assisted Language Learning.........20

2.3 Approaches to Scoring Written Work...............21

2.4 Holistic Scoring: An Overview....................24

2.4.1 Holistic Scoring – Its Strengths................26

2.4.2 Holistic Scoring – Its Limitations...............28

2.5 Analytic Scoring: An Overview....................30

2.5.1 Analytic Scoring: Its Strengths................32

2.5.2 Analytic Scoring: Its Weaknesses...............34

2.6 Previous Studies on Holistic vs. Analytic Scoring..................36

2.7 What is Feedback................................37

2.7.1 Considerations for Feedback in second Language Writing..................38

2.8 The Feedback vs. No Feedback Debate..............40

CHAPTER 3 METHODOLOGY

3.1 Introduction..................................45
3.2 The IELTS Exam .............................................. 46
3.2.1 The TCSJ IELTS Preparatory Course ................. 49
3.2.2 The Course Content .................................. 50
3.3 Subjects ..................................................... 51
3.3.1 Student Selection Criteria .............................. 52
3.3.2 Scorer Selection Criteria ............................... 54
3.3.3 Selection Criteria for Interviewees .................... 54
3.4 Instruments ............................................... 55
3.4.1 Student Essays (Pre-test & Post-test) ................ 55
3.4.2 Questionnaire ......................................... 56
3.4.3 Interviews with Lecturers .............................. 58
3.5 Scoring Scheme .......................................... 59
3.5.1 The IELTS Scoring Scale .............................. 60
3.5.2 The ESL Composition Profile Scale ................... 62
3.6 Methodology .............................................. 65
3.6.1 Subjects, Writing Tasks and Scoring Methods ...... 65
3.6.2 Training of Scorers ..................................... 66
3.6.3 Administration of Pre-test and Post-test .............. 67
3.6.4 Administration of the Questionnaires ................ 68
3.6.5 Interviews with Lecturers .............................. 68
3.7 Data Analysis ............................................. 70
CHAPTER 4

RESULTS AND DATA ANALYSIS

4.1 Analysis of Data ............................................ 71

4.2 Analysis of Students’ Essays ............................... 71

4.2.1 Findings of Students’ Writing Performance
using the IELTS Band Descriptor Scale ............. 72

4.2.2 Findings of Students’ Writing Performance
using the ESL Composition Profile Scale ........... 74

4.3 Analysis of Students Overall Improvement in
Each Writing Skill ............................................. 76

4.3.1 Percentage of Improvement for Content .......... 77

4.3.2 Percentage of Improvement for Language ....... 78

4.3.3 Percentage of Improvement for Organization ... 79

4.3.4 Percentage of Improvement for Vocabulary .... 80

4.3.5 Percentage of Improvement for Mechanics .... 81

4.4 The Average Percentage of Improvement for
Each Student in Course A and Course H for
the Different Skill Areas .................................... 82

4.5 Analysis of Students’ Questionnaires ................. 84

4.5.1 Students’ Perceptions of their Writing Skills . 85

4.5.2 Attitudes toward the Holistic Scoring Method .... 86

4.5.3 Attitudes toward the Analytic Scoring Method .. 87
4.5.4 Students' Responses to Feedback..........................89
4.5.4.1 Initiative to Re-read Essays..........................89
4.5.4.2 Initiative to Think about and
Self-Edit Errors..............................................91
4.5.4.3 Pro-active Actions taken by Students in
Response to Feedback........................................92
4.5.5 Usefulness of Teacher’s Feedback.........................94
4.6 Analysis of Interview with Lecturers......................96
4.6.1 Background Information of the Teachers..............97
4.6.2 Scoring Essays – Teachers’ Viewpoints.................99
4.6.3 Teachers' Views of the Analytic Scoring,
Holistic Scoring and Other Methods of
Scoring Essays.............................................101

CHAPTER 5
5.1 Introduction.................................................108
5.2 Research Question 1..........................................108
5.3 Research Question 2..........................................112
5.4 Research Question 3..........................................116
5.5 Conclusions.................................................119
5.6 Implications for Teaching....................................120
5.7 Recommendations..........................................121
APPENDICES...........................................................................................................131

LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix A       Students' Questionnaire.........................................................132
Appendix B       Interview Guide.................................................................133
Appendix C(i)    The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores of Students
                 in Course A (IELTS Band Method of Scoring).........................134
Appendix C(ii)   The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores of Students
                 in Course A (ESL Composition Profile Scoring).......................135
Appendix C(iii)  The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores for Content
                 for Course A........................................................................136
Appendix C(iv)   The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores for Language
                 for Course A........................................................................137
Appendix C(v)    The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores for
                 Organization for Course A .......................................................138
Appendix C(vi)   The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores for
                 Vocabulary for Course H...........................................................139
Appendix C(vii)  The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores for
                 Mechanics for Course A ............................................................140
Appendix C(viii) The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores of Students
                 in Course H (IELTS Band Method of Scoring).........................141
Appendix C(ix)   The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores of Students
Appendix C(x)  The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores for Content
for Course H......................................................143

Appendix C(xi)  The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores for Language
for Course H......................................................144

Appendix C(xii)  The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores for Vocabulary for Course H .........................145

Appendix C(xiii)  The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores for Organization for Course H........................146

Appendix C(xiv)  The Overall Pre-test and Post-test Scores for Mechanics for Course H .............................147

Appendix D(i)  The Overall Band Improvement for Students in Course A and Course H (IELTS Band Scoring Method)........148

Appendix D(ii)  The Overall Percentage of Improvement for Students in Course A and Course H (ESL Composition Profile Method of Scoring).....................................................149

Appendix D(iii)  The Overall Percentage of Improvement in the area of Content for Students in Course A and Course H......150

Appendix D(iv)  The Overall Percentage of Improvement in the area of Language for Students in Course A and Course H..........................151

Appendix D(v)  The Overall Percentage of Improvement in the area of Organization for Students in Course A and
Appendix D(vi)  The Overall Percentage of Improvement in the area of Vocabulary for Students in Course A and Course H.................................153

Appendix D(vii) The Overall Percentage of Improvement in the area of Mechanics for Students in Course A and Course H.................................154

Appendix E(i)  Sample Essay – Course A-ST6 Pre-test.........................155

Appendix E(ii)  Sample Essay- Course A-ST6 Post-test.........................156

Appendix E(iii) Sample Essay – Course A-ST12 Pre-test......................157

Appendix E(iv)  Sample Essay – Course A-ST12 Post-test......................158

Appendix E(v)  Sample Essay – Course H-ST12 Pre-test......................159

Appendix E(vi)  Sample Essay – Course H-ST12 Post-test.....................160

Appendix E(vii) Sample Essay – Course H-ST14 Pre-test......................161

Appendix E(viii) Sample Essay – Course H-ST14 Post-test....................162

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1  Evaluation in a Curriculum........................................2

Figure 3.1  The Various Stages of the Data Collection Process............69
LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1  The IELTS Band Scoring Scale .................................. 61
Table 3.2  The ESL Composition Profile Scale .............................. 62
Table 4.1  The Overall Band Improvement for Students in Course A and Course H (IELTS Band Descriptor Scale) .............. 73
Table 4.2  The Overall Percentage of Improvement in Scores for Students in Course A and Course H (ESL Composition Profile Scale) ........................................ 74
Table 4.3  The Average Percentage of Improvement for each Student in Course A and Course H (ESL Composition Profile Scale) ........................................ 75
Table 4.4  The Percentage of Improvement or Otherwise of Students in the areas of Content, Organization, Language, Vocabulary and Mechanics in Course A and Course H using the ESL Composition Profile Scoring Method ........................................... 76
Table 4.5  The Average Percentage of Improvement for each Student from Course A and Course H in the Different Skills ........................................ 82
Table 4.6  Students’ Perceptions of their Writing Skills .................. 85
Table 4.7  Students’ Attitudes toward the Holistic Scoring Method ........................................ 86
Table 4.8  Students’ Attitudes toward the Analytic Scoring Method ........................................ 87
Table 4.9  Students’ Initiative to Re-read their Essays upon
receiving them......................................................90

Table 4.10  Students' Initiatives to think About and
Self-Edit Errors...................................................91

Table 4.11  Pro-active Actions taken by Students in Response to
Feedback...........................................................93

Table 4.12  Usefulness of Lecturer’s Feedback......................95

Table 4.13  Background Information of the Teachers.................97

Table 4.14  Scoring Essays – Teachers' Viewpoints...............100

Table 4.15  Teachers' Views on Analytic Scoring, Holistic
Scoring and Other Methods of Scoring

Essays...............................................................102