

ADA 5456

Ⓟ

**DENNETT'S PHILOSOPHY OF MIND: A CRITICAL
STUDY OF DENNETT'S THEORIES OF
CONTENT AND CONSCIOUSNESS**

by
TAN KOCK WAH
DEPARTMENT OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY STUDIES
FACULTY OF SCIENCE
UNIVERSITI MALAYA

**DISSERTATION PRESENTED FOR THE DEGREE
OF DOCTORATE OF PHILOSOPHY**
UNIVERSITI MALAYA
KUALA LUMPUR
2003

Perpustakaan Universiti Malaya



A511194817

ABSTRACT

DENNETT'S PHILOSOPHY OF MIND: A CRITICAL STUDY OF DENNETT'S THEORIES OF CONTENT AND CONSCIOUSNESS

Dennett's sculpted philosophical standpoint leaves distinct marks on the faces of contemporary Philosophy of Mind. His position has been analyzed and criticized by peers and reviewers alike. However, there is yet to appear a work that seeks to scrutinize Dennett's views in its relative whole. This study hopes to contribute to the narrowing of this lacuna. Whilst the study does not claim to be comprehensive (in purpose and approach), it nonetheless hopes to permeate the *raison detre* of Dennett's *Weltanschauung*. Hence, the focus of the study is the dual backbone of Dennett's philosophy. Particularly, it aims to analyze Dennett's theory of content which he claims is the foundation to his philosophy of mind. Subsequently, his thesis of explaining consciousness would be more closely examined. Amongst other major aspects of his formulations scrutinized are meme, qualia, language and culture. On the whole, this thesis argues against a Dennettian philosophy of mind. It is hoped that it would genuinely contribute to existing Dennett's scholarship.

ABSTRAK

FALSAFAH MINDA DENNETT: KAJIAN KRITIKAL TEORI DENNETT TERHADAP KANDUNGAN DAN KESEDARAN

Pendirian falsafah yang diolah oleh Dennett meninggalkan kesan yang ketara di dalam bidang falsafah minda kontemporari. Pandangan Dennett telah dianalisa dan dikritik oleh rakan dan pengkritik lain. Walaubagaimanapun, belum terdapat lagi kajian yang mengkaji secara lebih terperinci pandangan Dennett secara lebih menyeluruh. Diharapkan kajian ini dapat merapatkan jurang ini. Walaupun kajian ini tidak mendakwa ianya komprehensif (dalam tujuan dan pendekatan), adalah diharapkan bahawa ia dapat mengolah teras falsafah Dennett. Oleh itu, kajian ini mengfokuskan kepada dwi teras penting falsafah Dennett. Khususnya, ia bertujuan untuk menganalisa teori kandungan Dennett yang didakwa adalah asas kepada falsafah minda beliau. Selepas itu, tesis beliau dalam penerangan kesedaran akan dilihat dengan lebih teliti. Antara aspek-aspek utama lain formulasi Dennett yang diteliti adalah meme, qualia, bahasa dan budaya. Secara keseluruhannya, kajian ini cuba menyangkal falsafah minda Dennett. Akhirnya, adalah diharapkan kajian ini dapat menyumbang kepada keserjanaan Dennett.

DECLARATION

No portion of the work referred to in this thesis has been submitted in support of an application for another degree of qualification of this or any other university or institution of higher learning.

PENGAKUAN

Tiada bahagian daripada tesis ini telah dikemukakan untuk menyokong sesuatu permohonan lain untuk mendapatkan ijazah di universiti ini atau institusi pengajian tinggi yang lain.

Signature:



Name: Tan Kock Wah

Date: 12th March 2003

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank the University of Malaysia Sarawak, especially the former Vice Chancellor, Prof. Dato' Zawawi, the current Deputy Vice Chancellor, Prof. Rahsid and the former Dean of the Faculty of Cognitive Sciences, Prof. Razali Arof for making this possible.

I also take this opportunity to express my gratitude to supervisor, Prof. Dr. Hairudin Harun, for being a source of unfailing support and insights in the preparation of the manuscript. I am also indebted to Associate Prof. Dr Joe Lau of the University of Hong Kong and Associate Prof. Dr Mark D'Cruz of the National University of Singapore, and numerous other colleagues, who have one way or the other given invaluable time and insightful comments that make the present study the way it is now. Needless to say, I take full responsibility for all errors and imperfections found in the thesis.

My heartfelt gratitude to Ms Tan Seu Mee, Ms Tan Shaw Tye, Ms Hashimah and Mr Lim of the National University of Singapore, as well as Mr Zainal and Mr Faizal of the University of Malaya and Ms Siti Emilia Merzuki and Mr Abang Ekhsan of the University of Malaysia Sarawak for their dedicated assistance without which the present work would never have seen daylight.

Last but not least, I thank Prof. Dr Daniel Dennett for his bold and innovatory ideas without which this work would not have been conceived. Though I disagree much with what he said, I have also learnt much from him. However, limitations of space and scope of the study have not permitted me rooms to say more on this. Hence, it is hoped that these brief lines of acknowledgement here would make do what more lengthy commendations he certainly deserves, given the ways, conscious or otherwise, he has influenced my thinking in the field.

ABBREVIATIONS

Some of the more commonly used reference keys are given in the text by the following abbreviations:

BS	<i>Brainstorms</i> (1978g)
AP	<i>On the Absence of Phenomenology</i> (1979a)
SHCE	<i>How to Study Human Consciousness Empirically or Nothing Comes to Mind</i> (1982a)
IS	<i>Intentional Stance</i> (1987b)
QQ	<i>Quinning Qualia</i> (1990i)
CE	<i>Consciousness Explained</i> (1991h)
DC	<i>Back from the Drawing Board</i> (1993a)
MNM	<i>The Message is: There is no Medium</i> (1993f)
GR	<i>Get Real</i> (1994a)
DDI	<i>Darwin's Dangerous Idea</i> (1995h)
KM	<i>Kinds of Minds</i> (1996c)
FDDI	<i>Granny versus Mother Nature – No Contest</i> (1996a)
BC	<i>Brainchildren</i> (1998a)
RLM	<i>Reflections on Language and Mind</i> (1998b)
ZH	<i>The Zombic Hunch</i> (2001c)
FFP	<i>The Fantasy of a First-Person Science of Consciousness</i> (2001f)
RWEC	<i>Are We Explaining Consciousness Yet?</i> (2001l)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	page
ABSTRACT	i
ABSTRAK	ii
DECLARATION	iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iv
ABBREVIATIONS	v
TABLE OF CONTENTS	vi-ix
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION	
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Background on Dennett	3
1.3 Overview of Major Literature on Dennett	9
1.4 Aims, Scope and Limitations of Study	44
1.5 Organization of Chapters	47
PART I: MENTAL CONTENT	
CHAPTER 2: INTENTIONAL STANCE THEORY	
2.1 Introduction	52
2.2 The Founding Framework of Dennett's Thought	52
2.3 The Legacy of Darwinian Influence	56
2.4 Folk Psychology and the Rationale of Intentional System	61
2.5 The Three Stances	63

2.6	Realism and Intentionality	68
2.7	Original and Derived Intentionality	70
2.8	Conclusion	77

CHAPTER 3: INTENTIONALITY AND SCIENCE

3.1	Introduction	82
3.2	The Intentional Stance Theory	82
3.3	Stability of the Stances	87
3.4	Whither Intentional Stance?	88
3.5	Intentionality and Science	95
3.6	Conclusion	106

CHAPTER 4: INTENTIONAL STANCE AND PREDICTION

4.1	Introduction	108
4.2	What is it to be Intentional System	108
4.3	Lectern and Intentional System	113
4.4	Chess and Computer	121
4.5	Problems of Attribution	133
4.6	Competence and Subpersonal Characterization	144
4.7	Conclusion	165

PART II: CONSCIOUSNESS

CHAPTER 5: CONSCIOUSNESS EXPLAINED

5.1	Introduction	167
5.2	Heterophenomenology	167
5.3	Multiple Drafts Model	173
5.4	The Evolution of Consciousness	181
5.5	Quinning Qualia	185
5.6	Conclusion	197

CHAPTER 6: LANGUAGE AND CULTURE IN CONSCIOUSNESS EXPLAINED

6.1	Introduction	202
6.2	Language, Culture and Consciousness	202
6.3	Complexity and Consciousness	214
6.4	Meme and Consciousness	219
6.5	Conclusion	222

CHAPTER 7: QUALIA AND CONSCIOUSNESS (I)

7.1	Introduction	223
7.2	Quinning Qualia	224
7.3	Qualia and Properties	227
7.4	Immediate Apprehension (Privilege Access)	235

7.5	Ineffability and Privacy	258
7.6	Intrinsicity	270
7.7	Conclusion	274

CHAPTER 8: QUALIA AND CONSCIOUSNESS (II)

8.1	Introduction	275
8.2	Qualia and Consciousness: A Dichotomy?	275
8.3	Qualia as Figment of Imagination	280
8.4	Qualia and Disposition	283
8.5	Concept and Concept	287
8.6	Qualia and Judgement	295
8.7	Conclusion	297

PART III: CONCLUDING ANALYSIS

CHAPTER 9: CONTENT AND CONSCIOUSNESS REVISITED

9.1	Introduction	298
9.2	First Person Vs Third Person Methodology	298
9.3	Heterophenomenology	314
9.4	Consciousness Explained or Explained Away?	326
9.5	Intentional Stance and Consciousness	333
9.6	Conclusion	344
	BIBLIOGRAPHY	347