THE EFFECTIVENESS OF COLLABORATION
IN TEACHING AND LEARNING WRITING

TAN HSIANG CHYII

DISSERTATION SUBMITTED IN FULFILMENT
OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF LINGUISTICS

FACULTY OF LANGUAGES AND LINGUISTICS
UNIVERSITY OF MALAYA
KUALA LUMPUR

SEPTEMBER 2009
TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT ii

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS v

TABLE OF CONTENTS vi

LIST OF TABLES xi

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background 1

1.2 Statement of the Problem 2

1.3 Purpose of the Study 4

1.4 Research Questions 6

1.5 Significance of the Study 7

1.6 Scope of the Study 10

1.7 Summary 11

CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Social Interactionism 12

2.2 Theories of ESL Writing 15

2.3 The Concept of Collaborative Learning 19

2.3.1 Limitations and Challenges of Collaborative Work 28

2.3.2 Collaboration in Writing 30

2.3.2.1 Step 1: Discussing Ideas for the Essay 32
2.3.2.2 Step 2: Producing a Rough Draft 33
2.3.2.3 Step 3: Sharing and Editing Essays among Group Members 33
2.3.2.4 Step 4: Redrafting the Essay 34

2.4 Conclusion 34

CHAPTER 3: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1 Overview 35
3.2 Research Design 35
3.3 Data Collection Method 36
  3.3.1 Student Participants and Setting 36
  3.3.2 Teacher Participants 37
  3.3.3 Instruments 39
    3.3.3.1 Pre- and Post-Tests 39
    3.3.3.2 Observation 42
    3.3.3.3 Questionnaire 45
  3.4 Data Collection Procedure 46
    3.4.1 Pre-Test 47
    3.4.2 Intervention 48
    3.4.3 Observation 58
    3.4.4 Post-Test 59
    3.4.5 Questionnaire 60
  3.5 Conclusion 61
CHAPTER 4: DATA PRESENTATION, ANALYSES AND DISCUSSION

4.1 Overview 63

4.2 Research Question 1: How can Collaborative Work in Writing be Implemented? 63
   4.2.1 Data Presentation of Observation 63
   4.2.2 Data Analyses and Discussion 67
   4.2.3 Summary of Observation Analyses and Discussion 70

4.3 Research Question 2: To What Extent can Collaborative Work Benefit Students’ Writing, in terms of Content, Vocabulary, Language and Mechanics? 70
   4.3.1 Data Presentation of Pre-Test and Post-Test 71
      4.3.1.1 Content 71
      4.3.1.2 Language 76
      4.3.1.3 Vocabulary 78
      4.3.1.4 Mechanics 81
   4.3.2 Data Analyses and Discussion 85
   4.3.3 Summary of Pre- and Post-Tests Analyses and Discussion 91

4.4 Research Question 3: To What Extent Do Students Find Collaborative Work Useful in Writing their Essays? 92
   4.4.1 Data Presentation of Questionnaire 92
      4.4.1.1 Questions 1, 2 and 3 93
      4.4.1.2 Questions 4 – 12 94
      4.4.1.3 Question 13 99
   4.4.2 Data Analyses and Discussion 101
   4.4.3 Summary of Questionnaire Analyses and Discussion 106
4.5 Overall Summary

CHAPTER 5: LIMITATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 Overview

5.2 Review of the Discussion of the Research Questions

5.2.1 Review of Research Question 1: How can Collaborative Work in Writing be Implemented?

5.2.2 Review of Research Question 2: To What Extent can Collaborative Work Benefit Students’ Writing, in terms of Content, Vocabulary, Language and Mechanics?

5.2.3 Review of Research Question 3: To What Extent Do Students Find Collaborative Work Useful in Writing Their Essays?

5.3 Limitations of the Study

5.4 Recommendations for Future Studies

5.5 Concluding Comments

APPENDICES

Appendix A
Appendix B
Appendix C
Appendix D
Appendix E
Appendix F
Appendix G
Appendix H
Appendix I
Appendix J
LIST OF TABLES

Table 4.3.1.1(a) : A comparison in content between pre-test and post-test essays 72
Table 4.3.1.1(b) : Comparison of changes in content 76
Table 4.3.1.2 : Comparison of subjects’ language proficiency 76
Table 4.3.1.3 : Comparison of vocabulary among subjects 78
Table 4.3.1.4(a) : Comparison of subjects’ use of paragraphing 82
Table 4.3.1.4(b) : Comparison of subjects’ use of spelling 83
Table 4.4.1.1(a) : Subjects’ opinions on working in a group 93
Table 4.4.1.1(b) : Subjects’ opinions on whether they find group work to be useful 93
Table 4.4.1.1(c) : Subjects’ opinions on working in a group 93
Table 4.4.1.2(a) : Subjects’ opinions on training 94
Table 4.4.1.2(b) : Subjects’ opinions on whether they find their friends’ comments to be useful 95
Table 4.4.1.2(c) : Subjects’ opinions on whether their friends find their comments to be useful 96
Table 4.4.1.2(d) : Subjects’ opinions on whether collaborative work has helped them in producing ideas 96
Table 4.4.1.2(e) : Subjects’ opinions on whether collaborative work has helped them in improving their language 97
Table 4.4.1.2(f) : Subjects’ opinions on whether collaborative work has helped them in improving their vocabulary 97
Table 4.4.1.2(g) : Subjects’ opinions on whether collaborative work has helped them in improving their use of punctuation marks 98
Table 4.4.1.2(h) : Subjects’ opinions on whether collaborative work has helped them in improving their paragraphing 98
Table 4.4.1.2(i) : Subjects’ opinions on whether collaborative work
has helped them in improving their spelling

Table 4.4.1.3(a) : Subjects’ opinions on whether collaborative work has helped them in their writing

Table 4.4.1.3(b) : Reasons for preferring collaborative work in writing

Table 4.4.1.3(c) : Reason for not preferring collaborative work in writing