THE EFFECTIVENESS OF COLLABORATION IN TEACHING AND LEARNING WRITING

TAN HSIANG CHYII

DISSERTATION SUBMITTED IN FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF LINGUISTICS

FACULTY OF LANGUAGES AND LINGUISTICS
UNIVERSITY OF MALAYA
KUALA LUMPUR

SEPTEMBER 2009

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT ii

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS v

TABLE OF CONTENTS vi

LIST OF TABLES xi

CHAPTER 1:INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background 1

1.2 Statement of the Problem 2

1.3 Purpose of the Study 4

1.4 Research Questions 6

1.5 Significance of the Study 7

1.6 Scope of the Study 10

1.7 Summary 11

CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Social Interactionism 12

2.2 Theories of ESL Writing 15

2.3 The Concept of Collaborative Learning 19

2.3.1 Limitations and Challenges of Collaborative Work 28

2.3.2 Collaboration in Writing 30

2.3.2.1 Step 1: Discussing Ideas for the Essay 32

2.3.2.2 Step 2: Producing a Rough Draft 33

2.3.2.3 Step 3: Sharing and Editing Essays among Group Members 33

2.3.2.4 Step 4: Redrafting the Essay 34

2.4 Conclusion 34

CHAPTER 3: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1 Overview 35

3.2 Research Design 35

3.3 Data Collection Method 36

3.3.1 Student Participants and Setting 36

3.3.2 Teacher Participants 37

3.3.3 Instruments 39

3.3.3.1 Pre- and Post-Tests 39

3.3.3.2 Observation 42

3.3.3.3 Questionnaire 45

3.4 Data Collection Procedure 46

3.4.1 Pre-Test 47

3.4.2 Intervention 48

3.4.3 Observation 58

3.4.4 Post-Test 59

3.4.5 Questionnaire 60

3.5 Conclusion 61

CHAPTER 4: DATA PRESENTATION, ANALYSES AND DISCUSSION

4.1 Overview 63

4.2 Research Question 1: How can Collaborative Work in Writing be Implemented? 63

4.2.1 Data Presentation of Observation 63

4.2.2 Data Analyses and Discussion 67

4.2.3 Summary of Observation Analyses and Discussion 70

4.3 Research Question 2: To What Extent can Collaborative Work Benefit Students' Writing, in terms of Content, Vocabulary, Language and Mechanics? 70

4.3.1 Data Presentation of Pre-Test and Post-Test 71

4.3.1.1 Content 71

4.3.1.2 Language 76

4.3.1.3 Vocabulary 78

4.3.1.4 Mechanics 81

4.3.2 Data Analyses and Discussion 85

4.3.3 Summary of Pre- and Post-Tests Analyses and Discussion 91

4.4 Research Question 3: To What Extent Do Students Find Collaborative Work Useful in Writing their Essays? 92

4.4.1 Data Presentation of Questionnaire 92

4.4.1.1 Questions 1, 2 and 3 93

4.4.1.2 Questions 4 – 12 94

4.4.1.3 Question 13 99

4.4.2 Data Analyses and Discussion 101

4.4.3 Summary of Questionnaire Analyses and Discussion 106

4.5 Overall Summary 106

CHAPTER 5: LIMITATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 Overview 108

5.2 Review of the Discussion of the Research Questions 108

5.2.1 Review of Research Question 1: How can Collaborative Work in Writing be Implemented? 108

5.2.2 Review of Research Question 2: To What Extent can Collaborative Work Benefit Students' Writing, in terms of Content, Vocabulary, Language and Mechanics? 109

5.2.3 Review of Research Question 3: To What Extent Do Students Find Collaborative Work Useful in Writing Their Essays? 110

5.3 Limitations of the Study 110

5.4 Recommendations for Future Studies 112

5.5 Concluding Comments 113

APPENDICES

Appendix A 116

Appendix B 117

Appendix C 118

Appendix D 119

Appendix E 120

Appendix F 121

Appendix G 122

Appendix H 123

Appendix I 124

Appendix J 125

Appendix K 126

Appendix L 129

Appendix M 131

Appendix N 132

Appendix O 134

Appendix P 136

REFERENCES 137

LIST OF TABLES

Table 4.3.1.1(a)	: A comparison in content between pre-test and post-test essays	72
Table 4.3.1.1(b)	: Comparison of changes in content	76
Table 4.3.1.2	: Comparison of subjects' language proficiency	76
Table 4.3.1.3	: Comparison of vocabulary among subjects	78
Table 4.3.1.4(a)	: Comparison of subjects' use of paragraphing	82
Table 4.3.1.4(b)	: Comparison of subjects' use of spelling	83
Table 4.4.1.1(a)	: Subjects' opinions on working in a group	93
Table 4.4.1.1(b)	: Subjects' opinions on whether they find group work to be useful	93
Table 4.4.1.1(c)	: Subjects' opinions on working in a group	93
Table 4.4.1.2(a)	: Subjects' opinions on training	94
Table 4.4.1.2(b)	: Subjects' opinions on whether they find their friends' comments to be useful	95
Table 4.4.1.2(c)	: Subjects' opinions on whether their friends find their comments to be useful	96
Table 4.4.1.2(d)	: Subjects' opinions on whether collaborative work has helped them in producing ideas	96
Table 4.4.1.2(e)	: Subjects' opinions on whether collaborative work has helped them in improving their language	97
Table 4.4.1.2(f)	: Subjects' opinions on whether collaborative work has helped them in improving their vocabulary	97
Table 4.4.1.2(g)	: Subjects' opinions on whether collaborative work has helped them in improving their use of punctuation marks	98
Table 4.4.1.2(h)	: Subjects' opinions on whether collaborative work has helped them in improving their paragraphing	98
Table 4.4.1.2(i)	: Subjects' opinions on whether collaborative work	

has helped them in improving their spelling 99

Table 4.4.1.3(a) : Subjects' opinions on whether collaborative work has helped them in their writing 100

Table 4.4.1.3(b) : Reasons for preferring collaborative work in writing 100

Table 4.4.1.3(c) : Reason for not preferring collaborative work in writing 100