

## CHAPTER 6

### Results and Discussion III

#### 6.1 Linguistic analysis

In this final Results and Discussion chapter, I will attempt to describe the results of the linguistic analysis of the titles and new knowledge claim sequences taken from the corpus and discuss it in light of the two recent studies in this area. The 90 titles that were analysed and the new knowledge claim sequences derived from the introductions and discussion and conclusion sections were used for this analysis.

#### 6.2 Research Article Titles

A preliminary analysis in terms of the length of the titles shows that the titles are about the same length in these disciplines and average at 13 words in EdP, 12 words in EnP and 10 words in EcP. For the purpose of this analysis the titles are grouped as in full sentence form, as compound titles and as remaining structures, which refers to titles cast other than in full sentence and compound forms.

##### 6.2.1 Full sentence titles

Out of the 90 titles analysed, the tendency to use full sentence titles among writers across these disciplines was rare as only five or 5.5% of the titles in the entire corpus were written in the form of a full sentence. This is similar to Haggan's (2004) finding that full sentence titles, however interestingly they are cast, and as also indicated in the illustrations below, in drawing readers to read the content, were rarely used in science,

literature and linguistics. The five titles, one each in EdP and EnP, and the remaining three from EcP are illustrated below. The first three contain a complete question following a noun phrase while the remaining 2 contain a statement and a complete question followed by a noun phrase. These titles make confident assertions presented as a statement of fact without qualifications and hedges and are written using the simple present tense, providing as much information as possible as to what was investigated in the study. This is similar to titles in Linguistics where writers do not make assertions related to the findings and unlike the science titles where writers make assertions as to what was found in the study (Haggan, 2004).

*Early acceleration of students in mathematics: Does it promote growth and stability of growth in achievement across mathematical areas?*

EdP 23

*Process utility and help seeking: What do people want from experts?*

EcP 16

*Tax framing, Instrumentality and individual differences: Are there two different cultures?*

EcP 25

*There is no "I" in nature: The influence of self-awareness on connectedness to nature*

EnP 22

*Does the framing of investment portfolios influence risk-taking behavior? Some experimental results.*

EcP 13

### **6.2.2 Compound titles**

Compound titles are used in 14 (46.6%) EdP RAs, 16 (53.3 %) EnP RAs and, 14 (46.3%) EcP RAs (The EdP and EnP articles and the three EcP articles containing a full

sentence are also included in this type as they contain a noun phrase). This type of title is used almost equally across the three disciplines.

In this type of title, the first noun phrase indicating a general topic or mapping the location of the paper's subject matter within the field is followed by another noun phrase which expands on particular aspects of the topic that was dealt with in the study. This may refer to what was dealt with either within the discipline as in the majority of such titles or in a geographic sense as in the last example below. In this type the results are not presented and the reader has to read the full paper unlike the science titles in Haggan (2004)

*Understanding managerial problem-solving, knowledge use and information processing: Investigating stages from school to the workplace*

EdP 1

*Domain knowledge and individual interest: The effects of academic level and specialization in statistics and psychology*

EdP 16

*Homework practices and academic achievement: The mediating role of self-efficacy and perceived responsibility beliefs*

EdP 21

*Homeward bound: Introducing a four-domain model of perceived housing in very old age*

EnP 1

*Time perspective and values: An exploratory study of their relations to environmental attitudes*

EnP 18

*Fear versus fascination: An exploration of emotional responses to natural threats*

EnP 26

*Outcomes versus intentions: On the nature of fair behavior and its development with age*

EcP 1

*Knowing and teaching fractions: A cross-cultural study of American and Chinese mathematics teachers*

EdP 3

Also observed is that the first noun phrase, apart from containing a general topic, as in the instances shown above, also exhibit a ‘sharpening of focus’ where writers pack it with either one or more prepositional phrases, showing very clearly and early what they have done to report in the paper as in the following examples.

*Students’ experiences **of** home–school dissonance: The role of school academic culture and perceptions of classroom goal structures*

EdP 4

*Students’ choice **of** animated pedagogical agents **in** science learning: A test of the similarity-attraction hypothesis on gender and ethnicity*

EdP 12

*Predictors **of** a behavioral measure **of** scholastic cheating: Personality and competence but not demographics*

EdP 19

*Commitment **of** farmers **to** environmental protection: From social pressure to environmental conscience*

EnP 4

*Perceptions **of** forestry alternatives **in** the US Pacific Northwest: Information effects and acceptability distribution analysis*

EnP 7

*Effects **of** road traffic noise **on** sleep: Studies on children and adults*

EnP 8

*Determinants **of** willingness **to** pay **in** separate and joint evaluations **of** options: Context matters*

EcP 17

*New perspectives **for** the evaluation **of** training sessions **in** self-regulated learning: Time-series analyses of diary data*

EdP 18

### 6.2.3 Remaining structures

Around half the titles across the three disciplines fall within this category with EdP having 16 (53.3%), EnP 14 (46.6%) and EcP 16 (53.3%). A noun phrase followed by a prepositional phrase occurs in 5 titles in EdP, in 6 EnP and 10 EcP titles as in samples 1-3 below. A noun phrase followed by two prepositional phrases occurs in 6 titles in EdP, in 5 EnP and 2 EcP titles as in samples 4-6 below. A noun phrase followed by three prepositional phrases occurs in 3 titles in EdP, in 3 EnP and 2 EcP titles as in samples 7-9, while a noun phrase followed by four prepositional phrases occurs in 2 EdP and 1 EcP title as in samples 10 and 11 below.

- |  |        |
|--|--------|
| <i>(1) Sound symbolic word learning in written context</i>   | EdP 14 |
| <i>(2) Facilitating route memory with auditory route guidance systems</i>                              | EnP 11 |
| <i>(3) Focal points in coordinated divergence</i>  | EcP 11 |
| <i>(4) Sources of academic and self-regulatory efficacy beliefs of entering middle school students</i> | EdP 9  |
| <i>(5) Environmental odor annoyance from air pollution from steel industry and bio-fuel processing</i> | EnP 10 |
| <i>(6) The role of self- and group-efficacy in moderated group chat</i>                                | EcP 5  |
| <i>(7) Learner-generated drawing as a strategy for learning from content area text</i>                 | EdP 10 |
| <i>(8) The need for psychological restoration as a determinant of environmental preferences</i>        | EnP 3  |

- (9) *Explaining heterogeneity in utility functions by individual differences in decision modes*  
EcP 18
- (10) *The impact of instructional practices in Grades 1 and 2 on reading and spelling achievement in high poverty schools*  
EdP 15
- (11) *Occupational hierarchy as a device to study Mexican children's and adolescents' ideas about consumption and saving in adults*  
EcP 27

The basic structure involving a noun phrase with one or more post modifying prepositional phrases appears to be a structure preferred by writers in these disciplines other than the compound titles discussed above. By doing so, these writers, seem to be able to inform the reader, at the earliest possible stage, the specific focus of the study that is being reported, a feature which was also observed in science based titles. However, scientists appear to use this feature more than writers in these disciplines as more than two thirds of the titles in science have it compared to compound and full sentence titles and also the piling up of up to four prepositional phrases following a noun phrase is quite a rare occurrence (occurring in 2 EdP and 1 EnP) in these disciplines compared to the science titles in Haggan, (2004).

The most common preposition used in these titles is *of*. Usually the initial noun phrase is followed by an *of* phrase as in the following examples.

- The development of flexibility.....*  
EdP 6
- Applying the methods of image evaluation and spatial analysis.....*  
EnP 24
- Psychological mechanisms of investors in .....*  
EcP 2

The *of* phrase is most commonly used to specify the particular area of research as in:

..... <i>of academic and self-regulatory efficacy beliefs...</i>	EdP 9
..... <i>of image evaluation and spatial analysis....</i>	EnP 24
..... <i>of personal financial debt....</i>	EcP 12

It is also used to indicate the subjects involved in the study

<i>Characteristics of students.....</i>	EdP 7
<i>Peer crowds, work experience, and financial saving behaviour of young Canadians....</i>	EcP23

The second most frequent preposition used is *in* which is mostly used to denote a particular or specific area of research as in first 4 samples below and to specify the geographical focus of research as in the last sample .

..... <i>in Psychology and Statistics.</i>	EdP 8
..... <i>in written context.</i>	EdP 14
..... <i>in investor regret</i>	EcP 3
..... <i>in coordinated divergence.</i>	EcP 5
..... <i>in North West Frontier Province, Pakistan</i>	EnP 5

Apart from the frequent use of *of* and *in* there are instances of other prepositions such as *for, to, with, as, on, during, and from* but no significant trend was discerned from the titles across the three disciplines.

It appears from the analysis that writers across these disciplines, by opting not to provide the full propositional form of the research that is to be reported in the paper ( *in*

full sentence form), presuppose readers prior knowledge regarding the content of the paper. The compound titles and the other types of structures that were discussed above indicate that these writers indeed present their information in a straight forward manner, informing the reader immediately as what can or may be found in the article.

### **6.3 New knowledge claims**

It was observed that writers across these disciplines state the value of their research towards the end of their introductions. It was observed that a standard or unified way of making new knowledge claims was not observed across the three disciplines and following below are examples of structures containing new knowledge claims derived from the corpus to illustrate such occurrences.

#### **6.3.1 New knowledge claims in educational psychology**

(1) This claim sequence in EdP 9 starts with Claims 1 and 2 followed by support for the claims made.

##### **Claim 1 and Claim 2**

*(i) Exploring the predictive value of the sources of students' academic self-efficacy beliefs and (ii) determining whether this prediction varies as a function of group membership such as gender, academic ability, and race/ethnicity is a matter of import.*

##### **Support for Claims 1 and 2**

*(i) Of course, empirical findings are required to buttress Bandura, 1986 and Bandura, 1997 theoretical tenets regarding the formation of self-efficacy beliefs. (ii) Moreover, if the sources predict self-efficacy differently for boys and girls, for students of varying ability level, or for students of minority race or ethnicity, then attending*



*differently to the different sources in schooling practices and academic interventions is warranted.*

(2) This claim sequence starts with a preview sentence to link with the preceding discussion (*as an extension of Schraw's (2000)*) followed by claims 1 and 2.

**Preview Sentence**

*The studies introduced below, as an extension of Schraw's (2000) investigation mentioned above, have been carried out to further examine.....*

**Claim 1**

*We extended the previous investigation by first asking .....*

**Claim 2**

*We also asked whether .....*

EdP 2

(3) This claim sequence starts with a preview sentence followed by the first claim and the second preview sentence and claim two.

**Preview sentence 1**

*Fuchs et al. (2001) demonstrated that .....*

**Claim 1**

*Thus, there is reason to believe that analysis of ..... may provide insights on the development of word reading and spelling skills.*

**Preview Sentence 2**

*Also of interest was the .....*

**Claim 2**

**These analyses provide a preliminary view** of how foundational sublexical skills evolve and contribute to each other.

EdP 6

(4) This claim sequence begins with two preview sentences and claims one and two. It ends with a preview sentence three including claim three.

### Preview Sentence 1

*The study reported in this article is a continuation of the research reported by Van Meter (2001).*

### Preview Sentence 2

*Again, experimental drawing conditions test the benefits of provided support and posttests are designed to illustrate the characteristics of the knowledge acquired when the drawing strategy is used.*

### Claim 1

*The current study, however, is grounded in a theoretical model of the cognitive and knowledge representation processes that underlie drawing.*

### Claim 2

*The result has been methodological changes with respect to both the design of the control condition and the higher-order posttest employed.*

### Preview 3 including Claim 3

*Given that research on other strategies has found differences in strategy effectiveness across grade levels (Pressley & Van Meter, 1993), **it is important to explore** the possibility that there are also age-related effects tied to drawing.*

EdP 10

(5) This claim sequence consists of a preview sentence including a claim.

### Preview sentence including a claim

*Considering that low-income, minority students are less likely to attain post-secondary education and more likely to experience high school dropout (Children's Defense Fund, 2000),.... **we need more research that focuses on** the factors that help low-income, minority students successfully navigate the transition to high school.*

EdP 17

(6) This claim sequence begins with a preview sentence including claim 1.1 and 1.2 followed by claims two and three

### **Preview sentence including Claims 1.1 and 1.2**

*To examine whether our assumptions are justified, we try to give empirical evidence for: (a) having changed the (training) session-related variables and (b) for the links between training and outcome variables.*

### **Claim 2**

*We also intend to increase self-efficacy beliefs since they are known to be a crucial factor within the self-regulation cycle (Bandura, 1997).*

### **Claim 3**

*We expect to improve self-efficacy indirectly by supporting the self-regulation cycle.*

EdP 18

(7) This claim sequence begins with a preview sentence including claims 1, 1.1 and 1.2.

This is followed by preview sentence 2 and claim 2 and claim 2.1.

### **Preview sentence**

*Several researchers have examined the effect of goal instructions on students' argumentative writing (Ferretti et al., 2000 and Page-Voth and Graham, 1999), and have found that certain goal instructions can be effective in improving the quality of students' written arguments.*

### **Claim 1**

*This study extends this work to an interactive discussion context (specifically Web-based discussions) and ...*

### **Claim 1.1**

*... also evaluates a greater variety of goal instructions.*

### **Claim 1.2**

*In addition, it explores the effect of an individual difference variable, need for cognition.*

### **Preview Sentence 2**

*A second question addressed by this study is whether there is a positive association between NFC and argument complexity in an interactive context.*

## Claim 2

*Answering this question would help clarify the role of NFC in argumentation.*

### Claim 2.1

*It also enables us to explore whether there are interactions between NFC and goal instructions, particularly whether goal instructions help to compensate for any deficiencies in the tendencies of low NFC students.*

EdP 25

(8) This claim sequence begins with a preview Sentence and includes the major claims.

### Preview sentence

*Using responses to the AMS obtained from a large sample of American college students, we ..*

*(1) re-examined the fit of a seven-factor model of academic motivation in comparison to the fit of five-factor and three-factor models,*

*(2) estimated the internal consistency of the scores for each subscale and evaluated their adequacy (i.e.,  $\alpha > .70$ ),*

*(3) calculated the correlations among the AMS subscales to examine the simplex pattern hypothesized by Vallerand et al., 1993 and Cokley, 2000a and finally,*

*(4) investigated hypothesized relationships between the AMS scores and the scores from other motivation and goal orientation measures to provide needed convergent and discriminant validity evidence.*

EnP 27

(9) This claim sequence begins with the global claim of the article including support for the claim (*this is because..*) . This is followed by a preview sentence 1 including claim 1 and support for the claim. It ends with a preview sentence 2 including claim 2 (**we considered the possibility...**)

## Global claim and support for claim

*We felt it was important to first identify whether beliefs existed in writing and, if so, then determine how they influenced writing processes. **This is because writing** beliefs may be a useful aid in teaching and learning writing. Helping students become better writers remains a critical educational task.*

### Preview sentence 1 including claim 1

*In the current study, **we extended the methods** used in reading beliefs research to the process of writing.*

### Support for claim 1

*We wanted to see whether or not writers hold a set of implicit beliefs about writing that have transmissional and transactional dimensions. Similar to implicit beliefs about reading we thought that, if they exist, implicit beliefs about writing would provide a context for the processes of writing and would be evident in the written product.*

### Preview sentence 2 including Claim 2

*Furthermore, given that implicit transmissional and transactional beliefs in reading were found to be statistically independent of each other (i.e., a reader could exhibit both beliefs at the same time at high and low levels of intensity) **we considered the possibility** that similar belief configurations might be found in writing.*

EdP 30

## 6.3.2 New knowledge claims in Environmental Psychology

(1) This claim sequence begins with a preview sentence followed by a claim

### Preview sentence

*Housing satisfaction has predominantly been used in the psychology and sociology of ageing in place (Pinquart & Burmedi, 2004), while place attachment has been used .....*

### Claim 1

*Given the heterogeneity of these constructs, **there is a clear need for an integrative approach** which identifies the role of such concepts in comprehensively documenting the subjective perception of home in old age.*

EnP 1

(2) This claim sequence begins with three preview sentences with the third containing the claim and support for it.

**Preview sentence 1**

*The results of our two earlier experiments largely conformed with our hypotheses, but one major **methodological feature** raised a concern that we could not counter with statistical analyses.*

**Preview sentence 2**

*Arguably, using scenarios to manipulate the need for restoration imposed demand characteristics that guided participants to provide ratings in line with our hypotheses.*

**Preview sentence 3 including claim 1**

*To address this concern, in the present study we use a **naturalistic manipulation to vary attentional fatigue**.*

**Support for claim 1**

*Our participants completed the procedure either in the morning just before a lecture or in the afternoon, just after a lecture, which itself came .....Note that this manipulation involves less extreme, more frequently occurring, conditions of.....*

(3) This claim sequence is structured with each preview sentence containing the claims

**Preview sentence 1 including Claim 1**

*In this paper we document the process of **introducing new ideas of sanitation** to a rural Muslim community and how they have adapted these ideas to their culture and environment.*

**Preview sentence 2 including Claim 2**

*The study also shows **the importance of choosing an appropriate research methodology** that will allow researchers to enter the community and develop a rapport with a rural community not otherwise open to external intervention.*

**Preview sentence 3 including Claim 3**

*The study further aims (a) to gain an understanding of....., (b) to explore peoples', and finally, (c) to see how.....*

EnP 5

(4) This claim sequence begins with a global claim followed by a more specific Claim 1 and ends by supporting the claim.

### **Global claim**

*In this paper, we propose an adapted theory of cognitive stress to analyze and explain when and why environmental stress actually leads to pro- environmental behavior.*

EnP 14

### **Claim 1**

*Compared with previous research, new aspects in the model are (a) the focus on demand appraisal as a process of threat and harm appraisal, (b) demand and resource appraisal are measured on the same level of generality and (c) the elaboration of coping strategies, which could mediate between an “undirected” motivation and pro-environmental behavior, (d) from a methodological point of view it is a new step to test all assumptions simultaneously.*

### **Support for Claim 1**

*Our model goes beyond other models (theory of planned behavior, Ajzen, 1991; Bamberg & Schmidt, 2003; the norm activation model, Hunecke, Blöbaum, Matthies, & Höger, 2001; Schwartz, 1977; value believe model, Stern, 2000) because none of them integrates coping and general efficacy. The presented model is similar to the protection- motivation-model (Rogers, 1983; Gardner & Stern, 1996) but here appraisal-processes are regarded as more distal to the behavior than in the protection-motivation-model. This approach allows for the integration of early stages into the process of stress management.*

EnP 14

(5) This claim sequence contains a preview sentence including Claim 1 and support for the claim

### **Preview sentence including Claim 1 and support for claim**

*In this paper we have included variables such as income, education, occupational status, and household size to see how they contribute to explaining differences in noise annoyance. ....*

*Income and education can be viewed as .....*

EnP 16

(6) This claim sequence is structured with a preview sentence followed by Claim 1, another preview sentence which includes a claim 2 and ends with support for Claim 2.

#### **Preview sentence 1**

*Studies in this area have identified many factors that either facilitate or hamper outdoor autonomy.*

#### **Claim 1**

*However, **there lacks an understanding of the processes through which this influence is exerted.***

#### **Preview sentence 2 including Claim 2**

*Research in this area has been primarily qualitative; **therefore, it is difficult to understand** if—and to what degree—the social and physical characteristics of the neighbourhood influence parental behaviour and that of the children through the parents' experience/perception of the neighbourhood and through their opinion on the children's independent mobility.*

#### **Support for Claim 2**

*Quantitative measures allow for easier testing of complex models that simultaneously consider the influence of many variables and the relationships between them .*

EnP 23

(7) This claim sequence begins with Preview sentences 1 and 2 and is followed by the claims in a sequential order.

#### **Preview sentence 1**

*That study provided initial evidence of a positive relationship between natural views and the capacity to direct attention.*

#### **Preview sentence 2**

*The present experiment extends that research in several ways.*

#### **Claims 1 - 4**

*(i) **First**, it enhances the methodology by providing baseline information about initial attentional capacity, (ii) it uses an experimental design with random assignment to increase internal validity, (iii) and provides*



*experimental control by conducting the experiment in a laboratory. (iv) As discussed below, it also uses a new way of exhausting and testing attentional capacity.*

EnP 25

### **6.3.3 New knowledge claims in Economic Psychology**

(1) This claim sequence is structured with a preview sentence which includes the claim of the article.

#### **Preview sentence including Claim 1**

*Given that numerous experimental studies with student participants have led to new approaches in modeling economic decision-making and the influence of outcomes and intentions....<sup>1</sup> **whether these models are suitable for describing and predicting behavior of subjects who are not students in their early twenties should be considered a relevant issue for economics.***

EcP1

(2) This sequence begins with a preview sentence 1 including claim 1 and is followed by a preview sentence 2 including claim 2

#### **Preview sentence 1 including Claim 1**

*The present study **purports to construct a psychosocial model** which may be used as the theoretical foundation for investigating the psychological mechanisms of investment behaviors in Chinese Stock Markets.*

#### **Preview sentence 2 including Claim 2**

*This study also aims **to provide psychological and managerial suggestions** in risk management of stock markets and contribute to the establishment of a national psychological precautionary system during stock crises (Shi, 2003).*

EcP 2

(3) In this claim sequence the writer provides a preview sentence and proceeds to make the first claim and supports it. It is then followed by Claim 2 and a supporting sentence. The sequence ends with a supporting sentence for claim 3 followed by the claim.

### **Preview sentence 1**

*In the present research we built on and extend the [Tsiros \(1998\)](#) research in three important ways.*

### **Claim 1**

*First, **our participants are real stock investors** reflecting about their personal investment experiences.*

### **Support for Claim 1**

*As argued earlier, their regrets are understudied and of particular interest. Moreover, because of their personal involvement we can expect that they are sufficiently motivated to provide reliable data.*

### **Claim 2**

*Second, we mainly aimed to study how investors' regrets are **influenced** by multiple reference points.*

### **Support for Claim 2**

*For this reason the investors were not asked to self-report the referent points, but instead, they rated how much regret they would feel after they read all performance outcomes in relation to their chosen and the forgone options.*

### **Support for Claim 3**

*Third, we did not give any expectation information. Instead, the investors indicated themselves how many profits they expected to earn from their investments.*

### **Claim 3**

*Thus, it is believed that this field study will meaningfully mirror how an investor..... .*

EcP 3

(4) In this sequence the writers provide four preview sentences with the fourth containing the claim.

**Preview sentence 1**

*Numerous past studies have documented related tendencies.*

**Preview sentence 2**

*We know, for example, that people are willing to pay substantially different sums of money for a bottle of beer to be consumed on a beach depending on whether they plan to buy it at a small bodega as opposed to a five-star hotel ([Thaler, 1985](#)).*

**Preview sentence 3**

*We also know that people value the cost of waiting a month differently depending on whether they are waiting for small or for large sums (Leclerc, Schmitt, & Dube, 1995), and that they prefer to pay after acquiring a fridge, but before taking a cruise (Loewenstein & Prelec, 1992).*

**Preview sentence 4 including Claim 1**

*In the present work, **we focus on** how people represent the value of items as a result of alternative ways in which such value can be construed.*

EcP 6

(5) This sequence begins with a preview sentence followed by Claim 1 and support for the claim.

**Preview sentence**

*Several countries try to stimulate household savings by introducing special tax-favored savings schemes. [Scholz \(2001\)](#), for example, discusses the plans of the US government to introduce new tax-favored savings schemes and to make the tax rules concerning Individual Retirement Accounts (IRAs) more generous, with the aim of stimulating savings for retirement.*

## Claim 1

*Knowing how participation in such plans relates to income, wealth and other household characteristics is **crucial for understanding the implications** for the distribution of savings, wealth, and future income and consumption.*

## Support for Claim 1

*Analyzing the reasons for non-take-up is helpful to design the plans in such a way that they will be used by the households they are aimed at.*

EcP 8

(6) In this sequence the writers provide 2 preview sentences followed by the Global claim of the paper. They then go on to make Claims 1 and 2

## Preview sentence 1

*Shafir, Diamond, and Tversky (1997) described psychological mechanisms underlying a phenomenon which Fisher called money illusion (Fisher, 1928).*

## Preview sentence 2

*It consists in the fact that people tend to use the nominal value as an anchor when they evaluate the value of goods, and they disregard the real value of money.*

## Global Claim

*Our research **focuses on two factors** which, according to the corresponding theories, should modify the strength of money illusion.*

## Claims 1 and 2

*These are: (1) **the emotional attachment to a currency, and (2) the level of gains and losses.** 10*

(7) This sequence begins with a claim ends with support for the claim

### **Claim 1**

*The focus of this research was to create an indebtedness model to be used for early identification of US Air Force members most at risk for developing personal financial management problems.*

### **Support for Claim 1**

*Recent data shows that active duty Air Force E-3s, E-4s and E-5s (which are identifiers assigned to personnel that is...*

EcP 12

(8) This sequence begins with a preview sentence and is followed by Claim 1. Claim 2 including support for it is then made before ending with the third claim.

### **Preview sentence**

*This paper has three main aims.*

### **Claim 1**

*First, to see if it is possible to replicate some of the findings reported by others (for example that those who characterised their parents as having saved more than average saved themselves more than others) using a very different kind of sample.*

### **Claim 2 including support for claim**

*Second, to explore the relationships between a number of important economic psychological variables (future orientation, conscientiousness, saving) in late adolescents/young adults, which, as far as we are aware, have never been considered in previous studies.*

### **Claim 3**

*Finally to explore the relative impact of the economic behaviour of grandparents (as reported by parents) and the economic behaviour and attitudes of parents (as reported by themselves) on the behaviour and time orientation of children .....*

EcP19

(9) This sequence begins with the global claim of the article. It is then followed by a preview sentence, Claim 1 and support for it. It ends with Claims 2 and 3.

### **Global Claim**

*We address directly the magnitude of the online couponing conundrum in terms of its specific impact on profit.*

### **Preview sentence**

*In this paper, we add to the literature in the following manner.*

### **Claim 1**

*First, we analyze purchase probabilities as functions of both the respondents' stated willingness to pay and the experimental condition.*

### **Support for Claim 1**

*This analysis allows us to gauge how sensitive is the link between consumer surplus and purchase intention to our fairness manipulations.*

### **Claim 2**

*Second, we assess the profit implications of incorporating non-neoclassical economic assumptions (fairness in the present case) into the classical model.*

### **Claim 3**

*Lastly, we present the first analysis known to the authors of the motivations behind web coupon search.*

EcP 20

(10) In this sequence the writers first make the global claim. This is followed by Claim

1. Claim 2 is then posited and supported

### **Global Claim**

*For these reasons, we think it is appropriate and productive to pay more attention to social dynamics in an economic context. This paper is intended to contribute to the development of this line of research.*

### **Claim 1**

*The use of laboratory experimentation as research method is helpful in this respect, since a solid empirical study of the dynamics of interpersonal relations is difficult to achieve in the field, due to observational and control problems.*

### **Claim 2**

*Our focus on how groups develop in a public good environment, moreover, seems relevant for various (political) economic contexts.*

### **Support for Claim 2**

*One major context is the functioning of organizations. Key characteristic of many work situations is synergy of the efforts of groups of workers and unobservability of individual effort. As a result, work processes can be represented in an abstract way by the private provision of public goods.*

EcP 22

As the examples illustrated above show the new knowledge claims in these disciplines appear to be structured in a more complex, elaborate and varied manner compared to the economics and linguistics material in Dahl (2008). Preview sentences and supporting sentences appear to be a common feature in sequencing claims across the three disciplines. Also noted is that these claims often appear as contributions to the ongoing debate in the field. Authors often indicated that they were making attempts to fill the void in past research in the particular area of interest. In sum it is noted that authors do not just provide just previews of claims. They seem to provide the reader with elaborate accounts of their contribution to the creation of new knowledge at the beginning of the article thus concurring with Swales(2004) that there are indeed opportunities for writers to “expatiate upon the news value or interestingness of their work towards the end of their introductions.”(pp:232).

### 6.3.4 Metadiscursive elements in new knowledge claims

The claim sentences or sequences containing claims across the three disciplines also incorporate metadiscursive pointers to claims and research contributions either in the form of a full sentence or as metadiscursive elements within a sentence. The latter feature was very obvious in the corpus across the three disciplines. This feature was also noted to appear more often in the economics material analysed in Dahl (2008). Following below are the relevant and varied forms these metadiscursive elements were manifested in the present corpus.

*(1) re-examined the fit.....*  
*(2) estimated the internal consistency of .....*  
*(3) calculated the correlations among the AMS subscales, and finally*  
*(4) investigated hypothesized relationships .....*  
EdP 27

*We extended the previous investigation by first asking ....., We also asked whether.... Also of interest was the .....*  
EdP 2

*To examine whether....., we try to give empirical evidence for: (a) .....(b)..... We also intend to increase self- efficacy....We expect to.....*  
EdP 18

*In the present research, we developed a new scale called the Self-Efficacy for Learning Form*  
EdP21

*The present study attempted to determine how much growth in achievement ....., Furthermore, the present study attempted to examine the impacts of student and school characteristics*  
EdP 22

*Such a study is important in that researchers who study mathematics coursework have increasingly .....*  
EdP 23



*Findings of the present study are able to assist politicians, administrators, and researchers to assess the merits and deficiencies of the policy and practice of early acceleration.*

EdP 23

*This study extends this work to an interactive discussion context....**In addition**, it explores the effect .....*

EdP 25

*In line with these research directions, **the present study** investigated the extent to which..... Specifically, **the study examined** the effects of teaching ....*

EdP 26

### **Metadiscursive elements in EnP**

*Our approach **builds on theory and research in two areas**, restorative environments and the modeling of attitudes.*

EnP 3

***In this paper we document the process of introducing new ideas of sanitation to a .... The study also shows the importance** of choosing an appropriate research methodology ....., The study **further aims** (a) .....(b) ..... and finally, (c).....*

EnP 5

***The purpose of the present work** was to demonstrate the applicability of the master-scale procedure by applying it to the environmental problem of odor annoyance*

EnP10

***In this paper, we propose an adapted theory** of cognitive stress to analyze.....*

EnP14

***In this paper we have included** variables such as ....*

EnP16

*Therefore, **this paper seeks to add** to the growing body of studies that help .....*

EnP 20

*That study provided initial evidence of a positive relationship between natural views and the capacity to direct attention.*

EnP25

*This study describes the development of a tool to assess the condition of the physical environment of residential areas.....*

EnP 27

*In the present study, an attempt will be made to find out ....But in addition, by pitching the study of place belonging to the city, it has .....*

EnP29

### Metadiscursive elements in EcP

*The present study purports to construct a .....This study also aims to .....*

EcP 2

*In the present research we built on and extend the [Tsiros \(1998\)](#) research in three important ways. **First**, our participants are..... **Second**, we mainly aimed to.... **Third**, we did not give ....*

EcP 3

*Along the way, our experiment will demonstrate that.... idiosyncratic differentiation is possible .....*

EcP4

*In the present work, we focus on how people .....*

EcP 6

*Using a rich data set allowing to include conditioning variables that describe attitudes towards savings and time preference, we aim at identifying the reasons..... We also analyze how.....*

EcP8

*Our research focuses on two factors which, ..... These are: (1).. and (2) .....*

EcP 10

<i>The general aim of the present study is to.....</i>	EcP 11
<i>The focus of this research was to.....</i>	EcP 12
<i>In looking for theoretical guidance for ....., we extend previous research on .....</i>	EcP15
<i>The goal of this study was to link psychometric measures .....</i>	EcP 18
<i>This paper has three main aims. First, ..... Second, ..... Finally.....</i> ...	EcP19
<i>We extend their experiment introducing additional variables to address three questions. First, ..... Second,..... Third.....</i>	EcP20
<i>This paper is intended to ..... Specifically, our goal is to .....</i>	EcP22
<i>There is merit in this approach and the current paper covers .....as well as ....</i>	EcP25
<i>A novel feature of our approach is that .....</i>	EcP28

### 6.3.5 Hedged and unhedged claims

Both hedged and unhedged statements of new knowledge claims were observed across the three disciplines similar to the findings in economics and linguistics (Dahl, 2008) as can be seen in the following examples taken from across the three disciplines

### Hedged claims in EdP

- *The current study **proposes** to extend.....*
- *Thus, there is reason to believe that ..... **may provide insights** on .....*
- *These analyses **provide a preliminary view** ....*
- *Therefore, **in the spirit of infusing** cognitive theory .....*
- *These studies **are intended** as an extension of previous work .....*
- *Understanding how goal orientations .....**may contribute to** .....*
- *To examine whether ..... **we try** to give empirical evidence for.....*
- *Although these results shed..... **we believe much more can be learned**.....,*
- *Answering this question **would help clarify** the role of ....*
- *We **felt that** the pursuit of this additional study was necessary.....*
- *This **could be** very interesting when.....*
- *We **felt** it was important to first identify ....*

### Hedged claims in EnP

- *In this paper, **we propose** an adapted theory ....*
- *Examination of factors.... **may further improve** the understanding of .....*
- *Based on previous research, **we propose**....*
- *Therefore, **this paper seeks to** ....*
- *Given the link.... **as it may shed light** on ....*
- *Previous studies have dealt.....but our study **will attempt** to delve..... This **could enable** us to...*
- ***We feel that** research that situates.... **would be** timely for Hong Kong....*
- *In the present study, **an attempt will be made** to.....*
- ***In attempting** to better understand....., **it may be** especially important to.....*

### Hedged claims in EcP

- *The present study **purports to** construct*
- *We **suggest** that individually stable traits, ....**might help** explain...*
- *We **propose** a framework for*
- *For these reasons, **we think** it is appropriate and productive to..... This paper **is intended** to contribute to .... By focusing on the..... this paper addresses **in our view** an important.....*
- *As suggested by behavioural economist Gruber (2001), models from developmental psychology .... **can be useful** to economic analyses.*

### Unhedged claims EdP

- *We **extended** the previous investigation .....*
- *Exploring the predictive value ..... **is a matter of import***
- *The current study, **is grounded** in a theoretical model*
- *The result has been **methodological changes**....*
- *To examine this possibility **it is necessary** to .....*

- *To address our question, it is important to consider.....*
  - *Considering that low-income..... we need more research that.....*
  - *In the present research, we developed a new scale called.....*
  - *Given the importance of ....., it is especially important to investigate ...*
  - *Such a study is important in that researchers ....*
  - *This effort underscores the assumption that .....*
  - *This study extends.... and also evaluates a greater variety of*
  - *The three instructional strategies constituted variations of Ennis's (1992) suggestions.*
  - *In sum, the purpose of this new validity investigation was four-fold...*
- (1) *re-examined the fit .....*
  - (2) *estimated the internal consistency of*
  - (3) *calculated the correlations among the.....*
  - (4) *investigated hypothesized relationships between ....*
- *Therefore, in contrast with previous research, our investigation balances the stimuli .....*

### Unhedged claims in EnP

- *Given the heterogeneity... there is a clear need for an integrative approach ..*
- *Our approach builds on theory and research in two areas*
- *The study also shows the importance of .....*
- *Thus a comparison of the two scales is theoretically and practically useful.*
- *As communities respond..... it is important to better understand...*
- *Compared with previous research, new aspects in the model are.....*
- *This approach allows for....*
- *In contrast to previous studies, we test the complete VBN theory.*
- *The present experiment extends that research in several ways. First, it enhances the.... it also uses a new way of exhausting...*
- *This study describes the development of a tool to assess ...*
- *The extent to which these.... should be examined further.*

### Unhedged claims in EcP

- *In the present research we built on and extend the Tsiros (1998) research in three important ways. First,..... Second, .....Third,.... Thus, it is believed that this field study will meaningfully mirror.....*
- *We extend Schelling's original insights to consider Thus we seek to understand...*
- *Along the way, our experiment will demonstrate that.....*
- *Knowing how participation..... is crucial for understanding .....Analyzing the reasons for non-take-up is helpful to .....*

- *Using a rich data set allowing to include .... we aim at identifying the reasons ....We also analyze .....*
- *Our research focuses on two factors which, according to the corresponding theories, should modify the strength..... of money illusion. These are: (1) .....(2).....*
- *The general aim of the present study is to continue this line of research focusing on.....*
- *The focus of this research was to create an indebtedness model to be used*
- *In looking for theoretical guidance..... we extend previous research on The two experiments that we report were designed to examine these possibilities*
- *This paper has three main aims. First, to see .....Second, to explore.... Finally to explore...*
- *We address directly the magnitude of .....In this paper, we add to the literature... First, we analyze ..... This analysis allows us to ..... Second, we assess .... Lastly, we present the first analysis known to the authors.*
- *We extend their experiment introducing additional variables to address ...*
- *For this reason, it is of great interest to find out*
- *There is merit in this approach and the current paper covers*
- *The research is a significant extension of work conducted by Cullis, Jones, and Lewis .... )*
- *In order to remedy this, the present paper analyses..... for the first time.*
- *A novel feature of our approach is that .....*

It was noted that the present material contained more unhedged statements compared to hedged ones which is also similar in economics and linguistics and which may be attributed to, as Dahl (2008) had observed, the competition for attention in the research world where “overt marking of originality and strong position- taking is encouraged by gatekeepers such as journal editors and referees” (pp: 1199). It could also be said that hedges in these disciplines show a greater variation in terms of the linguistic forms compared to the hedges observed in linguistics and economics (Dahl, 2008).

#### 6.4 Conclusion

The results in this chapter clearly demonstrate that the structure of the titles are quite akin to titles in the sciences analysed in Haggan (2004) and that the new knowledge

claim sequences are varied and not as simplistic to the extent that a definitive structure cannot be posited compared to similar sequences analysed in Dahl (2008). This chapter thus brings the analysis and discussion of the results to a close. In the next chapter I will summarize the results and draw some basic conclusions from the main findings and state limitations and provide suggestions for further research.