

**A CONTRASTIVE AND ERROR ANALYSIS OF THE USE
OF ENGLISH PREPOSITIONS BY MALAY LEARNERS**

WOO SOW YIN

**RESEARCH REPORT SUBMITTED IN FULFILMENT OF
THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF MASTER
OF ENGLISH AS A SECOND LANGUAGE**

**LANGUAGE AND LINGUISTICS FACULTY
UNIVERSITI OF MALAYA
KUALA LUMPUR**

2010

UNIVERSITI MALAYA

ORIGINAL LITERARY WORK DECLARATION

Name of Candidate: Woo Sow Yin (I.C. No: 631124-07-5364)

Matric No: TGB070031

Name of Degree: Master of English as a Second Language (MESL)

Title of Research Report: The Use of English Prepositions by Malay Learners in Written Assignments: A Contrastive and Error Analysis

Field of Study: SMK Alam Megah, Shah Alam, Malaysia

I do solemnly and sincerely declare that:

- (1) I am the sole author/writer of this Work;
- (2) This Work is original.
- (3) Any use of any work in which copyright exists was done by way of fair dealing and for permitted purposes and any excerpt from, or reference to or reproduction of any copyright work has been disclosed expressly and sufficiently and the title of the Work and its authorship have been acknowledged in this Work;
- (4) I do not have any actual knowledge nor do I ought reasonably to know that the making of this work constitutes an infringement of ant copyright work;
- (5) I hereby assign all and every rights in the copyright to this Work to the University of Malaya("UM"), who henceforth shall be owner of the copyright in this Work and that any reproduction or use in any form or by means whatsoever is prohibited without the written consent of UM having the first had and obtained;
- (6) I am fully aware that if in the course of making this Work I have infringed any copyright whether intentionally or otherwise, I may be subject to legal action or any other action as may be determined by UM.

Candidate's Signature

Date:

Subscribed and solemnly declared before,

Witness's Signature

Date:

Name:

Designation:

ABSTRACT

This study has two main objectives. The first objective is to find the similarities and differences between the prepositions in English and Malay through the description of the prepositions of both the languages. Next, the second objective is to identify prepositional errors in the written text of Malay Form Five students and explain why these errors occur.

The primary sources of reference for English prepositions are from four written sources namely Casell's Students' English Grammar, A University Grammar of English, A Practical English Grammar, and A Communicative Grammar of English. *Tatabahasa Dewan*, *Tatabahasa Melayu* and *Nahu Kemas Kini: Panduan Bahasa yang Baik dan Betul* are three written sources of reference for Malay prepositions. The methodology used is the Contrastive and Error Analysis approach as the two methods complement each other. Moreover, Contrastive Analysis reveals that the similarities between the native language and the target language facilitate learning for the students. It also suggests that the differences between both the languages can cause difficulties in the learning of the target language.

Using Contrastive Analysis, the researcher found that there are similarities and differences between English and Malay prepositions. A hierarchy of difficulties is drawn up based on the analysis with the most difficult prepositions on the top of the hierarchy to the easiest ones at the bottom. An Error Analysis which focussed on the use of English prepositions in sixty written essays by thirty Malay students from SMK Alam Megah, Shah Alam was carried out to find whether the results of the Error Analysis would match with the findings of the Contrastive Analysis.

One of the findings of this study is that prepositions which are easy to learn share the same functions and distributions in a sentence for both languages. When a preposition in English has more functions and meanings despite having the same distribution, this preposition is difficult to learn. Some prepositions in English do share the same meaning and Malay learners tend to think they can use one preposition for various functions and meanings. Next, the error analysis carried out on the study essays revealed that many errors were caused by interference of the learners' mother tongue as learners tend to translate from their native language (Malay) to the target language (English). Malay learners have difficulty using simple English prepositions which they are familiar with. In addition, they also face difficulty with prepositions that do not exist in their own language.

ABSTRAK

Kajian ini tertumpu kepada dua objektif. Objektif yang pertama adalah untuk mengenalpasti dan menyenaraikan persamaan dan perbezaan dalam Bahasa Inggeris dan Bahasa Melayu dengan mendeskripsikan subsistem preposisi kedua-dua bahasa. Objektif yang kedua adalah untuk mengenalpasti kesilapan preposisi dalam karangan yang ditulis oleh pelajar Melayu Tingkatan Lima dan menerangkan sebab-sebab kesilapan yang telah dibuat.

Sumber utama preposisi Bahasa Inggeris adalah didapati dari empat buku iaitu *Casell's Students' English Grammar*, *A University Grammar of English*, *A Practical English Grammar*, dan *A Communicative Grammar of English*. Manakala, preposisi Bahasa Melayu dikutip dari Tatabahasa Dewan, Tatabahasa Melayu dan Nahu Kemas Kini: Panduan Bahasa yang Baik dan Betul. Metodologi yang digunakan dalam kajian ini adalah Analisis Kontrastif dan Analisis Kesilapan di mana kedua-dua pendekatan ini saling melengkapi antara satu sama lain. Tambahan, Analisis Kontrastif menyarankan bahawa ciri-ciri linguistik bahasa sasaran yang sama dengan bahasa ibunda pelajar memudahkan pembelajaran bahasa tersebut. Sebaliknya akan berlaku apabila ciri-ciri linguistic bahasa sasaran yang berbeza boleh menyukarkan proses pembelajaran bahasa sasaran.

Analisis Kontrastif telah menunjukkan padanan setara dan perbezaan kedua-dua bahasa. Suatu hierarki kesulitan dikemukakan berdasarkan analisis yang dibuat dengan preposisi yang susah di atas senarai sehingga preposisi yang mudah diletakkan di bawah.

Tambahan, analisis penggunaan preposisi dari enam puluh karangan Bahasa Inggris yang ditulis oleh tiga puluh orang pelajar SMK Alam Megah, Shah Alam telah dilakukan untuk melihat sama ada keputusan Analisis Kontrastif adalah sama dengan Analisis Kesilapan.

Salah satu dapatan dari kajian adalah preposisi yang senang dipelajari mempunyai fungsi dan posisi yang sama dalam suatu ayat dalam kedua-dua bahasa. Apabila suatu preposisi Bahasa Inggris mempunyai posisi yang sama dengan Bahasa Melayu tetapi mempunyai jauh lebih banyak fungsi dan pengertian, pembelajaran preposisi tersebut akan menjadi rumit. Terdapat juga beberapa preposisi dalam Bahasa Inggris mempunyai makna yang sama di mana pelajar Melayu membuat tanggapan bahawa mereka boleh menggunakan satu preposisi itu untuk semua situasi. Tambahan, analisis kesilapan karangan pelajar menunjukkan gangguan bahasa ibunda dalam penggunaan preposisi dalam Bahasa Inggris. Mereka menterjemah dari Bahasa Melayu ke Bahasa Inggris dan mengakibatkan kesilapan berlaku dalam penggunaan preposisi. Tambahan, mereka juga menghadapi masalah dalam penggunaan preposisi yang mudah walaupun mereka kerap menggunakan mereka dan preposisi yang tidak terdapat dalam Bahasa Melayu.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would to thank Professor Dr. Choi Kim Yok, my supervisor, for making her knowlegde and experience available to me throughout this study. This research report owes much to her linguistic insights and sharp eyes for details.

I am also grateful to my school principal, Pn. Miss Yati Dani for her generosity in allowing me to carry out my study in SMK Alam Megah. Further, I wish to acknowledge my fellow colleagues, Pn. Hilwana Ahmad Sha'ari and Pn. Rohana Ramli for their support in encouraging their students to write the essays. I am particularly grateful to Pn. Laila Manja Mohd. Yunus for offering invaluable expertise in editing, giving invaluable comments and assisting me to translate sentences from English to Malay. I especially want to thank my students for their support in the time-consuming task of writing the essays despite their busy schedule.

Finally, to my husband and children for their love and patience to encourage me to complete my study.

ABBREVIATION

CA	Contrastive analysis
CAH	Contrastive analysis hypothesis
EA	Error analysis
ESL	English as a Second Language
*	Grammatically incorrect sentence/ erroneous sentence
No.	Number
%	Percentage
L1	First Language
L2	Second Language
NL	Native Language
TL	Target Language

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
Declaration	i
Abstract	ii
Abstrak	iv
Acknowledgements	vi
Table of contents	vii
List of tables	xv
Abbreviation	xxi

CHAPTER ONE : INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background of The Study	1
1.2 Statement of The Problem	3
1.3 Research Objectives	4
1.4 Research Questions	4
1.5 Significance of The Study	4
1.6 Theoretical Framework	5
1.7 Limitations of The Study	6
1.8 Definitions of Terms	6
1.8.1 Contrastive Analysis	7
1.8.2 Error Analysis	7
1.8.3 Interference	8
1.8.4 Interlanguage	9
1.8.5 Mistakes and Errors	10
1.8.6 Interlingual Errors	12
1.8.7 Intralingual Errors	12
1.8.8 Developmental Errors	13
1.8.8.1 Overgeneralization	13
1.8.8.2 Ignorance of Rule Restrictions	14

1.8.8.3 Incomplete Application of Rules	15
1.8.8.4 False Concepts Hypothesized	16
1.9 Prepositions	16
1.9.1 Simple Prepositions	18
1.9.2 Compound Prepositions	18
1.9.3 Prepositions in -ing	18
 CHAPTER TWO: REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE	
2.1 Introduction	19
2.2 Contrastive Analysis (CA)	19
2.2.1 Historical Development of CA	20
2.2.2 Strong Version of CA	21
2.2.3 Weak Version of CA	22
2.3 Error Analysis (EA)	23
2.4 Interference (Negative Transfer) and Overgeneralization	24
2.5 Studies on Differences Between English and Malay	24
2.6 Studies on Prepositions	25
2.7 Conclusion	28
 CHAPTER THREE: ANALYSIS OF MALAY PREPOSITIONS	
3.1 Introduction	29
3.2 Categories of Malay Prepositions	29
3.2.1 Prepositions Indicating Location	31
i. Malay Prepositions Indicating Location - di	31
ii. Malay Preposition Indicating Location - pada	32
iii. Malay Prepositions Indicating Location - dalam	33
3.2.2 Prepositions Indicating Time	34

i. Malay Preposition Indicating Time – pada	34
ii. Malay Preposition Indicating Time – dalam	35
3.2.3 Prepositions Indicating Duration	35
i. Malay Preposition Indicating Duration – dari	36
ii. Malay Prepositions Indicating Duration – hingga/ sampai	36
iii. Malay Prepositions Indicating Duration – bagi and untuk	37
iv. Malay Preposition Indicating Duration – sejak, semenjak and selama	37
3.2.4 Prepositions Indicating Direction	38
i. Prepositions Indicating the Onset of Direction	39
ii. Prepositions Indicating the Passage of the Direction	39
iii. Prepositions Indicating the Target of the Direction	40
a) ke	40
b) kepada	41
3.2.5 Prepositions Indicating Accompaniment	41
3.2.6 Prepositions Indicating Means/ Instrument	42
3.2.7 Prepositions Indicating Manner	42
3.2.8 Prepositions Indicating Purpose	43
i. bagi and untuk	43
ii. kepada	44
iii. demi	45
3.2.9 Prepositions Indicating the Agentive	46
3.2.10 Prepositions Indicating Cause or Reason	46
i. tentang/ mengenai	47
ii. akan/ terhadap/ kepada	47
3.2.11 Prepositions Indicating Metaphorical/ Figurative Usage	48

3.2.12 Prepositions Indicating Negation	48
3.2.13 Prepositions Indicating Inclusions and Exclusions	49
3.2.14 Prepositions Indicating Relationships	50
i. daripada	50
ii. antara	51
3.3 Summary	51

CHAPTER FOUR: CONTRASTIVE ANALYSIS OF MALAY AND ENGLISH PREPOSITIONS

4.1 Introduction	52
4.2 Contrastive Analysis Procedures	52
4.3 Description of English Prepositions	53
4.4 A Contrastive Analysis of Prepositions in English and Malay	58
4.4.1 Prepositions Indicating Location	58
i. Before	58
ii. Across	58
iii. Opposite	59
iv. Against	59
v. Between	60
vi. By	60
vii. Beside	60
viii. About	61
ix. On	61
x. Above, Below and Behind	62
xi. At	63
xii. In	63

xiii. Of and Up	64
xiv. From	64
xv. Over	65
xvi. Near	65
xvii. Off	66
xviii. Within	66
4.4.2 Prepositions Indicating Time	67
i. After and Against	67
ii. Before	68
iii. By, On, At and About	68
iv. Near	69
4.4.3 Prepositions Indicating Duration	69
i. By	69
ii. During	69
iii. Since, Sejak and Semenjak	70
iv. In	70
v. From	71
vi. For	71
vii. Over	72
viii. Until / till, Throughout, and All Through	72
ix. Within	73
4.4.4 Prepositions Indicating Direction	73
i. After	73
ii. Across	73

iii. Against	74
iv. Between	75
v. About	75
vi. At	75
vii. Up, Down and Along	76
viii. For	77
ix. To, From and Over	78
4.4.5 Prepositions Indicating Accompaniment	79
4.4.6 Prepositions Indicating Means / Instruments	79
i. By	79
ii. On	80
iii. With	81
4.4.7 Prepositions Indicating Manner	81
i. By, With and At	81
ii. On, In and Within	82
iii. Off	83
4.4.8 Prepositions Indicating Purpose	83
i. After and Against	83
ii. For	84
4.4.9 Prepositions Indicating the Agentive	85
4.4.10 Prepositions Indicating Cause or Reason	85
4.4.11 Prepositions Indicating Metaphorical / Figurative Usage	86
4.4.12 Prepositions Indicating Negation	87
4.4.13 Prepositions Indicating Inclusion and Exclusion	87
4.4.14 Prepositions Indicating Relationships	88

i. Sharing	88
ii. Comparison	89
iii. Measurement	90
iv. Mathematical Expression	91
v. Source	91
vii. Reactions	92
viii. Membership	93
ix. State	93
x. Subject Matter	94
4.5 Summary	96
 CHAPTER FIVE : ERROR ANALYSIS	
5.1 Introduction	100
5.2 Location of the Study	100
5.3 Samples and Selection	101
5.4 Data Collection Procedures	101
5.5 The Instrument	102
5.6 Background Information on the Subject	102
5.7 Causes of Errors	103
5.7.1 Overgeneralization	103
5.7.2 Ignorance of Rule Restrictions	105
i. Ignorance of Rule Restrictions - in	105
ii. Ignorance of Rule Restrictions - for	106
5.7.3 Incomplete Application of Rules	107
5.7.4 False Concepts Hypothesized	109
5.7.5 Interlingual Errors	109

5.8	Types of Errors	121
5.8.1	Inappropriate selection or usage of prepositions	121
5.8.2	Addition	122
5.8.3	Omission of Prepositions	123
5.8.4	Word Order	126
5.9	Summary	126
CHAPTER SIX : CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS		
6.1	Summary of Findings	128
6.2	Findings and Recommendations	129
6.2.1	Implications for Second Language or Foreign Language Teachers	131
6.2.2	Implications for Syllabus Designers and Textbook Writers	131
6.2.2.1	Learner's Needs	131
6.2.2.2	Teacher's Needs	132
6.3	Recommendations for Further Research	133
6.4	Conclusion	133
	Bibliography	134
	Appendices	140

LIST OF TABLES

	PAGE
Table 1.1 : Examples of Incomplete Application of Rules for English Preposition	15
Table 3.1 : Categories of Prepositions	30
Table 3.2 : Prepositions Indicating Location	31
Table 3.3 : Di Indicating Location with its Equivalents in English	32
Table 3.4 : Pada Indicating Location with its Equivalents in English	33
Table 3.5 : Dalam Indicating Location with its Equivalents in English	34
Table 3.6 : Prepositions Indicating Time	34
Table 3.7 : Pada Indicating Time with its Equivalents in English	35
Table 3.8 : Dalam Indicating Time with its Equivalents in English	35
Table 3.9 : Prepositions Indicating Duration	36
Table 3.10 : Dari Indicating Duration with its Equivalents in English	36
Table 3.11 : Hingga/ sampai Indicating Duration with its Equivalents in English	37
Table 3.12 : Untuk/ bagi Indicating Duration with its Equivalents in English	37
Table 3.13 : Sejak/ semenjak and selama Indicating Duration with its Equivalents in English	38
Table 3.14 : Prepositions Indicating Direction	38
Table 3.15 : Dari and daripada Indicating the Onset of Direction with its Equivalents in English	39
Table 3.16 : Melalui, melintasi and menerusi Indicating the Passage of the Direction with its Equivalents in English	40
Table 3.17 : Ke Indicating the Target of the Direction with its Equivalents in English	40
Table 3.18 : Kepada Indicating the Target of the Direction with its Equivalents in English	41

Table 3.19 : Dengan and bersama Indicating Accompaniment and its Equivalents in English	42
Table 3.20 : Dengan Indicating Means/ instrument and its Equivalents in English	42
Table 3.21 : Dengan Indicating Manner with its Equivalents in English	43
Table 3.22 : Prepositions Indicating Purpose with its Equivalents in English	43
Table 3.23 : Untuk / Bagi Indicating Purpose and its Equivalents in English	44
Table 3.24 : Kepada Indicating Purpose and its Equivalents in English	45
Table 3.25 : Demi Indicating Purpose and its Equivalents in English	46
Table 3.26 : Oleh Indicating Agentive and its Equivalents in English	47
Table 3.27 : Tentang/ mengenai Indicating Cause or Reason and its Equivalents in English	47
Table 3.28 : Akan/ terhadap/ kepada Indicating Cause or Reason and its Equivalents in English	48
Table 3.29 : Seperti/ bagai/ umpama/ laksana/ bak Indicating Metaphorical/ Figurative Usage	49
Table 3.30 : Tanpa Indicating the Negation and its Equivalents in English	49
Table 3.31 : Kecuali/ melainkan Indicating Inclusions and Exclusions and its Equivalents in English	50
Table 3.32 : Daripada Indicating Relationships and its Equivalents in English	51
Table 3.33 : Antara Indicating Relationships and its Equivalents in English	52
Table 4.1 : Distributions of English and Malay Prepositions	58
Table 4.2 : Prepositions Indicating Location - Before	59
Table 4.3 : Prepositions Indicating Location - Across	60
Table 4.4 : Prepositions Indicating Location - Opposite	60
Table 4.5 : Prepositions Indicating Location - Against	60
Table 4.6 : Prepositions Indicating Location - Between	61
Table 4.7 : Prepositions Indicating Location - By	61

Table 4.8 : Prepositions Indicating Location – Beside	62
Table 4.9 : Prepositions Indicating Location - About	62
Table 4.10 : Prepositions Indicating Location – On	63
Table 4.11 : Prepositions Indicating Location - Above, Below and Behind	63
Table 4.12 : Prepositions Indicating Location – At	64
Table 4.13 : Prepositions Indicating Location - In	64
Table 4.14 : Prepositions Indicating Location – Of and Up	65
Table 4.15 : Prepositions Indicating Location – From	65
Table 4.16 : Prepositions Indicating Location - Over	66
Table 4.17 : Prepositions Indicating Location - Near	67
Table 4.18 : Prepositions Indicating Location - Off	67
Table 4.19 : Prepositions Indicating Location - Within	67
Table 4.20 : Prepositions Indicating Time - After	68
Table 4.21 : Prepositions Indicating Time – Before	69
Table 4.22 : Prepositions Indicating Time - By, On, At and About	69
Table 4.23 : Prepositions Indicating Time - Near	70
Table 4.24 : Prepositions Indicating Time -By	70
Table 4.25 : Preposition Indicating Time - During	71
Table 4.26 : Prepositions Indicating Time - Since, Sejak and Semenjak	71
Table 4.27 : Prepositions Indicating Time -In	72
Table 4.28 : Prepositions Indicating Time - From	72
Table 4.29 : Prepositions Indicating Time - For	72
Table 4.30 : Prepositions Indicating Time -Over	73
Table 4.31 : Prepositions Indicating Time - Unti/till and throughout/ all through	73
Table 4.32 : Prepositions Indicating Time - Within	74
Table 4.33 : Prepositions Indicating Direction - After	74

Table 4.34 : Prepositions Indicating Direction - Across	75
Table 4.35 : Prepositions Indicating Direction - Against	75
Table 4.36 : Prepositions Indicating Direction - Between	76
Table 4.37 : Prepositions Indicating Direction -About	76
Table 4.38 : Prepositions Indicating Direction - At	77
Table 4.39 : Prepositions Indicating Direction - Up, Down and Along	78
Table 4.40 : Prepositions Indicating Direction - For	78
Table 4.41 : Prepositions Indicating Direction - To, From and Over	79
Table 4.42 : Prepositions Indicating Accompaniment - With	80
Table 4.43 : Prepositions Indicating Means/ Instruments - By	81
Table 4.44 : Prepositions Indicating Means/ Instruments - On	81
Table 4.45 : Prepositions Indicating Means/ Instruments - With	82
Table 4.46 : Prepositions Indicating Manner - By, With and At	83
Table 4.47 : Prepositions Indicating Manner - On, In and Within	83
Table 4.48 : Prepositions Indicating Manner - Off	84
Table 4.49 : Prepositions Indicating Purpose - After and Against	85
Table 4.50 : Prepositions Indicating Purpose - For	85
Table 4.51 : Prepositions Indicating Purpose - By	86
Table 4.52 : Prepositions Indicating Cause or Reason - Behind, From, Over and Of	87
Table 4.53 : Prepositions Indicating Metaphorical / Figurative Usage - As	87
Table 4.54 : Prepositions Indicating Negation - Without	88
Table 4.55 : Prepositions Indicating Inclusion and Exclusions	89
Table 4.56 : Prepositions Indicating Relationships - Sharing	90
Table 4.57 : Prepositions Indicating Relationships - Comparison	91
Table 4.58 : Prepositions Indicating Relationships – Measurement	92

Table 4.59 : Prepositions Indicating Relationships - Mathematical Expression	92
Table 4.60 : Prepositions Indicating Relationships – Source	93
Table 4.61 : Prepositions Indicating Relationships – Reactions	93
Table 4.62 : Prepositions Indicating Relationships – Membership	94
Table 4.63 : Prepositions Indicating Relationships – State	95
Table 4.64 : Prepositions Indicating Relationships – Subject Matter (Of, On and Off)	96
Table 4.65 : Prepositions Indicating Relationships – Subject Matter (About)	97
Table 4.66 : Hierarchy of Difficulty of Prepositions in English and Malay – Very difficult	98
Table 4.67 : Hierarchy of Difficulty of Prepositions in English and Malay – Difficult	98
Table 4.68 : Hierarchy of Difficulty of Prepositions in English and Malay – Easy	99
Table 4.69 : Hierarchy of Difficultiy of Prepositions in English and Malay – Very Easy	100
Table 5.1 : Distribution of the Sample	103
Table 5.2 : PMR English Results	104
Table 5.3 : Frequency of Errors Made in Prepositions	104
Table 5.4 : Overgeneralization - by	105
Table 5.5 : Overgeneralization - in (Interlingual Errors)	105
Table 5.6 : Ignorance of Rule Restrictions - in	107
Table 5.7 : Ignorance of Rule Restrictions - for	107
Table 5.8 : Incomplete Appliction of Rules - for, into, on & to	108
Table 5.9 : Incomplete Appliction of Rules - Apart from that	109
Table 5.10 : Incomplete Appliction of Rules - nearby & by	110
Table 5.11 : False Concepts Hypothesized - in	110
Table 5.12 : Interlingual Errors - at	111

Table 5.13 : Interlingual Errors – Translation of Words	113
Table 5.14 : Interlingual Errors – Translations of Malay Prepositions	113
Table 5.15 : Interlingual Errors - from	114
Table 5.16 : Interlingual Errors – down	115
Table 5.17 : Interlingual Errors – about	115
Table 5.18 : Interlingual Errors - in and out of	116
Table 5.19 : Interlingual Errors - on	116
Table 5.20 : Interlingual Errors - to	118
Table 5.21 : Interlingual Errors-with	119
Table 5.22 : Interlingual Errors - on	120
Table 5.23 : Interlingual Errors - for, inside, in, with & to	121
Table 5.24 : Type of Errors	122
Table 5.25 : Addition - on, at and to	123
Table 5.26 : Addition - by and about	123
Table 5.27 : Addition - in	124
Table 5.28 : Omission of Prepositions - at, on & for	125
Table 5.29 : Omission of Prepositions - for, into, on & to	126
Table 5.30 : Causes of Errors and Types of Errors Found in the Essays	128
Table 5.31 : Occurrence of Errors According to the Prepositions	128