

## **CHAPTER FIVE**

### **ERROR ANALYSIS**

#### **5.1 Introduction**

In this section, the researcher presents and discusses the findings of the study in the light of its objectives. First, a brief description of the Malay students' scores in a public English examination is given. This is followed by a specific analysis of their essays on the types of errors made by the students in using prepositions.

#### **5.2 Location of the Study**

This study was carried out in a co-educational secondary school in the sub-urban township of Shah Alam. The school is Sekolah Menengah Alam Megah (SMKAM) in the Petaling Perdana District in the state of Selangor. The researcher is currently teaching in Sekolah Menengah Alam Megah (SMKAM) itself. SMKAM is situated in a predominantly Malay area. The majority of the Malay population here speak Kelantan and Terengganu dialects in their daily conversations. The subjects speak Malay with their family members, friends, teachers, and with the other students of different races. The Malay language is the language of instruction whereas English is a second language learnt in school since their primary years and used during English classes only. The other sources where Malay students have access to English are the internet, newspapers, television and radio. Except for the Internet, the other sources are rarely used.

### **5.3 Samples and Selection**

In carrying out the research, the researcher employed the convenience sampling procedure. With the help of two of her colleagues who are teaching English in the two Form Five science classes, she collected two take-home essays from thirty Malay students. The written assignments were produced by fifteen Malay girls and fifteen Malay boys. They have been studying English since Year One. These students were advised to start with an outline, write a first draft and followed by a final draft. They were also reminded that they could use a dictionary.

### **5.4 Data Collection Procedures**

The researcher has obtained permission from the principal of SMKAM and briefed the teachers concerned on the necessary information needed. The students were also informed of the criteria for selecting their written assignments. These students were provided with guidelines as well as the freedom of choice of topics in writing their written assignments (refer to Appendix A). The students were given a week to accomplish the task at home.

The analysis of data collected from the written assignments involves several stages. The first stage is to detect and identify the errors. Second, an analysis of the collected data is carried out to interpret what the students have intended to convey and to reconstruct his sentence in English.

## 5.5 The Instrument

The instrument in this study is an error analysis of the prepositions used by the students in their written assignments.

## 5.6 Background Information on the Subject

This study involves thirty Malay students who are seventeen years old from two science classes. Fifteen Malay girls and fifteen Malay boys were involved in this study in order to avoid gender biasness. Table 5.1 shows the actual number of students involved in this study according to their respective classes.

**Table 5.1: Distribution of the Sample**

<b>Class</b>	<b>5 Meranti</b>	<b>5 Medang</b>	<b>Grand Total</b>
<b>No. Of Malay Students</b>	20	10	30

In Table 5.2, the students' English results reveal that they achieved good grades based on a public examination taken two years ago. A total number of twenty six students obtained "A" and only four students obtained "B" for their PMR English examination which involved two papers. The first paper has questions on response to stimulus, forms and functions, cloze passage, comprehension, and literary questions based on one poem and one short story. The second paper involves writing a guided essay, a summary, and a fifty-word response to a previously read novel. Here, we can conclude that the Malay students are proficient in English.

**Table 5.2: PMR English Results**

<b>Class</b>	<b>5 Meranti</b>	<b>5 Medang</b>	<b>Total</b>
<b>English PMR GRADE A</b>	17	9	26
<b>English PMR GRADE B</b>	3	1	4
<b>Grand Total</b>			<b>30</b>

Each of them was asked to write two essays as take home assignments. Essay 1 is a guided essay and Essay 2 is a free essay based on the topics given (Appendix 1). From the analysis, three students did not make any errors on prepositions in Essay 1. For Essay 2, six students did not have any errors in the use of prepositions. The students had more errors in their guided essays compared to the free essays.

**Table 5.3: Frequency of Errors Made in Prepositions**

<b>Class</b>	<b>5 Meranti</b>	<b>5 Medang</b>	<b>Total</b>
<b>Essay 1</b>	19	8	27/30
<b>Essay 2</b>	15	9	24/30

## **5.7 Causes of Errors**

Errors found in the essays are due to overgeneralization, ignorance of the English grammatical rule restrictions, false concepts hypothesized, incomplete application of rules and interlingual errors.

### **5.7.1 Overgeneralization**

Richards defines overgeneralization as “instances where the learner creates a deviant structure on the basis of his experience of other structures in the target language” (Richards, 1971). In the analysis of Malay learners’ essays, it is found that Malay learners tend to over-generalize the grammar rule and produced ungrammatical structures as shown

below. Presently, Mathematics is taught in English locally. This particular Malay learner has over-generalized the mathematical expressions which he has learnt in his Mathematics class. He has used the expression “divided by ...” in the following structure found in Essay 2 causing it to be erroneous. He has used the preposition **by** inappropriately.

**Table 5.4: Overgeneralization - by**

Ungrammatical Sentence	Correct Sentence
* Actually, the entertainment can devide <b>by</b> two type of entertainment.	Actually, the entertainment can be divided <b>into</b> two types.

Here are more examples of erroneous structures where the Malay learners used a single preposition in English for the different situations. In Malay, only a single preposition **dalam** is needed to refer to time. The following Malay phrases are grammatical.

- **dalam** tiga minit (**in** three minutes)
- **dalam** masa lapang (**during** ... free period)
- **dalam** masa yang dihadkan (**within** the time limit)
- **dalam** menguasai tatabahasa (**in** mastering grammar)

The learners have over-generalized the rule. Interference from their mother tongue is clearly seen in these sentences too.

**Table 5.5: Overgeneralization - in (Interlingual Errors)**

NL to TL	Ungrammatical Sentences	Correct Sentences
<b>in</b> instead of <b>during</b>	1.* With the modern lifestyle, parents and community will not care about what their youngster doing <b>in</b> the free period.	In the modern lifestyle, parents and the community do not care what their youngsters do <b>during</b> their free time.
<b>in</b> instead of <b>within</b>	2.* The exam orientated questions help us to detect our strengths and weaknesses in grammar, provided that we do the questions <b>in</b> the time limit.	The exam-orientated questions help us to detect our strengths and weaknesses in grammar, provided that we do the questions <b>within</b> the time limit.

NL to TL	Ungrammatical Sentences	Correct Sentences
<b>in</b> instead of <b>of</b>	3.* This is due to the lack <b>in</b> mastering grammar among the students.	This is due to the lack <b>of</b> mastery of grammar among the students.

### 5.7.2 Ignorance of Rule Restrictions

Some errors occur when learners “fail to observe the restrictions of existing structures, that is, the application of rules to contexts where they do not apply” (Richards, 1971). Richards pointed out that this type of errors is the result of rote learning of rules or analogy. He further explains that analogy appears to be a major factor in using inappropriate prepositions. The learners had used a particular preposition with one type of verb, and tried by analogy to use the same preposition with similar verbs.

#### i. Ignorance of Rule Restrictions - in

Malay learners are familiar with the phrases “write **in**” and “speak **in**” as found in the following structures in their NL.

For example:

1. *Ada sesiapa di sini boleh bercakap **dalam** Bahasa Inggeris?*

Is there anyone here who can speak **in** English?

2. *Dia boleh menulis dalam Bahasa Jepun.*

He can write **in** Japanese.

The preposition **dalam** in Malay is equivalent to the English preposition **in**. They assume the hybrid sentence below is correct since the verbs “speak (*bercakap*)” and “write (*menulis*)” use the same preposition **dalam** in their mother tongue. The Malay learner also

knows that the words “speak” and “talk” are synonymous. He tries by analogy to use the same preposition with similar verbs. Clearly, the Malay learner has failed to observe the restriction of English grammatical rules.

**Table 5.6: Ignorance of Rule Restrictions - in**

Ungrammatical Sentence	Correct Sentence
* Many useful tips and keywords are given too so that you can write and talk <b>in</b> correct grammar anytime.	Many useful tips and keywords are given too so that you can write and talk <b>using</b> correct grammar anytime.

## ii. Ignorance of Rule Restrictions - for

Malay learners have identified the function of the preposition used in the sentences below to indicate intention and used the preposition **for** in these sentences. They did not observe rule restrictions on the use of this preposition. In addition, they thought that **for** is the equivalent of the Malay prepositions - **untuk** or **bagi**. The learners used **for** in their sentences instead of other prepositions which are appropriate.

**Table 5.7: Ignorance of Rule Restrictions - for**

Prepositions	Ungrammatical Sentences	Correct Sentences
<b>for</b> instead of <b>on</b>	1.* Besides that, this book gives clear explanations <b>for</b> grammar.	Besides that, this book gives clear explanations <b>on</b> grammar. Or Besides that, this book explains grammar clearly.
<b>for</b> instead of <b>to</b>	2. * The conclusion is you all should have this book because it gives many goodness <b>for</b> you. 3.* After he tried <b>for</b> looking something that could open the door, he then went back to enter his house.  4.* That is all about this book and I am glad to have my friends here to lend their ears <b>for</b> me.	In conclusion, you should all get this book because it is beneficial <b>to</b> you.  After he had tried <b>to</b> look for something that could open the door, he went back to his house.  That is all about this book and I am glad to have my friends here lend their ears <b>to</b> me.

### 5.7.3 Incomplete Application of Rules

In the sentences below, the prepositions **for**, **into**, **on** and **to** were omitted with a few other errors causing the sentences to be ungrammatical. The prepositional errors in the sentences reveal that they lacked the knowledge in applying the rules governing the English language. Even in Malay, various types of prepositions are required in the Malay version of these sentences. As an example, the Malay version of sentence (1) is *Penerbit Mudah telah menerbitkan buku ini kerana mereka sedar betapa bergunanya buku ini kepada pelajar*. The Malay preposition **kepada** is equivalent to the English preposition **for**.

**Table 5.8: Incomplete Application of Rules - for, into, on & to**

Prepositions	Ungrammatical Sentences	Correct Sentences
<b>for</b>	1.* Mudah Publications has published because they knew that the book is very useful ^ student.	Mudah Publications published the book because they knew that the book would be very useful <b>for</b> students.
<b>into</b>	2.* Kim and both of them quickly enter back ^ the basement tunnel and walk toward the door at the farm.	Kim and her siblings quickly went back <b>into</b> the basement tunnel and walked towards the door to the farm.
<b>on</b>	3.* ^ First day, I have to wake up early in the morning on 4.30am because my dad said, on 5am we must be on airport.	<b>On</b> the first day, I have to wake up early in the morning at 4.30am because my dad said that we must be at the airport by 5am.
<b>to</b>	4. * Her results of 4B 2C 3E won't appealed ^ her. 5. * After she come back ^ Malaysia she start writing a story book. 6. * So we decide to go ^ Sarawak, the biggest state in Malaysia. 7. * The explanation that are give are very clear and you will easily attractive ^ the presentation is given.	Her results of 4B's, 2C's and 3E's won't appeal <b>to</b> her. After she came back <b>to</b> Malaysia, she started writing a story book. So we have decided to go <b>to</b> Sarawak, the biggest state in Malaysia. The explanations that are given are very clear and you will be attracted <b>to</b> the book.



	8. * After thinking and thinking, he decided to go <u>^</u> bedroom and sleep.  9. * And thank you very much for listening <u>^</u> my talk, and have a nice day.	After thinking and thinking, he decided to go <b>to</b> his bedroom and sleep.  And thank you very much for listening <b>to</b> my talk, and have a nice day.
--	---	---

Richards posits that incomplete application of rules is “the occurrence of structures whose deviancy represents the degree of development of the rules required to produce acceptable utterances.”

**Apart from that** in British English and **aside from that** in American English are synonymous. The learner did not use what he has learnt completely and could have possibly combined the British English and American English together.

**Table 5.9: Incomplete Application of Rules – Apart from that**

<b>Ungrammatical Sentence</b>	<b>Correct Sentences</b>
1.* <b>Aside of that</b> , variety of grammar exercises is also included with the book.	<b>Apart from that</b> , a variety of grammar exercises is also included in the book. (British English) <b>Or</b> <b>Aside from that</b> , a variety of grammar exercises is also included in the book. (American English)

Some adjectives, adverbs and prepositions seem alike to the Malay learners or they may not have the knowledge of a wide variety of prepositions. So, they tend to use prepositions that they know without considering their suitability to the context. Thus, errors are created.

**Table 5.10: Incomplete Application of Rules - nearby & by**

<b>Prepositions</b>	<b>Ungrammatical Sentences</b>	<b>Correct Sentences</b>
nearby instead of <b>near</b>	1.* It is now in any bookstores <u>nearby</u> your house.	It is now in bookstores <b>near</b> your house.
<b>by</b> instead of <b>over</b>	1.* So, you all must get confidence to faced examination because you all already understand and your knowledge had increase time <b>by</b> time.	So, you must all be confident to face the examination because you have already understood and your knowledge has increased <b>over</b> time.

#### **5.7.4 False Concepts Hypothesized**

Richards (1971:210) sees false concepts hypothesized as errors “... derive from faulty comprehension of distinctions in the target language. These are sometimes due to poor gradation of teaching items.” Malay learners have seen a sentence such as “She left the room in tears.” And they make a false concept with this structure as shown in the sentence below.

**Table 5.11: False Concepts Hypothesized - in**

<b>Prepositions</b>	<b>Ungrammatical Sentences</b>	<b>Correct Sentences</b>
<b>in</b> instead of <b>into</b>	* Kim suddenly burst <b>in</b> tears and hug her parents.	Kim suddenly burst <b>into</b> tears and hugged her parents.

#### **5.7.5 Interlingual Errors**

**Pada** is the equivalent of **at** and it is used to indicate time. In sentence (1), this particular learner has translated from “*Buku ini telah diterbitkan pada Mach tahun ini.*” to “This book were just publish **at** March this year.” Here, we can see clearly that the students

have used their native language in the target language. Similarly, they also used **di** as the equivalent of **at** to indicate location instead of the preposition **in**:

“... **di** tingkat bawah tanah...” - sentence (2)

“...**di** dewan sekolah.” – sentence (3),

“... di Sabah dan Sarawak.” – sentence (4)

“...**di** tengah-tengah perhimpunan...” – sentence (5)

“ **di** banyak kedai...” – sentence (6) and

“...simpan **di** laci.” - sentence (7)

The learners again used **at** as **di** in sentences (8), (9), (10) and (11) when they translated from their native language to English. They should have used “**on**” in those sentences. In sentence (12), we can see that the learner committed the error of using **at** instead of **to**. Here, the learner may have assumed that “ ...berjalan **ke** arah pintu **di** ladang itu” to indicate direction as in “ ... walked toward the door at the farm.” By using translation method to form their sentences thus they have created erroneous ones. Thus, these sentences below are ungrammatical as a result of interference from the Malay language.

**Table 5.12: Interlingual Errors –at**

NL to TL	Ungrammatical Sentences	Correct Sentences
<b>at</b> instead of <b>in</b>	<p>1. *This book were just publish <b>at</b> March this year.</p> <p>2. * Kim can’t stop thinking of her parent and then she remember that her youngest sister and her youngest brother are <b>at</b> the basement of the house, sleeping.</p>	<p>This book was just published <b>in</b> March this year.</p> <p>Kim couldn’t stop thinking of her parent and then she remembered that her youngest sister and brother were <b>in</b> the basement of the house, sleeping.</p>

	<p>3. * First of all, my friends and I waiting for other students and teachers <b>at</b> school hall.</p> <p>4. * Many interesting information we can get from visit the National Muzeum for instant we can learn about culture in Malaysia especially the culture of ethnic group <b>at</b> Sabah and Sarawak.</p>	<p>First of all, my friends and I are waiting for the other students and teachers <b>in</b> the school hall.</p> <p>A lot of interesting information can be gained from visiting the National Museum. For instance, we can learn about the culture in Malaysia, especially the culture <b>of</b> the ethnic groups <b>in</b> Sabah and Sarawak.</p>
	<p>5. *Standing here on this stage <b>at</b> the middle of assembly, I, Nabilah Binti Baharudin, a SPM candidate from 5 Meranti would love to share some informations I have gained about a grammar book, that is, to me a very suitable and a must-have for all students, who are still in great dilemma on which reference book is good for them.</p> <p>6. *The book also available <b>at</b> many book shop near the neighbourhood.</p> <p>7. * Do not buy the book just to keep it <b>at</b> the drawer.</p>	<p>Standing here on this stage <b>in</b> the middle of this assembly, I, Nabilah Binti Baharudin, an SPM candidate from 5 Meranti would love to share some knowledge I have learnt from a grammar book, that is, to me very suitable and a must-have for all students especially those who are still in a dilemma on which reference book is good for them.</p> <p>The book is also available <b>in</b> many bookshops near the neighbourhood.</p> <p>Do not buy the book just to keep it <b>in</b> the drawer.</p>
<b>at</b> instead of <b>on</b>	<p>8. * Nowadays there is a lot of reality programmes shown <b>at</b> the t.v.</p> <p>9. * Fish that we catch will be sell to the fishmonger who had been waiting for us <b>at</b> the beach.</p> <p>10. * I knew that it was my friend's car as it had a 'Manchester United' logo sticked <b>at</b> the window.</p>	<p>Nowadays there are a lot of reality programmes shown <b>on</b> TV.</p> <p>Fish that we catch will be sold to the fishmonger who has been waiting for us <b>on</b> the beach.</p> <p>I knew that it was my friend's car as it had a 'Manchester United' logo stuck <b>on</b> the window.</p>

	11. * Then, she sat <b>at</b> the sofa in the living room.	Then, she sat <b>on</b> the sofa in the living room.
<b>at</b> instead of <b>to</b>	12.* Kim and both of them quickly enter back the basement tunnel and walk toward the door <b>at</b> the farm.	Kim and her siblings quickly went back into the basement tunnel and walked toward the door <b>to</b> the farm.

Here are more examples of sentences which reflect literal translation from Malay as shown in sentences (1) and (2). The learner did not use a preposition in sentence (1) as it is not required in their native language as in “*berjalan masuk*”.

**Table 5.13: Interlingual Errors – Translation of Words**

NL to TL	Ungrammatical Sentences	Correct Sentences
“ <i>berjalan masuk</i> ”	1.* Sharp 10 o’clock, I saw the principle and the examination coordinator <b>walked entered</b> the hall.	At 10 o’clock sharp, I saw the principal and the examination coordinator walked <b>into</b> the hall.
“ <i>datang untuk</i> ”.	2. * Even in Malaysia, thousands of teenagers annually come <b>for</b> television reality shows such as Akademi Fantasia, Mentor and So You Think You Can Dance.	Even in Malaysia, thousands of teenagers annually go <b>to</b> television reality shows such as Akademi Fantasia, Mentor and So You Think You Can Dance.

The following structures are erroneous as the prepositions **dengan, dalam ... ke, antara** and **oleh** used are literally translated from Malay to English. The Malay learners tend to look at the type of the preposition in their mother tongue and tried to find a similar preposition in English.

**Table 5.14: Interlingual Errors – Translations of Malay Prepositions**

NL to TL	Ungrammatical Sentences	Correct Sentences
“ <i>dengan latihan</i> ”	1.* Why they include the book <b>with</b> practice question papers and sample answers is, because give	They have included practice question papers and sample answers <b>with</b> the book so as to

<i>“dalam satu topik ke topik yang lain”</i>	you a practice after you finished learn <b>in</b> one topic <b>to</b> another topic.	give you practice <b>after</b> learning each topic.
<i>“sama dengan kertas ujian”</i>	2.* Furthermore, if you all want to get use with the exam paper, the book provides practice question papers exactly <b>with</b> the exam paper.	Furthermore, if you all want to get used to the exam paper, the book provides practice question papers exactly <b>like</b> the exam paper.
<i>“dengan jalan yang betul”</i>	3.* We can entertain our self <b>by</b> a right path.	We can entertain ourselves <b>in</b> correct ways.
<i>“kenangan manis antara keluarga saya”</i>	4.* There are many sweet memories <b>between</b> my family and I when we stayed <i>at</i> there.	There are many sweet memories that I share <b>with</b> my family when we stayed there.
<i>“oleh setiap orang”</i>	5.* The most important thing is the book is cheap and very affordable <b>by</b> everyone.	The most important thing is the book is cheap and very affordable <b>for</b> everyone.

The Malay writing style tends to be cyclical compared to English. The following sentence is erroneous as a result of translating word for word from Malay to English as shown in the Table 5.11.

**Table 5.15: Interlingual Errors – from**

NL to TL	Ungrammatical Sentence	Correct Sentence
<b>from</b> instead of <b>in</b> <i>“dari buku”</i>	1.* On the other hand, clear explanations are provided as a guidance to make advantages <b>from</b> the book.	On the other hand, clear explanations are provided as guidelines <b>in</b> the book.

It is obvious that the learners could have used the word “**down**” to literally mean “jatuh” as in “knocking a tree down” in sentence (1) and “turun ke pantai” in sentence (2).

**Table 5.16: Interlingual Errors – down**

NL to TL	Ungrammatical Sentences	Correct Sentences
<b>down</b> instead of <b>beside/ by</b>	1.* I lost control of it and crashes into a tree <b>down</b> the roadside.	I lost control of it and crashed into a tree <b>by</b> the roadside.
<b>down</b> instead of <b>on</b>	2.* The heat during the summer’s day is very nice to remember or we could wear sleeveless shirts and shorts <b>down</b> the beach and let the sun shone us.	The heat during summer is very nice and we can wear sleeveless shirts and shorts <b>on</b> the beach and let the sun shine on us.

Similarly, the preposition **about** has its equivalent in Malay which are **tentang** and **mengenai**, but the learner has translated them and used **about** for the following structure regardless of its context. The writer had written “...take notice **about** my talk **about** this book...” as he had translated from “...*mengambil berat tentang ceramah saya ... mengenai buku ini ...*”.

**Table 5.17: Interlingual Errors – about**

NL to TL	Ungrammatical Sentence	Correct Sentence
<b>about</b> instead of <b>of</b> <b>about</b> instead of <b>on</b>	1.* I really hope that you will enjoy and take notice <b>about</b> my talk <b>about</b> this book later.	I really hope that you will enjoy and take notice <b>of</b> my talk <b>on</b> this book later.

In the following structure, the Malay learner could be implying that the author is a good writer both within the country and abroad as in “**di** dalam dan luar negara”. However, he was not able to express them in English but merely translated directly thus committing such errors.

**Table 5.18: Interlingual Errors – in and out of**

NL to TL	Ungrammatical Sentence	Correct Sentence
<b>in</b> and <b>out of</b> instead of <b>in</b>	1.* Noraini Syawal is one of excellent author <b>in</b> and <b>out of</b> country.	Noraini Syawal is one of the excellent authors <b>in</b> the country. Or Noraini Syawal is an excellent author <b>in</b> our country and abroad.

Once again, we can see that the learners have used the preposition **pada** then translated it to the English preposition **on** in the following sentences. The influence of their mother tongue has affected their choice of prepositions in their writing such as **on** is used instead of **at**, **in**, **to** and **of** without bearing in mind the different contexts in the English structure. From sentences (1 - 13), we notice that the Malay learners have over-generalized the use of a single preposition to indicate time, location and manner. In sentence (13), the reason for the learner to use the preposition **on** instead of the preposition **of** is because he translated from "... mengambil kesempatan **di** atas mereka."

**Table 5.19: Interlingual Errors – on**

NL to TL	Ungrammatical Sentences	Correct Sentences
<b>on</b> instead of <b>at</b>	1. * <b>On</b> the end of SPM's examination day, Kim was a bit happy, she could answered all the questions given.	<b>At</b> the end of the SPM examination, Kim was a bit happy as she could answer all the questions given.
	2. * They decided to make a beeline for home as Kim's flight was <b>on</b> 9.00p.m.	They decided to make a beeline for home as Kim's flight was <b>at</b> 9.00p.m.
<b>on</b> instead of <b>by</b>	3. * First day, I have to wake up early in the morning <b>on</b> 4.30am because my dad said, <b>on</b> 5 am we must be on airport.	On the first day, I have to wake up early in the morning <b>at</b> 4.30am because my dad said that we must be at the airport <b>by</b> 5 am.



<p><b>on</b> instead of <b>in</b></p>	<p>4. * Moreover, like Cerdik Publications and Sasbadi Publications, Mudah Publications also known for its quality of their book that you can put your trust <b>on</b> it.</p> <p>5. * Kim suddenly paused, she didn't know her own goal, her aim <b>on</b> her life.</p> <p>6. * <b>On</b> October, I having the real PMR examination.</p>	<p>Moreover, like Cerdik Publications and Sasbadi Publications, Mudah Publications is also known for the quality of their books so you can put your trust <b>in</b> them.</p> <p>Kim suddenly paused; she didn't know her own goal, her aim <b>in</b> life.</p> <p><b>In</b> October, I will be having the real PMR examination.</p>
<p><b>on</b> instead of <b>to</b></p>	<p>7. * It is a blunder if we turn a blind eye <b>on</b> this matter.</p> <p>8. * With these helpful diagrams, you would not feel bored to refer <b>on</b> this book and they help you to memorise quickly too.</p> <p>9. * Besides its attractive presentation that will definitely make you stick <b>on</b> this book, it provides a very clear explanation from A to Z.</p> <p>10. * Kim then tell about the thing happen <b>on</b> him before.</p> <p>11. * Then after Kim finish explain the thing happen <b>on</b> him, all of his family had a big laugh because the thing happen <b>on</b> him was planned by his family.</p> <p>12. * They will get easy excess <b>on</b> game and ^ website which are not suitable for them.</p>	<p>It will be a blunder if we turn a blind eye <b>to</b> this matter.</p> <p>With these helpful diagrams, you will not feel bored referring <b>to</b> this book and they help you to memorise quickly too.</p> <p>Besides the attractive presentation that will definitely make you stick <b>to</b> the book, it provides a very clear explanation from A to Z.</p> <p>Kim then talked about the thing that had happened <b>to</b> him before.</p> <p>Then, after Kim had finished explaining what had happened <b>to</b> him, his family had a big laugh because the thing that happened <b>to</b> him was planned by his family.</p> <p>They will get easy access <b>to</b> games <b>on</b> websites which are not suitable for them.</p>
<p><b>on</b> instead of <b>of</b></p>	<p>13.* It is dangerous because they are exposed with rapist and people who will take advantage <b>on</b> them.</p>	<p>It is dangerous because they are exposed to rapists and people who might take advantage <b>of</b> them.</p>

**Kepada** and **ke** are the equivalents of **to**. The learners may not be able to differentiate the use of **to** to show direction (in sentence 1 & 2) and purpose (in sentence 3).

**Table 5.20: Interlingual Errors – to**

NL to TL	Ungrammatical Sentences	Correct Sentences
<b>to</b> instead of <b>at/ in</b>	1. * Then there is a signboard tells they are arrived <b>to</b> Kuala Besut.	Then there is a signboard that tells them that they have arrived <b>at</b> Kuala Besut. Or Then there is a signboard that tells them that they have arrived <b>in</b> Kuala Besut.
<b>to</b> instead of <b>on</b>	2. * The title of the book is Grammar Made Simple should have an impact <b>to</b> the students.  3. * Which will help me prepare for my biggest exam this year and there is a prediction SPM question which will help me concentrate <b>to</b> specific subject.	The title of the book, “Grammar Made Simple” should have an impact <b>on</b> the students.  This book will help me prepare for my biggest exam this year and there is a forecast SPM paper which will help me concentrate <b>on</b> a specific subject.

Similarly, the Malay learners used the preposition **with** in the following sentences when they translated the preposition **dengan** from Malay. Either they do not understand the use of different prepositions in different contexts or they assume a one-to-one relationship. They tend to translate their thoughts possibly in Malay and then writing it down in English. As a result, the following erroneous sentences are produced in their writing. The appropriate choice of prepositions to indicate the different functions such as reactions, manner, the agentive and purpose is overlooked by the learners.

**Table 5.21: Interlingual Errors – with**

NL to TL	Ungrammatical Sentences	Correct Sentences
<b>with</b> instead of <b>in</b>	1. *Kim still standing in front of the door <b>with</b> shock.  2. * The book is wrote <b>with</b> sistematically orders.	Kim is still standing in front of the door <b>in</b> shock.  The book is written <b>in</b> systematic order.
<b>with</b> instead of <b>by</b>	1. * Naz is distracted <b>with</b> the noisy.  2. * I hope, I could build my muscle <b>with</b> eating my favourite food, that I ate so much.	Naz is distracted <b>by</b> the noise.  I hope I can build my muscles <b>by</b> eating my favourite food.
<b>with</b> instead of <b>from</b>	1.* “His father is a businessman, his mother is the headmaster but why his attitude towards studying have a big difference <b>with</b> me.”	“His father is a businessman and his mother is the headmistress but his attitude towards studies is different <b>from</b> mine.”
<b>with</b> instead of <b>to</b>  <b>with</b> instead of <b>like</b>	1. * Furthermore, if you all want to get use <b>with</b> the exam paper, the book provides practice question papers exactly <b>with</b> the exam paper.  2. * It is dangerous because they are exposed <b>with</b> rapist and people who will take advantage on them.  3. * It can lead us <b>with</b> successful English.	Furthermore, if you want to get used <b>to</b> the exam paper, the book provides practice question papers exactly <b>like</b> the exam paper.  It is dangerous because they are exposed <b>to</b> rapists and people who might take advantage of them.  It can lead us <b>to</b> successful English.

Malay learners who are not skilful in their writing, tend to make more errors when writing long sentences. In the sentence below, the learner used a single preposition **on** in place of the preposition **di** without considering its suitability the preposition.

**Table 5.22: Interlingual Errors - on**

Ungrammatical Sentence	Correct Sentence
1.* First day, I have to wake up early in the morning on 4.30am because my dad said, on 5 am we must be <b>on</b> airport.	On the first day, I have to wake up early in the morning <b>at</b> 4.30am because my dad said that we must be <b>at</b> the airport <b>by</b> 5 am.

In the English sentences below, prepositions are not required after the verbs or before the nouns. On the other hand, prepositions are used in the Malay language. Here, we can clearly see the interference of the students' mother tongue in the use of prepositions in these sentences. In sentences (1) and (2), **at** is used as the Malay preposition to show location "... bercuti **di** Pulau Redang ..." and "... kedai **di** sana.". Likewise, in sentences (3) and (4), the preposition "**dari**" in Malay language as shown in "... bertolak **dari** Makkah ..." and "samada ia **dari** Barat ..." are instances where the students' NL interfere with the learning and acquiring of the TL.

Other examples of ungrammatical use of prepositions due to the interference of the NL are:

**for** used in sentences (5), (6) and (7) as the equivalent of "**untuk**"

**in** used in sentences (8), (9) and (10) as the equivalent of "**pada**", "**di**" and "**dalam**"

**inside** used in sentences (11) as the equivalent of "**di dalam**"

**on** used in sentence (12) as the equivalent of "**sedang**"

**with** used in sentences (13) and (14) as the equivalent of "**dengan**"

**on** used in sentence (15) as the equivalent of "**di atas**"

**to** used in sentence (16) as equivalent of "**untuk**"

**Table 5.23: Interlingual Errors –for, inside, in, with & to**

Ungrammatical Sentences	Correct Sentences
1.* In the silent night with full moon, Kim was thinking why this thing happen to him while his family on vacation <b>at</b> someplace in Perak that does not interest him to follow his family.	In the silent night with a full moon, Kim was wondering why this thing had happened to him while his family was on vacation somewhere in Perak which did not interest him enough to follow his family.
2.* In fact, it is a huge shopping complex and many luxurious shop <b>at</b> there.	In fact, it is a huge shopping complex with many luxurious shops.
3.* I feel like very sad because I have to leave <b>from</b> Makkah and Madinah.	I feel very sad because I have to leave Makkah and Madinah.
4.* I eat many kind of food whether its <b>from</b> Western, East or even ‘kampung’ style.	I eat many kinds of food whether it is Western, Eastern or even ‘kampung’ style.
5.* I use this time to go <b>for</b> shopping.	I use this time to go shopping.
6.* Then my father’s check in ours ticket to confirm <b>for</b> our flight.	Then my father checks in our tickets to confirm our flight.
7.* It is for early requirement <b>for</b> students to take an exam.	It is a requirement for students <b>before</b> taking an exam.
8.* Kim and family were ready to head to Langkawi <b>in</b> the next evening.	Kim and her family were ready to head for Langkawi the next evening.
9.* In certain country, they have different climate <b>in</b> each month.	In certain countries, they have different climates each month.
10.* Why they include the book with practice question papers and sample answers is, because give you a practice after you finished learn <b>in</b> one topic <b>to</b> another topic.	The book includes practice question papers and sample answers to allow you to practise after <b>every topic</b> .
11.* Other than that, <b>inside</b> the book also have helpful diagrams.	Other than that, the book also has helpful diagrams.
12.* When the aeroplane <b>on</b> take off, the plane shaking and fell very fast.	When the aeroplane took off, it shook and fell very fast.
13.* The last reason is the book also include <b>with</b> the useful tips that may be will help you.	The last reason is the book also includes useful tips that may be helpful <b>to</b> you.

14.* Besides that, this book will offer you <b>with</b> clear explanation, from A to Z, and all you have to know about English grammar.	Besides that, this book will offer you a clear explanation, from A <i>to</i> Z, all that you need to know about English grammar.
15.* Furthermore, you can practice <b>on</b> questions papers which major the grammar aspect.	Furthermore, you can practise answering the question papers which test the grammar aspect.
16.* So, you don't have to worry if buying this book will cause <b>to</b> you hardly to understands.	So, you don't have to worry whether buying this book will not help you to understand.

## 5.8 Types of Errors

Errors are identified and categorized into four categories namely inappropriate selection or usage, addition, omission and word order. We have identified that most errors made by the learners is on inappropriate selection or usage of prepositions compared to the others and there were no errors on word order.

**Table 5.24: Types of Errors**

Types of Errors	Inappropriate selection or usage of prepositions	Addition	Omission	Word Order	Total
<b>Essay 1</b>	29	10	2	-	41
<b>Essay 2</b>	32	15	10	-	57

### 5.8.1 Inappropriate selection or usage of prepositions

There are many instances found in the learners' essays where prepositions used are inappropriate due to over-generalization, ignorance of English grammatical rules restriction, interference of their mother tongue and making false concept. The examples are found in the discussion of these causes of errors.

### 5.8.2 Addition

In English, words like “regret, reach and visited” are transitive verbs that do not require prepositions after them. Inserting a preposition after the verb would create erroneous sentences as shown below.

**Table 5.25: Addition – on, at and to**

<b>Ungrammatical Sentences</b>	<b>Correct Sentences</b>
1.* With a new goal in her mind, she regret <b>on</b> all her past actions.	With a new goal in her mind, she regretted all her past actions.
2.* I am very excited when reach <b>at</b> Federal Court because it really a huge building and a beautiful decoration outside and inside the building.	I was very excited when we reached the Federal Court because it was really a huge building and had beautiful decorations inside and outside the building.
3.* Lastly, we are visited <b>to</b> Kuala Lumpur City Centre (KLCC).	Lastly, we visited the Kuala Lumpur City Centre (KLCC).

In Malay, the passive form is expressed with the word **oleh** (**by** in English). However, using “**by** everyone” is redundant in the English structure. As a result, the sentence becomes ungrammatical. Hence, the prepositional phrase “**by** everyone” should be omitted or the preposition **by** replaced with **for** as in sentence (1). The other instance of redundant use of prepositions is shown in sentence (2) where the preposition **about** is not required in English as well as in Malay in the context given. In Malay, the sentence would be “... *apa penulis cuba menerangkan.*”.

**Table 5.26: Addition – by and about**

<b>Ungrammatical Sentences</b>	<b>Correct Sentences</b>
1.* The most important thing is the book is cheap and very affordable <b>by</b> everyone.	The most important thing is that the book is cheap and very affordable.

	Or The most important thing is that the book is cheap and very affordable <b>for</b> everyone.
2.* Furthermore, this book has clear explanations which can make you understand what is the author trying to tell <b>about</b> .	Furthermore, this book has clear explanations which can help you understand what the author is trying to tell us.

When a grammatical item is added in a sentence which is not required, it is redundant. In the following structure, the use of a preposition is not necessary in English. However, the use of prepositions is needed in Malay as in “*Kim dan keluarganya telah bersedia ke Pulau Langkawi pada petang keesokannya.*” In the following sentence, by adding a preposition in this sentence before the nouns, the prepositions have become redundant.

**Table 5.27: Addition -in**

<b>Redundant Preposition</b>	<b>Ungrammatical Sentence</b>	<b>Correct Sentence</b>
<b>in</b>	* Kim and family were ready to head <b>to</b> Langkawi <b>in</b> the next evening.	Kim and his family were ready to head <b>for</b> Langkawi the next evening.

### 5.8.3 Omission of Prepositions

Prepositions are omitted in the Malay students’ sentences because of their mother tongue interference as well as they did not apply the rules completely. When a more sophisticated and different structural pattern is used, the learners do not apply the English grammatical rules correctly. The following examples are explained accordingly.

In writing an essay in the TL, most learners have a tendency to think in their own NL as they are more competent and at ease with it. Then, they translate their thoughts from



their NL to the TL. Malay learners in this study also reflect such a tendency to think in their NL (Malay) and translate their thoughts to English. As an illustration, the phrase “Tepat jam sepuluh” does not require a preposition before the specified time in Malay language. In contrast, English needs a preposition before the stipulated time in the structure. Therefore, the omission of the preposition **at** would be ungrammatical as in sentence (1) below. It can be corrected by adding the preposition **at**.

Other examples of such interferences in writing English essays are reflected in sentences (2) and (3). Malay language does not require a preposition after the verb “menyinari” (shine) as in “...biar matahari menyinari kita...” and “...mencari sesuatu ...”. The above deviant structures can be corrected by rephrasing some of the words and by adding the prepositions **on** after the verb in (2) and **for** after the verb in (3) respectively.

**Table 5.28: Omission of Prepositions –at, on &for**

<b>Ungrammatical Sentences</b>	<b>Correct Sentences</b>
1.* Sharp ^ 10 o'clock, I saw the principle and the examination coordinator walked entered the hall.	<b>At</b> 10 o'clock sharp, I saw the principal and the examination coordinator walk into the hall. or <b>At</b> 10 o'clock sharp, I saw the principal and the examination coordinator enter the hall.
2.* The heat during the summer's day is very nice to remember or we could wear sleeveless shirts and shorts down the beach and let the sun shone ^ us.	The heat during summer is very nice and we can wear sleeveless shirts and shorts <i>on</i> the beach and let the sun shine <b>on</b> us.
3.* After he tired for looking ^ something that could open the door, he then went back to enter his house.	After he tried <b>to</b> look <b>for</b> something that could open the door, he went back to his house.

Prepositions are omitted by the learners as they have not learnt the grammatical rules well or the prepositions are not needed in the sentence constructed in the learners' mother tongue. The following are the sentences where prepositions are omitted.

**Table 5.29: Omission of Prepositions –for, into, on & to**

Prepositions	Ungrammatical Sentences	Correct Sentences
<b>for</b>	1.* Mudah Publications has published because they knew that the book is very useful <u>^</u> student.	Mudah Publications published the book because they knew that the book would be very useful <b>for</b> students.
<b>into</b>	2.* Kim and both of them quickly enter back <u>^</u> the basement tunnel and walk toward the door at the farm.	Kim and her siblings quickly went back <b>into</b> the basement tunnel and walked towards the door to the farm.
<b>on</b>	3.* <u>^</u> First day, I have to wake up early in the morning on 4.30am because my dad said, on 5am we must be on airport.	<b>On</b> the first day, I have to wake up early in the morning at 4.30am because my dad said that we must be at the airport by 5am.
<b>to</b>	4. * Her results of 4B 2C 3E won't appealed <u>^</u> her.  5. * After she come back <u>^</u> Malaysia she start writing a story book. 6. * So we decide to go <u>^</u> Sarawak, the biggest state in Malaysia.  7. * The explanation that are give are very clear and you will easily attractive <u>^</u> the presentation is given.  8. * After thinking and thinking, he decided to go <u>^</u> bedroom and sleep.  9. * And thank you very much for listening <u>^</u> my talk, and have a nice day.	Her results of 4B's, 2C's and 3E's won't appeal <b>to</b> her.  After she came back <b>to</b> Malaysia she started writing a story book.  So we have decided to go <b>to</b> Sarawak, the biggest state in Malaysia.  The explanations that are given are very clear and you will be attracted <b>to</b> the book.  After thinking and thinking, he decided to go <b>to</b> his bedroom and sleep.  And thank you very much for listening <b>to</b> my talk, and have a nice day.

#### **5.8.4 Word Order**

There were no errors on word order found in the essays. This is a possibility the number of samples essays used are not sufficient, the learners do not make such errors or the nature of the essays themselves.

#### **5.9 Summary**

Based on the findings of the error analysis, the most frequent type of errors found in the essays of Malay learners is inappropriate selection of preposition which has a total of 64 erroneous sentences. The least frequent type of errors made is omission of prepositions with 12 sentences identified. Under inappropriate selection of preposition category, there are 58 erroneous sentences which reveal that the learners have a tendency to translate the prepositions used in their NL and use them in their English essays. Thus, the main cause of the errors committed by these learners is the interference of their NL in all types of errors. Next, the causes of errors that least affected the Malay learners are over-generalization and making false concepts. There are 4 ungrammatical sentences in the category of ignorance of English grammatical rules restriction.

As for unnecessary insertion of prepositions, the interference of NL has the most errors compared to the other causes. The other minor causes of unnecessary insertion of prepositions are transitive verbs, phrasal verbs and adding preposition where they do not belong. Most of the prepositions omitted in the sentences are due to the learners not applying the grammatical rules learnt in English. The next reason for the omission of prepositions is interference of the learners NL. Only one erroneous sentence is identified which was caused by different structural patterns between English and Malay.

**Table 5.30: Causes of Errors and Types of Errors Found in the Essays**

Causes of Errors	Types of Errors		
	Inappropriate Selection of Preposition	Unnecessary Insertion of Prepositions	Omission of Prepositions
Overgeneralization	1		
Ignorance of Rules Restriction	4		
Interference of NL	58	16	3
Incomplete Application Of Rules			9
False Concept Hypothesized	1		
Total	64	16	12

Most of the errors made are in the use of simple prepositions such **on, at, to, with, in** and **for** as seen in Table 5.33. These prepositions are more difficult than the other prepositions in the hierarchy of difficulty found in the Summary of Chapter Four.

**Table 5.31: Occurrence of Errors According to the Prepositions**

Prepositions	Total number of Errors
<b>on</b>	22
<b>at</b>	16
<b>to</b>	12
<b>with</b>	12
<b>in</b>	11
<b>for</b>	10
<b>by</b>	5
<b>down</b>	3
<b>about</b>	3
<b>of</b>	2
<b>into</b>	2
<b>from</b>	1
<b>between</b>	1
<b>inside</b>	1
<b>Phrasal verbs</b>	2
<b>Complex preposition</b>	1