TEACHER COLLEGIALITY AND COMMITMENT IN HIGH- AND LOW-ACHIEVING SECONDARY SCHOOLS IN ISLAMABAD, PAKISTAN

MADIHA SHAH

THESIS SUBMITTED IN FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

FACULTY OF EDUCATION
UNIVERSITY OF MALAYA
KUALA LAMPUR

2011
TEACHER COLLEGIALITY AND COMMITMENT IN HIGH- AND LOW-ACHIEVING SECONDARY SCHOOLS IN ISLAMABAD, PAKISTAN

SYNOPSIS

Abundant literature has suggested that teacher collegiality is the basis of good teamwork and high professionalism in schools. This study analyzed the impact of teachers’ collegiality on their organizational and professional commitment in public secondary schools in Islamabad, Pakistan. The study also examined the differences of teacher collegiality, organizational commitment, and professional commitment in high-achieving and low-achieving schools. The effects of teacher personal variables (e.g. gender, educational level, and professional experience) on teacher collegiality, organizational commitment, and professional commitment were also investigated.

A teacher collegiality scale (TCS) was developed and tested using exploratory and confirmatory factor analytic techniques. The final Teacher Collegiality Scale (TCS) comprised seven dimensions, namely (1) Demonstrating Mutual Support and Trust, (2) Observing One Another Teaching, (3) Joint Planning and Assessment, (4) Sharing Ideas and Expertise, (5) Teaching Each Other, (6) Developing Curriculum Together, and (7) Sharing Resources. The instruments of organizational commitment and professional commitment were adapted from Meyer, Allen, and Smith (1993).

The survey instrument, comprising the TCS and Commitment Scale was distributed to a sample of 364 public secondary school teachers in eight high-achieving and nine low-achieving schools located in Islamabad. Structural Equation Modeling (SEM) with AMOS 16.0 was used to assess the impact of teacher collegiality on teachers’ organizational and professional commitment. Latent Mean Structure Analysis was used to determine the differences in teacher collegiality, organizational commitment, and professional commitment between high-achieving and low-achieving school teachers. The effects of demographic variables on study main variables were analyzed using Multivariate Analysis of Variance (MANOVA).

The analysis confirmed that teacher collegiality positively impacted organizational commitment and professional commitment among secondary school teachers in Pakistan. Multi-group SEM analysis did not support for the moderating effects of school type based on achievement. The differences in teacher collegiality and professional commitment were found to be statistically non-significant between high-achieving and low-achieving school teachers. However, organizational commitment among high-achieving school teachers was significantly higher than low-achieving school teachers. Teacher collegiality among female teachers was more evident than male teachers. Female teachers were also found to be more organizationally committed in Pakistani schools. However, gender was not correlated with teacher professional commitment. Teachers with higher educational qualifications and/or teachers with more professional experience perceived collegiality to be higher in their respective schools. Similarly, an increase in educational level and professional experience heightens teachers’ commitment towards their organization and profession. The results of this study offer numerous implications for theory, practice, and future research.
KESEPAKATAN DAN KOMITMEN GURU DI SEKOLAH MENENGAH BERPENCAPAIAN TINGGI DAN RENDAH DI ISLAMABAD, PAKISTAN

SINOPSIS


ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

All praises be to Allah Almighty who blessed me with the strength, ability, and resources I needed to successfully accomplish this task. Million thanks to Almighty for bestowing me with the most loving partner Anees-ur-Rehman and a very supportive supervisor Prof. Dr. Sufean Hussin who both played a great role in making this dream come true.

I truly believe that without my soulmate Anees, this work quite simply would not have happened. His love, encouragement, and all kind of moral, financial, and emotional support made this journey not only possible but pleasing as well. I am eternally grateful to have such a sweet partner in my life.

I am whole heartedly thankful to my supervisor Prof. Dr. Sufean Hussin, whose guidance, ongoing commitment, and constant support has made this study substantial and rich. He has shaped my thinking tremendously and made me think like a researcher. The expertise and time he invested in this work is truly a selfless gift. He is a wonderful person who cares deeply about his students and I believe I am blessed to have him as my supervisor and advisor.

I sincerely appreciate the assistance provided by Prof. Dr. Siow Heng Loke from Asia e University, Prof. Elizabeth O’ Sullivan from the University of Maryland, and Prof. Dr. Ananda Kumar from University of Malaya. They all helped me so much in building the conceptual model of this study and deciding the analytical tools for my work. I am very grateful to Prof. Siow who gave me his time and guidance whenever I needed. My special thanks to Prof. Elizabeth for giving me her precious time during her visits to Malaysia and for thoroughly reading my thesis and providing me with the valuable feedback.

I am also thankful to my relatives in Pakistan who made my stay comfortable and relaxing at their place during the data collection process. Their kindness and support meant a lot to me.

Finally, my deepest thanks and appreciation to the principals and teachers of public secondary schools in Pakistan who made me feel welcome in their schools and invested their time in making this study a success.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

SYNOPSIS ............................................................... ii
SINOPSIS ............................................................... iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ................................................ iv
TABLE OF CONTENTS ................................................ v
LIST OF TABLES ...................................................... x
LIST OF FIGURES ..................................................... xvii
LIST OF APPENDICES ............................................... xviii

CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION TO THE STUDY

1.1 Introduction ......................................................... 1
1.2 Background of the Study ......................................... 6
   1.2.1 Background Context of Pakistan Educational System ...... 13
1.3 Statement of the Problem ......................................... 16
1.4 Research Questions ............................................... 26
1.5 Objectives of the Study ........................................... 27
1.6 Significance of the Study ......................................... 28
1.7 Operational Definitions of Important Terms ..................... 32
   1.7.1 Teacher Collegiality ........................................ 32
   1.7.2 Organizational Commitment ................................ 33
   1.7.3 Organization ................................................. 34
   1.7.4 Professional Commitment .................................. 34
   1.7.5 Profession ................................................... 34
   1.7.6 Public Secondary Schools in Pakistan ..................... 34
   1.7.7 Teachers ...................................................... 35
   1.7.8 High-Achieving School .................................... 35
   1.7.9 Low-Achieving School .................................... 35
1.8 Organization of the Thesis ...................................... 36

CHAPTER 2 REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

2.1 Introduction ......................................................... 37
2.2 Teacher Collegiality .............................................. 38
   2.2.1 Models and Forms of Teacher Collegiality ............... 40
   2.2.2 Benefits of Teacher Collegiality ......................... 44
   2.2.3 Barriers to Teacher Collegiality ......................... 49
   2.2.4 Criticism on Teacher Collegiality ....................... 53
   2.2.5 Teacher Collegiality and School Improvement .......... 56
   2.2.6 Teacher Collegiality and Improved Teacher Instruction .. 62
   2.2.7 Teacher Collegiality and Teacher Professional Growth and Development ............................................... 66
   2.2.8 Role of Leadership in Developing Teacher Collegiality .... 72
   2.2.9 Teacher Collegiality and Student Academic Achievement .... 76
CHAPTER 3 METHODOLOGY

3.1 Introduction ................................................................. 154
3.2 Research Framework and Hypotheses ................................. 155
3.3 Research Design .......................................................... 167
3.4 Sample and Participant Selection ..................................... 168
3.5 Data Collection Procedure ............................................. 169
3.6 Instrumentation or Measures .......................................... 171
3.6.1 Measurement of Teacher Collegiality ............................. 171
3.6.1.1 Development of Teacher Collegiality Scale and Pilot Study
          Results ................................................................. 172
3.6.1.2 Reliability Analysis of Teacher Collegiality Scale .......... 181
3.6.2 Measurement of Organizational Commitment .................... 183
3.6.2.1 Reliability and Validity of Organizational Commitment
          Measure .............................................................. 184
3.6.3 Measurement of Professional Commitment ....................... 185
3.6.3.1 Reliability and Validity of Professional Commitment
          Measure .............................................................. 186
3.7 Data Analysis .............................................................. 187
3.8 Summary ..................................................................... 189
CHAPTER 4  ANALYSIS OF DATA

4.1 Introduction ................................................................. 190
4.2 Preliminary Analysis of Data ............................................. 191
4.3 Reliability Analysis of Survey Questionnaire ....................... 195
4.4 Demographic Characteristics of Survey Respondents ............ 198
4.5 Descriptive Analysis of Data for High-Achieving and Low-Achieving Public Secondary School Teachers in Islamabad ........ 200
  4.5.1 Descriptive Statistics (Frequencies and Percentages) on Teacher Collegiality Scale for High-Achieving Public Secondary Schools in Islamabad .................................................. 200
  4.5.2 Descriptive Statistics (Frequencies and Percentages) on Teacher Collegiality Scale for Low-Achieving Public Secondary Schools in Islamabad .............................................. 208
  4.5.3 Descriptive Statistics (Means and Standard Deviations) on Teacher Collegiality for High-Achieving and Low-Achieving Public Secondary Schools in Islamabad .................. 216
  4.5.4 Descriptive Statistics (Frequencies and Percentages) on Organizational Commitment Scale for High-Achieving Public Secondary School Teachers in Islamabad ...................... 226
  4.5.5 Descriptive Statistics (Frequencies and Percentages) on Organizational Commitment Scale for Low-Achieving Public Secondary School Teachers in Islamabad ................. 230
  4.5.6 Descriptive Statistics (Means and Standard Deviations) on Organizational Commitment for High-Achieving and Low-Achieving Public Secondary School Teachers in Islamabad ........ 234
  4.5.7 Descriptive Statistics (Frequencies and Percentages) on Professional Commitment Scale for High-Achieving Public Secondary School Teachers in Islamabad ...................... 240
  4.5.8 Descriptive Statistics (Frequencies and Percentages) on Professional Commitment Scale for Low-Achieving Public Secondary School Teachers in Islamabad ...................... 245
  4.5.9 Descriptive Statistics (Means and Standard Deviations) on Professional Commitment for High-Achieving and Low-Achieving Public Secondary School Teachers in Islamabad ........ 249
4.6 Descriptive Statistics for Male and Female Secondary School Teachers in Islamabad ................................................. 254
4.7 Descriptive Statistics for Teachers with Different Levels of Educational Attainment ..................................................... 257
4.8 Descriptive Statistics for Teachers with Different Levels of Professional Experience ...................................................... 261
4.9 Impact of Teacher Collegiality on Organizational Commitment and Professional Commitment in High-Achieving and Low-Achieving Public Secondary School Teachers in Islamabad – (Results of Research Question 1 and 2) ................................................................. 264
4.11.6 Effects of Educational Qualification on Professional Commitment

4.11.6.1 Tests of Homoscedasticity

4.11.6.2 Results of MANOVA and One-way ANOVA

4.11.6.3 Results of Post Hoc Analysis

4.11.7 Effects of Professional Experience on Teacher Collegiality

4.11.7.1 Tests of Homoscedasticity

4.11.7.2 Results of MANOVA and One-way ANOVA

4.11.7.3 Results of Post Hoc Analysis

4.11.8 Effects of Professional Experience on Organizational Commitment

4.11.8.1 Tests of Homoscedasticity

4.11.8.2 Results of MANOVA and One-way ANOVA

4.11.8.3 Results of Post Hoc Analysis

4.11.9 Effects of Professional Experience on Professional Commitment

4.11.9.1 Tests of Homoscedasticity

4.11.9.2 Results of MANOVA and One-way ANOVA

4.11.9.3 Results of Post Hoc Analysis

4.12 Summary

CHAPTER 5 SUMMARY, IMPLICATIONS, AND CONCLUSION

5.1 Introduction

5.2 Summary of Major Findings and Discussion

5.3 Implications and Suggestions

5.3.1 Theoretical Implications

5.3.2 Practical Implications

5.4 Limitations and Delimitations of the Study

5.5 Recommendations for Further Research

5.6 Conclusion

REFERENCES
Table 2.1  Collaborative Cultures and Contrived Collegiality (From Hargreaves, 1994) ................................................................. 54
Table 2.2  Characteristics of Learning Impoverished and Learning Enriched Schools ................................................................. 59
Table 2.3  Factors Affecting Teacher Collegiality ............................... 87
Table 2.4  Outcomes of Teacher Collegiality ..................................... 88
Table 2.5  Antecedents of Organizational Commitment ..................... 111
Table 2.6  Outcomes of Organizational Commitment ....................... 119
Table 2.7  Antecedents of Professional Commitment ....................... 145
Table 2.8  Outcomes of Professional Commitment ............................ 149
Table 3.1  Results of KMO and Bartlett’s Test ................................. 175
Table 3.2  Factor Loadings for Teacher Collegiality Scale (TCS) .......... 177
Table 3.3  Internal Reliability of Teacher Collegiality Subscales ........... 182
Table 4.1  Multivariate Outliers and their Respective Mahalanobis $D^2$ Values ................................................................................. 195
Table 4.2  Internal Reliability of Teacher Collegiality Scale ............... 197
Table 4.3  Internal Reliability of Organizational Commitment Scale .... 198
Table 4.4  Internal Reliability of Professional Commitment Scale ...... 198
Table 4.5  Demographic Features of Survey Respondents ................. 199
Table 4.6  Frequencies and Percentages for Teacher Collegiality Scale (High-Achieving Schools) ..................................................... 202
Table 4.7  Frequencies and Percentages for Teacher Collegiality Scale (Low-Achieving Schools) ..................................................... 210
Table 4.8  Means and Standard Deviations of Teacher Collegiality Scale for High-Achieving and Low-Achieving Secondary Schools .......... 217
Table 4.9  Frequencies and Percentages for Organizational Commitment Scale (High-Achieving Schools) ................................. 227

Table 4.10  Frequencies and Percentages for Organizational Commitment Scale (Low-Achieving Schools) ................................. 231

Table 4.11  Means and Standard Deviations of Organizational Commitment Scale for High-Achieving and Low-Achieving Secondary Schools .................................................................................. 235

Table 4.12  Frequencies and Percentages for Professional Commitment Scale (High-Achieving Schools) ................................. 242

Table 4.13  Frequencies and Percentages for Professional Commitment Scale (Low-Achieving Schools) ................................. 246

Table 4.14  Means and Standard Deviations of Professional Commitment Scale for High-Achieving and Low-Achieving Secondary Schools ................................................................. 250

Table 4.15  Descriptive Analysis of Data on Teacher Collegiality Scale for Male and Female Secondary School Teachers .................................................. 255

Table 4.16  Descriptive Analysis of Data on Organizational Commitment Scale for Male and Female Secondary School Teachers .............................................. 256

Table 4.17  Descriptive Analysis of Data on Professional Commitment Scale for Male and Female Secondary School Teachers .............................................. 256

Table 4.18  Descriptive Analysis of Data on Teacher Collegiality Scale for Teachers with Different Educational Levels .................................................. 258

Table 4.19  Descriptive Analysis of Data on Organizational Commitment Scale for Teachers with Different Educational Levels .................................................. 259

Table 4.20  Descriptive Analysis of Data on Professional Commitment Scale for Teachers with Different Educational Levels .................................................. 260

Table 4.21  Descriptive Analysis of Data on Teacher Collegiality Scale for Teachers with Different Levels of Professional Experience .............................................. 262

Table 4.22  Descriptive Analysis of Data on Organizational Commitment Scale for Teachers with Different Levels of Professional Experience .............................................. 263

Table 4.23  Descriptive Analysis of Data on Professional Commitment Scale for Teachers with Different Levels of Professional Experience .............................................. 263
Table 4.24  CFA Model Summary .......................................................... 267
Table 4.25  Variable Counts for CFA Model ........................................... 268
Table 4.26  Parameter Summary .......................................................... 269
Table 4.27  List of Observed and Unobserved Endogenous Variables ........ 271
Table 4.28  List of Unobserved Exogenous Variables ............................. 272
Table 4.29  Covariances in CFA Model ............................................... 275
Table 4.30  Correlations in CFA Model ............................................... 275
Table 4.31  GOF Statistics for Measurement Model ............................... 279
Table 4.32  Fit Indices for Measurement Model ..................................... 280
Table 4.33  Modified Measurement Model Summary ............................ 288
Table 4.34  Variable Counts for Modified Measurement Model ............... 289
Table 4.35  Parameter Summary for Modified Measurement Model .......... 290
Table 4.36  Fit Indices for Modified Measurement Model ....................... 291
Table 4.37  Fit Indices for Structural Model ......................................... 294
Table 4.38  Multi-group Configural Model Summary ............................ 298
Table 4.39  GOF Statistics for Multi-group Configural Model ................. 298
Table 4.40  Invariance Tests for High-Achieving Versus Low-Achieving School Teachers ................................................................. 302
Table 4.41  GOF Statistics for Configural Model ................................... 305
Table 4.42  Structured Means Model Summary .................................... 309
Table 4.43  Invariance Tests for Configural, Measurement, and Structured Means Models ................................................................. 310
Table 4.44  Latent Mean Estimates for Structured Means Model: (High-Achieving School Teachers) ......................................................... 313
Table 4.45  Descriptive Statistics of Teacher Collegiality Scale for Male and Female Teachers  .......................................................... 317

Table 4.46  Multivariate Test of Homoscedasticity for Gender on Teacher Collegiality  ................................................................. 319

Table 4.47  Univariate Test of Homoscedasticity for Gender on Teacher Collegiality  ................................................................. 319

Table 4.48  Multivariate Tests for Gender Differences in Teacher Collegiality Scale  ................................................................. 321

Table 4.49  Univariate Tests for Gender Differences in Teacher Collegiality Scale  ................................................................. 322

Table 4.50  Descriptive Statistics of Organizational Commitment Scale for Male and Female Teachers  ............................................. 323

Table 4.51  Multivariate Test of Homoscedasticity for Gender on Organizational Commitment  .................................................. 324

Table 4.52  Univariate Tests of Homoscedasticity for Gender on Organizational Commitment  .................................................. 325

Table 4.53  Multivariate Tests for Gender Differences in Organizational Commitment Scale  .................................................. 326

Table 4.54  Univariate Tests for Gender Differences in Organizational Commitment Scale  .................................................. 327

Table 4.55  Descriptive Statistics of Professional Commitment Scale for Male and Female Teachers  ............................................. 328

Table 4.56  Multivariate Tests of Homoscedasticity for Gender on Professional Commitment  .................................................. 329

Table 4.57  Univariate Tests of Homoscedasticity for Gender on Professional Commitment  .................................................. 329

Table 4.58  Multivariate Tests for Gender Differences in Professional Commitment Scale  .................................................. 330

Table 4.59  Univariate Tests for Gender Differences in Professional Commitment Scale  .................................................. 331
Table 4.60  Descriptive Statistics of Teacher Collegiality Scale for Teachers with Different Educational Level ................................. 333

Table 4.61  Multivariate Tests of Homoscedasticity for Educational Qualification on Teacher Collegiality ......................................................... 334

Table 4.62  Univariate Tests of Homoscedasticity for Educational Qualification on Teacher Collegiality ......................................................... 335

Table 4.63  Multivariate Tests for Educational Level Differences in Teacher Collegiality Scale ................................................................................. 336

Table 4.64  Univariate Tests for Educational Level Differences in Teacher Collegiality Scale ................................................................................. 337

Table 4.65  Post Hoc Comparisons for Teacher Collegiality Scale across Groups with Different Educational Levels ................................................. 339

Table 4.66  Descriptive Statistics of Organizational Commitment Scale for Teachers with Different Educational Level ................................. 341

Table 4.67  Multivariate Tests of Homoscedasticity for Educational Qualification on Organizational Commitment ......................................................... 342

Table 4.68  Univariate Tests of Homoscedasticity for Educational Qualification on Organizational Commitment ......................................................... 342

Table 4.69  Multivariate Tests for Educational Level Differences in Organizational Commitment Scale ................................................................................. 344

Table 4.70  Univariate Tests for Educational Level Differences in Organizational Commitment Scale ................................................................................. 345

Table 4.71  Post Hoc Comparisons for Organizational Commitment Scale across Groups with Different Educational Levels ................................................. 346

Table 4.72  Descriptive Statistics of Professional Commitment Scale for Teachers with Different Educational Level ................................. 348

Table 4.73  Multivariate Tests of Homoscedasticity for Educational Qualification on Professional Commitment ......................................................... 349

Table 4.74  Univariate Tests of Homoscedasticity for Educational Qualification on Professional Commitment ......................................................... 349
Table 4.75  Multivariate Tests for Educational Level Differences in Professional Commitment Scale ................................................................. 350

Table 4.76  Univariate Tests for Educational Level Differences in Professional Commitment Scale ................................................................. 351

Table 4.77  Post Hoc Comparisons for Professional Commitment Scale across Groups with Different Educational Levels ................................. 352

Table 4.78  Descriptive Statistics of Teacher Collegiality Scale for Teachers with Different Levels of Professional Experience ................................ 353

Table 4.79  Multivariate Tests of Homoscedasticity for Professional Experience on Teacher Collegiality ............................................................. 356

Table 4.80  Univariate Tests of Homoscedasticity for Professional Experience on Teacher Collegiality ............................................................. 357

Table 4.81  Multivariate Tests for Experience Level Differences in Teacher Collegiality Scale ........................................................................... 358

Table 4.82  Univariate Tests for Experience Level Differences in Teacher Collegiality Scale ........................................................................... 359

Table 4.83  Post Hoc Comparisons for Teacher Collegiality Scale across Groups with Different Levels of Professional Experience .................. 361

Table 4.84  Descriptive Statistics of Organizational Commitment Scale for Teachers with Different Level of Professional Experience .................. 367

Table 4.85  Multivariate Tests of Homoscedasticity for Professional Experience on Organizational Commitment ..................................................... 369

Table 4.86  Univariate Tests of Homoscedasticity for Professional Experience on Organizational Commitment ..................................................... 369

Table 4.87  Multivariate Tests for Experience Level Differences in Organizational Commitment Scale ............................................................... 370

Table 4.88  Univariate Tests for Experience Level Differences in Organizational Commitment Scale ............................................................... 371

Table 4.89  Post Hoc Comparisons for Organizational Commitment Scale across Groups with Different Levels of Professional Experience ........... 373
Table 4.90  Descriptive Statistics of Professional Commitment Scale for Teachers with Different Levels of Professional Experience  ………………… 376

Table 4.91  Multivariate Tests of Homoscedasticity for Professional Experience on Professional Commitment  ………………………………… 377

Table 4.92  Univariate Tests of Homoscedasticity for Professional Experience on Professional Commitment  ………………………………… 378

Table 4.93  Multivariate Tests for Experience Level Differences in Professional Commitment Scale  ……………………………………… 379

Table 4.94  Univariate Tests for Experience Level Differences in Professional Commitment Scale  ……………………………………… 380

Table 4.95  Post Hoc Comparisons for Professional Commitment Scale across Groups with Different Levels of Professional Experience  ………………… 381
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1   Little’s Descriptive Model - A Provisional Continuum of Joint Relations (Adapted from Little, 1990) ................................................................. 40

Figure 2.2   Little’s Indicators of Collegiality and Joint Work (From Little, 1990) ............................................................. ................................................................. 42

Figure 3.1   Conceptual Framework of the Study ........................................... 157

Figure 3.2   Factor Scree Plot ................................................................. 176

Figure 4.1   CFA Model with Standardized Estimates ................................. 277

Figure 4.2   Modified Measurement Model with Standardized Estimates ..... 287

Figure 4.3   Structural Model with Standardized Estimates ...................... 293

Figure 4.4   Structural Model with Standardized Estimates for High- Achieving School Teachers ............................................................ 299

Figure 4.5   Structural Model with Standardized Estimates for Low- Achieving School Teachers ............................................................ 299

Figure 4.6   Standardized Estimates for High-Achieving School Teachers ... 306

Figure 4.7   Standardized Estimates for Low-Achieving School Teachers .... 306
# LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix A. Structure of the Education System in Pakistan (Formal only) .. 474  
Appendix B. A Survey on Teacher Collegiality and Commitment ............ 475  
Appendix C. Skewness and Kurtosis of Observed Variables ................. 484  
Appendix D. Unstandardized Regression Weights of CFA Model .......... 489  
Appendix E. Standardized Regression Weights of CFA Model ............ 494  
Appendix F. Variances in CFA Model ........................................ 499  
Appendix G. Permission Letters .................................................. 504