

EXPLICIT STRATEGY-INSTRUCTION
AND THE DEVELOPMENT OF
HIGHER-ORDER THINKING SKILLS
IN READING COMPREHENSION
IN A PRIMARY ESL CLASSROOM

SAW BENG HONG

INSTITUTE OF GRADUATE STUDIES
UNIVERSITY OF MALAYA
KUALA LUMPUR

2012

EXPLICIT STRATEGY-INSTRUCTION
AND THE DEVELOPMENT OF
HIGHER-ORDER THINKING SKILLS
IN READING COMPREHENSION
IN A PRIMARY ESL CLASSROOM

SAW BENG HONG

RESEARCH REPORT SUBMITTED TO THE FACULTY OF LANGUAGES AND
LINGUISTICS UNIVERSITY OF MALAYA, IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE
REQUIREMENT FOR THE DEGREE OF MASTER IN LINGUISTICS

2012

UNIVERSITI MALAYA

ORIGINAL LITERARY WORK DECLARATION

Name of Candidate: **SAW BENG HONG**
5690)

(I.C/Passport No: **591031-08-**

Registration/Matric No.: **TGC 070039**

Name of Degree: **MASTER IN LINGUISTICS**

Title of Project Paper/ Research Report/ Dissertation/ Thesis ("this Work"):

**EXPLICIT STRATEGY-INSTRUCTION AND THE DEVELOPMENT OF HIGHER-ORDER THINKING SKILLS
IN READING COMPREHENSION**

Field of Study: **READING**

I do solemnly and sincerely declare that:

- (1) I am the sole author/writer of this Work;
- (2) This Work is original;
- (3) Any use of any work in which copyright exists was done by way of fair dealing and for permitted purposes and any excerpt or extract from, or reference to or reproduction of any copyright work has been disclosed expressly and sufficiently and the title of the Work and its authorship have been acknowledged in this Work;
- (4) I do not have any actual knowledge nor do I ought reasonably to know that the making of this work constitutes an infringement or any copyright work;
- (5) I hereby assign all and every rights in the copyright to this Work to the University of Malaya ("UM"), who henceforth shall be owner of the copyright in this Work and that any reproduction or use in any form or by any means whatsoever is prohibited without the written consent of UM having been first had and obtained;
- (6) I am fully aware that if in the course of making this Work I have infringed any copyright whether intentionally or otherwise, I may be subject to legal action or any other action as may be determined by UM.

Candidate's Signature

Date

Subscribed and solemnly declared before,

Witness's Signature

Date

Name: **DR. EVELYN KHOR**

Designation: **SUPERVISOR**

Abstract

Effective reading instruction in the early grades is the key to creating strong, competent readers. Hence, explicit strategy-instruction can be seen as a powerful student-centred approach to develop good learners to engage in divergent thinking. This study was conducted to look into the efficacy of explicit strategy-instruction in reading to develop the higher-order thinking skills in a year-four primary classroom. The focus of the study was on higher-order thinking skills such as predicting, inferencing and personal response. The materials used were from children's year-four textbooks and literature books supplied by the Curriculum Development Centre of Malaysia. This was carried out to ensure adherence to curriculum guidelines as well as for ease and effectiveness of implementation in the language classroom. Collection of data was through interviews, questionnaires, participant observation, written responses as well as results of pre and post intervention reading tests. The Critical Reading Inventory test was administered to measure participants' critical reading ability pre and post intervention of explicit strategy-instruction. Reading lessons were purposely tailored to create opportunities to enable participants to apply strategies taught. The gains in critical reading ability were assessed based on pre and post reading tests. Results from interviews, questionnaires, participants' written responses, reading tests revealed that participants critical reading ability did improve in a significant way post intervention of explicit strategy-instruction. To conclude the study is a discussion on the limitations of the study, implications of the study, implications of the study to teachers and also implications for future research.

Abstrak

Keberkesanan amalan membaca pada masa awal sekolah merupakan kunci untuk memperkukuhkan kemahiran membaca. Seterusnya, pengajaran strategi membaca secara eksplisit adalah satu pendekatan yang bukan hanya berpusat murid tetapi juga dapat membimbing murid untuk befikir secara divergen. Kajian ini bertujuan untuk mengenal pasti keberkesanan pengajaran strategi membaca secara eksplisit untuk meningkatkan pencapaian murid dalam pemahaman Bahasa Inggeris di sebuah kelas tahun empat. Fokus kajian ialah kemahiran berfikir aras tinggi secara meramal, inferensi dan merespon secara individu. Penggunaan bahan pengajaran adalah dari buku teks dan buku sastera yang dibekalkan oleh Pusat Perkembangan Kurikulum Malaysia untuk memastikan keabadian pada huraian rancangan mengajar dan juga untuk memanfaatkan pelaksanaannya di dalam bilikdarjah. Analisis data dikumpul melalui temuduga, soal-selidik, pemerhatian dan ujian inventori bacaan secara kritis pra dan pos intervensi. Latihan pemahaman direka supaya sampel kajian dapat mengaplikasikan strategi-strategi membaca yang telah diajar secara eksplisit. Peningkatan tahap membaca dinilai dari keputusan pos ujian inventori bacaan. Hasil kajian dari instrumen menunjukkan satu peningkatan yang signifikan dalam tahap membaca secara kritis. Kesimpulan diakhiri dengan perbincangan had kajian, implikasi kepada warga pendidik dan tindakan susulan untuk masa depan.

Acknowledgements

It has taken me a while in completing this report and finally I have accomplished it but only with the love and understanding of all those beautiful people around me. First, I would like to express my deepest appreciation to my supervisor, Dr. Evelyn Khor, for her constant guidance and advice. My sincere gratitude to my family for their patience and support without which my research would not have been possible.

Table of Contents

Original Literary Work Declaration	ii
Abstract	iii
Abstrak	iv
Acknowledgements	v
Table of Contents	vi
List of Figures	x
List of Tables	xi
List of Diagrams	xii
List of Appendices	xiii
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
1.1 Overview	1
1.2 Reading Comprehension	2
1.3 Higher-Order Thinking in Relation to Reading Comprehension	4
1.4 Explicit Strategy-Instruction Involving Higher-Order Thinking Skills in Real Reading	6
1.5 Background to the Study	7
1.6 Statement of the Problem	10
1.7 Research Objective	11
1.8 Research Questions	11
1.9 Purpose of the Study	12
1.10 Significance of the Study	12
1.11 Limitations of the Study	13
Chapter 2: Review of Related Literature	14
2.1 Introduction	14
2.2 Cognitive Learning	15
2.3 Past Studies	16
2.4 Use of Questioning Strategies in Reading Comprehension	19
2.5 Teachers' Knowledge of Higher-Order Thinking Skills	22
2.6 Classroom Practice in Building Higher-Order Thinking Skills	27
2.7 Conclusion	29
Chapter 3: Methodology	30
3.1 Introduction	30
3.2 The Research Approach	31

3.3 The Research Setting	32
3.4 The Participants	32
3.5 Ethical Considerations	33
3.6 Critical Reading Inventory	34
3.7 Measures Used in Critical Reading Inventory	35
3.8 Scoring in Critical Reading Inventory	36
3.8.1 Text-Based Items	36
3.8.2 Inference Items	36
3.8.3 Critical Response Items	37
3.9 Follow-Up Questions	37
3.10 Pre-Intervention Stage - Critical Reading Test	37
3.10.1 Administering the Critical Reading Inventory	38
3.10.2 Graded Word List	38
3.10.3 Critical Reading Inventory Test	39
3.11 Nuttall's Reading Taxonomy	40
3.12 The Reading Comprehension Test	41
3.13 The Process of Explicit Strategy-Instruction	42
3.13.1 Explicit Strategy-Instruction in Reading Comprehension	43
3.13.2 Pre Reading	44
3.13.3 While Reading	45
3.13.4 Post Reading	46
3.14 Summary of Activities During Explicit Strategy-Instruction of the Stories	47
3.14.1 Text 1 - Yusuf	47
3.14.2 Text 2 - Elves and the Shoemaker	48
3.14.3 Text 3 - Grasshopper in Trouble	49
3.14.4 Text 4 - Devi and the Stranger	49
3.14.5 Text 5 - The Perfect Present	49
3.14.6 Text 6 - The Frog	50
3.14.7 Text 7 - Raven Boy	50
3.15 Post-Intervention Stage Reading Tests	50
3.15.1 The Critical Reading Inventory	51
3.15.2 Reading Comprehension Test	51
3.16 Data Collection and Analysis Procedures	51
3.17 Participant Observation	51

3.18 Interviews	52
3.18.1 Interview with Participants' Parents	52
3.18.2 Interview with Participants	53
3.19 Participants' Questionnaire	53
3.20 Teachers' Questionnaire	53
3.21 Students' Response During Explicit Strategy-Instruction of Reading Comprehension Lessons	54
3.22 Data Analysis	54
3.23 Summary	55
Chapter 4: Findings	56
4.1 Introduction	56
4.2 Findings from Interviews	57
4.2.1 Interview with Participants' Parents	57
4.2.1.1 Language of Communication	57
4.2.1.2 Participants' Leisure Activities	58
4.2.1.3 Participants' Inquisitiveness	59
4.2.2 Interview with Participants	59
4.2.2.1 Reading as a Pastime	60
4.2.2.2 Reading Preference	60
4.2.2.3 Ability to Read Independently	61
4.2.2.4 Guidance in Reading	62
4.2.2.5 Asking Questions as a Reading Strategy	62
4.2.3 Feedback from Interview	63
4.3 Findings from Questionnaires to Participants' Parents	64
4.3.1 Reading Preference	64
4.3.2 Reading Habits	65
4.3.3 Higher-Order Thinking and Reading Skills	66
4.4 Findings on Teacher's Perception of HOT skills	67
4.4.1 Encouraging Teacher-Student Dialogue	68
4.4.2 Encouraging the Use of Open-Ended Questions - 'why', 'how'	68
4.4.3 Encouraging Students to Give Their Opinion	69
4.4.4 Using Questions which Encourage HOT skills	69
4.4.5 Encourage Students to Evaluate What They Have Read	69
4.4.6 Employing the Use of Wait Time	70

4.4.7 Use of Divergent Thinking Terminology	70
4.4.8 Findings From Teacher's Questionnaire	71
4.5 Results of Pre Intervention Critical Reading Inventory Test Scores	73
4.6 Results of Pre Intervention Reading Comprehension Test	74
4.7 Participants' Response to Higher-Thinking Questions in Reading Tests	75
4.8 Explicit Strategy-Instruction Intervention to Develop HOT skills	77
4.8.1 Predicting	77
4.8.2 Inferencing	80
4.8.3 Critically Responding to Text	86
4.8.4 Synthesizing of Strategies	89
4.9 Findings of CRI Test Post Explicit-Strategy Instruction	91
4.10 Findings of Reading Comprehension Test Post Explicit-Strategy Instruction	93
4.11 Comparison of CRI Tests Pre and Post Explicit-Strategy Instruction	94
4.12 Comparison of Reading Comprehension Tests Pre and Post Explicit-Strategy Instruction	96
Chapter 5: Conclusion	99
5.1 Introduction	99
5.2 Summary and Discussion of Findings	100
5.3 Classroom Observation	101
5.4 Limitations of the Study	105
5.5 Implications for Teaching	106
5.6 Implications of the Study	109
5.7 Implications for Future Research	111
5.8 Conclusion	113
References	114
Appendices	120

List of Figures

Figure 3.1 Framework to study the impact of explicit strategy-instruction during reading comprehension lessons	31
Figure 3.2 Use of CRI and Nuttall's Reading Taxonomy in the Preparation of Tests and Tasks	34
Figure 3.3 Reading tests at pre intervention stage	37
Figure 3.4 Pre intervention stage - administering the CRI One-to-one session	39
Figure 3.5 Summary of explicit strategy-instruction during reading comprehension lessons	44
Figure 3.6 Steps in explicit strategy-instruction during pre reading	45
Figure 4.1 Results of pre explicit-strategy instruction Critical Reading Inventory test scores	95
Figure 4.2 Results of post explicit-strategy instruction Critical Reading Inventory test scores	95
Figure 4.3 Results of pre explicit strategy-instruction reading comprehension test scores	96
Figure 4.4 Results of post explicit strategy-instruction reading comprehension test scores	97

List of Tables

Table 3.1 Question Types in Critical Reading Inventory	.35
Table 3.2 Types of pre intervention CRI questions	40
Table 3.3 Rationale and summary of texts used in explicit strategy-instruction	.43
Table 4.1 Reading habits of parents	65
Table 4.2 Parents' perceptions regarding higher-order thinking in reading	66
Table 4.3 Breakdown of questions in the pre Critical Reading Inventory	73
Table 4.4 Results of pre intervention Critical Reading Inventory	74
Table 4.5 Breakdown of questions for the pre reading comprehension test	.74
Table 4.6 Results of pre intervention reading comprehension test	.75
Table 4.7 Breakdown of questions in the post Critical Reading Inventory	91
Table 4.8 Results of CRI pre and post explicit-strategy instruction	92
Table 4.9 Breakdown of questions for reading comprehension test	93
Table 4.10 Pre and post intervention reading comprehension test scores	94

List of Diagrams

Diagram 4.1 Participants' language of communication at home	57
Diagram 4.2 Participants' activities during their free time	58
Diagram 4.3 Parents responses as to whether their children ask questions when in doubt	59
Diagram 4.4 Participants' preference in reading	61
Diagram 4.5 Participants' ability to read independently	61
Diagram 4.6 Parental guidance in reading	62
Diagram 4.7 Questioning as a reading strategy	62
Diagram 4.8 Reading preference of participants' parents	64

List of Appendices

Appendix A (Word List)	120
Appendix B (The Baker)	121
Appendix C (Scoring Comprehension Questions)	123
Appendix D (Nuttall Reading Framework for Questions)	125
Appendix E (Yusuf)	126
Appendix F (Stories and Tasks)	128
Appendix F (i) (Yusuf)	129
Appendix F (ii) (The Elves and the Shoemaker)	140
Appendix F (iii) (Grasshopper in Trouble)	142
Appendix F (iv) (Devi)	143
Appendix F (v) (The Perfect Present)	147
Appendix F (vi) (The Three Sons)	149
Appendix F (vii) (The Raven Boy)	156
Appendix G (Word List)	164
Appendix H (Fish)	165
Appendix I (Just Draw)	167
Appendix J (Interview with Participants' Parents)	171
Appendix K (Interview with Participants)	172
Appendix L (Questionnaire)	173
Appendix M (Classroom Practice)	177
Appendix N (Pre-Intervention CRI – Baker)	178
Appendix O (Pre-Intervention Reading Comprehension Test – Yusuf)	179
Appendix P (Post-test CRI – Fish)	180
Appendix Q (Intervention Reading Comprehension – Just Draw)	181
Appendix R (T tests)	182