INVESTIGATING YOUNG ESL LEARNERS’ COMPREHENSION OF STORIES SITUATED IN NATIVE AND NON-NATIVE CULTURES

SAWITTRI SHOTIWUTH CHARUN

DISsertation submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of master of English as a second language

FACULTY OF LANGUAGES AND LINGUISTICS UNIVERSITY OF MALAYA KUALA LUMPUR

2011
UNIVERSITI MALAYA

ORIGINAL LITERARY WORK DECLARATION

Name of Candidate:  Sawittri Shotiwuth a/p Charun  (I.C/Passport No: 840324-02-5194)
Registration/Matric No:  TGB080066
Name of Degree:  Masters in English as a Second Language

Title of Dissertation (“this Work”):
Investigating Young ESL Learners’ Comprehension of Stories Situated in Native and Native Cultures

Field of Study:  Applied Linguistics

I do solemnly and sincerely declare that:

(1) I am the sole author/writer of this Work;

(2) This Work is original;

(3) Any use of any work in which copyright exists was done by way of fair dealing and for permitted purposes and any excerpt or extract from, or reference to or reproduction of any copyright work has been disclosed expressly and sufficiently and the title of the Work and its authorship have been acknowledged in this Work;

(4) I do not have any actual knowledge nor do I ought reasonably to know that the making of this work constitutes an infringement of any copyright work;

(5) I hereby assign all and every rights in the copyright to this Work to the University of Malaya (“UM”), who henceforth shall be owner of the copyright in this Work and that any reproduction or use in any form or by any means whatsoever is prohibited without the written consent of UM having been first had and obtained;

(6) I am fully aware that if in the course of making this Work I have infringed any copyright whether intentionally or otherwise, I may be subject to legal action or any other action as may be determined by UM.

Candidate’s Signature  

Date:

Subscribed and solemnly declared before,

Witness’s Signature  

Date:
Name:  Assoc. Prof. Dr. Mohana K. Nambiar
Designation:  Supervisor
Children’s literature has long been regarded as appropriate and engaging materials for teaching language to young learners. Teachers of English as a second language (ESL) have found narrative texts to be effective in building language and comprehension skills. A massive volume of children’s literature, however, are produced for the native speakers in mind, thus bearing cultural references and settings that may be unfamiliar to non-native speakers. Viewed from the Schema Theory perspective – which holds that comprehension of texts is made possible through existing mental frameworks – the lack of familiarity with the culture upon which a story is situated may result in comprehension being more difficult to achieve. This is especially so when young readers with little engagement with non-native cultures read culture-laden narrative texts.

In response to this issue, this study explores the extent to which culturally-acquired prior knowledge affects young ESL learners’ comprehension of narrative texts situated in native and non-native cultures. 21 Year 3 pupils from a Tamil vernacular primary school in Sungai Buloh, Selangor, Malaysia read two narrative texts situated in non-native cultures (Roman-Catholic Filipino and Great Plains Indians) and one narrative text situated in native culture (Malaysian Hindu Indian). Participants’ level of comprehension for each text was measured through written comprehension tests and verbal story retelling tasks.
Transcripts from the story retelling task were analysed for inaccuracies in comprehension. The inaccuracies were then categorized and checked for possible causes. Finally, to check the value of story retelling task as a comprehension assessment tool, scores from the story retelling task and scores from the comprehension tests were checked for correlations.

Overall, participants scored higher in the comprehension test based on the text situated in the native culture. Scores from the story retelling task also confirmed that participants had more sophisticated comprehension of the narrative text situated in the native culture. While retelling the texts, participants made inaccuracies that appeared as enhancements, alterations, substitutions and omissions. The retellings of the narrative text situated in the Roman-Catholic Filipino culture bore the most number of inaccuracies while the retellings of the narrative text situated in the Great Plains Indian culture were significantly shorter than the retellings of the other two texts. When scores from the comprehension tests were compared against scores from the retelling task, a significant correlation was found, suggesting that in assessing the comprehension of culture-laden narrative texts, story retelling may be used as an alternative method of assessment.
ABSTRAK


Kajian ini bertujuan menyiasat sejauh mana pengetahuan budaya mempengaruhi tahap pemahaman kanak-kanak akan teks berbentuk cerita yang berlatarbelakangkan budaya jati dan budaya asing. 21 orang murid Tahun 3 daripada sebuah sekolah jenis kebangsaan (Tamil) di Sungai Buloh membaca dua buah cerita pendek yang berlatarbelakangkan budaya asing iaitu budaya Filipina Roman-Katolik dan budaya Great Plains Indians dan satu cerita pendek yang berlatarbelakangkan budaya jati iaitu budaya kaum India beragama Hindu di Malaysia.

Tahap pemahaman peserta kajian diukur melalui tiga ujian pemahaman dan tiga aktiviti bercerita semula. Ketidaktepatan di dalam pemahaman cerita-cerita yang dibaca dikenalpasti melalui transkrip aktiviti bercerita semula dan dikategorikan sebelum dikenalpasti punca-puncanya.
Akhir sekali, untuk memastikan keberkesanan aktiviti bercerita sebagai instrumen penilaian tahap pemahaman teks berbentuk cerita, perhubungan di antara markah ujian pemahaman dan markah daripada aktiviti bercerita semula disemak.

Secara keseluruhan, peserta kajian menunjukkan pencapaian yang lebih tinggi di dalam ujian pemahaman serta aktiviti bercerita semula bagi teks cerita yang berlatarbelakangkan budaya jati. Di dalam aktiviti bercerita semula, ketidaktepatan di dalam pemahaman dikenalpasti sebagai ketidaktepatan yang berbentuk penambahbaikan, pengubahsuaian, penggantian dan pengabaian jalan cerita.

Ketidaktepatan di dalam pemahaman paling kerap dikenalpasti semasa aktiviti bercerita menggunakan teks cerita yang berlatarbelakangkan budaya Filipina Roman Katolik manakala penceritaan semula teks cerita yang berlatarbelakangkan budaya Great Plains Indian adalah jauh lebih singkat daripada penceritaan semula menggunakan teks-teks yang lain. Apabila kesemua markah ujian pemahaman dan aktiviti bercerita semula dinilai, suatu perhubungan jelas kelihatan di antara pencapaian di dalam ujian pemahaman dan pencapaian di dalam aktiviti bercerita semula. Ini menunjukkan bahawa bagi penilaian pemahaman teks berbentuk cerita yang mengandungi banyak unsur budaya, aktiviti bercerita semula boleh digunakan sebagai instrumen penilaian alternatif.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

To acquire the habit of reading is to construct for yourself a refuge from almost all the miseries of life. ~W. Somerset Maugham

I would like to thank my supervisor, Associate Prof. Dr. Mohana Kumari Nambiar for her guidance and words of encouragement. To my parents, Charun Nai Kuan and Som Porng Boon Leong, thank you for helping me discover the wonders of storybooks and for nurturing my love for reading. To my fellow IPBA alumni especially Ms. Tasneem Muhammad, Ms. Nurul Akmal Farid and Ms. Lee Poh Lin, thank you for your constant support. May we continue to be rewarded with stories of success in our classrooms. To my colleagues at Sekolah Jenis Kebangsaan (Tamil) Saraswathy, Sungai Buloh, thank you for having taught me many valuable lessons on teaching. Finally, to my partner and bestfriend, Roobaganesan Paramanathan, thank you for always believing in my dreams. Your faith in me has made a lot of differences.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract iii
Acknowledgements vii
List of Tables xii
List of Appendices xiii

Chapter 1: Introduction

1.0 Background 1
1.1 The Teaching of English in Malaysia 4
1.2 Reading Comprehension: Where Are Meanings Hidden? 6
  1.2.1 Variables Affecting Reading Comprehension 8
1.3 Culture in Language Learning 12
  1.3.1 Culturally- Relevant Pedagogy 14
  1.3.2 Culturally- Diverse Texts 16
1.4 Statement of Problem 19
1.5 Statement of Purpose 20
1.6 Research Questions 21
1.7 Definitions
  1.7.1 Native and Non-Native Cultures 21
  1.7.2 Narrative Texts 22
  1.7.3 Prior Knowledge 22
  1.7.4 Comprehension 22
1.8 Significance of Study 23
1.9 Scope and Limitations 23
1.10 Conclusion 25

Chapter 2: Literature Review

2.0 Introduction 26
2.1 Views on Reading 26
2.2 Reading Comprehension as Extraction and Construction of Meaning 29
2.3 Development of Reading Comprehension: Schema Theory 30
2.4 Influences of Culturally-Acquired Prior Knowledge on Reading Comprehension 34
2.5 Children’s Literature as Language Learning Resource 40
2.6 Story Retelling as Comprehension Assessment 44
2.7 Conclusion 46

Chapter 3: Methodology

3.0 Introduction 47
3.1 Design 47
3.2 Research Questions 49
3.3 Theoretical Framework 50
3.4 Hypothesis 51
3.5 Materials 52
3.6 Instruments
   3.6.1 Prior Knowledge Assessment 57
   3.6.2 Comprehension Test 58
   3.6.3 Story Retelling Assessment 60
3.7 Participants 61
3.8 Procedure
   3.8.1 Piloting 63
   3.8.2 Data Collection
      3.8.2.1 Practice Session 64
      3.8.2.2 Task 1: Prior Knowledge Assessment 65
      3.8.2.3 Task 2: Reading and Retelling 66
      3.8.2.4 Task 3: Comprehension Assessment 67
3.9 Data Analysis
   3.9.1 Analysis of Comprehension Test Scores 68
   3.9.2 Analysis of Story Retelling Scores 69
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>The Extent to Which Story Retelling Scores Correlate With</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Comprehension Test Scores</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>The Significance of Cultural Settings in Narrative Texts</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>Reading Comprehension as an Interactive Process</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>Implications</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>Suggestions for Future Research</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Appendices 122
References 152
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1: Time Allocated for the Teaching of English in SK and SJK Schools 5

Table 3.1: Description of Texts 53

Table 3.2: Themes, Main Characters and Story Events in Texts 55

Table 3.3: Mark Allocation for Story Retelling Assessment 69

Table 4.1: Means and Standard Deviations of Comprehension Test Scores 75

Table 4.2: ANOVA of Explicit Comprehension Questions 76

Table 4.3: ANOVA of Implicit Comprehension Questions 76

Table 4.4: Summary of Overall Comprehension Test Scores 76

Table 4.5: Mean and Standard Deviations of Story Retelling Scores 78

Table 4.6: ANOVA of Story Retelling Scores 79

Table 4.7: Sum of Explicit Comprehension Scores, Retelling Scores 94 and Degree of Correlation

Table 4.8: Sum of Implicit Comprehension Scores, Retelling Scores 94 and Degree Of Correlation

Table 4.9: Sum of Comprehension Scores, Retelling Scores and Degree of Correlation 95
LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix A: Narrative Text 1 – Magnificent Benito and His Two Front Teeth 122
Appendix B: Narrative Text 2 – The Goddess with Her Hands Full 123
Appendix C: Narrative Text 3 – The Legend of the Indian Paintbrush 124
Appendix D: Prior Knowledge Interview Questions 125
Appendix E: Comprehension Test Questions 126
Appendix F: Narrative Retelling Summary Sheet 132
Appendix G: Consent Form 135
Appendix H: Images Used in Prior Knowledge Assessment 139
Appendix I: Scores for Comprehension Tests Based on Type of Questions and Texts 140
Appendix J: Story Retelling Scores and T-Units Based on Texts 141
Appendix K: Prior Knowledge Interview Field Notes 142
Appendix L: Inaccuracies Observed in Participants’ Retellings 150