A THEORETICAL AND EMPIRICAL STUDY OF COMPUTER-MEDIATED SECOND LANGUAGE INSTRUCTION

LOI YAW YUEN

DISsertation submitted in fulFIlment of the requirements for the degree of masters in ENGLISH AS A SECOND LANGUAGE

Faculty of languages and linguistics
University of Malaya
Kuala Lumpur

April 2003
ABSTRAK

Pembelajaran Bahasa Bantuan Komputer (PBBK) telah banyak berubah sejak 1960an, tetapi bentuk utamanya masih kekal dalam pendekatan kognitif yang tidak mementingkan perbuatan komunikasi. Pelaksana-pelaksana PBBK bercenderung untuk mengetepikan pendekatan sosio-kognitif yang lebih berpadan dengan Pengajaran Bahasa Berkomunikasi.

Kajian ini menuntut satu model pedagogi yang mengfokuskan interaksi antara manusia melalui komputer and bercadang supaya Pengajaran Bahasa Berasaskan Rangkaian (PBBR) mengganti PBBK tradisional yang berasaskan komputer.

Sebagai suatu PBBK tidak berisi yang bertindak sebagai satu perkakas untuk berkomunikasi dalam suatu ruang maya yang tersesar masanya, PBBR akan dinilai dengan pendekatan multi-disiplin yang mengandungi dimensi-dimensi berikut: persekitaran pembelajaran, profil linguistik, pedagogi bahasa yang mungkin dan keakurannya terhadap pengajian Pembelajaran Bahasa Kedua.

Suatu integrasi inter-disiplin akan dilaksanakan dalam penganalisisan data dengan penganalisisan teori secara pertimbangan pada aras makro dan penganalisisan kandungan empirical pada aras mikro. Data akan dikutip dari emel yang disimpan secara elektronik dalam keadaan individu and kumpulan.

Keputusan penganalisisan menunjukkan bahawa kedua-dua bentuk PBBR dalam kajian ini adalah bentuk-bentuk PBBK yang berdayamau. Mereka menyumbang kepada pengalaman pembelajaran yang penting terhadap kelas tradisional dan menghasilkan keputusan positif yang biasa tidak terdapat pada PBBK tradisional yang tidak berrangkaian komputer.
ABSTRACT

Computer-assisted Language Learning (CALL) has changed significantly since 1960s, but the dominant forms of CALL still remain within the cognitive approach that does not emphasise communicative acts. CALL practitioners tend to sideline the sociocognitive approach that is congruent with Communicative Language Teaching.

This study calls for a pedagogical model that focuses on human-to-human interaction through computer and suggests Network-Based Language Teaching (NBLT) to replace the traditional computer-based model of CALL.

Being a contentless CALL form that acts as a tool for communication in a time-displaced virtual space, NBLT is evaluated using a multidisciplinary approach that include the dimensions of: learning environment, its linguistic profile, possible language pedagogy and its conformity to the Second Language Acquisition research.

An interdisciplinary integration of the diverse disciplines above is carried out in the analyses of data with judgemental theoretical analysis conducted at the macro level and empirical content analysis at the micro level. The data was collected from electronically archived emails in both individual and group settings.

The results of the analyses indicated that the two forms of NBLT in this study were viable forms of CALL. They contribute valuable learning experience to the traditional classroom and produces positive results that are not usually observed in traditional non-networked CALL.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First of all I would like to give thanks to my God, the Holy Father of Lord Jesus Christ, for His continuous guidance and inspiration throughout the long preparation of this dissertation.

I would like to extend my sincere thanks to my supervisor Dr Su’ad Awab for her insightful and critical comments. My thanks also goes to Mr Ling Teck Chaw from the Faculty of Computer Science and Information Technology, University of Malaya, who has shown me the potential and capability of networked computers.

I would also like to thank my students at Tunku Abdul Rahman College who had been willing to try out new ways of learning with me. The same goes to Lily Lu, Cheang Pek Tan, and Leong Yin Mei who had agreed to correspond with me and provide me with valuable data.

Lastly I would like thank Leng Hui Ngee, my other half, for bearing with me through the long years of writing this dissertation and for her unwavering love and encouragement.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRAK</td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF CONTENTS</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF TABLES</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES</td>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Guiding Principles .................................................. 1
1.2 Definitions .......................................................... 2
1.3 The Root of Network-Based Language Teaching ................. 3
1.4 Current CALL Failures .............................................. 5
  1.4.1 The Human Element ........................................ 6
    1.4.1.1 Ethnographic Microanalysis Perspective ............. 7
    1.4.1.2 Intentionality and Purposefulness ................... 9
  1.4.2 Teaching Machine and Communicative Competence .......... 10
  1.4.3 Software Development and Learning Environment Management .. 12
1.5 Medium or People? .................................................... 13
1.6 Model of Instruction ............................................... 14
1.7 A Note on Methodology in CALL ................................ 15
1.8 Aim of Study .......................................................... 16
1.9 Framework of Study ................................................ 19

## CHAPTER 2 REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE .................... 21

2.1 Introduction ........................................................ 21
2.2 Online Virtual Learning Environment ............................ 22
  2.2.1 Asynchronous Learning Networks ......................... 22
    2.2.1.1 Advantages of Asynchronous Communication .......... 24
  2.2.2 Learning Environment and Orientation ................ 26
  2.2.3 Synthesis of Online Language Learning Environment .... 27
2.3 Defining Cyberspace ............................................... 30
2.4 Social Presence and Equalising Effect in Cyberspace .......... 34
2.5 Linguistic Profile of Email ..................................... 38
2.6 Spoken, Written and CMC Discourse ............................ 40
  2.6.1 Comparison of Textuality ................................ 40
  2.6.2 Comparison of Interpersonal Aspect .................... 41
  2.6.3 Comparison of Modality ................................ 42
  2.6.4 Semiotic Field of CMC ..................................... 43
2.7 Grammar of Speech, Writing and CMC .......................... 44
2.8 Current Trend of Language Pedagogy ............................ 46
2.9 Communicative Competence ...................................... 50
  2.9.1 Definition of Communicative Competence ................. 50
CHAPTER 3  METHODOLOGY ........................................ 83
  3.1 Methodological Issues ..................................... 83
    3.1.1 Coding Versus Interpretative Approaches .......... 83
    3.1.2 First-Order Versus Second-Order Perspectives ... 87
  3.2 Use Of CMC Data: Issues ................................ 88
    3.2.1 Ease and Advantages of Data Collection in CMC .. 88
    3.2.2 Ethical Issues ...................................... 90
    3.2.3 Fidelity ........................................... 91
    3.2.4 Naturalness ......................................... 91
  3.3 Research Participants and Data ......................... 93
    3.3.1 One-On-One Setting ................................. 94
    3.3.2 Group Email Discussion Setting .................... 95
  3.4 Data Collection Procedures ............................... 98
    3.4.1 One-On-One Setting ................................ 98
    3.4.2 Group Email Discussion Setting .................... 99
  3.5 Principles for CALL Evaluation .......................... 100

CHAPTER 4  DATA ANALYSIS ..................................... 104
  4.1 Introduction ............................................. 104
  4.2 Empirical Analysis ....................................... 104
    4.2.1 Pre-emptive Focus on Form: Translation .......... 105
    4.2.2 Reactive Focus on Form ............................. 107
    4.2.3 Pushed Output with very low proficiency learner 107
    4.2.4 Feedback .......................................... 109
    4.2.5 Implicit Negative Feedback (Recast) .............. 109
    4.2.6 Explicit Negative Feedback ......................... 113
      4.2.6.1 Repetition as Uptake .......................... 115
    4.2.7 Empowerment of Learner ............................ 116
      4.2.7.1 Learner's Contribution ......................... 117
      4.2.7.2 Learner's Self-Regulation ..................... 118
      4.2.7.3 Shield of Computer Mediation .................. 120
      4.2.7.4 Equalisation of Teacher-Learner Status ....... 122
      4.2.7.5 Learners' Empowerment Discussion ............. 125
4.2.8 Network Effect and Vicarious Learning ........................................... 127
4.3 Empirical Analysis Discussion ......................................................... 130
4.4 Judgemental Analysis ...................................................................... 132
  4.4.1 The Nature Of Input In Email ..................................................... 132
  4.4.2 The Nature Of Output In Email .................................................. 133
  4.4.3 Activity Features in NBLT ......................................................... 134
  4.4.4 Time Pressure in Email Discussion ............................................ 134
  4.4.5 Optimal Language Learning Conditions ..................................... 135
  4.4.6 Effective Task-Based Instruction ............................................... 143
4.5 Judgemental Analysis Discussion ..................................................... 147

CHAPTER 5  CONCLUSION .................................................................. 149
  5.1 Introduction ................................................................................... 149
  5.2 Internalisation of CMC as a Medium .............................................. 150
  5.3 Centrality of the Social Element in CALL ...................................... 151
  5.4 Increasing Zone of Proximal Development ..................................... 152
  5.5 Limitations of the Study .................................................................. 153
    5.5.1 Scope of Study within CALL Applications ................................. 153
    5.5.2 Effect of Online-Facilitation Procedures on Learning Outcome .... 154
    5.5.3 Model of Teaching and Learning Online through CMC ............. 154
    5.5.4 Incorporation into Campus-Wide Learning Management System .... 155
    5.5.5 Language Learning Assessment ............................................... 156
  5.6 Suggestions for Further Research .................................................... 156
    5.6.1 Research in NBLT Tasks ........................................................... 157
    5.6.2 Need for Comparative Studies ................................................. 157
    5.6.3 Effective Online Instructional Conditions and Methodology ......... 158
    5.6.4 Integration with Learning Management System ........................ 158
    5.6.5 Control and Autonomy ............................................................. 159
    5.6.6 NBLT in Primary and Secondary Schools ................................. 159
    5.6.7 Optimal Online Time in NBLT .................................................. 160
    5.6.8 Institutional and Cultural Issues ............................................... 160

BIBLIOGRAPHY ........................................................................ 162

APPENDIX A ........................................................................... 180

APPENDIX B ........................................................................... 181

APPENDIX C ........................................................................... 183
LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1  Linguistic Profile of Email (Baron, 2000) ..............................................39
Table 2.2  A comparison of Audiolingual Method and Communicative Language Teaching ........................................................................................................48
Table 2.3  Types of Form-Focused Instruction ..................................................................75
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1 Supplementary role of online interaction to face-to-face interaction.....25
Figure 2.2 Language learning in host environment...........................................28
Figure 2.3 Language learning in non-host environment.................................29
Figure 2.4 Language learning in online host environment...............................30
Figure 2.5 Virtual Manifestation of Authorising Body in Cyberspace...............33
Figure 2.6 Bachman’s components of language competence..........................51
Figure 2.7 Bachman’s model of language use.................................................53
Figure 2.8 Output and second language learning................................................67
Figure 4.1 Four Types of Interaction..................................................................128
Figure 4.2 Vicarious Interaction (Adapted from Sutton, 2001, p. 233, Fig. 1).....128
Figure A Language processing model (Levelt 1993)........................................183
# LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ALN</td>
<td>Asynchronous Learning Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CALL</td>
<td>Computer-assisted Language Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLA</td>
<td>Communicative Language Ability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLT</td>
<td>Communicative Language Teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CMC</td>
<td>Computer-Mediated Communication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSCL</td>
<td>Computer-Supported Cooperative Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DDL</td>
<td>Data Driven Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESL</td>
<td>English As a Second Language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FFI</td>
<td>Form-Focused Instruction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTF</td>
<td>Face-to-face</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICT</td>
<td>Information and Communication Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IRC</td>
<td>Internet Relay Chat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L1</td>
<td>First Language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L2</td>
<td>Second Language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LAN</td>
<td>Local Area Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LRE</td>
<td>Language Related Episode</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MFI</td>
<td>Meaning-Focused Instruction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOO</td>
<td>MUD Object Oriented</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MUD</td>
<td>Multi-User Dungeons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MUSE</td>
<td>Multi-User Simulation Environments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NBLT</td>
<td>Network-Based Language Teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NLP</td>
<td>Natural Language Processing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RFC</td>
<td>Request For Clarification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLA</td>
<td>Second Language Acquisition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WAN</td>
<td>Wide Area Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WWW</td>
<td>World Wide Web</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZPD</td>
<td>Zone of Proximal Development</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>