6.0 Introduction

This chapter presents the findings revealed from this research study. The findings were presented as they related to the three research questions that anchored the direction of this research study as well as the fourth research questions to describe the performance of novice teachers after the training. The findings were presented in tandem with the teachers’ own words with regards to, both exemplary and novice teachers not only to illustrate the depth and complexity of the themes, but also to give voice with important experiences to share.

This section of the thesis examines four teachers. Two exemplary teachers participated in the Situated Classroom Observation (SCO), Exemplary Teacher Interview (ETI), as well as being the coach to guide the other two novice teachers throughout the cognitive apprenticeship training for character education at Prokidz Institution. Novice Teacher Interview (NTI) was also conducted to understand the factors that affect ‘learning to teach’ experience of novice teachers infusing the Codes of Exemplary Situated Teaching during the 30-Hour Cognitive Apprenticeship Training. In addition, the reflection from novice teachers were also used as an important data to obtain the result presented in this chapter. Same evaluation tools were employed to evaluate both exemplary teachers (exemplary teachers selection process) and novice teachers (after training).

These teachers were presented as a series of individuals, each focusing on the unique observation and interview that took place with each participant. Each individual research participant was presented in the same manner, first with a brief introduction of the teacher followed by their words and experiences as they related to the key questions. Exemplary teachers focused on providing insights of their situational knowledge in the
context of classroom teaching experience in relation to character education as well as facilitating the establishment codes of exemplary situated teaching dispositions and practices for character education at Prokidz Institution. The novice teachers provided their factors that affect ‘learning to teach’ experiences at Prokidz Institution. The researcher arranges this chapter in accordance to the above two research objectives and presented the result of the collected data in a systematic manner. Research Objective 2 – ‘Establishing codes of exemplary situated teaching for character education Prokidz Institution’ already explained in the previous Chapter 5. Hence, this chapter focuses on Research Questions (RQ) of which are shown below:

(a) RQ 1: What is the situated knowledge of exemplary teachers at Prokidz Institution in the context of classroom teaching experience in relation to character education?

(b) RQ 3: What are the factors that affect ‘learning to teach experience’ from novice teachers at Prokidz Institution?

After the Novice Teacher Interview (NTI), the researcher synthesized the functions of the established Codes of Exemplary Situated Teaching for Character Education from the novice teachers’ ‘learning to teach’ experience. Although, it wasn’t part of the research questions, the researcher explained the functions of the codes in preparing novice teachers for character education in this chapter.

(c) RQ 4: How is the performance of novice teachers after the training at Prokidz Institution?

6.1 Situational Knowledge of Exemplary Teachers at Prokidz Institution

The initial focus of the interview was on the first research question for this study: What is the situated knowledge of exemplary teachers at Prokidz Institution in the context of classroom teaching experience in relation to character education? The interview began with a prompt in order to trigger their recall of events of the lesson. The
excerpts from the interview demonstrate how observed practices from the Situated Classroom Observation (SCO) could lead to an extensive interview around a specific disposition and practice and why the teacher used and why they thought it was important and effective.

As the researcher reviewed the transcripts, the significance of these key teaching dispositions and practices continued to come to her mind. Each Exemplary Teacher Interview (ETI) began with questions drawn from the SCO. ETI interviews in this study began with questions about classroom routines that were observed, interactions between the teacher and students at the beginning of lessons or during transitions between activities, dispositions of the teacher during the class and how teachers dealt with character or behavioural issues in the classroom. Subsequent questions were included when they responded to the prepared questions during ETI.

The experiences, dispositions and practices that were represented here were the actual words of the participants as drawn from the transcripts from the ETI. Please note that all names found in the transcript were shortened to a single letter. Selected exemplary teachers for this study were coded as V6 & V11. At the time of the researcher’s encounter with V11, she had been teaching for 3 years at Prokidz. As for V6, she had been teaching for 2 ½ years at Prokidz Institution. Both of them have been teaching at the Institute across Foundational to Advanced Level (according to the character education programme at Prokidz Institution). In this study, exemplary teachers were observed at the Beginner (age group 10-12) & Intermediate Level (age group 13–15). The researcher first presented the first exemplary teacher – V11.

6.1.1 Exemplary Teacher (V11, ETI, 17-3-2014)

Visiting her classroom and watching her work with the students provided the researcher an opportunity to see what she believed was a truly exceptional teacher at work. V11 was an enthusiastic professional at the time of the observation. Her
classroom was a beehive of activity and energy. V11 was effervescent, engaging and obviously enjoying what she did when she was in her classroom. It was immediately obvious to the researcher that there was a strong rapport between V11 and the students in her classroom. V11 was observed to have a usual routine that appeared very planned and intentional. She met students at the door. The initial prompt that the researcher focused on was the practice of engaging students at the door as she entered the room, ready to begin the class.

‘It’s a form of greeting and letting the students know that I am always charming... be in ready to have fun with them. I love fun! It is a personal process to me. Learning can be better when the relationship between teacher and student is good. It is a simple thing I do every time but... it is powerful...it is the easiest, most enjoyable and energy uplifting. I will greet the students individually and welcome at the door as if they are my friends entering my house.’

V11 shared the personality a teacher should possess humorous, charming, feeling happy and energetic, and allowing students to enjoy the class.

‘I always had the impression of teachers that they were untouchable, they were unreachable. I did not want to have that at all...I tend to reach them with humour, jokes and smiles. Like don’t go in with a frown on your face or anything, be charming......You have got to smile all the time.....You must also feel joyful and fill with energy all the time. They know they enjoy the class in such environment.’

V11 had different perspectives about the kids’ energy levels as compared to some of her colleagues.

‘... energy of the students is what I like the most in teaching. Though sometimes, some of the teachers complained that kids have lots energy which their energy is drained off by them ...’

The interview continued on how important energy level was to a teacher. The researcher could see the great energy she had with the kids. She was really jumping high up and vibrant throughout her class.
‘Teaching is a high-energy job especially student-centred and active learning approach. The kids have lots of energy. We need to be able to keep up with them...’

The researcher periodically heard the teacher asking students to answer the learning objective of the day. V11 emphasized the importance to ensure all students remember the learning objective as it is the core of the lesson. It is the key words that will be imprinted in their mind. The created fun and excitement is the hook needed to hook the students’ attention in learning through assessing their prior knowledge with regards to the topic.

‘I learned that when I convey the learning objective with fun and excitement they will listen and remember. You need to create a hook to hook their attention. The learning objective is as important as it is the central of the lesson. Constantly repeating the key words will imprint in their minds. As long as I create excitement and pride in students that they have prior knowledge in regards to the topic or subject matter, they will go all-in.’

The researcher also observed her of having big body movements and facial expressions. Saw her crawling on the floor to exemplify a soldier’s movement on that day’s SCO. She was good at creating an atmosphere where all students appeared to be engaging, participating and showing interest. This allows students to remember the learning objective better and to create such a context through different creative ways. She also emphasized that being energetic and expressive was also a great way to build on good relationship with students.

‘...It is important to make it real. Just like embracing the value actions, it has to be real. Body movements and facial expressions are the key to create excitement... oh yes... big big energy...It is easier to catch their attention. With such, they can relate to the learning objective better and remember what they have learned through the created context..... being energetic and expressive to create excitement is a great way to build connection with students.’

In addition, the researcher was intrigued by the eerie music that the teacher would play during one of her lessons. Not only body expression and body movements of the
teacher exemplified affect the learning excitement of students, music played an important role as well. She stressed the importance of imagination and creativity. In addition, using props or tools also helped to create the context and enhance learning.

‘...same concept as the body movements and facial expression, to make it as real as possible... Teaching is an art which requires creativity and imagination especially true of teachers because teaching is an art..., always look for new and creative ways to teach in class. It is the context that makes the students excited, and feels in accordance to the learning objective of the session. They can remember better. .......Sometimes, I also get them to create animal costume using newspaper/waste paper.

V11 appreciates for having this diverse group of students in allowing her to instil values such as harmony, understanding, tolerance and respect. In addition, she emphasizes herself to be the role model in demonstrating those values. She explained through a reciprocal approach especially living in such diverse background in terms of ethnicity, race, gender and socio-economic status.

‘It is important to treat every student with respect... the students here are quite diversified. Just like us, living in Malaysia, having different ethnics. It is challenging but a good platform for me to instil values such as harmony, understanding, tolerance and respect. I have to exhibit the value of respect for students as they are from diverse groups with different ethnicity, gender, socio-economic status, race... I believe it is a reciprocal process. If you want to be treated with respect, they you have to treat others with respect too. If we want to mould a sound character, we have to be that person first...’

She further emphasized the importance of herself being a role model to the students instilling values and shaping character. She believes that students are attuned to her actual behaviour.

‘...As for value, it is the same. Students observe and pay attention to my actual behaviour and will reflect upon.... I need to be a good role model only then can inculcate such value in students ... hence, it is necessary to be the model....

V11 advocated in promoting and instilling a culture of positive values who always ensured her students and herself to practice in action.
‘I advocate and take the role in promoting & instilling a culture of positive values. I always ensure my students and myself speak polite words such as ‘thank you’, ‘please’, ‘excuse me’, ‘I am sorry’…’

The teacher had clearly outlined the importance she saw in forming relationships with her students through giving fair and respectful treatment to every student without bias.

‘...it is important to be fair when come to punishment for violating a classroom rule to form a positive relationship with students. I have seen teachers who are fond of a group of students, even they misbehave, and the treatment to them was different. I think it is sending a message to other students that fairness doesn’t exist as long as you can be teacher’s pet, then you are safe...

Besides being fair to students in terms of behaviour management, she also much emphasized on the importance of engaging and ensuring all voices were heard amongst each other in discussion. She would not the quiet students go. She made by making sure they had the opportunity to express themselves too so as not to develop the habit of getting away.

‘...fair to give every student an equal chance to speak too. Never neglect a child.... I think it is important to have an equitable classroom so everyone gets a chance to speak. I will normally allow my students to speak and discuss without my mediation ... when I see some quiet students trying to hide themselves from the light, I will call them, even those who don’t .... It is a habit, a practice. If I permit students to hide themselves, they will be hiding forever...

V11 shared the indicator of having good classroom management ability and perceived it as the central part of successful teaching. She nurtures students to have self-responsibility ensuring efficiency of time used in class while she just needs to ensure the smooth operation of the classroom.

‘...1000% important to have a smoothly functioning classroom.... My job is to create and ensure the routines and procedures are carried out smoothly to ensure the increase efficiency...Their (students) job is to ensure everything is in place. To me, the best transition from one activity to another is when students assume self-responsibility to ensure efficiency of time used...I name it as class running itself.'
The teacher also shared the chaotic moment when she didn’t master the instructional skills when she was a novice teacher. This put importance on teacher’s experiences as to how important she perceived instruction skills especially in a student-centred and activity-based teaching approach classroom style.

‘I remember my first few lessons of teaching. I explained wrongly, some parts were unclear, so students couldn’t follow ... I could not invite students to engage intellectually... Wahl..... Since, it was a student-centred and activity-based approach, students ran around uncontrollably. It was indeed a nightmare!’

V11 once again emphasized the power of clarity and the ability to establish attention signals.

‘...Clarity is power! I establish signal to get attention, such as raising hands or off the lights ... give clear instruction by saying, “Step 1 .. Step 2... Step 3...or “First, Second, Third...’

She related demonstration or modelling to facilitate better instructional skills. This could minimize time lost during activity.

‘Students follow what I demonstrate. Demonstration is the most powerful tool. Students know what they are expected to be and acquire. With such, it can also minimize lots of time lost in activity.’

V11 also shared her techniques in prompting the students to answer questions (open ended questions) and explaining (using imaginative analogies and metaphors) regarding the value concepts or skills being presented (connecting to lives beyond schools) and gradually students could build the skills and values in them.

‘...I like to use open-ended questions, and have students to think and provide multiple answers to reflect their learning. I suppose when explaining the value concepts and skills to students.....it is great to use imaginative metaphors and descriptions ... also to connect with students daily life experience ... they could build the skills and values in them...’
V11 did her best to understand her student’s level of understanding in relation to the values they were learning for the first day by inviting them link connections and challenge their prior knowledge.

‘... I always get them to link the connections, and also challenge their prior knowledge... students’ responses are important, so I responded as reply and also and making use of their ideas.

The benefits of explanation and making connection practices were also outlined in increasing students’ self-esteem by allowing them to express what they have known in relation to their prior knowledge,

‘...students feel very excited and eager to learn more when they feel a sense of achievement as they have known something... the self-esteem of the students also increases with such verbal discussion arena allowing them to express what they have known...’

V11 emphasized that it was essential to relate their learning beyond the classroom boundary through discussion by engaging them in a discussion. During the meaningful discussion or conversation, students were able to deepen their understanding and skills needed to be a sound character person. The more students were able to relate, the more enjoyable and meaningful the learning could be.

‘... Most of the teaching, teachers ask students to do things without connection to their ‘real lives’. With such, they have no interest or lose interest in learning. Teachers really need to help students to see the connections... I do this by engaging them in discussion about the values of the lesson and help them to connect in their lives such as families and community members...The more they are able to relate and apply the learned skills and values, the more enjoyable and meaningful learning can be...’

The researcher remembered V11 stopped half way in her lesson and changed her teaching approach. She appeared to be constantly checking on her students, identifying individual students’ need and providing a high level of support to the students who she felt needed help. She was flexible and able to scaffold professionally through monitoring the students.
‘...Oh... I monitored the students and realized that they were not at that skill level to perform the tasks. Hence, I need to scaffold...through monitoring what they ask... write and learn. I change my approach of teaching and learning spontaneously.

V11 once again emphasized about students themselves should be responsible of their learning by providing them the criteria of learning, hence students could monitor their progress and strive to achieve. She would explain the rubrics of assessment to students to enable students to check their work against clear criteria.

‘...it is important to have students to be responsible of their learning. They should monitor their learning progress... allowing students to know the expectation or criteria to achieve learning outcome is important too. So, I explain the rubrics of assessment to the students every class.’

V11 commented that monitoring students’ behaviour and attuning to the happenings in the classroom was teacher’s responsibility.

’I seem to have eyes in the backs of my head. I am a monster. When monitoring behaviour, I am aware of student’s passing notes in the classroom or bothering their classmates... I need to be aware of the happening in the classroom ...’

She emphasized the importance of dealing spontaneously as it is the golden opportunity to correct and instil values.

‘...in class, there are many social and moral issue conflicts. Teachers have to take advantage of this sort of teachable moments to allow students to understand the meaning of those values through real life experience. That’s the moment, we teachers need to catch. If students are not behaving, I need to deal with it immediately as the moment of intensity...’

The researcher was curious about the ways to deal with students who still violate the set standards of conduct in the classroom. V11’s approach was trying to understand the reason behind each student’s misbehaviour. It is essential to be highly sensitive to students’ needs in order to deal with it.

‘...I try to go deeper into their world, understanding why they behave themselves in such a manner? Are they trying to show off and impress his
friends? Remember WY, the girl who felt upset as she was lined behind? I talked to her privately after the class. I got to know that she was neglected by her friends at school always. When she came to the centre, she was very happy as everyone treated her as friend. However, she felt being neglected again when she saw everyone was in front and left her behind. I suppose we need to be highly sensitive to students’ needs and able to deal.’

The following sub-section shows the second exemplary teacher’s situated knowledge at Prokidz Institution through an interview session.

6.1.2 Exemplary Teacher (V6, ETI, 17-3-2014)

The Exemplary Teacher Interview (ETI) with V6 began in the same way, focusing on observations from the Situated Classroom Observation (SCO). V6 was observed interacting with the students as they entered the room. She introduced a number of reasons behind her practices of greeting and interacting with her students, to build a good relationship. Also like V11, she emphasized the importance of a high energy level.

‘...Many children are not good with hand shaking with confidence, looking at you with confident eye contact or even greet others. Many started off looking down on the floor, keep their hands in the pocket and speak softly on the first few lessons. However, it was easily overcome with some coaching... the relationship and interaction with students can be improved. It is the best time to set the energy level right.’

While observing V6’s classroom, the researcher could not help but notice the tremendous enthusiasm and high energy level in her classroom. V6 perceived that a high energy level could improve relationships with students as they could feel her existence with a charming and energetic personality.

‘It is important to show enthusiasm and high power level through all kind of presentation both verbal and action. Students can feel your power and energy level, in other words, they will be like you too. Learning needs energy, learning needs vibration...they feel your existence, the personality you have to be charming and energetic.’
One of the ways to gain trust from the students is to know her (V6) lesson plan and classroom flow well as this signified that trust was important to build relationships with the students and thus gradually nurturing them. Trust is so important to begin building a relationship with students and gradually nurturing them.

‘...You see, students nowadays are very smart. They respect you when you really know your stuff...Trust is so important to begin building a relationship with students and gradually nurturing them.’

She shared her experience the before and after feeling when she managed to familiarize with the class flow and procedure as the students treated her differently with more respect.

‘I remember first I started teaching here constantly looking at the lesson plan and the classroom flow and procedure as I wasn’t really clear. With such, students had that look like doubting. I assumed their mind was like ‘are you sure you know? Should I believe her? ‘Eventually, they would not respect and that’s when the class started to go chaos and they wouldn’t share much with you... After four months, I was used to it and the students treated me differently. It was the total different story.’

V6 perceived that trust is built through constant fulfilling of promises and commitments. Trust overcome fear by replacing confidence and openness. With such, students trust their teachers and able them to have opportunity to learn from mistake, and learn from every failure instead of shying away from failure. Encouragement and a supporting environment enabled students to grow and improve.

‘Trust enable students to learn from mistake and repeated failures without giving up because they have confidence in teacher. Some of my students are very passive and introvert, so I have to set rule by nailing down no one should ridicule anyone and should respect each other... students are not afraid to be laughed and put down by other students, creating this safe environment. They are safe and supporting each other in such environment to learn. I always encourage students by saying ‘you can do it’, ‘you are improving’, ‘yes, you can!’ They trust my words, and will try their best to do it and improve.'
The researcher would like to know how to handle and help difficult children to attempt challenges. V6 compared a fixed mindset with a growth mindset that affected students’ view of learning. Fixed mindset is a perception that our capabilities are determined at birth without the need to put much effort in order to strive. In contrast, growth mindset focuses on the learning process and believe given efforts could overcome obstacles and improve to be better. V6 mentions the importance to communicate this concept across to students. It is the teacher’s role to create the platform allowing students to feel the personal advancement and improvement.

‘You see fixed mindset means you believe that your capabilities is fixed on the day you were born. This kind of thinking will not allow us to focus on learning process but rather the outcome and result only. The contrast of growth mindset, individuals believe that they can overcome obstacles and improve as long as they put in more effort to challenge...We as teachers need to communicate this to our students. I always create a platform for students to have the feeling of improvement. They need to have the feeling of advancing, moving forward even it is minute.’

V6 was seen as very passionate and advocated the importance of teachers communicating that the result was due to effort instead of innate talent. V6 also analytically predicted the effect if teachers allow and deliver the message that students think innate talent produces better results that effort.

‘Very important!!! It is just important to instil the mindset of growth through putting much effort. Because if we as teachers communicate that result is due to innate talent instead of effort and label students in accordance in such a way, it is ending up producing labels to which some students are good or smart and some are stupid or bad.

V6 used words of encouragement to motivate and convince the students that they could master it with effort and patience instead of relating their (students) success to natural ability.

‘...I used to say ‘this is important!’, ‘it will be a good habit’, ‘let’s work together’. I will try to encourage by convincing them they could master it with
effort and patience. I will convey that every person’s success is the result of putting effort and hard work instead on relying merely on natural ability.

The following really brought the idea of relationship building to the fore in the researcher’s mind. It was an important aspect of the exemplary teacher’s day-to-day teaching practices and a conscious strategy for dealing with students with behavioural issues. V6 continued to accentuate building caring relationships with students in a safe, trusting and respectful environment. She shared that students would still love her even if she was strict in upholding the values because of the affection given to the student.

‘...It is very important to have a caring and supporting learning environment in the classroom. Not only environment, I must also have good interpersonal relationship with the students. This sounds difficult with different students, but it can be done. Like EV, the hyperactive child. Though I am very strict on him in terms of values, he still hugs me at the end of every class. What’s more, he likes to give me a sudden surprise of ‘hug’ to show his affection as he knows I care for him.’

It is important to possess observation skills and able to identify the needs of students as every person behave differently. V6 continued to share her success practice on how to handle this particular difficult student as mentioned above, EV.

‘As a teacher, it is so important to be observant. I constantly checking on my students, identifying what individual students need and providing high level of support...Same goes to the boy. He was happy when I positioned him as the leader of the class sometimes to ensure the rules of the class were well followed. He told me once that, ‘I am very happy as you are the first teacher allowing me to be a leader... it is just about a different approach to care for student. He feels the sense of achievement and pride when I could see something in him to lead.’

V6 also suggests the way to improve supportive relationships through cooperative learning.

‘...the supportive relationship is very important. Example, it is essential to allow students to know each other, so to work through cooperation live to achieve goals together.’
The teacher periodically was moving among all the groups in the classroom, speaking to individual students or groups, emphasizing again and again what the expectations were for the lesson as well as for their behaviour. It was clear to that V6 was teaching to these expectations at every opportunity.

‘...It was laid clearly on the first day of class, even then there’s still times when they need some sort of reinforcement. They know there are certain things that are expected and much of it comes just from respecting each other and instilling the value. I like to talk to them in group or personally once in while serving as a reminder about those values set.’

V6 has the ability to catch the students’ attention so well during her story telling session. The researcher was very intrigued to know the practices behind to have such a mesmerizing ability to listen, allowing the students to express the value of the story clearly. She perceived that it is important to be a good story teller. It is always better to use stories to convey values instead of the lecture mode.

‘As a teacher, I think being a good story teller is important. In my first year of teaching, I understand that children are attuned to story. Tell story and they will listen to you. They will tune out a lecture. There’s nothing like a good story to get your point across. Children like to view body actions and feel the emotions.’

In addition, V6 suggested that a good story teller is also a good actor who can exemplify different facial emotions spontaneously.

‘...A good teacher is a good actor, someone who can act different emotions spontaneously such as angry, sad, happy, excited...’

It also includes the ability of varying the voice volume and intonation that can depict different characters of the story

‘Also vary according to the character and emotions with audible voice volume. I can speak like a monster, girl, old man or any others depicting the character. I remember once, I spoke softly and suddenly shrieked to depict a sudden happening of the story. The students shrieked together with me. That’s the power of voice control and intonation!’
V6 also has the same perception as V11 to have a good classroom management style. She suggested a way to signal to the students returning to their seats after each transition session.

’I like to count down to signal students returning to their seats, start a new activity, transit to another session…’

V6 re-emphasized once again about having students to be ‘accountable’. Firstly, she trained students to be accountable of managing instructional groups through cooperating learning.

‘...I make sure they are accountable to it as well. I trained students through cooperative learning in managing instructional groups. It saves lots of my time as I don’t need to group them…’

Managing transition is important to the teacher to handle the students’ movement within the class for different types of activities in order to save time.

’I cannot bear with the time lost due to the students’ movement. My lessons require students to move around and change of activities regardless in a big or small group. Students are also trained to manage themselves to settle down in the shortest period of time…’

Managing supplied materials is also another way to reduce time loss with minimum disruption to the flow of instruction by implementing routines for distribution and collection of materials.

‘...managing the supplied materials is also very important, for example distributing pencils, stationeries or any other props. Students are taught to implement routines for distribution and collection of items…. Save time... independent…’

The researcher observed one of the students requested to redo the work voluntarily. She was very curious with such behaviour and action. The researcher learned to understand from V6 that, the culture of excellence is able to ignite the internal motivation of students and be willing to devote their energy, thus taking pride in their
accomplishment.

‘Since she now sees how it could be strengthened, she is motivated to redo for better quality. When students believe their capabilities, they will devote their time, effort and energy to produce greater work and thus take pride of their accomplishments. Real motivation comes from within……, it is the fire from within, it doesn’t need anyone to ignite for them … the culture of excellence is important.’

V6 describes classroom should be a place or established environments where students value and appreciate the learning and hard work as well as committed to produce excellent work. Teachers set high expectations which enable the students to challenge and gain satisfaction and feel proud from their given effort.

‘...the culture should require hard work and be persistent to produce quality work. Students have high expectation for themselves as they strive for self-satisfaction ... They feel pride of their work.’

The teacher constantly communicated the rubric and ensured high quality performance from the students by providing the students the criteria for assessment.

‘I always communicate the rubric and ensure high quality performance is met. It is important to allow students to be aware of the criteria. With the criteria and rubric, students have clear goals in mind and able to monitor themselves and advanced in meeting those criteria…’

V6 puts on an impetus note about the choices of words used in the classroom setting. Every word a teacher puts forward does make an impact to the student. The difference between nourishing words and toxic words were explained by her.

‘Words have power, both good and bad. However, we are just not aware of what we say. Words can be poisonous or nourishing...the words use will imprint in their mind and make them label themselves and this could shape who they are...’

Praise is a feedback tool to enable students to develop and improve with motivation. Every praise needs to come with a reason to justify the appraisal so that the students know clearly what they have done correctly and feel motivated to continue.
‘I always praise my students for their good deeds, effort and behaviour. It is considered as a feedback for them, to motivate them. Importantly, it has to be explained with reasons. Students need to know the reason of me appraising them in order to keep that motivation going to do better.’

On the other hand, feedback is also given for improvement purposes and it has to be done on the spot with constructive feedback with reasons and evidences. Nonetheless, V6 highlighted that students tend to accept feedback for improvement only with the condition that the relationship and trust between the teacher and student exists.

‘I want the students to use the feedback to improve. Hence, it has to be on the spot. Students who are good learners will constantly wondering how they have been doing. Personally, I think constructive feedback is very powerful. Giving reasons and evidences, students tend to accept openly provided the relationship and trust is there. Constructive feedback must be given on time with concrete reasoning and elaboration.’

Embedded in the culture of learning, students can instil the habit of learning continuously by taking feedback seriously, thus developing the attitude of thirst for improvement.

‘The culture of learning needs to be embedded in their learning habit. They take feedback seriously and always thirst to have them for improvement.’

Introducing a new learning objective, V6 would prompt her students’ immediate experiences in search for meaningful examples. One such practice was to ask about recent events which took place in the school, neighbourhood, at home or about an event that was hit headlines nationally or internationally.

‘I truly believe that these children are able to relate well and apply if the examples give are well connected to their daily life. Before I officially introduce the learning objective of the day, I will prompt students about their experiences to understand their prior knowledge in relation to their daily life.’

Same as V11, V6 also ensured the students realize the importance of learning that could be applied in real life. She would create the excitement and importance so they (students) will be enthusiastic about their learning. The cognitive process that V6
utilized was to provide the students a platform to summarize and explain how they could apply knowledge to real life situations.

‘After student’s responses, I build on further in order to deepen their understanding… I like to create the excitement and importance of the learning that leads them to be exciting about it…actually, if they realize the skill or value is able to apply someone else, they will think it is important and learn better. I always like to ask the students to summarize and explain … how to apply in daily life...

The researcher observed her students say “shhh…” to one of the classmates because he was talking to another. V6 highlighted the importance they placed on the independence of their students and the responsibility for their part in the learning process to behave appropriately. Once again, emphasizing ‘self-responsibility’.

‘They take the role to monitor their behaviour and also others... as long as those much senior students realize someone in the class violate the set rules, they will take actions ... that’s why most of the time I don’t need to discipline the students... realize... They do the so called job for me.’

V6 insisted on treating her class between good and ‘badly’ behaved students as much as she could for she believed that by ‘working cooperatively everyone would gain, after all’.

‘... Those who are already embracing the behaviour, they will feel good being empowered to be able to remind or help their peers. As to the less behaved ones, they will feel much less pressure than if I, or another teacher tries to instil values in them....’

V6 stands firm in upholding values and dealing with misbehaviour students.

‘If a student in my class says something rude and mean, and I ignore it, I have taught students two things... is ok to be like that... is alright for other students to behave that way too. It is essential for the teacher to uphold the values and deal with misbehaviour students.’

Besides, V6 mentions that a teacher needs to tough and do not tolerate misbehaviour. It is essential to hold them accountable.
‘Teachers need to be tough. People always think that teachers are patient, soft and nice. It is not a job for sissy. It is important to be tough as teacher is a demanding profession especially in character education. There are times that I have to be tough on kids. Not mean, but tough. We need to hold them accountable, and they need to know we will’

The researcher observed V6 emphasized a lot on having good accuracy of the progress recording. The purpose was to update the learning progress right after class as well as keeping track of students’ assignment completion. By citing examples of action or behaviour of students in class, could help her to modify the lesson plan to maximize students’ learning.

‘...We need to update the record of student’ assignment completion. Also, must be updated right after the class to ensure a student’s progress and performance is still vividly in mind. By citing examples, I can periodically monitor and adjust my lesson plan to suit and build their character in accordance.’

V6 also practiced journaling of her lesson and practices frequently. This could help her to make deliberate and accurate assessment of meeting the desired learning outcomes and thus make necessary amendments to improve teaching approach.

‘...Not only for students, I, myself have a journal keeping track of my teaching practice as well. I always reflect my teaching practice after the class to improve. I need to deliberate and accurate assessment to meet the planned lesson outcome or make amendment in her teaching approach.’

The following sub-section is the discussion on the exemplary situated teaching dispositions and practices from the two teachers at Prokidz Institution.

6.1.3 Discussion on Exemplary Situated Teaching Dispositions and Practices of Exemplary Teachers

In this study, the researcher’s intention was to explore the exemplary dispositions and practices of exemplary teachers at Prokidz Institution to establish the Codes of Exemplary Situated Teaching for Character Education. Hence, the researcher arranged the following discussion section according to the seven broad themes (C-R-A-M-V-I-L
Teaching Mode) that were identified by the two participating exemplary teachers at Prokidz Institution in establishing the codes as stated in Chapter 5.

(a) Creativity Teaching Mode (C-Mode)
(b) Relationship Teaching Mode (R-Mode)
(c) Assessment Teaching Mode (A-Mode)
(d) Motivation Teaching Mode (M-Mode)
(e) Value Teaching Mode (V-Mode)
(f) Instructional Teaching Mode (I-Mode)
(g) Linkage Teaching Mode (L-Mode)

6.1.3.1 Exemplary Dispositions and Practices: Creativity Teaching Mode

The exemplary teachers in this study emphasized the importance of having good expressions and creating a conducive environment to increase students’ learning. It is exemplified through expressive body action and facial motion. It is also important to have the right context to allow students to learn effectively and cheerfully (Narvaez, 2010; Jessica & Julie, 2009; Noddings, 2010). The classroom atmosphere may be vibrant and cheerful. Both exemplary teachers had big body movements. For example, V11 crawled on the floor to exemplify a soldier’s movement and V6 was able to depict the characters so well by expressing different facial expressions such as ‘angry’, ‘sad’, ‘happy’ and ‘surprise’ during a story telling session. According to Milne (2010), utilizing the entire space of the entire classroom, facial expressions, body actions and eye contact are important. She commented that, ‘If you want to control your students, you need to control your body language’ (p.1). V6 also emphasized that being expressive was a great way to build a good relationship with students. This was supported by Urban (2007), who commented that students engaged better and had more fun with the teachers, thus building better relationships.

Besides exemplifying good expressions as illustrated in Figure 6.1 (p.215), the
exemplary teachers agreed to create good learning context through different creative ways. For example, when learning the value of being helpful, students can have different attires to carry out the duties as postman, fireman, police officers and many more. Real life scenarios can be given to allow students to dramatize creatively the role as responsibility community helpers through exhibiting body actions and facial expressions. This allows students to remember learning objective better (Sun, 2003).

Both teachers stressed the importance of imagination and creativity. Teachers need to be creative to utilize the tools to deliver the knowledge or instil value in an imaginative approach. For example, using props or tools help to create the context and enhance learning such as using brooms to act as witches exemplifying the role of a witch. Peregoy and Boyle (2008) support to use or make props for role play and drama play to act out or exemplify the message that needs to be sent across to students.

V6 was good at creating an atmosphere where all students appeared to be engaging, participating and showing interest, for example playing eerie music during one of her lessons to create a scary atmosphere. Koelsch (2005) has confirmed that music is capable of inducing emotions with a fairly strong intensity. Not only body expression and body movements of the teacher exemplified affecting the learning excitement of students, music played an important role as well. Savan (1996) also confirms that because emotion and physiological changes are inextricably linked, then music will exert physical change. Our mood is largely influenced by our emotions and feelings which may impede or enhance the learning process (Griffin, 2006). Using this understanding, Price et al. (2002) suggests that music can be used to increase or maintain student arousal levels for study purposes.

Figure 6.1 (p.215) illustrates the components ‘Expressions’ and ‘Context’ and elements ‘Body Action’, ‘Facial Motion’, ‘Tools’ and ‘Atmosphere’ of Creativity Teaching Mode with given examples.
6.1.3.2 Exemplary Dispositions and Practices: Relationship Teaching Mode

The exemplary teachers in this study emphasized the importance of having an exemplary personality and communication to increase the relationship between students and teachers. An exemplary personality is exemplified through a high energy level, being charming and establishing trust. Exemplary communication includes engaging, interacting and proactively guiding students.

Both exemplary teachers stressed the importance of having high energy levels. They perceived that high energy level could improve relationships with students as they could feel their existence with an energetic personality. V11 was effervescent, engaging and obviously enjoying what she did when she was in her classroom. It was
immediately obvious that there was a strong rapport between V11 and the students in her classroom. According to Hal (2007), positive energy is contagious. It is able to uplift the students’ learning ability through body kinaesthetic movements. Same goes to V6’s classroom; she was full of tremendous enthusiasm and had a high energy level in her classroom, jumping up and down with vibrancy. Also both teachers coherently agreed to have a charming smile always. They started by giving their charming smile right at the door before the class began.

Another important element to build a relationship with students is trust. V6 commented that one of the ways to gain trust from the students is to know her lesson plan and classroom flow well. She shared her experience the ‘before’ and ‘after’ feeling when she managed to familiarize the class flow and procedure as the students treated her differently with more respect. Students were able to learn better. Ellis and Shockley-Zalabak (2003) also found that trust in the teacher has an indirect effect on motivation and cognitive learning. Teachers are required to exemplify exemplary personalities which include high energy, being charming, and trusting as illustrated in Figure 6.2 (p.218).

V11 had clearly outlined the importance she saw in forming relationships with her students through giving fair and respectful treatment to every student without bias. In such a fair and respectful classroom learning environment, students feel stronger sense of learning due to the psychological safety (Anderman, 2003; Ma, 2003). Educational research claims that platform with mutual respect is important to allow students to share openly, expressing thoughts as well as asking questions (Stronge, 2002). V6 indicated that it was really essential to develop positive interaction and mutual respect without putting down each other. Jessica and Julie (2009) mention that the degree of freedom to speak and express can impede or enhance student’s learning.
According to Hattie (2012), it is imperative that teachers inculcate the thinking of learning from mistakes instead of perceiving mistake as failure. Many students are afraid to attempt because fear of being ridicule or receive negative response from peers. Hence, exemplary teachers need to create the learning environment which welcome mistake and learn from it (Hattie, 2010). It was clearly visible that students were not afraid to participate and express their thoughts freely by asking questions. Through such interaction, error are tolerable to learn from mistakes, comprehending new knowledge or skills. This is a vital process to learn. V6 accentuated on building caring relationships with students in a safe, trusting and respectful environment. The likelihood of learning will be reduced if there is not a sense of safety. Having this type of positive, caring, respectful interaction is precursor to learn (Hattie, 2012). Caring relationships fosters emotional and social bonding which creates positive experiences, thus providing a firm grounding for the formation of character with such caring value (Schaps, Battistich, & Solomon, 1997). This is aligned with CEP’s Principle 4 (Appendix A) stating the school must be a caring community.

V6 engaged and ensured all voices were heard among each other in discussion. She would not let go of those quiet or passive students by making sure they had the opportunity to express themselves too, so as not to develop the habit of getting away. As Bell (2008) stated, engaging students and valuing their verbal expression should be highly appreciated in learning discourse. The cognitive process that V6 utilized was to provide the students the platform to summarize, internalize and explain how they could apply the skills in real life situations. The more students were able to relate cognitively, the more enjoyable and meaningful the learning could be (Oser, 1986). Also, when students are able to think logically of the learning ideas and express them verbally, they tend to have a better understanding of the learning topic (Denton, 2008). It was also mentioned by V6 & V11 that teachers needed to be proactively guiding the students.
Both students and teachers co-construct the meaning throughout the learning process in a positive interpersonal relationship in the classroom. This is supported by the work of Vygotsky (1978), that ‘cognitive development is embedded in the context of social relationships’ (p.648). Goldstein & Freedman (2003) describes this concept, “as a shared intellectual space experienced by the teacher and learner” (p. 452). It is a space between what the student can do better with the help of a more able person (Lysaker, McCormick & Brunette, 2004). Figure 6.2 illustrates the ‘Personality’ component with the elements of ‘Energy, ‘Charming’ and ‘Trust’ and ‘Communication’ component with the elements of ‘Interaction’, ‘Engagement’, and ‘Proactive’ of Relationship Teaching Mode with given examples.

Figure 6.2: Exemplary components and elements of Relationship Teaching Mode
6.1.3.3 Exemplary Dispositions and Practices: Assessment Teaching Mode

The exemplary teachers in this study emphasized the importance of recording accurately and reflecting to enhance teaching practices and maximize student learning. V6 emphasized having good accuracy of the progress recording. The purpose was to keep the progress record updated with student’s completion of assignment, as well as updating the progress right after the class to ensure better accuracy. By citing examples of action or behaviour of students in class, it could help her to modify the lesson plan to maximize students’ learning. Other studies have stated that teachers should take the opportunity to modify their teaching and be better equipped to enhance their students’ understanding after knowing students’ learning difficulties through the progress record. Figure 6.3 illustrates the ‘Improvement’ component with the elements of ‘Recording’ and ‘Reflecting’ of Assessment Teaching Mode with given examples.

Figure 6.3: Exemplary components and elements of Assessment Teaching Mode
V6 practiced journaling of her lesson and practices frequently. According to her, this could help her to make deliberate and accurate assessment in order to attain the desired learning outcome of her lesson. Reflective teachers possess the ability to examine choices they make in the classroom, the willingness to consider implications of those actions, and the openness to hear different perspectives on those actions (Stemme & Burris, 2005). Expert teachers monitor the students’ progress and make appropriate adjustment to further enhance students’ learning and understanding. They utilize student’s learning progress as feedback to make alteration of the teaching pedagogy and further monitor the effect of students’ learning (Hattie, 2012).

6.1.3.4 Exemplary Dispositions and Practices: Motivation Teaching Mode

Teachers scaffold and provide feedback for students to help students in learning. Teachers help students to advance by giving encouragement, inculcate a growth mindset and assure a high quality standard. The question here arises, what is the relationship between motivations to learning? Rogers, Ludington and Graham (1999) describe motivation as an intrinsic feeling which will drive or push someone to do something. Hence, whenever an individual feels motivated and desire to attain through learning, only then the learning becomes more effective.

V11 stopped half way in her lesson and changed her teaching approach. She was flexible and able to scaffold professionally through monitoring the students. She appeared to be constantly checking on her students, identifying individual students’ need by providing a high level of support to the students. In character education, it becomes fairly crucial that the teacher has the ability to accurately assess the current needs of development for the students (Hough et.al, 2008). Teachers need to ensure that their lessons are at the right level of the students’ understanding and opportunities for learning are available for their students (Harlen, 2005).
Students require feedback to improve. Praise is a feedback tool to enable students to develop and improve with constant motivation. However according to William (2006), praise is good to motivate students to strive for excellence, it will not help the students with their learning as it does not tell the students their weaknesses or strengths and the steps that need to be taken to improve the quality of their work in the future. Nonetheless, according to V6, every appraisal needs to be elaborated with a reason or reasons so that the students know clearly what they have done correctly and feel motivated to continue such actions, practices or behaviours. In addition, both teachers mentioned feedback is also for improvement purposes.

Feedback is also given for improvement purposes and it has to be done on the spot or timely with constructive feedback meaning supported with evidences. Feedback should be specific and timely (Gareis, 2007). Evidence in this context means the happened actions, behaviours or incidents. As stated by Gareis (2007), feedback separated by days or weeks become useless to the students. Nonetheless, V6 highlighted that students tend to accept feedback for improvement only with the condition that the relationship and trust between the teacher and student exists. Feedback can only be employed by students to improve only if the relation between teacher and student is good (Noddings, 2002). Hence, the importance of a student-teacher relationship is once again emphasized. In order to help students to learn effectively, teachers need to scaffold and provide feedback to the students as illustrated in Figure 6.4 (p.224).

In order to help students to advance, an encouraging and supporting learning environment is important. V6 used words of encouragement to motivate and convince the students that they could master it with effort and patience instead of relating their (students) success to a natural ability. She put on an impetus note about the choices of words used in the classroom setting. A teacher’s words put forward, does make an impact on the student. Research evidence indicates that teachers’ verbal expression have
great impact on students’ motivation level in acquiring knowledge and skills (Lin, 2002; Allen, Witt & Wheeless, 2006).

Besides encouragement, it is important to know how to handle and help students to attempt challenges. V6 differentiated between a fixed mindset and growth mindset. The different mentality affects students’ view on learning. She mentioned the importance of teachers to convey the message – ‘every individual can succeed if they possessed a growth mindset’. Teachers themselves need to believe this. Hattie (2012) emphasizes that exemplary teachers believe that student’s performance varies accordingly depending on the motivation and trust the teachers have on students. This means that teachers should show high respect for their students and also be passionate in guiding students to succeed. It is the teacher’s role to create the platform allowing students to feel the personal advancement and improvement constantly. It is supported by Hal (2007) who mentioned the importance of providing students the avenue in developing the sense of advancement in learning.

Of course, it is also important to communicate to students about the quality of work expected by the teacher. V6 was periodically moving among all the groups in the classroom, speaking to individual students or groups, emphasizing time and again what the expectations were for the lesson as well as for their behaviour. It was clear that V6 was teaching these expectations at every opportunity. When students aware of teachers’ clear expectation and with the guidance and strategic help by the teachers, students are more likely to exert effort (Battistich, 2008). In other words, they are more motivated to learn.

According to Hattie (2012), teachers who communicate clearly the goal and criteria to attain the goal can evidently motivate students to have a higher challenging spirit to improve. It is very powerful to encourage students to learn and improve as they are very clear with their direction. Both teachers had similar approaches by explaining
the rubrics of assessment to students thus enabling students to check their work against a clear criteria. This could help ensure a high quality of performance from the students by providing the students the criteria for assessment. The requirement or criteria allows students to have a clear goal actions needed to be done in order to achieve the learning (Hattie, 2012).

In addition, V11 emphasized on students themselves taking the self-responsibility to monitor self-learning by providing them the criteria of learning. Teachers need to create a learning climate that inculcate a mind-set that students are willing to take responsibility of their learning (Frenstermacher & Richardson, 2005). It is the role of teachers in creating this classroom setting where students are given autonomy in their learning process (Stiggins & Chappuis, 2006). Not only conveying the standard of quality but also holding the students accountable to the quality or expectation. For example, in V11’s class, one of the students requested to re do the work voluntarily. This outcome matches with Character Effective Principle 7 that character education should strive to develop students’ intrinsic motivation. As students develop good character, they develop a stronger inner commitment to challenge and do their best (CEP, 2013).

According to CEP’s Principle 7 (refer to Appendix A) character education should strive to develop students’ intrinsic motivation. It is the culture of excellence that enables to ignite the internal motivation of students, thus making to devote their energy, and taking pride in their accomplishment. Both teachers mentioned that setting high expectations enable the students to challenge and gain satisfaction, thus feeling proud from their given effort. High expectations and encouragement for accomplishment produce best results (Zins et al., 2004). V6 described the classroom environment should be filled with zest to achieve excellence and both teachers and students appreciate learning and hard work (Masten, 2003). Culture promotes particular habits,
expectancies to achieve high quality or standards that affect individual’s actions to meet the goals due to the different interpretation of events. Human is vulnerable to suggestion and imitation. This means that if they see someone else do something, they are likely to do it too (Narveez, 2010)

Figure 6.4 illustrates the ‘Learning’ component with the elements of ‘Scaffolding’ and ‘Feedback’ while the ‘Advancing’ component portrays the elements of ‘Encouragement’, ‘Growth’, and ‘Quality’ of Motivation Teaching Mode with given examples.

Figure 6.4: Exemplary components and elements of Motivation Teaching Mode
6.1.3.5 Exemplary Dispositions and Practices: Values Teaching Mode

The exemplary teachers in this study emphasized the importance of having exemplary practices to instil value in students by monitoring, dealing and advocating professionally.

V11 commented that monitoring students’ behaviour and attuning to the happenings in the classroom are the responsibility of the teacher. During class period, moral issue conflicts or social issues would occur. Teachers should take advantage of these gold moments to develop students’ understanding and the importance of applying such values in life to prevent issues from happening (Meuwissen, 2005). V11 also emphasized that when misbehaviour happened it was important to deal with it spontaneously. Narveez (2010) also agreed that it is a golden opportunity to correct and instill values on the spot.

The way V11 dealt with misbehaving students was that she tried to understand the reason behind each student’s misbehavior. It is essential to be highly sensitive to students’ needs in order to deal with it. Observation skill is an important skill which teachers need to master in order to identify students’ needs, hence assisting them to have positive change (Noddings, 2010). The teacher builds good interpersonal bonding which facilitate the character development process of the students. V6 shared her approach in dealing with misbehaviours students by empowering hyperactive students to take charge of the class’s behaviour by being a role model. The particular hyperactive student gradually improved with the given responsibility. She handled the student professionally with her approach. There are a vast repertoire of strategies, models, and styles that a teacher can to employ depending on the situational needs of the classroom (Dawn, 2008).

V11 was an advocator in promoting and instilling a culture of positive values. She always ensured her students and herself practiced in action. This matches with the
Moral Reasoning Process, which move from moral knowing to moral valuing. Teachers facilitate students to internalize the values by continuously emphasizing the right and good (Lumpkin, 2008). The constant reinforcing of values by teachers are aligned with CEP’s Principle 8 (refer to Appendix A). The teachers take the responsibility as a character educator who also adhere to the same core values that is intended to guide the students through repeated reinforcement.

Both teachers further emphasized the importance of themselves being a role model to the students instilling values and shaping character. As Noddings (2010) put it, regardless of good or bad teachers, students constantly observed their teachers’ behaviour and actions. Therefore, teacher modelling is always the imperative trait in Character Education as students will consciously or unconsciously emulate their teacher’s behaviours and actions (Bier, 2008). Similarly, this matches with CEP Effective Principle 8 that teachers must model the values in their behaviour and actions which influence the character of students (CEP, 2013).

V6 explained through a reciprocity approach where if she embraced such values, the students would attune to her actual behaviour and model those values or practices. Teachers who know the impact of their behaviour and actions will take their manner seriously (Midle, 2008). They understand that they cannot expect honesty without being honest or generosity without being generous or diligence without themselves being diligent. Teachers who model respect will in turn gain respect from students and a respective learning environment is to be created (Noddings, 1992).

V6 mentioned that a teacher needs to be tough and must not tolerate misbehaviour. It is essential to hold them accountable about their values. Teachers help students with self-discipline (Narveez, 2010). The visible and evident outcome was that V6’s classroom’s students ensured each other to focus and pay attention to the teacher’s teaching. V6 highlighted the importance they placed on the independence of their
students and the responsibility for their part in the learning process to behave appropriately. Self-responsibility is essential. This was noted by V6. In a democratic learning environment, leadership and rule setting is commonly encouraged by every student. All students play a role to help in managing the classroom (Narveez, 2010).

Figure 6.5 illustrates the ‘Behaviour’ component with the elements of ‘Monitor’, ‘Deal’, ‘Growth’ and ‘Professional’ of Value Teaching Mode with given examples.

**Figure 6.5:** Exemplary components and elements of Value Teaching Mode
6.1.3.6 Exemplary Dispositions and Practices: Instructional Teaching Mode

The exemplary teachers in this study emphasized the importance of giving instructional dispositions and practices through exemplary verbal and coordination in class. Exemplary verbal practices include the voice and intonation expression. In addition, coordination of class flow means catching students’ attention, giving clear instruction (clarity), managing the class’s transition and pacing.

Students were paying attention to the two exemplary teachers’ story during the story telling section. V6 had the ability to catch students’ attention so well during her story-telling session. She perceived that it was important for a character educator to be a good story teller. Conveying values through stories are better than lecturing. A good teacher is able to depict the character well by being a good story teller Milne (2010). The verbal expression includes the ability of varying the voice volume and intonation that can depict different characters of the story. For example, from the exemplary teacher’s practices, the teacher could speak like a monster, girl, and an old man or any others depicting the character with different voices and speaking softly and suddenly shrieking to depict a sudden happening in the story.

Both teachers shared the indicator of having good classroom management ability and perceived it as the centre of successful teaching. V11 specifically shared her chaotic moment when she didn’t master the instructional skills when she was a novice teacher. This laid importance on the teacher’s experiences on how important they perceived instructional skills especially in a student-cantered and activity-based teaching approach classroom style. V11 emphasized the power of clarity and the ability to establish attention signals such as dimming the lights to catch attention or explaining clearly by giving instructions step-by-step. V11 also suggested having a demonstration or modelling in explaining the activities. This could minimize time lost during the activity.
V6 believed that by working cooperatively, everyone would gain. Cooperative learning builds positive relationships among students (Howes, 2000). She believed that peer influence is powerful. Peer learning influences are the common norm of personality among the members who exhibit and also consider as their type of habit dispositions they have practiced with (Narveez, 2010). Positive peer learning approaches include tutoring, giving feedback to each other as well as helping (Hattie, 2012).

V6 & V11 commented that management of transitions is important to the teacher in managing the students’ movement within the class for different types of activities in order to save time. She suggested a way to signal the students returning to their seats after each transition session. The class flow could be smoother with better transition and pacing of the class. Time could be controlled well. The teacher must master the interrelation of applying various approach of instruction (Hal, 2007), creating a suitable learning environment or climate as well as familiarize the management routines (Charney, 2002; Routman, 2000; Putman, 2009). Both teachers felt to nurture students to have the self-responsibility ensured efficiency of time used in class while they just needed to ensure the smooth operation of the classroom. Hence, having students to be ‘accountable’ and have ‘self-responsibility’ are emphasized here once again.

Figure 6.6 (p.230) illustrates the ‘Verbal’ component with the elements of ‘Voice’ and ‘Intonation’ while ‘Coordination’ component with the elements of ‘Attention’, ‘Clarity’, ‘Transition’ and ‘Pacing’ of Instructional Teaching Mode with a given example.
Figure 6.6: Exemplary components and elements of Instructional Teaching Mode
6.1.3.7 Exemplary Dispositions and Practices: Linkage Teaching Mode

The exemplary teachers in this study emphasized the importance of linking the learning objective of the class to students’ daily life. First of all, it is essential to get the student’s interest by hooking them with an appealing expressed learning objective and the process of externalizing students’ prior knowledge. After the class activities, teachers are required to explain the purpose of the activity, the importance of the learning objective as well as the application of the learned skills and values in daily life. This relates to Character CEP’s Principle 3 (refer to Appendix A) stating effective character education requires aggressive and comprehensive approach to instil values among students. The programmes have to be designed in a proactive way instead of waiting the moments of teaching or opportunities to happen (CEP, 2013).

The teacher would periodically ask students to answer the learning objective of the day throughout the class. V6 emphasized the importance of ensuring all students remember the learning objective as it is the core of the lesson. Both the teachers and students need to be crystal clear about the learning objectives and constantly check whether the class is on track towards meeting the objective (Hattie, 2012). If teachers want to meet the desired learning outcome, they must communicate the goals to the students at the beginning of the class. According to V6, fun and excitement is the hook needed to hook the students’ attention in learning through. This is supported by Hattie (2012), saying that having students’ attention and excitement about the learning intentions at the start of the class support their learning.

In addition, assessing students’ prior knowledge with regards to the topic is an essential practice, stated by V11. Hattie (2012) suggested that teachers must know what students prior knowledge and ability. V11 tried her best to understand her student’s level of understanding in relation to the value they were learning for the day by inviting them to formulate hypotheses, link connection and challenge prior perceptions and
thinking. The benefits of explanation and making connection practices were also outlined in increasing student’s self-esteem by allowing students to express what they have known in relation to their prior knowledge. For introducing a new learning objective, V6 would prompt her students’ immediate experiences in search for meaningful examples. One such practice was to ask about recent events which took place in the school, neighbourhood, at home or about an event that was a headline nationally or internationally. Figure 6.7 (p.233) illustrates that teachers need to hook students’ interest to ensure they remember the learning objective and also assess their (students) prior knowledge.

V11 shared her techniques in prompting the students to answer questions (open ended questions) and explaining (using imaginative analogies and metaphors) regarding the value concepts or skills being presented (connecting to lives beyond schools) and gradually students could gradually build the skills and values in them. Straits and Wilke (2002) emphasize the importance of providing students the opportunity to reflect upon what they have acquired in class and reinforce through verbal expression.

V11 also emphasized that it was essential to allow students to understand what they learn relates to the daily life through the engagement of discussion. The dialogue between teachers and students should be such that all students have the opportunity to think about the relationship and express their thoughts (Stiggins & Chappuis, 2005). Both teachers ensured the students realized the importance of the learning that could be applied in real life.

In Figure 6.7 (p.233) illustrates the ‘Hook’ component with the elements of ‘Learning Objective’ and ‘Prior Knowledge’ while ‘Experiential’ component with the elements of ‘Explanation’, ‘Importance’, and ‘Application’ of Linkage Teaching Mode with given examples.
6.1.3.8 Alignment between the Established Codes Content and Model of Processing

As noted in Chapter 5, the established Codes of Exemplary Situated Teaching for Character Education in this study is CRAMVIL Teaching Modes have four columns namely ‘Component of Teaching Mode’, ‘Description of Teaching Mode’, ‘Indicator of Teaching Mode’ and ‘Example Practices of Teaching Mode’ (refer to Appendix Q).
The theory-of-action, Argyris and Schon (1974) proposed the Model of Processing. This model consists of three elements, namely governing variables, action strategy and consequences (see Figure 3.2, p.98). ‘Governing Variables’ refers to a group of variables that one must keep within the limitation set in an organization or setting. These variables dependent to each other which means that an action will likely to impact upon others. The next element ‘Action Strategies’, includes the moves and actions taken by individuals to keep the governing variables within an acceptable range. The last element, ‘Consequences’, means the results of the actions.

After the process of establishing the codes, the researcher discovered the alignment of the codes content to the elements of Model of Processing by Argyris and Schon (1974). The established codes ‘Component’ is aligned with the ‘Governing Variable’. The ‘Component’ of CRAMVIL Teaching Mode includes ‘Expression’, ‘Context’, ‘Personality’, ‘Communication’, ‘Improvement’, ‘Scaffolding’, ‘Learning’, ‘Behaviour’, ‘Verbal’, ‘Coordination’, ‘Hook’ and ‘Experiential’, twelve components in total. It means, there are twelve variables that teachers must keep within acceptable limits in an organization as these variables can impact students. Secondly, the column of ‘Example Practices’ in the established codes is aligned with ‘Action Strategy’ (refer to Appendix Q – established codes). These examples are moves and actions taken by teachers to create the learning outcome among students. Lastly, the column of ‘Indicators’ in the established codes (refer to Appendix Q – established codes) is aligned with the ‘Consequences’. The practices which teachers take action on creating the intended result. The indicators refer to the students’ actions and behaviour (intended result) due to the teachers’ actions or practices.

Figure 6.8 (p.235), it is a representation diagram to show the alignment between the established codes content and Model of Processing. The dotted arrows show the alignment between the elements.
6.1.3.9 Alignment between the Established Codes and Effective Teaching Approaches

According to the literature review under the heading of ‘Effective Teaching Approaches’ (section 2.5.1), the researcher is able to compare the similarity to the established codes’ elements of exemplary dispositions and practices in this research. This is an important as this present research supports the comprehensive literature and yet be able contribute to the existing knowledge of exemplary character educators.

The researcher employs an example shown in Table 6.1 (p.236). The Cognitive science effective teaching approach requires teachers to create a meaningful context (as highlighted in Table 6.1) in relation to the lesson plan. On the other hand, elements derived from this research, ‘Atmosphere’, ‘Explanation’, ‘Application’ are also related to existing literature.

Description of the ‘Atmosphere’ element is that teacher employs music and space, decoration to create for contextual and emotional learning. Description of the ‘Explanation’ element is that teacher gives attractive real life examples to intrigue the motivation of students to learn. Description of the ‘Application’ element is that teacher requests students to summarize the leaning and ensure that the students share application examples relating to their real life. The given element descriptions provide
further support that the exemplary practices drawn out from the exemplary research participants are aligned with those from past literature.

**Table 6.1**: Alignment between the Established Code and Effective Teaching Approaches

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Process-Product</th>
<th>CRAMVIL Teaching Mode (Elements)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Classroom climate</td>
<td>CRAMVIL Teaching Mode (Elements)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-classroom management</td>
<td>Attention, Transition, Pacing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-behaviour management</td>
<td>Monitor, Deal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Right reaching</td>
<td>Clarity, Voice, Intonation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-class instruction</td>
<td>Objective, Advocate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-clear expectation</td>
<td>Application, Interaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-effective questioning</td>
<td>Feedback, Recording</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-feedback to students</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flexible teaching</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- teaching strategies</td>
<td>Body Action, Facial Motion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- difficulty of questions</td>
<td>Scaffolding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- materials</td>
<td>Tools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- learning styles</td>
<td>Energy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cognitive Science</td>
<td>CRAMVIL Teaching Mode (Elements)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Create cognitive processing structures for knowledge</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-curriculum</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-classroom routines</td>
<td>Transition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practice best process-product techniques</td>
<td>Scaffolding, Deal, Professionalism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-decision making</td>
<td>Interaction, Engagement, Proactive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-develop relationships with student</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching of cognitive strategies</td>
<td>Atmosphere, Explanation, Application</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-provide meaningful context</td>
<td>Trust, Prior Knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-understand children during interactive teachings</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constructivist</td>
<td>CRAMVIL Teaching Mode (Elements)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prior knowledge and new knowledge</td>
<td>Prior knowledge, explanation, importance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-student and student co-construct meaning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social relationship in classroom</td>
<td>Trust, Charming,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-build trust and caring</td>
<td>Engagement, Explanation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-help by the more expert others</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Establish learning environment</td>
<td>Encouragement, Growth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-willing to take risk to learn</td>
<td>Quality, Importance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-responsibility of learning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The two exemplary teachers at Prokidz Institution provided their embedded situational teaching knowledge for character education. The discussed exemplary dispositions and practices facilitated the establishment of Exemplary Situated Teaching for Character Education and support existing literature. The next section is the description of factors that affect ‘learning to teach’ experience of novice teachers at Prokidz Institution through the 30-Hour Cognitive Apprenticeship Training.

6.2 ‘Learning to Teach’ Experience of Novice Teachers throughout the 30-Hour Cognitive Apprenticeship Training

This section answers Research Question 3 of the study: What are the factors that affect the ‘learning to teach experience’ of novice teachers at Prokidz Institution? To facilitate better understanding on how the novice teachers gained their ‘learning to teach’ experience, the researcher first enlightened the reader by giving the mechanism of the 30-Hour Cognitive Apprenticeship Training. It followed by the interviews conducted with the selected two novice teachers to help understand the factors that affect ‘learning to teach’ experience of novice teachers for character education at Prokidz Institution. Lastly, the researcher discussed the result presented.

6.2.1 30-Hour Cognitive Apprenticeship Training

In this study, the researcher modified the Cognitive Apprenticeship Model to prepare novice teachers for character education. The researcher termed this training to prepare novice teachers as ‘30-Hour Cognitive Apprenticeship Training’. The exemplary teacher participants played the role as coach to the novice teacher participants. There are three coaching stages, namely Coaching Stage 1 – ‘Observation’, Coaching Stage 2 – ‘Scaffolding’ and Coaching Stage 3 – ‘Exploration’ (refer to Table 3.2, p. 106)

In the ‘Observation’ stage, novice teachers learned by observing the exemplary teachers model their exemplary situated teaching in their classroom. Essentially the
exemplary teacher modelled and explained the thought process while novice teachers observed and made connections to the learning. The exemplary teachers provided explanation by employing the established codes of exemplary situated teaching to facilitate better learning understanding of novice teachers.

In the ‘Scaffolding’ stage, it was the support that exemplary teachers provided that helped the novice teachers to carry out the teaching task with guided feedback. The ‘Dependent Teaching’ entailed opportunities for novice teachers to practice while the exemplary teachers (coach) provided feedback, hints, correction, advice and assistance when needed. The exemplary teachers (coach) used the established codes of exemplary situated teaching to give feedback to the novice teachers. After every class, there would be a session for ‘Articulation’ in which novice teachers were encouraged to verbalize their understanding and thinking. The novice teachers would also reflect or look back on their performance and compare their reflections to their exemplary teacher (coach). Eventually the novice teachers would be able to do the assigned teaching tasks with little or no help eventually from exemplary teachers, thus proceeding to the next coaching stage.

In the ‘Exploration’ stage, novice teachers manipulated and explored the learned skills or knowledge to promote their true understanding through application to teach independently. Similarly, the ‘Articulation’ and ‘Reflection’ process was carried out in this coaching stage. The exemplary teachers employed the codes as an evaluation tool to assess the exemplary dispositions and practices of novice teachers for their independent teaching class section.

Table 6.2 below is the structure that illustrates the coaching stages of this training. Each coaching stage has a specific number of hours to fulfil.
Table 6.2: Mechanism of 30-Hour Cognitive Apprenticeship Training

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Coaching Stages</th>
<th>Components</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Hours</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Observation</td>
<td>Modelling, Explaining</td>
<td>2 Lessons</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scaffolding</td>
<td>Dependent Teaching, Articulation, Reflection</td>
<td>4 Lessons</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exploration</td>
<td>Independent Teaching, Articulation, Reflection</td>
<td>4 Lessons</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The ‘Observation’ Stage required two class lessons. The number of hours included an hour for novice teachers to model their coach (exemplary teacher) during the class; another two hours for the coach to explain by employing the established codes of exemplary situated teaching to facilitate better learning understanding of novice teachers. The total hours required at this stage was six hours (1 hour modelling lesson + 2 hours explaining = 3 hours x 2 times = 6 hours). As for the ‘Scaffolding’ Stage, there was a one hour ‘Dependent Teaching’ lesson, and two hour ‘Articulation’ session for a frequency of four times. The total hours required at this stage was twelve hours (1 hour Dependent Teaching lesson + 2 hours Articulation session = 3 hours x 4 times = 12 hours). Novice teachers were required to write their reflection in a journal after their teaching lessons. This facilitated the researcher to understand the experience of novice teachers throughout the learning and teaching process as a data triangulation method besides interviewing them at in the later phase of this study. The ‘Exploration’ stage has a similar mechanism as the ‘Scaffolding’ stage. However, there was a slight difference where the researcher decided to have the novice teachers to be evaluated by both the exemplary teachers using the established Codes of Exemplary Situated Teaching.

When this study was initially conceived, the researcher intended to only understand the factors that affect ‘learning to teach’ experience from novice teachers as a result of a 30-Hour Cognitive Apprenticeship Training. However, upon the last stage of the training (Exploration Stage where the novice teachers would independently teach without any assistance/coach from the exemplary teacher), it gave the researcher the
impetus to carry out an evaluation phase. During the last coaching stage – ‘Exploration’ of final two teaching lessons, each novice teacher was evaluated by two exemplary teachers for two lessons using the code of exemplary situated teaching dispositions and practices for character education. This evaluation was to assess the performance of novice teachers after the learning phases through the 30-Hour Cognitive Apprenticeship Training. The reason for having both exemplary teachers to evaluate the performance of each novice teacher was to triangulate the evaluation result and increase reliability. The researcher created an evaluation format by infusing the established code (Appendix R).

The total hours required at this stage was twelve hours (*1 hour Dependent Teaching lesson + 2 hours Articulation session = 3 hours x 4 times = 12 hours*). In this ‘Exploration’ stage there was a one hour ‘Independent Teaching’ lesson, and a two hour ‘Articulation’ session for a frequency of four times. The total hours required at this stage was twelve hours (*1 hour Independent Teaching lesson + 2 hours Articulation session = 3 hours x 4 times = 12 hours*). The total number of hours in this 30-Hour Cognitive Apprenticeship Training was 30 hours.

Each Novice Teacher Interview (NTI) began with questions drawn from the Cognitive Apprenticeship Training’s mechanism. NTI interviews in this study began with questions about the experience throughout the training, experience with the coach (exemplary teacher), and feelings during and after the training. The experiences that are represented here are the actual words of the participants as drawn from the transcripts of the NTI. Please note that all names found in the transcript have been shortened to a single letter in order to assure the anonymity of all participants and students. Novice teachers for this study were coded as NT 1 & NT 2.

At the time of the researcher’s encounter with NT 1, she had no experience in teaching at Prokidz Institution as well as other places. However, she showed a high level of enthusiasm and passion to be an educator during the interview session (novice
teacher research participant selection process), especially on character building education. As for NT 2, she has been teaching at a tuition centre in relation to academic subjects, but not character education, not in Prokidz Institution too. Both of them have been teaching at the Institute for Beginner and Intermediate Level. In this study, they were trained for the Beginner (age group 10 -12) & Intermediate Level (age group 13 – 15).

Before this training was conducted to prepare novice teachers for character education, the researcher had a short briefing to enlighten novice teachers (apprentice) and exemplary teachers (coach) about their roles and responsibilities. Table 6.3 below shows the roles and responsibilities both exemplary teachers and novice teachers throughout the 30-Hour Cognitive Apprenticeship Training.

**Table 6.3:** Roles & responsibilities of exemplary teachers as coaches and novice teachers as apprentices throughout the 30-Hour Cognitive Apprenticeship Training

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Coaching Stages</th>
<th>Component</th>
<th>Roles and Responsibilities Exemplary Teacher (NT)</th>
<th>Roles and Responsibilities Exemplary Teacher (ET)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Observation</td>
<td>Modelling</td>
<td>Teach and exemplify the exemplary dispositions and practices in class</td>
<td>Observe ET’s exemplary dispositions and practices in the class</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Explaining</td>
<td>Explain according to the codes</td>
<td>Ask questions and clarify doubts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Answer questions from NT</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dependent Teaching</td>
<td>Observe NT in conducting class</td>
<td>Teach and experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Help out when necessarily during the class when NT faces difficulties</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Articulation</td>
<td>Explain according to the codes</td>
<td>Ask questions and clarify doubts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Answer questions from NT</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reflection</td>
<td>Write feedback to NT about the teaching practice</td>
<td>Write a journal about the class teaching experience Learn from ET’s feedback</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exploration</td>
<td>Independent Teaching</td>
<td>Observe and evaluate NT based on the codes</td>
<td>Teach and experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Articulation</td>
<td>Answer questions from NT</td>
<td>Ask questions and clarify doubts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reflection</td>
<td>Assess the teaching performance during the last two lessons of NT</td>
<td>Write a journal about the class teaching experience Learn from ET’s assessment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6.2.1.1 Novice Teacher (NT 1, NTI, 16-6-2014)

NT1 highlighted the importance of observing her coach. She perceived that observing and modelling from an experienced teacher was able to provide her an avenue to see what she would expect from the students in a classroom setting. Developing the art of close observation is important.

‘This stage is important for me. I learn through observation. My coach is really good. I love modelling because I have time to look how this should be in the classroom. So, I think modelling is to ensure what you would expect our kids to be as well and learn from the experienced teacher.’

Of course she was aware about the dangers in relying solely on observation as she also reckoned that currently there was insufficient of good character educators. However, she felt very lucky to have her coach (V6) to guide her. She admired her energy level and ability to control the class.

‘But there is a danger...Not every teacher is good. I mean not every experienced teacher is good. What if I have gotten a not very competent teacher? Oh well, I feel very lucky to have V6 as my coach. She is really awesome. The way she controls the class and the energy level she has to teach. I really admire her.’

Active learning creates more meaningful learning for NT 1 that she could use to create active learning in her classrooms. She felt excited to learn something that could help the students. This satisfaction with active learning opportunities translated into a higher rate of classroom implementation for active learning strategies by reviewing the authentic student work and see their improvement.

‘I like the active involvement as a learner and teacher. Just having the opportunity to practice what I have learned, having the opportunity to see the results of the teaching. I am always excited if I feel like I am going to learn something that is going to help the students. Just having the opportunity to practice what I am learning, having the opportunity to see the results of in my classroom during the training is great.’
Nonverbal communication signals, such as body language is important as every body language depicts certain messages that are sent across to students. NT1 realized that her facial expression actually depicted her disapproval and judgment on students from her coach’s feedback.

‘I became more aware with my non-verbal language... I remember one of the feedbacks from my coach, it really daunted me. I realized that when I was thinking, people thought that I was judging and disapproving them because of my facial expression.’

NT 1 mentioned the two roles she was working on, both learner and teacher.

‘...I was working on myself as a learner not only as a teacher...’

NT 1 shared not only she appreciated the feeling of externalizing the learning, she learnt much about the technicality of teaching such as the writing of the lesson plan, the components and elements stated in the Codes as well as the challenges she faced through asking lots of questions.

‘...We talk about the components, the elements, the lesson plan or particular challenge that I was facing. It was very pertinent and rigorous. I asked a lot of questions too...’

NT 1 found that she learned a lot from her coach as she (coach) was willing to share her best practices, to offer her suggestions, to share helpful resources and advice, as well as gaining insightful lessons from the written feedback given by the coach after every lesson. She also found great benefit from learning experiences that included receiving feedback constantly on their own teaching from their coach.

‘...Sharing best practices, offering suggestions to problems or questions, and sharing helpful resources and advice... Especially the feedback written by my coach after every lesson.... it was so helpful and useful for me to learn...Through the feedback that my coach gave me, I learned so much from there.’

NT 1 knew that she was improving through the following indicators. As the training period progressed, the support that the coach provided changed in both quantity and
quality. There was a decrease in the amount of support provided as she (NT 1) increased in competence and confidence. These recommendations from the exemplary teacher (coach) built on NT 1 during articulation sessions pushed her (NT 1) thinking about her (NT 1) instructional decision making, focusing not only on what she was ready to do, but on how she was ready to think about her instruction. Comments on teaching practice and discussions became shorter.

‘...Initially in the Articulation process, my coach gave me lots of recommendations and suggestions while I asked many questions about the codes and teaching practices, the rationale behind...Gradually, my coach started to prompt me questions about my decisions, practices and behaviour...We had shorter dialogue time too...’

NT 1 felt her progress and contentment when she received praise from her coach (V6). Her confidence level increased eventually due to her coach placing value on to her teaching practices. She could also gain much trust from the students with her attention and enthusiasm during class.

‘In her written feedback started to see praise! I was so happy to receive her appraisal on my fifth teaching day. At a later stage, she gave me lots of confidence by agreeing to my teaching practices and more appraisals. I could also feel that my students trusted me more with my attention and enthusiasm during class.’

NT 1 reported the importance of having the Codes in increasing their knowledge about the best practices with the description.

‘I feel like I have gained so much in this short period of time. I started of not knowing what to do with the codes of conduct. I have got bits and pieces of stuff all over, and it’s just trying to make those connections and put it all together. However, through description in the codes and the real life teaching experiences, it helps a lot.’

The Codes also helped the novice teacher to understand how to be an exemplary teacher and how to better engage students and instil positive values. It facilitated the
novice teacher’s learning. She reckoned that her coach was indeed the exemplary teacher who matched with the description of the Codes.

‘I find the codes really useful as it gives me the guideline in increasing my knowledge about the best practices, how to be an exemplary teacher and how to better engage students and instil positive values. So, by knowing the code and observing how the coach teaches, it’s really easy for me to learn. My coach really matches what’s stated in the code.’

NT 1 valued the motivation and encouragement given by her coach especially during the moment when she encountered a feeling of inadequacy and low self-esteem.

‘Lots of motivation and encouragement were given to me at the beginning of the class practices. I think my coach sensed my self-esteem was lowered due to my inadequate and poor teaching skills. …she motivates me too.

Throughout the training, she described the relationship between herself and the coach as important for her experiences. She described her coach as a caring and supportive person. She felt comfortable with her coach (V6) throughout the learning journey sharing her experience, difficulties, feelings and thinking.

‘I don’t feel isolated or alone, struggling for lack of support, knowledge and resolve in my practices…Not at all… My coach is very caring and supportive. The dialogue with her and reflection allow me to share my learning experiences, difficulties, feelings and thinking to the coach…’

NT 1 felt respected and didn’t feel being inferior as a novice teacher.

‘Honestly, I had never been in an environment where no one was judging me, I never felt unintelligent, or I’m just a second-grade teacher, or anything to make me feel down on myself.’

She highlighted that compassion was the key element to get in touch with people. To touch someone deeply through modelling humanness which she reckoned her coach (V6) was already doing.

‘…I think compassion and caring is important. With empathy and understanding, I can help the students better because I can understand them more…’
The training was able to increase her (NT 1) confidence level and self-esteem and in turn could better support her students in their learning. She knew that she could make a difference in the world with her effort and contribution.

‘I am confident that I can help the students and nurture the next generation... I am really happy... I feel good about myself...I know what I can do for the world...We can make a difference by modelling the humanness...’

Next, the researcher put the ‘learning to teach’ experience in words of NT 2 in the following section.

6.2.1.2 Findings of Novice Teacher (NT 2, NTI, 16-6-2014)

NT2 felt that observing her coach’s actions and behaviours rather than personality had been specifically very useful in developing teaching skills and personal growth. She noted that an observation should be purposeful, rather than casual, always seeking for reasons behind certain actions and behaviour of her coach.

‘I observed the actions and behaviours of my coach rather than personality traits. She has given me a very unique way of being a teacher... It was my first time experiencing such a fun and energetic class. The way she talked, conducted and managed the class was an eye-opener for me... Every practice has a purpose. I was questioning in my mind the reasons of my coach doing certain actions and why she behaved in a certain way.’

NT 2 commented that the Codes had definitely helped her a lot as a teaching framework hence assisting her to observe more critically or acutely. The Codes helped her to focus and made her observe specifically instead of vaguely. With the description of the codes and indicator of the classroom, it had given her a clearer picture and direction on what to focus in her class.

‘..It just totally focused me and made my efforts so much more specific and I think powerful and targeted. It trained me to observe, which something I think many teachers sometimes don’t do is...Not that they don’t want, maybe just that they don’t know what to look for. Nonetheless, with the code’s description and indicator, it gives a very clear picture and direction on what to focus... ’
In addition, NT 2 commented that the Codes served as a guideline to coordinate the instructional activities yet having the flexibility to meet individual student’s needs.

‘The code served as a great guideline that gave recommendations... pacing of instructional activities. I didn’t feel the constraint by this code as I was still flexible in meeting the needs of each individual student. I can still teach my class the way...’

She acknowledged that the Codes helped her to be an exemplary teacher instead of doing things in a trial and error manner.

‘I am able to put the codes into action... the codes really help me a lot to be an exemplary teacher like my coach instead of me going trial and error.’

NT 2 believed that attempting challenges and complex problems at the beginning stage of her career was a great source of learning.

‘...I learn when there’s struggle, I learn when there is dissonance, I learn when there is disequilibrium. I learn through problems...

NT 2 was astounding about the learning experience she could get in a short period of time with the combination usage of the Codes as well as the guidance from the coach.

‘The codes give me a clear guideline on what I am supposed to do, and with the combination of having a coach to guide me through...It is amazing to learn in such short duration.’

NT 2 shared her experience in facing a problematic child. This experience had given her the avenue to improve on her classroom management ability, working with her coach and learn the approach to deal with such behaviour. Once again emphasizing facing problems was an excellent way of learning.

‘I faced a problematic child. This necessitated me to seek for classroom management ability, working with my coach, approach to deal with such behaviour and a number of other things only in theory. I believed that attempting challenges and complex problems give be a great source of learning...forced me to draw on a range of skills, bringing these together and applying them... I am grateful that I had such experience also making me feel more ‘professional’...
The Codes facilitated her understanding faster and hence enhanced her teaching skills.

‘Especially referring to the codes, it facilitates my understanding further and quickly allows me to enhance my teaching in the class.’

NT 2’s coach (V6) gave her motivation and encouragement to have the courage in making changes. A good relationship among the coach and novice teacher enables learning to take place in a positive environment.

‘...my coach was always able to motivate me and give me the booster to be better. I feel better after talking to her always...Largely it is due to the support I received from my coach. The encouragement has motivated me to continue with great desire and has allowed me to feel courage in making changes and improve tremendously... I never was around anyone to bring such a positive effect to the learning experience. The positive atmosphere was beneficial to my learning...’

NT 2 started off by asking lots of question initially and she had lots of recommendations and suggestions from her coach (V6). Eventually, this process reversed as her coach asked her questions on how to improve and tried to understand her perception and feeling of the class.

‘...I had lots of questions to ask her initially. I remember she gave many suggestions and feedback for me to improve. Later on, it was a reverse process as she asked me questions on how to improve and knowing my perceptions as well as feeling of the class...’

Her coach gave fewer recommendations, more affirmations; more praises and put the novice teacher’s role as a partner instead of an apprentice at the later stage to discuss what was best for the students. These were forms of indicators allowing a novice teacher to know that she was improving and thus, increase her confidence level.

‘...when my coach started to reckon and affirm my actions, I knew I was improving. Besides, I really appreciate when she appraised and gave me inspiring encouragement to be a great educator. At the later stage... we were like colleagues working together, discussing together to plan what’s best for the children. That moment, I felt that I was good. Automatically, I increased my confidence level...’
The comments given by the coach changed from directive to affirmation.

‘To contrast, the initial comments were more directives but it changed to more affirming on my decisions and practices...’

NT 2 felt she benefited from active participation in learning experiences rather than based on the passive transmission of knowledge and skills. She described as having the opportunity to practice after modelling her coach.

‘I am so glad it is not a lecture style at all. If the coach didn’t model and explain the teaching practices, if they are just standing there and telling you all of the things that you are supposed to do without having a clear picture... then how am I supposed to teach? I think I can’t sit and get...At least for me, I need to do it and need to make something and figure it out through experience...’

NT 2 emphasized the importance of being supportive and yet allowed freedom to learn from mistakes with the guidance provided.

‘I think it is important to seek for a balancing point to receive support yet have the freedom to make mistakes in order to learn I really like my coach because she allows me to try teaching and support me by giving me guidance without the autocratic way to follow every step...’

6.2.1.3 Discussion on Modified Cognitive Apprenticeship Model

According to Brown, Collins & Duguid (1989), cognitive apprenticeship model comprises the components include modelling, explaining, coaching, scaffolding, reflection, articulation and exploration (refer to Table 3.1). In this study, the researcher modified the cognitive apprenticeship model to prepare novice teachers for character education. The researcher describes the entire cognitive apprenticeship process as the ‘Coaching Process’ instead stand-alone component (refer to section 3.2.2 for detailed explanation). Instead of a step-by-step approach according to the cognitive apprenticeship model developed by (Brown et.al, 1989), the researcher divided the model into three coaching stages, namely ‘Observation’, ‘Scaffolding’ and
‘Exploration’ (refer to Table 3.2, p.104 for the modified cognitive apprenticeship model).

NT 2 commented that the codes were confusing initially but after the articulation session with her coach explaining the rationale behind her (V11) actions and dispositions, she could link it so much better through observing. [Coaching Stage 1: Modelling & Explaining]

‘It was initially a bunch of words, but it made so much sense when my coach used that in our first dialogue session, talking through about her actions and reason behind such actions or dispositions

NT 1 enjoyed the articulation session a lot. She commented that her coach (V6) gave her much time to express what she had observed, heard and learned. This process made her learning experience more meaningful through externalization. Teachers’ participation in verbal discussions is related to their sense of importance of subject under discussion, its direct connection to what they could do with their students, and the support they feel they would receive for making such changes and improvements that are being discussed (Risko et.al, 2009). [Stage 2: Dependent Teaching, Articulation, Reflection]

‘...She has given me much time in which I can talk about what I have seen, heard and learned and it makes the learning experience more meaningful. I get to see live teaching and talk about it, and take it apart. My coach is conducting this rigorous dialogue about what I am seeing. It is a very dynamic learning thing.’

Dialogue with her (NT 2) coach enabled the novice teacher to articulate her own thinking, formulate a cohesive understanding that made deeper connections to her prior experiences. Dialogue conversations between coach and apprentice as coaching plays an essential role in teacher development (Risko et al, 2009). The articulation session even provided her the avenue to talk about the strategy to improve her class. [Stage 2: Dependent Teaching, Articulation, Reflection]
'I think is critical for me to just talk it through and inspect the learning and teaching process. It can assist me in processing my learning and making deeper connections to my own prior understandings and experiences...suggesting different strategies to improve my teaching or something else...'

NT 2 liked the reflection as this practice encouraged her to revisit her instructional decision and made herself aware of her teaching. It was important to write her journal identifying areas that needed to be strengthened, with improvement actions to be taken. Reflecting on practice (own and others) encourages novice teachers to revisit instructional experiences and maximizes the construction of meaning (Matanzo & Harris, 1999; Schon, 1987). [Stage 2: Dependent Teaching, Articulation, Reflection]

‘Reflecting on my practices encouraged me to revisit instructional experiences and make meaning. It helped me to have self-awareness. Through journaling, I recognize areas that need, strengthening, consider alternatives, and reconstruct teaching actions.’

NT 1 mentioned that writing a journal made her accountable for her improvement efforts and be more confident to give her best effort to improve. [Stage 2: Dependent Teaching, Articulation, Reflection]

‘Honestly, by asking me to reflect on what I have learned and how to apply it after every lesson really holds me accountable. I need to walk the talk. After every journal writing, it makes me more confident and really try my best to improve my teaching skill in my classroom.

NT 1 also described the components of articulation as important to her experiences. The session was important to her in being able to process all that she was learning and consider ways to implement new ideas, suggestions and feedback into her own classroom. She felt the togetherness with her coach (V6). Morris (2003) considered the impact of discussions between the novice teacher and coach after every class following support provided in situ, as teachers implemented new practices, allowed for dialogue
about questions and concerns as they arose and encouraged teachers to think about their own practice [Coaching Stage 3: Independent Teaching, Articulation, Reflection]

‘I like the articulation process the most which as there was time to share, to consider new knowledge and to think critically about my classroom practices and teaching. I love to talk with my coach after the lesson and share and share and share... I think it was... we were together. I feel the togetherness to have the opportunity to share things as they came up.’

NT 1 commented that every journal writing leads to greater implementation in the classroom as it integrates the new reflected knowledge and skills into existing schema and experiences a shift in ability that must accompany true improvement efforts. [Coaching Stage 3: Independent Teaching, Articulation, Reflection]

‘To me, every journal writing leads to greater implementation in the classroom as it integrate my new knowledge and skills to my existing understanding thus able to improve with given effort.’

NT 1 was asked to revisit what they learned, examined how their practices had changed based on their new learning, and most importantly, to evaluate the impact of these changes on their students’ performance, was a component of reflective practice and informed instructional decision making. [Coaching Stage 3: Independent Teaching, Articulation, Reflection]

‘Reflection was what drove me to really analyse my learning process... ‘I was asked to revisit what I have learned, examine how my practices have changed based on my new learning, and most importantly, to evaluate the impact these changes on the students’ performance.’

6.2.3 Discussion on ‘Learning to Teach’ Experience of Novice Teachers at Prokidz Institution

In this study, the researcher’s intention was to describe the ‘learning to teach experience’ of novice teaches at Prokidz Institution. There are several themes identified by the researcher stated as below.

(a) ‘Learning to Teach’ Experience of Novice Teachers: Active Learning in Situated Classroom
(b) ‘Learning to Teach’ Experience of Novice Teachers: Learning through Coach’s Feedback
(c) ‘Learning to Teach’ Experience of Novice Teachers: Modelling as a Learning Tool
(d) ‘Learning to Teach’ Experience of Novice Teachers: Articulation as a Learning Tool
(e) ‘Learning to Teach’ Experience of Novice Teachers: Journaling as a Learning Tool
(f) ‘Learning to Teach’ Experience of Novice Teachers: Interpersonal Relationship between Exemplary Teacher (Coach) and Novice Teacher (Apprentice)
(g) ‘Learning to Teach’ Experience of Novice Teachers: Change of Coaching Support
(h) ‘Learning to Teach’ Experience of Novice Teachers: Indicators of Improvement

6.2.3.1 ‘Learning to Teach’ Experience: Active Learning in Situated Classroom

Learning to teach is a particular challenging endeavour even to the most accomplished teachers (Manning, 2007). NT 2 in this study also believed that attempting problems and challenges at the beginning stage of her career is a great source of learning. Lieberman and Miller (2004) illustrate how each instance converges to demonstrate the tenet of “learning is experiential and collective; it is context-driven and context-sensitive; and it occurs through social participation” (p.33). NT 2 shared her experience on facing a problematic child. The problem enabled to view different range of teaching dispositions and practices and apply them in the situated context. This necessitated seeking for classroom management ability, working with the other coach, the approach to deal with such behavior.

One aspect mentioned by both participants was the importance of active learning embedded in the cognitive apprenticeship learning approach. NT 2 felt she benefited from active involvement in the learning process rather than just passively receiving knowledge. Instead being a passive observer or learner, the mode of learning in an active
learning engagement (Olgun, 2009). The approach of active learning allows learners to take on a more protagonist, less passive role than in traditional transfer of knowledge approaches (Cookson, 2005).

NT1 described as having the opportunity to practice after modelling her coach. Groves and Strong (2008) claims that a person can learn effectively through observation and imitation. However, according to Bandura’s (1986) Social Cognitive Theory, learning occurs as individuals encounter opportunities to execute. Active learning creates more meaningful learning for NT1 that she could use to create active learning in her classrooms.

Both teachers’ active involvement played the role as a learner and teacher. They noted excitement when learning something that would assist them in their own classrooms and this often served as motivation for pursuing learning opportunities. They suggested that these satisfactions with active learning opportunities translated into a higher rate of classroom implementation for active learning strategies by reviewing the authentic student work and view their improvement. Risko et al. (2009), found that teachers’ belief changed in a positive way when teachers had enactive opportunities to interpret students’ data and observed positive learning outcomes of students through improved teaching. Both also felt excited to learn something that could help the students.

6.2.3.2 ‘Learning to Teach’ Experience: Learning through Feedback given by Coach

The more experienced teacher or expert teacher constantly gives feedback to the novice teachers during their teaching and learning (Collet, 2012). NT 1 found that she learned a lot from her coach as she (coach) was willing to share her best practices, to offer her suggestions, to share helpful resources and advice, as well as gain insightful
lessons from the written feedback given by the coach after every lesson. Feedback is a means by which instructional support is provided and adjusted in the teaching/learning process (Morris, 2003).

NT 1 found great benefit to obtain feedback on her own teaching from her coach. For example, she realized that her facial expression actually depicted her disapproving and judging of students from her coach’s feedback. Nonverbal communication signals, such as body language is important as every body language depicts certain messages that send across to students (Milne, 2010).

6.2.3.3 ‘Learning to Teach’ Experience of Novice Teachers: Modelling as a Learning Tool

Many theorists such as Bandura (1986); Kolb (1984); Wales et al. (1993) supported that observation is an effective tool to increase competence development and also make ways to strengthen the learning process. Those who reported using observation aids may be highly adopting Bandura's model. However, according to Cheff and Chievers (2001), there was a different or rather contrast view about the significance of role model and even deny drawing on role models to shape personal identity instead of copying someone else. In this study, both novice teachers strongly agreed that modelling their coach (exemplary teacher) was a great learning approach.

Modelling is the one of the cognitive tools supported by Maclellan (2008) to enable the development of teacher education to offer teaching-learning situations. NT1 highlighted the importance of observing her coach. Developing the art of close observation is important. Of course she recognized there were problems in depending solely on observation as she too reckoned there was insufficient of capable character educators. However, she felt very lucky to have her coach (V6) to guide her.

During the data analysis process of scrutinizing modelling as a tool for novice teachers to learn, the researcher discovers that the Observational Learning Model by
Bandura (1977) matches well in the context of this study. Referring to Figure 6.9 (p.256), there are four processes that govern observational learning. These are ‘Attention’, ‘Retention’, ‘Reproduction’, and ‘Motivation’. Learners must first attend to the model and decide what information, if any, they will focus on. Then, the learner must also remember the observed events. This retention involves the transfer of what is observed into one’s memory, in the form of symbolic representation. Next, the learner must transform this knowledge into an appropriate course of action thus considering present abilities and capacities when determining this. Lastly, it is this right level of motivation that the learner must have the right level of motivation and want to copy the skill.

![Figure 6.9: Observational Learning Model](based on Bandura, 1977)

NT1 perceived that observing and modelling from an experienced teacher was able to provide her an avenue to see what she would expect from the students in a classroom setting. NT 2 commented that the Codes helped her to focus and made her observe specifically instead of vaguely. With the description of the codes and indicator of the classroom, it had given her a clear picture and direction on what to focus on her class. She noted that an observation should be purposeful, rather than casual, always seeking for reasons behind certain actions and behaviour of her coach. Both novice teachers were clear of the attention they needed to focus on.

In addition, both novice teachers felt that observing their coach’s actions and behaviours rather than personality had been particularly important in facilitating to develop teaching skills and personal growth. It must be clear that modelling is neither
mimicking, nor imitation (Bandura, 2005). NT 1 shared how much she admired her coach (V6) for being so energetic and able to coordinate the class so well. She had a clear mental image about her coach in terms of her dispositions and practices in class. Hence, she was able to retain the mental picture and wanted to be like her coach.

The learning approach was an active learning one where novice teachers were able to apply the developed skills in an authentic situated context, thus impacting students’ learning. This approach served as motivation for pursuing learning opportunities. They reckoned that these satisfactions with active learning opportunities translated into higher rate of classroom implementation and doing their best to reproduce what their coaches were practicing in class.

The researcher has modified the Observational Learning Model by putting two dotted arrows branching from the element ‘Retention’ to the elements of ‘Reproduction’ and ‘Motivation’. According to the novice teachers in this study, they explained that the viability and opportunity to apply what they had learned indeed increased their motivation to teach, putting into action. On the other hand, they also commented that because they took action in the classroom setting, experiencing and witnessing the improvement of their students, this eventually motivated them to learn and teach more. Researches that emphasize on teachers’ attaining goals (Butler, 2007; Retelsdorf, Butler, Streblow & Schiefele, 2010) relate to this situation. The situation in this context means that teachers feel motivated to learn and be better after their executed actions are able to improve student learning. Scrutinizing teacher’s attainment goals has yielded significant findings about their motivation, instructional practices and passion for teaching. Hence, by modelling exemplary teachers, novice teachers could have the motivation and take action or execute real action, experiencing visible teaching and learning outcome thus increasing personal motivation. Hence, it could have two possibilities. The two directional arrow is placed in between the elements
‘Reproduction’ and ‘Motivation’. This is because the researcher discovered from the novice teachers that it is a continuous cycle.

![Modified Observational Learning Model](based on Bandura, 1977)

**Figure 6.10:** Modified Observational Learning Model [based on Bandura, 1977]

### 6.2.3.4 ‘Learning to Teach’ Experience of Novice Teachers: Articulation as a Learning Tool

The participation in dialogue with coaches was described by both novice teachers as important to the overall effectiveness of the cognitive apprenticeship training. Critical dialogue, reflective conversations, and simple talk time were consistent patterns in both novice teachers’ experience. NT 1 enjoyed the articulation session a lot. She commented that her coach (V6) gave her much time to express what she had observed, heard and learned. NT2 commented that articulation was really a great tool to learn.

Articulation was described as being used for different purposes, including using talk to assist novice teachers in making connections and inspecting and formulating their own schema. Dialogue with her (NT 2) coach enabled the novice teacher to articulate her own thinking, formulate a cohesive understanding that made deeper connections to her prior belief. Teachers who initiate change and have ongoing opportunities to dialogue about these changes, often change their beliefs prior to changing their practices or interactively with changes in practice (Richardson & Hamilton, 1994).

Both valued the time given to talk with exemplary teachers (their coach) as well as talking about the best practices for situational teaching. Thoughtful dialogue
encourages novice teachers to analyse their instructional decisions. This is supported by Dutson (2007). The recommendations from the exemplary teacher (coach) built on NT 1 during articulation sessions pushed her (NT 1) thinking about her (NT 1) instructional decision making, focusing not only on what she was ready to do, but on how she was ready to think about her instruction. Extending the experience through dialogue encourages novice teachers to voice their new understandings and adapt them to their own pedagogical contexts (Morris, 2003). The novice teachers felt that this process made their learning experience more meaningful through externalization. As novice teachers become more cognizant thinking behind their own actions, opportunities for growth and change emerge (Risko et al., 2009).

NT 1 shared not only she appreciated the feeling and externalizing the learning, she also learned much about the technicality of teaching such as the preparing of the lesson plan, the components and elements stated in the Codes as well as the challenges she faced through asking lots of questions. The session was important to NT1 in that she was able to process all that she was learning and consider ways to implement new ideas, suggestions and feedback into her own classroom. Kozulin, Gindis, Geyev and Miller (2003) states that this is only effective when internalization occurs through the social interaction of people.

NT 2 commented that the codes were initially confusing but, after the articulation session with her coach explaining the rationale behind her (V11) actions and dispositions, she could link it much better. The articulation session even provided her the avenue to talk about the strategy to improve her class. Like Wilhelm, Baker, and Dube (2001), the researcher believes that when teachers discuss and critically consider their own teaching strategy to improve the class, they adapt their teaching in powerful, positive ways as discussion plays an important role in implementing sustainable change. When teachers involve in solid precise conversation about teaching strategies and
approaches to improve the class, the student’s learning outcome will be improved (Richardson and Hamilton, 1994). Figure 6.11 below shows the purposes of the ‘Articulation’ session throughout the 30-Hour Cognitive Apprenticeship Training from the perspective of both novice teachers.

Figure 6.11: Purposes of ‘Articulation’ session from the perspective of both novice teachers
The figure synthesizes the four major purposes of the ‘Articulation’ session. It includes, (i) making connections, inspecting, and formulating their own schema (ii) talking about the best practices for situational teaching (iii) learning about the codes through asking questions (iv) discussing about the strategy to improve the class. Every purpose met might lead to the occurrence of the following circumstances as illustrated by an arrow pointing downwards.

6.2.3.5 ‘Learning to Teach’ Experience of Novice Teachers: Journaling as a Learning Tool

Reflection is a process of reviewing the experience through reasoning, then reinterpreting, thus synthesizing the experience to form mental structure (Fenwick, 2000). Reflecting on practice encourages teachers to revisit instructional experiences and maximize the construction of meaning (Schon, 1987). Both teachers were asked to revisit what they learned, examined how their practices had changed based on their new learning, and most importantly, to evaluate the impact of these changes on their students’ performance. This was a component of reflective practice and informed instructional decision making.

Both teachers thought that journaling was an important learning tool in identifying areas that needed to be strengthened, with improvement actions to be taken. Vygotsky (1967) mentioned about the connection between thought and word. The use of writing could be seen as a learning tool, in which the learner is using the language system to formulate ideas, share experiences or record important self-observations. The act of writing allows for cognition at higher levels, creating lasting connections between content, experience, and prior knowledge and at the same time creating a record of experience for future use. NT 1 commented that every journal writing leads to greater implementation in the classroom as it integrates the new reflected knowledge and skills into the existing schema and experiences a shift in ability that must accompany true
improvement efforts. This allow us to challenge or prior learning and assimilate according to the current learning and understanding (Halen-Faber, 1997). According to Joseph (2007), in the beginning stages of learning to teach, linking our notions of prior learning to textual or experience takes root and becomes a new learning skill. This can engage learners in more meaningful education of experiences. In addition, by encouraging novice teachers to utilize these mediators, they are using language as a teaching tool, and not solely as a content focus. Besides, NT2 stated that writing journal made her accountable for her improvement efforts and to be more confident to give her best efforts to improve.

6.2.3.6 ‘Learning to Teach’ Experience of Novice Teachers: Interpersonal Relationship between Exemplary Teacher (Coach) and Novice Teacher (Apprentice)

The next theme focuses on the interpersonal relationships between the exemplary teacher (coach) and novice teachers (apprentice). Both novice teachers noted the importance of interpersonal relationships with their coaches as important in the learning process. Both novice teachers had positive relationships with their coaches. Example, NT 2 felt the togetherness with her coach (V6) while NT 1 appreciated her for having V11 as her coach who was caring and supportive.

Throughout the training, NT 2 described the relationship between herself and the coach as important for her experiences. She described her coach as a caring and supportive person. It is imperative to establish a supportive and caring classroom environment (Noddings, 1996). The exemplary teacher (coach) exhibits respectful and caring interaction with students and novice teachers. NT2 felt comfortable with her coach (V6) throughout the learning journey sharing her experience, difficulties, feelings and thinking. Similarly NT 1 highlighted that compassion was the key element to get in touch with people. To touch someone deeply through modelling humanness which she reckoned her coach (V6) was already doing practicing. It is the compassion which
drives the teachers to care for others and model this behaviour in every class (DeRoche & Williams, 2001).

Both novice teachers mentioned that motivation and encouragement from their coach was a major factor to have such good relationship. NT 1 valued the motivation and encouragement given by her coach especially during the moment when she had low self-esteem and was nervous. She felt the respect and didn’t feel being inferior as a novice teacher. NT 2’s coach (V6) gave her motivation and encouragement to have the courage in making changes. The novice teachers described the influence of such practices in many ways, all of which were positive and reinforced their learning and experience. Hence, encouragement and motivation were very much needed. A good relationship between the coach and novice teacher enables learning to take place in a positive environment.

6.2.3.7 ‘Learning to Teach’ Experience of Novice Teachers: Change of Coaching Support

As the training period progressed, the support that coaches provided changed. Bruner (1975) described a process of how learners can reach the Zone of Proximal Development. It refers to the support provided by a more knowledgeable person other that just assist each learner in achieving learning goals. According to both novice teachers, during the cognitive apprenticeship training at Prokidz Institution, the coaches (exemplary teachers) provided much support, encouragement and motivation to their respective learners (novice teachers) in order to meet the exemplary situated dispositions and practices for character education as stated in the code. The novice teachers in this study reckon the changes of coaching support include (i) making recommendation (ii) prompting questions (iii) affirming decisions
As the novice teachers were experiencing the situated teaching experiences and deciding what instructional approaches to take, they were also making recommendations. Making recommendations were supportive at the beginning of the training, when coaches assumed more of an "expert" role. Sometimes the recommendations came during informal discussions, as NT2 acknowledged during the interview that talking after the lessons, suggesting different strategies helped a lot to improve teaching skills. Morris describes the support through giving recommendations offered by a coach or a supervisor during the cognitive apprenticeship context as ‘the handling down of a craft’ (2003, p.1). Earlier in the training, the recommendations provided tended to be more directive, later comments took the form of confirming her decisions, as noted by the NT1. Collet (2012) commented that novice teachers are not competent at the beginning of the training, lacking a teaching knowledge and skills, hence the recommendations given were directive instead of a collaborative style during discussion.

As novice teachers gained more confidence and got better in working with their students, the coaches scaffold them by asking probing questions. "What’s your reason for having the students to stand on the chair?" asked the coach (exemplary teacher) “Do you think talking to him in such manner works?” Such questions push novice teachers to consider implications of their instruction and how they might move forward. Support provided in situ, as novice teachers implemented new practices, while the coach or mentor prompted questions and concerns as they arose encouraged the teachers to think about their own practices (Collet, 2012). Also by prompting novice teachers’ questions, the coach was assertive in directing instruction and such questioning increased the teacher's responsibility (Dutson, 2007).

Later in the training, coaches took the role of affirming teachers' instructional decisions; for example, coach V6 commented on her (NT2) novice teacher’s reflection
specifically addressed the ability to create the learning atmosphere confirming the novice teacher’s instructional decision. Also, the coach commented about the creativity approach allowing students to apply in their daily life by encouraging them to pick up rubbish down the street. Affirmations denoted a context in which novice teachers were making sound instructional decisions but were still looking to their coaches for confirmation whether that they (novice teachers) were doing the right thing during the articulation session. The novice teachers felt happy and motivated that the support given at this phase (later phase of the training) increased their self-esteem and self-efficacy. Teachers who have high teacher efficacy are confident to impact students’ learning and feel positive about themselves teaching (Ashton, 1984). As the training progressed and novice teachers’ teaching competence increased, novice teachers commented their coaches affirmed their decisions more frequently than gave recommendations and prompted questions.

Scrubinizing the written feedback given by the coaches to their respective novice teachers (apprentice), the number of praises written increased. By offering praise, coaches were utilizing a strengths-based approach. Besides a written format, immediately after an effective lesson, Coach (V6) exclaimed, “excellent idea to get the students to involve through exciting body actions.” Both novice teachers were very delighted to receive praises from their coaches as they knew the distance to be an exemplary teacher was shortened. Dunne and Villani (2007) stated the importance of recognizing the teachers through praise but this needed to be supported with evidence or reasons for such appraise. Instead of giving recommendations, prompting questions, affirming decisions; the coaching support given was transformed into offering praises.

Giving recommendations, asking questions, affirming teachers’ decision and giving praises, coach can move novice teachers towards independence throughout the coaching process. The approach shows teachers’ gradually increasing interdependence
as they rely less on the coach and engage more in application independently with a linear course, the coaching support change was shown as meandering. The coaching changed to match novice teachers’ increasing ability.

6.2.3.8 ‘Learning to Teach’ Experience of Novice Teachers: Indicators of Improvement

Both novice teachers were aware of their improvement progress throughout the training. The researcher had scrutinized and analysed their (novice teachers) interview transcripts, thus identifying several indicators of improvements. The indicators include (i) receive less comments (ii) reversal questioner role (iii) working as a collaborator (iv) receive more praise

There was a change in the amount of direct support provided by her coach as she (NT 1) increased in competence and confidence. For example, comments on teaching practice and discussions became shorter. Further, there were many of these later journals on which no comments were provided because the coach felt that none were needed.

NT 2 started off by asking lots of question initially and she had lots of recommendations and suggestions from her coach (V6). Besides, both novice teachers also asked many questions with regards to the codes. Eventually, this became a reversal process as their coach asked them questions on how to improve and tried to understand her perception and feeling of the class. The role of questioner was changed from novice teachers to coaches.

As the training progressed, the coaches' tended to move from a consulting stance to an increasingly collaborative one. By the end of the training, coaches began to treat the teachers as colleagues, a stance that was reflected in the novice teacher’s (V6) comments.
“We were like colleagues working together, discussing together to plan what’s best for the children. That moment, I felt that I was good. Automatically, I increased my confidence level.” (V6, NTI, 16-6-2014)

NT 1 felt her improvements and satisfaction when she received praise from her coach (V11). Her confidence level increased eventually due to her coach reckoning on her teaching practices. She could also gain much trust from the students with her attention and enthusiasm during class. Figure 6.12 below shows the indicators of improvement elucidated by the novice teachers in this study.

**Figure 6.12** Indicators of improvement elucidated by the novice teachers in this study.

6.2.4 Functions of the Established Codes of Exemplary Situated Teaching for Character Education

Throughout the 30-Hour Cognitive Apprenticeship Training at Prokidz Institution, the coaches (exemplary teachers) infused the established Codes of Exemplary Situated Teaching for Character Education to guide novice teachers. After the Novice Teacher Interview (NTI), the researcher synthesized the functions from the novice teachers’ ‘learning to teach’ experience. Although, it wasn’t part of the research questions, the researcher explained the functions of the Codes in preparing novice teachers for character education.

Codes serve as an Explanation Tool. NT 1 reported the importance of having the codes in increasing her knowledge about the best practices with the description. It
facilitated the novice teacher’s learning. NT1 started off in confusion looking at the codes and was trying to make connections. However, with the explanation given by her coach as well as real life ‘on the job’ experience, she could understand better and increase her competence of teaching. Guidance provided by coaches enabled performance before competence (Cazden, 1988), allowing for practice as the novice teachers’ understanding about the codes increased. The Codes facilitated her understanding faster and hence enhanced her teaching skills.

The Codes serve as a Guidance Tool. NT2 was struggling at her first teaching class. Nonetheless, she mentioned that the codes gave her a clear guideline on what she was supposed to do together, with the coaching from her coach. NT1 also agreed the codes served her as a guideline to coordinate the instructional activities yet having the flexibility to meet the individual student’s needs. NT1 commented that she could still be creative in carrying out her class and be observant at a student’s learning.

In addition, the codes serve as a Focus Tool. NT2 commented that the codes had definitely helped her a lot as a teaching framework hence assisting her to observe more critically or acutely. The Codes helped her to focus and made her observe specifically instead of vaguely. With the description of the codes and indicator of the classroom, it had given her a clear picture and direction on what to focus on her class. The codes also helped the novice teachers to understand how to be exemplary teachers and how to better engage students such as making sure every student had a fair chance to engage, depicting high energy levels and portraying charming smiles always. Both novice teachers reckoned that their coach was indeed the exemplary teacher who matched with the description of the Codes.

Code serves as a Feedback Tool. Throughout the learning process, feedback from a more expert preposition is essential as this gives another learning perspective from
another party’s observation. The coaches used the codes to provide feedback to their apprentice (novice teacher) during the articulation session.

Next, codes serve as a Self-Monitoring Tool. Humans have the capacity to think about their actions, or self-reflect, monitor their own performance, and learn from mistakes and successes according to Bandura (1981). The capability of humans to think about their performance and to adjust their behaviour and actions accordingly is an important metacognitive part of the self-system. It requires recognizing one’s own strengths and weaknesses as well as making decisions about future actions based on this knowledge.

Codes serve as an Achieving Tool. Improvement efforts have noted the importance of learning experiences linked to the goals of teachers (Eun, 2008; Guskey, 2000, Lieberman & Fredrich, 2007). Humans set goals for themselves and then act accordingly to take steps toward reaching those goals. In this reactive mode, the action is produced by the goal. This sentiment was clearly echoed by the novice teachers in the current research study to improve classroom practices. The novice teachers used the codes as a goal to be an exemplary teacher. They were aware that if they were able to internalize and externalize the dispositions and practices stated in the codes during their classroom teaching context, at least they would reckon themselves an exemplary teachers, thus, achieving their goal. The novice teachers were aware of the codes of conduct and strived to meet the criteria stated so of being labelled as an ‘exemplary teacher’. The act of setting such goals are proactive as the novice teachers evaluate past successes and failure through journaling and their coach’s feedback which would likely help them achieve what they strive for. In this cyclical pattern of improvement, self-regulation continues. The researcher has taken the self-regulation concept from Bandura (1981).
Codes serve as a Booster Tool. They (codes) speed up the learning process to be an exemplary teacher. NT1 acknowledged that the codes helped her to be an exemplary teacher instead of doing things in a trial and error manner. NT 2 was astounded about the learning experience she could get in such a short period of time with the combination usage of the Codes as well as the guidance from the coach.

Codes also serve as an Evaluation Tool. The researcher created an evaluation format according to the established codes’ components and elements. Each element has a minimum score of ‘0’ and a maximum score of ‘4’. At the last phase of the training ‘Exploration Stage’, NT1 & NT2 were anxious but at the same time excited about the evaluation done by both the coaches (exemplary teachers).

Figure 6.13: Functions of the codes in this study

Figure 6.13 above illustrates the functions of the codes using a representation diagram. The researcher added an evaluation phase to describe the performance of
novice teachers after the training using the established codes from this study. The performance description of novice teachers will be carried out in the following section.

6.3 Performance of Novice Teachers at Prokidz Institution after the Training

When this study was initially conceived, the researcher intended to only understand the ‘learning to teach’ experience from novice teachers as a result from the 30-Hour Cognitive Apprenticeship Training. However, upon the last stage of the training, that is the ‘Exploration Stage’ whereby the novice teachers independently taught without any assistance/coach from the exemplary teacher, gave the researcher the impetus to carry out an evaluation phase. The researcher notified the exemplary teachers (coach) to employ the codes as an evaluation tool to assess the exemplary dispositions and practices of novice teachers of their ‘Independent Teaching’ class section.

6.3.1 Exploration Performance Result of Novice Teachers

Table 6.4 presents the performance results of the novice teachers during the ‘Exploration’ stage of the last two classes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Beginner</th>
<th></th>
<th>Intermediate</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Novice Teacher</td>
<td></td>
<td>NT 1</td>
<td>NT 2</td>
<td>NT 1</td>
<td>NT 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exemplary Teacher</td>
<td>V6</td>
<td>V11</td>
<td>V6</td>
<td>V11</td>
<td>V6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C – Creativity</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R – Relationship</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A – Assessing</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M – Motivation</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V – Value</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I – Instructional</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L – Linkage</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Score</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Score</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>99.5</td>
<td>98.5</td>
<td>111.5</td>
<td>118.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The assessment was conducted in the respective novice teachers’ two classes (Beginner & Intermediate Class) using the established codes. The result has shown that
both novice teachers showed a consistent performance evaluated by two exemplary teachers. Hence, the tendency of biasness and being judgmental by the personal coach was eliminated.

The total score rated according to the Codes of Exemplary Situated Teaching Dispositions and Practices for character education is 130. NT 1 obtained 99.5/130 (5 points discrepancies between the score evaluated by both exemplary teachers V6 & V11) in her Beginner Class while 111.130 (3 points discrepancies between the score evaluated by both exemplary teachers V6 & V11) in her Intermediate Class. NT 2 obtained 98.5/130 (5 points discrepancies between the score evaluated by both exemplary teachers V6 & V11) in her Beginner Class while 118.5/130 (1 point discrepancy between the score evaluated by both exemplary teachers V6 & V11) in her Intermediate Class. In order to substantiate the meaning of those scores presented in Table 6.4 (p.272), the researcher described the performance of novice teachers in the following section.

6.3.2 Descriptive performance result of novice teachers after training

Comments were given by two exemplary teachers across two evaluation classes (Beginner & Intermediate Level). The researcher created an evaluation format according to the established codes’ components and elements (CRAMVIL). Exemplary Teachers wrote their comments and scores on the evaluation sheets (refer to Appendix S). The following are the excerpts given by both exemplary teachers. For example in the Acronym (NT1-V6-B, 27-5-2014), NT1 means Novice Teacher, V6 means Exemplary Teacher, B means Beginner Level Class (I mean Intermediate Level Class) and 27-5-2014 is the date the evaluation was conducted. The researcher described the performances according to the mode of teaching and its components.
6.3.2.1 Descriptive performance result of Novice Teacher (NT 1)

[Creativity Mode Teaching – Expression] Both ET (Exemplary Teachers) appraised NT1 for her excellent body actions and facial expressions using the term ‘dramatic’. She played different roles to depict the character of the lessons as well as demonstrating to students the contrast between a good practice and a bad practice.

Excellent body action and facial expression. Students are generally attracted to you. You are so dramatic.

(NT1-V6-B, 27-5-2014)

Big and dramatic body action. I like your facial expression especially when you were the instructor of the parenting class.

(NT1-V11-B, 27-5-2014)

Excellent as you acted so many superheroes. You did well in demonstrating the energetic affirmation and non-energetic affirmation.

(NT1-V11-I, 28-5-2014)

[Creativity Mode Teaching – Context] NT 1 able to create the relevant atmosphere in relation to the lesson plan. Props are utilized from the class such as tables, chairs, pens, and sound effects such as a ‘siren’ is created to illustrate the situation. She managed to put the students in the respective character roles.

Having the students using the chairs and tables to build their house. Their babies had ‘bed’ to sleep. In addition, you were creative to organize a parenting class for the students teaching them how to care and feed their baby. Well done.

(NT1-V6-B, 27-5-2014)

You had the students to create a bed and house. Also used a pen as the milk bottle.

(NT1-V11-B, 27-5-2014)

...created the ‘siren affect’ to create urgency that they needed to save the town people. More tools can be used instead of only the cape.

(NT1-V6-I, 28-5-2014)

You successfully made the students to be so involved in their character. Great

(NT1-V11-I, 28-5-2014)
[Motivational Mode Teaching – Advancing] Both ET agreed that NT1 encouraged her students and cultivated the challenging spirit to learn and improve. Also NT1 ensured the quality of the students’ actions instead of merely completing their tasks. The element of ‘growth’ was rather weak as NT1 did not deliver or inculcate the mindset of improvement and practices needed to improve instead of depending innate talent.

The students enjoyed being ‘parent’ due to your constant encouragement. Although they felt awkward initially, you give students confidence that they are able to care. In addition, you ensure students not merely completing the tasks but rather exemplifying as a caring and patient parent.

(NT1-V6-B, 27-5-2014)

You encouraged your students. I liked how you were trying your best to get Joseph and Natalie to treat their baby with care.

(NT1-V11-B, 27-5-2014)

Good. The students were willing to challenge their limit and be so enthusiastic to save the townspeople.

(NT1-V6-I, 28-5-2014)

The students were willing to challenge themselves to save more people.

(NT1-V11-I, 28-5-2014)

[Motivational Mode Teaching – Learning] NT1 able to scaffold the difficulty of the lesson to meet the students’ learning. Nonetheless, no action was taken when one of the students was not able to follow through. Immediate feedback was given allowing students to be aware and improved spontaneously.

Excellent in giving immediate feedback in terms of their affirmation performance.

(NT1-V11-I, 28-5-2014)

Increasing level of difficulties from taking care of a baby, toddler and kid. Your students took your feedback seriously and acted upon.

(NT1-V6-B, 27-5-2014)

Good that you scaffold the level from taking care of a baby, toddler and kid. Your students took your feedback seriously and acted upon, except for Joseph.

(NT1-V11-B, 27-5-2014)

Constantly giving feedback on student’s voices, body actions, energy levels and enthusiasm.

(NT1-V6-I, 28-5-2014)
[Linkage Mode Teaching – Hook] NT 1 prompted the students to understand their prior knowledge. ET both were impressed that her students remembered the learning objective of the lesson in both the Beginner and the Intermediate Class.

You emphasized the importance of appreciation. Asking them to share how their parents took care of them before moving into the activities. Before the class ended, every student was able to recap the learning objective of the day. Excellent.

Excellent! All students remembered the learning objectives of the day. You were also good at prompting the students to understand what they knew about appreciation.

You have lots of knowledge about the super hero’s character. Very up to date indeed. All students remembered the learning objective.

All students remembered the learning objective.

[Linkage Mode Teaching – Experiential] NT1 did well in emphasizing the importance of the value learned. Eventually, students could share how they applied the value in their daily life. More explanation and direct application could have been improved allowing students to understand the reasons of instilling such values.

You shared the importance and also allowed the students reflect. However, more explanation could be given to students on the implication and reasons to appreciate. Also relate to some real life contexts instead of on the surface yes/no question.

You shared the importance of appreciating very well. Suggest having more real life simple examples that they could apply in their daily life directly.

You talked about ways to be helpful, importance of being helpful as well as ways & words to self-affirm and the importance of self-affirmation. All students were
able to share how they could help others in their daily life even without supernatural powers.

(NT1-V6-I, 28-5-2014)

I like how you emphasize the point that even though the students don’t have supernatural power yet they could still be helpful and help others.

(NT1-V11-I, 28-5-2014)

[Instructional Mode Teaching – Verbal] NT1 varied her voice and intonation to create the right context and eventually getting the students to fully engage. The students were excited as a result of such effective instructional ability.

You varied your voice as an instructor in the parenting class. Acted as a baby crying with a shriek. Clear and loud.

(NT1-V6-B, 27-5-2014)

Very exciting to listen to your verbal expression as the students were attracted to you and all engaged into the context.

(NT1-V11-B, 27-5-2014)

I liked how you shouted for ‘help’.

(NT1-V6-I, 28-5-2014)

[Instructional Mode Teaching – Coordination] Students were generally in excitement. NT1 was good at time pacing and the transitions of activity. Nonetheless, clear signals or indication is needed to be given in order to coordinate the class smoothly. Receiving full attention before instruction is put forward.

Excellent. Except for students who went wild because of the excitement. Give signals or indication to control them such as raising hand or seconds of silence.

(NT1-V6-B, 27-5-2014)

Just be sure that all students were looking at you before you start explaining. Very good control of time.

(NT1-V11-B, 27-5-2014)

Good timing. Great attention received. Good idea to manage the behaviour of Mabel and Benjamin.

(NT1-V6-I, 28-5-2014)
[Value Mode Teaching – Behaviour] NT1 had good observation who constantly monitored the students’ behaviour. However, the approach of dealing and instilling is rather weak.

\[
\text{Natalie and Joseph mistreated their baby. You observed and called upon them. More debriefing could be done instead of just asking them ‘not to do that. Constantly repeating the word caring and appreciate will be good.} \\
\text{(NT1-V6-B, 27-5-2014)}
\]

\[
\text{Constantly repeat the values as a form of reminder. I suggest writing the key value on the board. If students were not behaving, point to the word. Also get other students to remind. Peer influence is powerful.} \\
\text{(NT1-V11-B, 27-5-2014)}
\]

\[
\text{Good that you constantly emphasized the value ‘helpful’. Also great way to get Mabel and Benjamin to focus by standing on the chair and table to answer questions.} \\
\text{(NT1-V6-I, 28-5-2014)}
\]

6.3.2.2 Descriptive performance result of Novice Teacher (NT 2)

[Creativity Mode Teaching – Expression] NT2 exemplified excellent body action and facial expressions through demonstration.

\[
\text{Wow! Your body actions and expressions were good during the play when you were demonstrating to the students.} \\
\text{(NT2-V6-B, 27-5-2014)}
\]

\[
\text{Full of body actions. Great job to also express the frustrated facial motion on different types of pollution.} \\
\text{(NT2-V6-I, 28-5-2014)}
\]

\[
\text{You have so much energy. Good facial expression especially the annoyance and sick expression.} \\
\text{(N21-V11-I, 28-5-2014)}
\]

[Creativity Mode Teaching – Context] NT 2 created the atmosphere through her body actions. She emphasized a lot on body actions and grabbed students’ attention well.

\[
\text{You set up a good context by allowing students to grab their chair and also adding the ‘ring’ sound effect to exemplify the context of the play.} \\
\text{(NT2-V6-B, 27-5-2014)}
\]
You demonstrated as a bird, as a singer. You created the context through flapping wings.  

(NT2-V11-B, 27-5-2014)

The students were so engaged in your newly created game. Full of body actions. Excellent in cutting out pictures of different pollutions.  

(NT2-V6-I, 28-5-2014)

Very creative game by using body actions to categorize the types of pollution.  

(NT2-V11-I, 28-5-2014)

[Relationship Mode Teaching – Personality] Both ET agreed that NT2 exemplifies charming and energetic personality.

Excellent and natural energy and charming looking throughout the lesson. The body actions and jumping around, the positive energy was great.  

(NT2-V6-B, 27-5-2014)

You were indeed charming with your smile. You flapped around with a joyous disposition.  

(NT2-V11-B, 27-5-2014)

[Relationship Mode Teaching – Communication] NT2 had good interaction with the students and always acted with the students. She ensured all students’ voice were heard and constantly engaged them.

Wow! I love the part that you were the bird just like them flying and flapping wings together. You guided them consistently and patiently on their voice and melody.  

(NT2-V6-B, 27-5-2014)

The interactions between were closed with much verbal communication. As you could observe, they were willing to collaborate with each other and asked you questions.  

(NT2-V11-B, 27-5-2014)

You did well by engaging the students through your explanation and interaction. You were part of them in all sessions from beginning till the end. You acted with them; you provided them the opportunity to speak with you.  

(NT2-V6-I, 28-5-2014)

Students worked well and cooperated with you well; marvellous teacher-student relationship.  

(NT2-V11-I, 28-5-2014)
[Motivational Mode Teaching – Advancing] NT2 encouraged her students though they felt shy initially. She clearly conveyed the criteria of the lesson, allowing students to understand the goal of learning. Her students were willing to be challenged.

You gave lots of encouragement to the children during the singing practice. They felt shy and reluctant but after every right tone & improvements, you gave verbal appraisal immediately.

(NT2-V6-B, 27-5-2014)

You communicated to the children what to look for during singing (singing criteria).

(NT2-V11-B, 27-5-2014)

They were participative and tried their very best to answer questions. For Carol, she was very willing to learn though she has some difficulty learning it. All students learnt about this topic and were able to differentiate well.

(NT2-V11-I, 28-5-2014)

[Motivational Mode Teaching – Learning] NT2 provided feedback for students to be aware of their performance and scaffold according to their level.

In addition, you constantly provided them feedback and sang with them to achieve accurate melody and rhythm.

(NT2-V6-B, 27-5-2014)

You increased the difficulty level by adding actions and emotions.

(NT2-V6-I, 28-5-2014)

You rendered a good feedback to Nik by linking the skill of the day which was responsiveness.

(NT2-V11-I, 28-5-2014)

[Value Mode Teaching – Behaviour] NT2 was a good advocator to constantly instil the values through reminder. She monitored, dealt and advocated with full conviction.

You did very well today to embrace the value. Very GOOD! E.g. ensure the children held their hands in a circle (G1), encouraged Carol to sit nearer to and gave a hand shake, ensured respect and you dealt with Ee Hang and Yoon, so that they listened to Kheng Kim’s point.

(NT2-V6-I, 28-5-2014)
Advocating the importance to care for the environment by having students to pick up the rubbish.

(NT2-V11-I, 28-5-2014)

You advocated the value of the day very well. Whenever, the students felt reluctant or shy to practise, you reemphasized the value.

(NT2-V6-I, 28-5-2014)

[Instructional Mode Teaching – Coordination] NT2 had great instructional ability in terms of handling the transition of lesson. The clarity of instruction enabled the students to follow through.

The transition and clarity was great. You managed the flow well. Students followed your instructions well. You used several effective instructional techniques according to action.

(NT2-V6-I, 28-5-2014)

You delivered clear instructions and the students understood the instruction well. The transition of agenda was smooth too. Just be cautious with the time.

(NT2-V11-I, 28-5-2014)

[Instructional Mode Teaching – Verbal] NT2 possessed excellent verbal presentation in articulating her voice and intonation, hence attracting the students’ attention

You changed your voice when you acted in accordance to the role. Michael’s voice, Teacher’s voice and etc.

(NT2-V6-I, 28-5-2014)

Nonetheless, Children are generally attracted to your instructions through your great presentation ability.

(NT2-V11-I, 28-5-2014)

[Linkage Mode Teaching – Hook] NT2 hooked the students’ interest by creating game and repeatedly emphasized the commencement of the class. Eventually, students remembered the learning objectives.

You prompted them about their actions in given scenarios. You prompted them if value was or wasn’t embraced.

(NT2-V6-B, 27-5-2014)

You prompted students about the value and created a game for students to understand the concept of environmental caring.

(NT2-V11-I, 28-5-2014)
[Linkage Mode Teaching – Experiential] NT2 emphasized the importance of the value and explained using different scenarios. ET was impressed by NT2 for her special activity in connecting students to daily real life practice.

You also asked about the importance of responsiveness. Students did well in expressing what they learned throughout the session especially about being not shy.

(NT2-V11-B, 27-5-2014)

I like how you brought the students down and picked up rubbish together. Indeed real life application. Also getting them to write down 5 actions on how to take care of the earth.

(NT2-V6-I, 28-5-2014)

Wow! You brought the students down and picked up rubbish together. Excellent explanation.

(NT2-V11-I, 28-5-2014)

6.4 Chapter Summary

In this chapter, the situated knowledge of participating exemplary teachers at Prokidz Institution in the context of classroom teaching experience in relation to character education was elicited and highlighted. Their exemplary practices and dispositions were utilized to establish the Codes of Exemplary Situated Teaching for Character Education at Prokidz Institution. By infusing the codes to prepare participating novice teachers at Prokidz Institution through the 30-Hour Cognitive Apprenticeship Training, the factors that affect ‘learning to teach’ were identified in the later chapter. In addition, the functions of the established codes were also explicated from the novice teachers’ learning to teach experience. At the end of the chapter, the researcher described the performance result of novice teachers after the training at Prokidz Institution. All research objectives were met and the alignment of conceptual framework and theoretical framework were discussed throughout the chapter. The researcher will discuss the implications and conclusion of this study in the next chapter.