A CRITICAL DISCOURSE ANALYSIS OF PPSMI
IN MALAYSIAN NEWS MEDIA

KIEW SIEH PING

SUBMITTED TO
THE FACULTY OF LANGUAGES AND LINGUISTICS
UNIVERSITY MALAYA,
IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENT FOR THE
MASTER OF LINGUISTICS

2012
UNIVERSITI MALAYA

ORIGINAL LITERARY WORK DECLARATION

Name of Candidate: Kiew Sieh Ping   (I.C. No: 780825-71-5052)
Registration/Matric No: TGC 060016
Name of degree: Master of Linguistics
Title of Project Paper (“this Work”):
A CRITICAL DISCOURSE ANALYSIS OF PPSMI IN MALAYSIAN NEWS MEDIA
Field of Study: Critical Discourse Analysis

I do solemnly and sincerely declare that:

(1) I am the sole author/writer of this Work;
(2) This Work is original;
(3) Any use of any work in which copyright exists was done by way of fair dealing and for permitted purposes and any excerpt from, or reference to or reproduction of any copyright work has been disclosed expressly and sufficiently and the title of the Work and its authorship have been acknowledged in this Work;
(4) I do not have any actual knowledge nor do I ought reasonably to know that the making of this Work constitutes an infringement of any copyright work;
(5) I hereby assign all and every rights in the copyright to this Work to the University of Malaya (“UM”), who henceforth shall be owner of the copyright in this Work and that any reproduction or use in any form or by any means whatsoever is prohibited without the written consent of UM having been first had obtained;
(6) I am fully aware that if in the course of making this Work I have infringed any copyright whether intentionally or otherwise, I may be subject to legal action or any other action as may be determined by UM.

Candidate’s signature     Date

Subscribed and solemnly declared before,

Witness’s Signature     Date

Name: Dr Lean Mei Li
Designation: Senior Lecturer, Faculty of Languages and Linguistics
ABSTRACT

This research report seeks to realise and compare the different ideologies that are contained in reports from Malaysian mainstream and alternative media with respect to the issue of teaching science and mathematics in English (otherwise known by the Bahasa Malaysia acronym, PPSMI). More specifically, the study focuses on the discourse that centres around the government’s decision to abolish the PPSMI. To do so, the study analyses a corpus of 21 news reports from The Star and 13 from Malaysiakini. These reports span a period of three months, i.e. from June to August 2009.

The media plays an important role in mediating texts and discourse. Therefore, it is important to realise the ideology behind each media house, as this ideology is disseminated and perpetuated within its news reports. By realising the ideology of the media house, the public can make an educated decision about what they read and evaluate the information they receive. In addition, the issue of PPSMI is critical as education policies affect the next generation, who will be the country’s future leaders.

Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) is the most helpful framework for examining and uncovering the ideology embedded in texts and discourse. Therefore, using Norman Fairclough’s (2001) three-dimensional framework, the study will conduct an intertextual and textual analysis.

The intertextual analysis is conducted both qualitatively and quantitatively. The qualitative analysis examines the level of dialogicality in reports from both media houses and how the reporters recontextualise the information in their reports. In addition, it will also study how both media houses frame the various voices in the discourse and investigate how other texts have been woven into the discourse.
The quantitative analysis determines which voices have been included and excluded from the discourse.

The textual analysis is conducted qualitatively and seeks to investigate how the reporters construct social reality through the representation of social actors and the use of transitivity.

Findings from the qualitative intertextual analysis show that the mainstream media, as represented by The Star, endeavours to sustain the government’s hegemony by recontextualising and framing the various voices in the discourse. This is in contrast to Malaysiakini, which attempts to undermine the government’s hegemonic position. The quantitative analysis shows that government voices are the most highly represented in The Star compared to other voices, while opposition voices are the least represented. However, Malaysiakini offers a more balanced representation of voices in its reports.

The textual analysis finds that both media houses attempt to construct a contrasting social reality through the representation of the various social actors in the discourse and the use of transitivity. The Star is supportive of the government’s decisions and hegemony, while Malaysiakini is more neutral on the issue.

In conclusion, by comparing both media houses’ reports on the PPSMI issue over the period of three months, the researcher is able to determine the ideology of both The Star and Malaysiakini. The ideology of the mainstream media, as represented by The Star, is consistent with the dominant ideology of the ruling government, but the ideology of the alternative media, represented by Malaysiakini, does not support the government’s hegemonic position.
ABSTRAK


Media memainkan peranan yang penting sebagai pengantara dalam teks dan wacana. Sejurus itu, adalah penting untuk mengetahui ideologi yang dipegang oleh syarikat-syarikat media, kerana ideologi ini akan disebarkan melalui berita yang mereka terbitkan. Orang ramai perlu tahu ideologi yang terkandung di dalam laporan berita ini, supaya mereka dapat membuat pilihan yang bijak tentang laporan-laporan yang mereka bacakan dan boleh menilai kandungan laporan-laporan tersebut. Selain itu, isu PPSMI ini adalah kritikal kerana dasar pendidikan akan memberi kesan kepada generasi muda, yang akan menjadi pemimpin masa depan.


Kajian intertekstual merupakan kajian yang kualitatif dan juga kuantitatif. Kajian kualitatif berkenaan dengan tahap ‘dialogicality’ yang terpapar di laporan-laporan The Star serta Malaysiakini dan cara wartawan-wartawan telah meletakkan dalam konteks lain, maklumat yang tertera di dalam laporan tersebut. Penggunaan ‘framing’ untuk suara-suara dalam wacana ini juga dikaji, berserta dengan
intertekstualiti, iaitu bagaimana wartawan telah melibatkan teks luar di dalam wacana tersebut. Analisis kuantitatif pula berkenaan dengan mana-mana ‘suara’ yang termasuk ataupun tidak termasuk dalam wacana ini.

Analisis tekstual dijalankan secara qualitatif dan mengkaji bagaimana wartawan membinakan realiti sosial melalui pewakilan ‘pelakon sosial’ (‘social actors’) dan penggunaan transitiviti.


Analisis tekstual menunjukkan bahawa The Star dan Malaysiakini masing-masing membina realiti sosial yang saling bertentangan melalui perwakilan ‘pelakon sosial’ dalam wacana tersebut dan penggunaan transitiviti. The Star menyokong keputusan kerajaan, tetapi Malaysiakini lebih neutral.

Kesimpulannya, pengajian ini dapat mengetahui ideologi yang dipegang oleh The Star dan Malaysiakini setelah mengkaji laporan-laporan yang diterbitkan dalam media tersebut selama tiga bulan. Ideologi media arus perdana, seperti diwakili oleh The Star, adalah konsisten dengan ideologi dominan kerajaan, tetapi ideologi media alternatif, seperti diwakili oleh Malaysiakini, tidak menyokong kedudukan hegemoni kerajaan.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This report would not have been possible without the guidance and assistance of my supervisor, Dr. Lean Mei Li. I owe her a debt of gratitude for helping me to gain a much deeper and clearer understanding of CDA and for being my beacon of light as I progressed through this research.

My ‘family’ at Sunway University, especially my bosses, Dr. Stephen J. Hall and Ms. Jeanette Lim, have been unfailingly supportive of me throughout this endeavour and have constantly encouraged me to push toward the finish line. I am more thankful than I can say for all the concern they have showed towards me and the myriad ways in which they have helped to smooth my way during these challenging months.

I am also very fortunate to have parents, a brother and many uncles and aunts who would continually ask for progress updates and who supported me in prayer throughout the duration of this research.

Finally, I am blessed to have many friends who have, in one way or another, expressed support and helped to spur me on when I was not sure whether I would make it. Their faith in me has been humbling.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Title page i
Original Literary Work Declaration ii
Abstract iii
Abstrak v
Acknowledgements vii
Table of Contents viii
List of Figures xii
List of Tables xii

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

1.1 Introduction 1
1.2 Background to the study 1
  1.2.1 Language in education: A historical journey 2
  1.2.2 The controversial English language 4
  1.2.3 The teaching of science and mathematics in English (PPSMI) 5
1.3 Statement of the Problem 7
1.4 Purpose Statement 8
1.5 Research Objectives 8
1.6 Research Questions 9
1.7 Significance of the Study 9

CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Introduction 11
2.2 The three core approaches in Critical Discourse Analysis 11
2.2.1 Socio-Cognitive Studies (van Dijk) 12
2.2.2 Discourse-Historical Approach (Wodak) 13
2.2.3 Fairclough’s Three-Dimensional Framework 15

2.3 Important concepts of CDA 16
2.3.1 Ideology 16
2.3.2 Hegemony and power 18
2.3.3 Intertextuality 19

2.4 The media 20
2.4.1 The structure of the news report 21
2.4.2 Impartiality and truthfulness 25
2.4.3 Press freedom 26

2.5 The Malaysian media 28
2.5.1 Media laws and censorship in Malaysia 29
2.5.2 The advent of online media and alternative media 32

CHAPTER THREE: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY 35

3.1 Theoretical Framework 38
3.2 Data Description 38
3.2.1 Choice of Data 38
3.2.2 Selection of Data 39
3.2.3 Collection of Data 39
3.2.4 Data Presentation 40

3.3 Analytical Systems and Categories 41
3.3.1 Intertextual Analysis 42
3.3.1.1 Qualitative Analysis 42
3.3.1.2 Quantitative Analysis 45
3.3.2 Textual Analysis 46
3.3.2.1 Social Actors 46
CHAPTER FOUR: ANALYSIS

4.1 Introduction 52

4.2 Intertextual Analysis 52

4.2.1 Qualitative Analysis 52

4.2.1.1 Degree of Dialogicality 53

4.2.1.2 Recontextualisation of Voices 62

4.2.1.3 Framing 66

4.2.1.4 Intertextuality 69

4.2.2 Quantitative Analysis 71

4.3 Textual Analysis 76

4.3.1 Social actors 77

4.3.1.1 Us vs Them 78

4.3.1.2 Power vs Helplessness 90

4.3.2 Transitivity 100

4.3.2.1 Relational Processes 100

4.3.2.2 Material Processes 102

4.3.2.3 Mental Processes 107

4.3.2.4 Verbal Processes 108

4.3.2.5 Conclusion 110

CHAPTER FIVE: CONCLUSION

5.1 Overview 111

5.2 Discussion 112

5.2.1 Significant Findings 112

5.2.2 Implications 116
5.3 Limitations 120
5.4 Suggestions for Future Research 120

REFERENCE LIST 121

APPENDICES 133

Appendix A: List of extracts
Appendix B: Articles from *The Star*
Appendix C: Articles from *Malaysiakini*
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1: The inverted pyramid news structure  22
Figure 3.1: Fairclough’s three-dimensional framework  36

LIST OF TABLES

Table 4.1: Percentage of voices represented in the news reports from both media houses  71